COLLECTIVE VIOLENCE
AND INTERNATIONAL
CRIMINAL JUSTICE

An interdisciplinary approach

Edited by

Alette Smeulers

Antwerp – Oxford – Portland
ACKNOWLEDGMENTS

This conference book is the outcome of an expert-meeting organized in June 2009 by the Amsterdam Centre of Interdisciplinary Research on International Crimes and Security (ACIC) which is based at the VU University in Amsterdam. The expert-meeting was financed by the Netherlands Science Organization (NWO) for the research project entitled 'A criminological approach to individual criminal responsibility for international crimes' in the innovational research incentive scheme and which had been granted to me in December 2005. A first expert-meeting was organized in April 2007 at Maastricht University. The conference book thereof was also published by Intersentia in this series and is entitled: Supranational criminology: towards a criminology of international crimes and was edited by Roelof Haveman and myself. This book is a follow up on the first conference book.

I wish to thank a number of people for helping to organize the conference and for their support or advice with the editing of the conference book, namely Elies van Sliedregt, Lotte Hoex, Barbora Holá, Klaas Rozemond, Nicole Lijs and Diana Turcas. I would furthermore like to thank all the contributors to the conference book for their contributions. I am also grateful to the participants of the expert-meeting who did not submit a chapter but nevertheless contributed to the discussions during the expert-meeting: Elies van Sliedregt, Leila Sadat and Larissa van den Herik. I furthermore wish to thank Stephan Parmentier and Howard Morrison who both turned out to be excellent chairs and thus greatly contributed to the success of the meeting by ensuring a continuous and lively debate.

I sincerely hope that this book will further contribute to this newly developing field of international crimes and of international criminology and that it will stimulate the academic and interdisciplinary debate on international crimes in order to enhance our knowledge and understanding of these crimes and thus ultimately contribute to preventing such crimes in the future.

Alette Smeulers
Amsterdam, June 4 2010
CONTENTS

Acknowledgements ........................................................................................................ v

INTRODUCTION

Chapter 1. Collective violence and international criminal justice – towards an interdisciplinary approach
   Alette SMEEuLERS .......................................................... 3

   1. Introduction ................................................................................................. 3
   2. A brief history of the international criminal justice system ....................... 3
   3. New areas of expertise .................................................................................. 6
   4. Outline of the book ....................................................................................... 8
   References ....................................................................................................... 13

PART I. PERPETRATORS OF INTERNATIONAL CRIMES

Chapter 2. The ordinariness of extraordinary evil: the making of perpetrators of collective violence
   James E. WALLER .................................................................................. 19

   1. Introduction ................................................................................................. 19
   2. Ordinary origins of extraordinary human evil .............................................. 22
   3. Cultural construction of worldview ............................................................... 26
   4. Psychological construction of the “other” ..................................................... 28
   5. Social construction of cruelty ...................................................................... 31
   6. Conclusion ................................................................................................... 36
   References ....................................................................................................... 37

Chapter 3. Rethinking the subjectivity of perpetrators of political violence
   Don FOSTER .................................................................................. 39

   1. Introduction ................................................................................................. 39
   2. Dominant accounts of perpetrators .............................................................. 40
   3. Criticism of the dominant accounts .............................................................. 42
   4. An alternative approach ............................................................................... 44

Intersentia vii
Chapter 6. Seizing the “Grotian Moment”: application of joint criminal enterprise liability to the proceedings of the Cambodia genocide tribunal
Michael P. Scharf .......................................................... 131

1. Introduction ............................................................ 131
2. Did the Nuremberg precedent establish JCE as customary international law? .......................................................... 134
   2.1. Application of JCE at Nuremberg .................................. 134
   2.2. Nuremberg as a “Grotian Moment” .................................. 143
   2.3. The Concept of “Grotian Moment” .................................. 146
3. Conclusion ............................................................. 148
References .................................................................. 151

Chapter 7. Criminologically explained reality of genocide, structure of the offence and the ‘intent to destroy’ requirement
Kai Ambos ............................................................... 153

1. Introduction ............................................................ 153
2. Typologies in criminology .................................................. 154
3. The significance of the criminological typology of perpetrators for the offence of genocide .................................................. 159
4. Correspondence of categories of international criminal law with criminological typologies of perpetrators .................................................. 163
   4.1. Regarding top-level perpetrators “intent to destroy” means knowledge and purpose .................................................. 166
   4.2. As to mid-level perpetrators the knowledge-based approach is applicable .................................................. 166
   4.3. Regarding the low-level perpetrators it is necessary to distinguish between state agents and private actors. While the former are normally informed about the genocidal (state) plan, the latter are not .................................................. 168
5. Conclusion: the structure of the genocide offence in light of the criminological findings .................................................. 170
References .................................................................. 171

Chapter 8. ICTY and the culpability of different types of perpetrators of international crimes
Alette Smeulers and Barbora Holá ...................................... 175

1. Introduction ............................................................ 175
2. Culpability of different types of perpetrators .............................. 179
   2.1. Highest level of blameworthiness: criminal masterminds .......... 180
   2.2. High level of blameworthiness: careerists and fanatics ............ 181

Intersentia ix
## Contents

2.3. Medium level of blameworthiness: devoted warriors .......................... 183
2.4. Low level of blameworthiness: “criminals and sadists” and the otherwise law abiding citizens .......................... 185
2.5. Lowest level of blameworthiness: compromised perpetrator ........ 188
3. ICTY sentencing case law ......................................................... 188
4. Empirical findings ................................................................. 190
   4.1. Methodology ................................................................. 190
      4.1.1. Data Collection .......................................................... 190
      4.1.2. Method ................................................................. 193
   4.2. Results ................................................................. 194
   4.3. Discussion ................................................................. 200
5. Conclusions ........................................................................ 203

References ............................................................................. 204

Chapter 9. Child soldiers: agency, enlistment, and the collectivization of innocence
Mark A. DRUMBL ................................................................. 207

1. Introduction ................................................................. 207
2. Criminally punishing adults for the conscription, enlistment, or use of child soldiers in hostilities ...................... 210
   2.1. Special Court for Sierra Leone ............................................ 210
   2.2. International Criminal Court ........................................... 213
   2.3. The agency of child soldiers: assumptions, narratives, and strategies ......................................................... 215
2.4. Conclusion ................................................................. 218
3. How do children end up in fighting forces? ......................... 218
   3.1. Forced conscription .......................................................... 219
   3.2. Voluntary enlistment ......................................................... 222
   3.3. Summary ................................................................. 226
4. Conclusion ........................................................................ 227
References ............................................................................. 229

PART III.
REFLECTIONS ON INTERNATIONAL CRIMINAL JUSTICE AND THE ICC

Chapter 10. The rough edges of the delicate mosaic: complexity theory and the early practice of the International Criminal Court
Salim A. NAKHJAVANI ............................................................. 235

1. Introduction ................................................................. 235
2. Some characteristics of complex adaptive systems ................................. 237
3. Lens, metaphor, analogy, model … or nothing at all? 239
4. Seeking complexity in international criminal justice 243
   4.1. The entry-into-force of the Rome Statute sets in motion a nonlinear, dynamic system 243
   4.2. Outcomes of decisions of the Court may be sensitively dependent on initial conditions and path-dependent 245
   4.3. The Rome Statute may co-evolve with ‘neighboring’ treaties 246
5. Novel insights or repackaged goods? 250
References 251

Chapter 11. The law and politics of self-referrals
Sarah Nouwen and Wouter Werner 255

1. Introduction 255
2. Self-referrals and complementarity 257
   2.1. Inaction as a ground for admissibility 260
   2.2. Narrowing down the definition of a ‘case’ 264
   2.3. Broadening the concept of unwillingness 265
   2.4. Conclusion: legal aspects of self-referrals 267
3. The politics of self-referrals 267
   3.1. ICC politics 267
   3.2. National politics 268
   3.3. Conclusion: politics of self-referrals 269
References 270

PART IV.
FROM FACTS TO FIGURES

Chapter 12. On research methods for international crimes – methodological issues in the empirical study of international crimes
Catrien Bijleveld 275

1. Introduction 275
2. Criminological areas of study 276
3. Methodological backdrop to social science research 278
   3.1. Working with samples 278
   3.2. Causality 280
   3.3. The role of assumptions 282
4. Research on international crimes 283
   4.1. Studying prevalence 283
   4.2. Etiology 288
   4.3. (Legal) reaction 291
   4.4. Victim studies 292

Intersentia xi
4. The judgment .................................................... 337
5. Lessons learned ............................................. 343
6. Conclusions ..................................................... 349
References ....................................................... 350

PART V.
FROM FIGURES TO FACTS

Chapter 15. Methodology for the criminal investigation of international crimes
Xabier Agirre Aranburu ........................................... 355
1. Introduction ..................................................... 355
2. Seize the opportunity structure ................................. 356
3. Beware of the inquisitorial temptation .......................... 358
4. Take a multi-disciplinary approach .............................. 361
5. Disregard simplistic explanations ............................... 364
6. Analysis first ....................................................... 365
7. Focus on specific and contextual elements ..................... 367
8. Prioritize documentary evidence ................................. 369
9. Look at the evidence as sample ................................. 375
10. Prioritize insider and international witnesses ................ 376
11. Anticipate security needs .................................... 379
References ....................................................... 380

Chapter 16. Closing the gap in truth finding: from the facts of the field to the judge's chambers
Martin Witteveen .................................................. 383
1. Introduction ..................................................... 383
2. The facts ......................................................... 384
3. The investigation ............................................... 386
3.1. Time lapse ..................................................... 386
3.2. Consequences of time lapse .................................. 388
3.3. Lack of documentation ...................................... 388
4. Issues of witnesses' memory ..................................... 389
4.1. Encoding phase ............................................... 390
4.2. Retention phase .............................................. 392
4.3. Retrieval phase ............................................... 393
5. Witnesses' recount of the facts – unprecedented challenges in the context of international crimes ....................... 395
5.1. Trauma ......................................................... 396
5.2. Quantative answers .......................................... 397