COLLECTIVE VIOLENCE AND INTERNATIONAL CRIMINAL JUSTICE

An interdisciplinary approach

*Edited by*

Alette Smeulers

intersentia
Antwerp – Oxford – Portland
ACKNOWLEDGMENTS

This conference book is the outcome of an expert-meeting organized in June 2009 by the Amsterdam Centre of Interdisciplinary Research on International Crimes and Security (ACIC) which is based at the VU University in Amsterdam. The expert-meeting was financed by the Netherlands Science Organization (NWO) for the research project entitled 'A criminological approach to individual criminal responsibility for international crimes' in the innovational research incentive scheme and which had been granted to me in December 2005. A first expert-meeting was organized in April 2007 at Maastricht University. The conference book thereof was also published by Intersentia in this series and is entitled: Supranational criminology: towards a criminology of international crimes and was edited by Roelof Haveman and myself. This book is a follow up on the first conference book.

I wish to thank a number of people for helping to organize the conference and for their support or advice with the editing of the conference book, namely Elies van Sliedregt, Lotte Hoex, Barbora Holá, Klaas Rozemond, Nicole Lijs and Diana Turcas. I would furthermore like to thank all the contributors to the conference book for their contributions. I am also grateful to the participants of the expert-meeting who did not submit a chapter but nevertheless contributed to the discussions during the expert-meeting: Elies van Sliedregt, Leila Sadat and Larissa van den Herik. I furthermore wish to thank Stephan Parmentier and Howard Morrison who both turned out to be excellent chairs and thus greatly contributed to the success of the meeting by ensuring a continuous and lively debate.

I sincerely hope that this book will further contribute to this newly developing field of international crimes and of international criminology and that it will stimulate the academic and interdisciplinary debate on international crimes in order to enhance our knowledge and understanding of these crimes and thus ultimately contribute to preventing such crimes in the future.

Alette Smeulers
Amsterdam, June 4 2010
CONTENTS

Acknowledgements

INTRODUCTION

Chapter 1. Collective violence and international criminal justice – towards an interdisciplinary approach
   Alette Smeulers

   1. Introduction
   2. A brief history of the international criminal justice system
   3. New areas of expertise
   4. Outline of the book

References

PART I.
PERPETRATORS OF INTERNATIONAL CRIMES

Chapter 2. The ordinariness of extraordinary evil: the making of perpetrators of collective violence
   James E. Waller

   1. Introduction
   2. Ordinary origins of extraordinary human evil
   3. Cultural construction of worldview
   4. Psychological construction of the “other”
   5. Social construction of cruelty
   6. Conclusion

References

Chapter 3. Rethinking the subjectivity of perpetrators of political violence
   Don Foster

   1. Introduction
   2. Dominant accounts of perpetrators
   3. Criticism of the dominant accounts
   4. An alternative approach

References

Intersentia
### Contents

5. Two case studies ................................................................. 48  
   5.1. The Eichmann case .................................................. 48  
   5.2. The case of John Deegan ........................................ 54  
6. Implications and concluding remarks ............................... 58  
References ................................................................. 60  

PART II.  
COLLECTIVE CRIMES – INDIVIDUAL RESPONSIBILITY  

Chapter 4. Discourses on international criminality  
Athanasios CHOULIARAS .................................................. 65  

1. Introduction ................................................................. 65  
2. The collective nature of core crimes as the common ground of  
   different fields of knowledge ........................................... 67  
3. Criminology: state and state-corporate crime as instances of  
   organizational deviance .................................................. 70  
4. International criminal law: looking for the individual criminal,  
   losing the delinquent state ............................................. 77  
   4.1. Contextual elements and admissibility criteria: 'Walks like a  
        duck, swims like a duck, and quacks like a duck'... Ain't a duck! ... 78  
   4.2. Modes of individual criminal liability: in search of the  
        organizational role .................................................. 84  
5. The rationale for the international criminal justice system ................. 89  
6. Discussion ................................................................. 92  
References ................................................................. 94  

Chapter 5. Ascribing individual liability within a bureaucracy of murder  
Mark OSIÉL ................................................................. 105  

1. Introduction ................................................................. 105  
2. Easing superior responsibility: a new concept of effective control ...... 106  
   2.1. Roxin's theory of "domination over an organizational apparatus" ... 107  
3. Difficulties with Roxin's approach: a post-Weberian update .................. 110  
   3.1. The fungibility of subordinates .................................... 114  
   3.2. Discretion enjoyed by subordinates ................................ 114  
   3.3. Non-western military organization ................................ 116  
   3.4. Shifting the evidentiary onus ...................................... 119  
   3.5. The sociology of mass atrocity ................................... 122  
   3.6. The mental element ................................................ 124  
4. Conclusion ................................................................. 125  
References ................................................................. 127
Chapter 6. Seizing the “Grotian Moment”: application of joint criminal enterprise liability to the proceedings of the Cambodia genocide tribunal
Michael P. SCHARF ................................................................. 131

1. Introduction ................................................................. 131
2. Did the Nuremberg precedent establish JCE as customary international law? ......................... 134
   2.1. Application of JCE at Nuremberg. .................................. 134
   2.2. Nuremberg as a “Grotian Moment” .................................. 143
   2.3. The Concept of “Grotian Moment” ................................. 146
3. Conclusion ................................................................. 148
References ........................................................................ 151

Chapter 7. Criminologically explained reality of genocide, structure of the offence and the ‘intent to destroy’ requirement
Kai AMBOS ............................................................. 153

1. Introduction ................................................................. 153
2. Typologies in criminology ................................................ 154
3. The significance of the criminological typology of perpetrators for the offence of genocide .................. 159
4. Correspondence of categories of international criminal law with criminological typologies of perpetrators ................................................. 163
   4.1. Regarding top-level perpetrators “intent to destroy” means knowledge and purpose .................. 166
   4.2. As to mid-level perpetrators the knowledge-based approach is applicable .......................... 166
   4.3. Regarding the low-level perpetrators it is necessary to distinguish between state agents and private actors. While the former are normally informed about the genocidal (state) plan, the latter are not ....................................................... 168
5. Conclusion: the structure of the genocide offence in light of the criminological findings ................. 170
References ........................................................................ 171

Chapter 8. ICTY and the culpability of different types of perpetrators of international crimes
Alette SMEULERS and Barbora HOLÁ ................................. 175

1. Introduction ................................................................. 175
2. Culpability of different types of perpetrators ................................................................. 179
   2.1. Highest level of blameworthiness: criminal masterminds ......................................... 180
   2.2. High level of blameworthiness: careerists and fanatics ................................. 181

Intersentia ix
2.3. Medium level of blameworthiness: devoted warriors ............... 183
2.4. Low level of blameworthiness: "criminals and sadists" and the otherwise law abiding citizens .......................... 185
2.5. Lowest level of blameworthiness: compromised perpetrator .... 188
3. ICTY sentencing case law ............................................. 188
4. Empirical findings ..................................................... 190
   4.1. Methodology ...................................................... 190
       4.1.1. Data Collection ............................................ 190
       4.1.2. Method ...................................................... 193
   4.2. Results ............................................................ 194
   4.3. Discussion ...................................................... 200
5. Conclusions ............................................................ 203

Chapter 9. Child soldiers: agency, enlistment, and the collectivization of innocence

Mark A. Drumbl .......................................................... 207

1. Introduction ............................................................ 207
2. Criminally punishing adults for the conscription, enlistment, or use of child soldiers in hostilities ......................... 210
   2.1. Special Court for Sierra Leone .................................. 210
   2.2. International Criminal Court ................................... 213
   2.3. The agency of child soldiers: assumptions, narratives, and strategies ...................................................... 215
   2.4. Conclusion .......................................................... 218
3. How do children end up in fighting forces? ............................. 218
   3.1. Forced conscription ................................................ 219
   3.2. Voluntary enlistment .............................................. 222
   3.3. Summary ............................................................ 226
4. Conclusion ............................................................... 227
References ................................................................. 229

PART III.
REFLECTIONS ON INTERNATIONAL CRIMINAL JUSTICE AND THE ICC

Chapter 10. The rough edges of the delicate mosaic: complexity theory and the early practice of the International Criminal Court

Salim A. Nakhjavani ....................................................... 235

1. Introduction ............................................................. 235
2. Some characteristics of complex adaptive systems .................... 237
3. Lens, metaphor, analogy, model … or nothing at all? .......................... 239
4. Seeking complexity in international criminal justice .............................. 243
   4.1. The entry-into-force of the Rome Statute sets in motion a nonlinear, dynamic system .................................................. 243
   4.2. Outcomes of decisions of the Court may be sensitively dependent on initial conditions and path-dependent ......................... 245
   4.3. The Rome Statute may co-evolve with ‘neighboring’ treaties .......... 246
5. Novel insights or repackaged goods? .................................................. 250
References ...................................................................................... 251

Chapter 11. The law and politics of self-referrals
Sarah Nouwen and Wouter Werner ................................................. 255

  1. Introduction ................................................................................. 255
  2. Self-referrals and complementarity ............................................. 257
     2.1. Inaction as a ground for admissibility ................................... 260
     2.2. Narrowing down the definition of a ‘case’ ............................... 264
     2.3. Broadening the concept of unwillingness ............................... 265
     2.4. Conclusion: legal aspects of self-referrals .............................. 267
  3. The politics of self-referrals ......................................................... 267
     3.1. ICC politics ......................................................................... 267
     3.2. National politics .................................................................... 268
     3.3. Conclusion: politics of self-referrals ...................................... 269
References ...................................................................................... 270

PART IV. FROM FACTS TO FIGURES

Chapter 12. On research methods for international crimes –
methodological issues in the empirical study of international crimes
Catrien Bijleveld ............................................................... 275

  1. Introduction ................................................................................. 275
  2. Criminological areas of study ..................................................... 276
  3. Methodological backdrop to social science research ..................... 278
     3.1. Working with samples .......................................................... 278
     3.2. Causality ............................................................................. 280
     3.3. The role of assumptions ....................................................... 282
  4. Research on international crimes .................................................. 283
     4.1. Studying prevalence ............................................................. 283
     4.2. Etiology ............................................................................... 288
     4.3. (Legal) reaction ................................................................. 291
     4.4. Victim studies ..................................................................... 292
5. Conclusion and some ways forward ........................................ 294
References ................................................................. 295

Chapter 13. Sexual violence during war: variation and accountability
Elisabeth Jean Wood ....................................................... 297

1. Introduction ............................................................ 297
2. Key concepts ............................................................ 299
3. Incomplete explanations .................................................. 303
   3.1. Type of conflict ..................................................... 303
   3.2. Opportunity ........................................................ 303
   3.3. Incentives ........................................................... 305
   3.4. Rape as a substitution for consensual sex ....................... 306
   3.5. Female combatants ............................................... 307
   3.6. Sexual violence as instrumental for the group .................. 307
4. Theoretical framework .................................................. 309
   4.1. Individual combatants ............................................. 309
   4.2. Leadership strategy ................................................ 310
   4.3. Institutions for combatant socialization ......................... 310
   4.4. Wartime dynamics ................................................... 312
   4.5. Military hierarchy ................................................ 313
5. When is wartime rape a strategy of war? When is it rare? Top-down
and bottom-across logics ................................................. 314
   5.1. Explaining the absence of sexual violence: two logics ........ 315
      5.1.1. The top-down logic ......................................... 315
      5.1.2. The bottom-across logic ................................... 317
   5.2. Explaining rape as a strategy (or tactic) of war: two logics ... 318
      5.2.1. Top-down logic: rape as a strategy of war ............... 318
      5.2.2. Bottom-across logic: rape as a tactic of war ........... 318
6. Conclusion ................................................................. 319
References ................................................................. 322

Chapter 14. Learning the hard way at the ICTY: statistical evidence of
human rights violations in an adversarial information environment
Amelia Hoover Green ....................................................... 325

1. Introduction ............................................................ 325
2. The prosecution’s analysis .............................................. 327
   2.1. Descriptive analysis ............................................... 327
   2.2. Causal analysis .................................................... 330
3. Defense challenges ...................................................... 333
   3.1. Defining “statistics” and “the scientific method” .............. 334
   3.2. “Fundamental flaws” ............................................. 336
4. The judgment ......................................................... 337
5. Lessons learned .................................................. 343
6. Conclusions ......................................................... 349
References ............................................................. 350

PART V.
FROM FIGURES TO FACTS

Chapter 15. Methodology for the criminal investigation of international crimes
Xabier Agirre Aranburu ............................................. 355

1. Introduction ......................................................... 355
2. Seize the opportunity structure ................................ 356
3. Beware of the inquisitorial temptation ....................... 358
4. Take a multi-disciplinary approach ............................. 361
5. Disregard simplistic explanations ............................... 364
6. Analysis first .......................................................... 365
7. Focus on specific and contextual elements .................. 367
8. Prioritize documentary evidence ................................. 369
9. Look at the evidence as sample ................................. 375
10. Prioritize insider and international witnesses ................ 376
11. Anticipate security needs ........................................ 379
References ............................................................. 380

Chapter 16. Closing the gap in truth finding: from the facts of the field to the judge's chambers
Martin Witteveen ..................................................... 383

1. Introduction ......................................................... 383
2. The facts ............................................................... 384
3. The investigation ................................................... 386
3.1. Time lapse .......................................................... 386
3.2. Consequences of time lapse .................................... 388
3.3. Lack of documentation .......................................... 388
4. Issues of witnesses’ memory ........................................ 389
4.1. Encoding phase .................................................... 390
4.2. Retention phase ................................................... 392
4.3. Retrieval phase .................................................... 393
5. Witnesses’ recount of the facts – unprecedented challenges in the context of international crimes ................. 395
5.1. Trauma ................................................................. 396
5.2. Quantative answers ............................................... 397

Intersentia xiii
Contents

5.3. Misunderstandings ................................................................. 398
5.4. Language challenges ............................................................ 399
  5.4.1. Rare languages ............................................................... 400
  5.4.2. Translation errors ........................................................... 400
  5.4.3. Lack of vocabulary .......................................................... 401
5.5. Cultural differences ............................................................. 402
  5.5.1. Education and personal identities ....................................... 402
  5.5.2. Behavior of witnesses ...................................................... 403
  5.5.3. Misinterpretation ........................................................... 404
  5.5.4. Witness's reluctance ....................................................... 404
  5.5.5. Oral culture and lack of sourcing ....................................... 405
6. After the witnesses the professionals take over ................................ 406
  6.1. Role of investigators ........................................................... 406
  6.2. Role of the prosecutor or trial attorney .................................... 407
  6.3. Role of the judges ............................................................... 408
  6.4. Dilemmas and possible changes ........................................... 409
7. The final stage – The judge's chambers ........................................ 411
  References ................................................................................. 411

Chapter 17. Preserving the overview of law and facts: the Case Matrix
  Morten BERGSMO, Olympia BEKOU and Annika JONES ....................... 413
  1. Introduction ........................................................................... 413
  2. Some difficulties faced in relating law to facts in core international
    crimes cases ........................................................................ 416
    2.1. Understanding the legal requirements for the prosecution of
        core international crimes ..................................................... 416
    2.2. Applying the legal requirements to large quantities of evidence ...... 419
  3. The significance of an informed, efficient and precise approach to
    the application of law to facts in core international crimes cases ....... 420
    3.1. The ability to pursue justice and the quality of the process .......... 421
    3.2. The efficiency of the criminal justice process and the fight against
        impunity ............................................................................ 422
    3.3. Promotion of the rights of the accused ................................... 423
    3.4. Summary ............................................................................ 424
  4. The Case Matrix and the facilitation of the application of law to facts . . . 425
    4.1. The Case Matrix .................................................................. 425
    4.2. The facilitation of the application of law to facts through use of
        the Case Matrix ................................................................. 428
  5. The ICC and the Case Matrix ...................................................... 429
    5.1. Adoption of the Case Matrix logic ......................................... 429
    5.2. Justifications for the approach of the Chambers ....................... 431