VICTIMOLOGICAL APPROACHES TO INTERNATIONAL CRIMES: AFRICA

Edited by

Rianne Letschert
Roelof Haveman
Anne-Marie de Brouwer
Antony Pemberton

intersentia
Cambridge – Antwerp – Portland
WORDS OF APPRECIATION

We would like to express some special words of appreciation. First, we wish to thank the director of TAI/GLR, Alphonse Muleefu, who was instrumental in organising the conference and inviting local stakeholders from Rwanda and other African countries. Secondly, we thank Tim van den Meijdenberg, student assistant at the department of Criminal Law of Tilburg Law School, who was responsible for compiling the bibliography list. Finally, a special word of thank you goes to Tilburg Law School, whose ambition to encourage international and interdisciplinary projects and facilitate networking seminars enabled us to pursue this project by covering for the expenses made.
CONTENTS

Words of Appreciation ............................................................... v

Introduction: Victimological Approaches to International Crimes .......... 1

PART I
VICTIMS OF INTERNATIONAL CRIMES

I. Genocide, Crimes against Humanity and War Crimes.
A Victimological Perspective on International Criminal Justice
Marc S. Groenhuijsen and Antony Pemberton ............................. 9

1. Introduction ................................................................. 9
2. Special features of genocide, war crimes and crimes against humanity . 11
3. Victims of crime committed or condoned by the State ............... 13
   3.1. The culture of impunity as the ultimate perversion of the rule
       of law ........................................................................ 13
   3.2. Reinstating the rule of law: backward and forward looking aspects . 14
   3.3. Reacting to atrocities: Adapting criminal justice ................. 15
   3.4. Some unresolved questions in International Criminal Justice ...... 16
   3.5. A rupture between backward and forward-looking functions
       of ICJ ........................................................................ 17
   3.6. Basic premises of a victimological perspective ..................... 19
   3.7. Consequences of state crime for a victimological perspective .... 20
4. Large numbers of victims .................................................. 22
   4.1. The presumption of victimhood ..................................... 23
   4.2. Procedural rights ...................................................... 24
   4.3. Reparation ............................................................... 25
   4.4. Notions from a victimological perspective ....................... 26
5. Victims are perceived as enemies and as perpetrators ............ 28
   5.1. The social death of victims ........................................ 28
   5.2. The characteristics of perpetration of genocide and a
        victimological perspective ....................................... 30
6. A victimological framework for reviewing international criminal
   justice ................................................................. 32
## Contents

### II. The Victimological Concern as the Driving Force in the Quest for Justice for State-Sponsored International Crimes
   Athanasios CHOUiliaras ................................................. 35

1. Introduction ......................................................... 35
2. Constructing the victim ......................................... 37
   2.1. From positivist to critical victimology and to sociology of harm . . . 37
   2.2. The victims of state: Delimitation through the concept of state crimes ................................................................. 42
   2.3. A qualitative analysis of state crime victimization ...................... 44
   2.4. Recognition of state-sponsored crime victims at international level ................................................................. 50
3. Dealing with state-sponsored crimes and addressing the plight of its victims ......................................................... 52
   3.1. Contextualisation and policy considerations .......................... 53
   3.2. (International) criminal trials ....................................... 54
   3.3. Non-criminal justice strategies: The case of truth and reconciliation commissions as restorative justice mechanisms ....... 59
4. A tentative conclusion: Pluralising justice as victims' need, victimized societies' demand and (international) law's wager ............ 63

### III. Eroding the Myth of Pure Evil. When Victims become Perpetrators and Perpetrators Victims
   Alette SMEULERS ...................................................... 65

1. Introduction .......................................................... 65
2. The role of past victimhood in genocidal and other violent ideologies ... 66
3. Committing crimes while asserting the right to self defence .......... 68
4. Enforced compliance and cooperation ................................ 69
5. Case studies .......................................................... 71
   5.1. The role of the Jews in the Holocaust ................................ 72
   5.2. The South African askaris .......................................... 75
   5.3. Child soldiers ....................................................... 79
   5.4. Parallels and differences .......................................... 82
6. The aftermath ........................................................ 84
7. Conclusion ............................................................ 86

### IV. Victims of the Genocide against the Tutsi in Rwanda
   Etienne RUYEBANA ..................................................... 89

1. Historical background of the genocide against the Tutsi ............ 89
2. The perpetrators and victims of the Rwandan genocide ............... 93
   2.1. The perpetrators of the genocide and their techniques/means ... 93
2.2. Victims during the genocide ........................................... 97
3. The consequences and needs of victims post-genocide ................. 107
  3.1. Disabilities and incurable diseases .................................. 107
  3.2. Widows and widowers ...................................................... 109
  3.3. Plight of children ............................................................. 110
  3.4. Trauma .......................................................................... 114
4. Conclusion ........................................................................... 115

V. Primary and Secondary Victims andVictimization during Protracted Conflict.
National Trauma through Literary Lens in Jerusalem and Kigali
Edna Erez and Tikva Meroz-Aharoni ........................................ 117

1. Introduction ........................................................................ 117
2. Between Kigali and Jerusalem .............................................. 118
3. Secondary victimization and victims – A conceptual framework .... 120
4. Literature as constitutive and expressive of secondary victimization .. 122
5. Secondary victimization, tertiary victims ................................. 124
  5.1. Literary work written by Israeli authors during periods of mass victimization ....................................................... 124
  5.2. Historical background: Arab-Jewish/Israeli relations in the lens of literature .............................................................. 129
  5.3. Comparison of literary works written before and after the second Intifada ............................................................... 130
  5.4. The Rwandan literary presentation of personal and national trauma ................................................................. 134
6. Summary and conclusion ...................................................... 139

PART II
REPARATIVE JUSTICE

VI. Victims’ Need for Justice.
Individual versus Collective Justice
Jo-Anne Wemmers ............................................................... 145

1. Introduction ........................................................................ 145
2. Justice at the level of the individual ....................................... 145
  2.1. Procedural and interactional justice .................................... 146
  2.2. Distributive justice .............................................................. 147
3. Justice at the level of the group ............................................. 148
  3.1. Procedural justice ............................................................... 149
  3.2. Distributive justice .............................................................. 150
4. Concluding remarks ............................................................ 152
VII. Providing Reparation in Situations of Mass Victimization.
   Key Challenges Involved
   Rianne Letschert and Theo van Boven ........................................ 153

1. Setting a trend towards reparative justice ..................................... 153
2. Outline chapter ................................................................. 156
3. Parameters of reparative justice .................................................. 156
   3.1. Right to know, right to justice, right to reparation .................... 157
   3.2. Reparation-as-right, as-symbol, as-process ............................ 160
4. First challenge – Conceptualization of victimhood ........................... 161
5. Second challenge – Individual versus collective reparations ............... 165
   5.1. Individual (legal) approach to reparations ............................. 166
   5.2. Collective reparation; latitudes and limits .............................. 169
   5.3. Collective reparation; affirmation and assertion ....................... 170
6. Third challenge – Linking reparative justice to development aid ........... 173
   6.1. Human security and reparative justice .................................. 173
   6.2. Linking reparative justice and development goals ..................... 177
7. Victims’ perspectives on reparations ............................................ 178
8. Concluding remarks .............................................................. 181

VIII. Reparations for Victims of Massive Crimes.
     Making Concrete a Message of Inclusion
     Cristian Correa ............................................................ 185

1. Introduction ................................................................. 185
2. Aims of a reparations program for massive crimes ........................... 187
3. The coherence of the message of acknowledgment and inclusion ............ 191
4. Elements of a reparations program ............................................ 194
   4.1. Guaranteeing income .................................................... 196
   4.2. Providing health care and psychosocial support ....................... 202
   4.3. Guaranteeing access to education ..................................... 205
   4.4. Housing and other forms of support .................................. 208
   4.5. Collective reparations .................................................. 208
5. Financing reparations .......................................................... 210
6. Implementing reparations ....................................................... 215
   6.1. Defining victims and beneficiaries ..................................... 216
   6.2. Transforming recommendations into law ................................ 219
   6.3. Defining and establishing implementing institutions ................. 221
   6.4. Registering victims ..................................................... 223
   6.5. Providing services and goods .......................................... 228
   6.6. Victims’ participation and communication efforts ..................... 229
7. Conclusions ................................................................. 230
IX. Massive Trauma and the Healing Role of Reparative Justice  
Yael DANIELI ................................................................. 235

1. Introduction .......................................................... 235
2. Conspiracy of silence ........................................... 236
3. The need for a multidimensional, multidisciplinary integrative framework ........................................... 238
4. Post-traumatic stress disorder (PTSD) and other diagnostic conditions ............................................... 240
5. Survivor’s shame and guilt ...................................... 242
6. The healing process ................................................ 244
7. Necessary elements of healing (summary) ............... 245
8. Impunity – A societal instance of the conspiracy of silence ......................................................... 247
9. The reparative aspects of victims’ participation in the justice process ................................................. 249
   9.1. (Missed) opportunities and further victimisation ................................................................. 250
   9.2. Remote, exclusionary, and partial justice: Justice for the world vs. justice for victims .................. 251
   9.3. Being treated with dignity and respect ......................... 254
   9.4. Being afforded support, assistance and protection ....................................................... 257
10. Conclusion ............................................................. 259

PART III  
AMNESTY, TRUTH, RECONCILIATION AND TRADITION

X. Drawing the Line: Amnesty, Truth Commissions and Collective Denial  
Frank HALDEMMANN .................................................. 265

1. Introduction .......................................................... 265
2. Blocking out the past .............................................. 267
3. Collective denial as misrecognition ............................. 270
4. Vocabularies of recognition ...................................... 272
   4.1. Interpersonal recognition .................................. 273
   4.2. Collective recognition ......................................... 276
5. South Africa’s search for truth and reconciliation .......... 278
6. Truth, amnesty and denial ........................................ 282
7. Concluding remarks ............................................... 286
XI. Should We Ever Say Never?
Arguments against Granting Amnesty Tested
Joris van Wijk ................................................................. 289

1. Introduction ............................................................... 289
2. Arguments against granting amnesty .... 291
   2.1. Dogmatic arguments .............................................. 292
       2.1.1. International community's moral obligation .......... 292
       2.1.2. Victims' rights .............................................. 293
   2.2. Pragmatic arguments ............................................ 293
       2.2.1. Granting amnesty leads to impunity .................... 294
       2.2.2. Granting amnesty creates a culture of impunity .... 294
       2.2.3. Granting amnesty does not take the victims' wishes into account ............................................ 296
       2.2.4. Granting amnesty increases victim traumatisation .... 296
       2.2.5. Granting amnesty leads to vigilante justice by the victims . 297
       2.2.6. Granting amnesty hinders truth-seeking .............. 298
       2.2.7. Granting amnesty obstructs (sustainable/lasting) peace ........ 300
3. The effects of amnesties in Mozambique, Angola and Uganda ........ 300
   3.1. Three countries .................................................... 302
       3.1.1. Mozambique ................................................... 302
       3.1.2. Angola .......................................................... 303
       3.1.3. Uganda .......................................................... 305
   3.2. Pragmatic arguments reinterpreted ............................ 306
       3.2.1. Does granting amnesty create a culture of impunity? ... 306
       3.2.2. Does granting amnesty not take victims' wishes into account? ................................................. 308
       3.2.3. Does granting amnesty increase the risk of victim traumatisation? ............................................ 309
       3.2.4. Does granting amnesty lead to vigilante justice by victims? . 309
       3.2.5. Does granting amnesty hinder truth seeking? ........... 311
       3.2.6. Does granting amnesty obstruct (sustainable/lasting) peace? .................................................... 311
4. Conclusion ............................................................... 313

XII. The South African Truth and Reconciliation Commission.
Challenges in Contributing to Reconciliation
Robert Peacock ............................................................ 315

1. Introduction ........................................................... 315
2. Brief overview of Apartheid ......................................... 315
3. Legislative framework and nature of the South African Truth and Reconciliation Commission ............................................ 318
Contents

4.2. Restorative justice ...................................................... 365
4.3. In country research .................................................. 365
4.4. Concluding on victims’ rights and needs .................... 367
5. Victims in the three countries ................................. 368
  5.1. Sierra Leone: Formal justice and non-official use of tradition ... 369
  5.2. Rwanda: Formal justice and official hybridization of tradition ... 371
  5.3. Uganda: Official complementarity ............................ 377
6. Preliminary assessment ............................................. 380
7. Conclusion ............................................................... 384

XV. Prosecution of Genocidal Rape and Sexual Torture before the Gacaca Tribunals in Rwanda
    Usta Kaitesi and Roelof Haveman ................................. 385
  1. Introduction ......................................................... 385
  2. Sexual violence during the genocide ........................ 386
  3. Gacaca ................................................................. 387
     3.1. Genocide and crimes against humanity ................ 388
     3.2. The procedure ............................................... 390
     3.3. Hearing and judgement ................................... 392
     3.4. Participative lay justice ................................. 393
  4. Specific rules regarding rape and sexual torture .......... 395
  5. Training the Inyangamugayo ................................. 398
     5.1. Background to the training .............................. 398
     5.2. Harmonising the training manual ...................... 400
     5.3. The training ............................................... 402
     5.4. Sharing experiences: Breaking the ice ................ 404
  6. Epilogue ............................................................. 406

XVI. The Role of Civil Society in Addressing Problems Faced by Victims in Post-Genocide Rwanda
    Alphonse Muleefu .................................................... 411
  1. Introduction ......................................................... 411
  2. Some civil society organisations ............................ 414
  3. Civil society interventional role .............................. 418
     3.1. Housing, poverty and education ....................... 419
     3.2. Health conditions .......................................... 424
     3.3. Prosecution of perpetrators ............................ 427
     3.4. Reparation .................................................... 429
     3.5. Protection of victims and witnesses .................. 432
     3.6. Raising awareness on victim’s rights .................. 433
4. Challenges in addressing problems of victims .......................... 434
5. Conclusion ............................................................................. 435

PART IV
INTERNATIONAL AND NATIONAL LEGAL AND POLICY APPROACHES

XVII. Universal Justice? ................................................................. 439
The Practice and Politics of Universal Jurisdiction Cases Relating to
Crimes Committed in Africa
Carla Ferstman and Jürgen Schurr ................................................. 439

1. Introduction ............................................................................. 439
2. The challenges associated with the exercise of universal jurisdiction . . 441
3. The practice of universal jurisdiction ......................................... 442
4. Extraterritorial jurisdiction cases relating to Africa ..................... 444
   4.1. A review of key territorial prosecutions in Africa ................. 445
   4.2. A review of key universal jurisdiction cases regarding crimes
        allegedly committed in African States ............................... 447
      4.2.1. Genocide cases relating to Rwanda .............................. 447
      4.2.2. Senegal and the Hissène Habré case ......................... 450
      4.2.3. Liberia and the case of Chuckie Taylor in the United States . 451
      4.2.4. Congo Brazzaville and the ‘Disappeared of the Beach’
            case in France ......................................................... 451
      4.2.5. Mauritania and the Ely Ould Dah case in France ............. 452
      4.2.6. Tunisia and the case of Khaled Ben Said in France .......... 453
      4.2.7. Rwanda and the RPF cases in France and Spain ........... 453
4.5. The politics of universal jurisdiction ...................................... 456
6. Prospects and trends of universal jurisdiction ............................ 459
7. Conclusion ............................................................................. 460

XVIII. Survivors of the Rwandan Genocide under Domestic and
International Legal Procedures
Felix Ndahinda .......................................................... 463

1. Introduction ............................................................................. 463
2. Living after death: The realities of survivors after the genocide ....... 464
   2.1. Living in the aftermath of the genocide ............................. 464
   2.2. Negotiating post-genocide social harmony: Justice and
        sacrifices .................................................................... 465
   2.3. The voice of survivors in the aftermath of the 1994 genocide ... 467
3. Legal procedures in Rwanda and the position of genocide survivors .... 468
   3.1. Post-1994 judicial landscape .......................................... 468
XX. Survivors of Sexual Violence in Conflict. Challenges in Prevention and International Criminal Prosecution
Sandra Ka Hon Chu, Anne-Marie de Brouwer and Renée Römkens ........................................... 527

1. Introduction ................................................................. 529
2. Sexual violence in times of conflict and peace: Prevalence, nature, societal attitudes and impact ................................................. 530
   2.1. Prevalence and nature of sexual violence in times of conflict .... 530
   2.2. Sexual violence in 'peace time': Prevalence and gendered attitudes ................................................................. 532
   2.3. Silencing of survivors of sexual violence: The double assault .... 535
   2.4. Impact of mass sexual violence ........................................ 537
      2.4.1. Physical and mental health problems ............................... 537
      2.4.2. Social isolation, stigma and ongoing victimization ............. 538
      2.4.3. Poverty and economic damage ........................................ 539
   2.5. Needs of survivors of mass sexual violence ........................... 539
      2.5.1. Physical and mental health support ................................... 540
      2.5.2. Physical security ........................................................ 541
      2.5.3. Financial support and compensation ................................ 542
      2.5.4. Justice and the need for recognition and validation ............ 543
3. Responses of the international community: Potential and limits of preventive policies and criminal prosecution .......................... 544
   3.1. International responses: Prevention ..................................... 544
   3.2. International responses: Prosecution .................................... 549
      3.2.1. Victim participation and reparation .................................. 550
      3.2.2. Protective and support measures ...................................... 554
      3.2.3. Gender balance and expertise as structural characteristics of the institution ......................................................... 555
      3.2.4. Charges of sexual violence .............................................. 556
4. Final remarks: One size does not fit all .................................... 558

XXI. Victims of Sexual Violence in the International Criminal Court. Challenges Related to Legal Representation and Protection
Gabbi Mesters and Adesola Adeboyejo ........................................ 561

1. General introduction ....................................................... 561
2. Gender-based crimes: Definition and charges ............................ 563
   2.1. Introduction ............................................................... 563
   2.2. Charges for gender-based crimes in the cases before the ICC ...... 565
      2.2.1. Prosecutor v. Lubanga .................................................. 565
      2.2.2. Prosecutor v. Katanga et al. .......................................... 569
      2.2.3. Prosecutor v. Mbarushimana ........................................ 570

Intersentia xvii
PART V
VICTIMOLOGICAL APPROACHES TO INTERNATIONAL CRIMES

XXIII. Victimological Approaches Applied to International Crimes.
Concluding Remarks .................................................. 621
Rianne Letschert, Roelof Haveman, Anne-Marie de Brouwer
and Antony Pemberton ............................................. 621

1. Introduction .................................................. 621
2. International crimes: The ultimate perversion of the rule of law .... 624
3. Mass victimization and ‘the social death of victims’ .................... 625
4. Reparative justice ............................................. 627
5. Individual versus group perspective ................................ 629
6. The ICC and the ICTR ......................................... 631
  6.1. Victims of sexual violence .................................. 633
  6.2. Child victims ............................................. 635
7. National procedures ............................................. 637
  7.1. Universal jurisdiction ....................................... 637
  7.2. Territorial jurisdiction ...................................... 638
8. Preventive measures ............................................. 639
9. Truth, reconciliation, amnesty and tradition ............................ 640
10. Final remarks: Central features of a victimological perspective on
    international crimes ........................................... 645

The Authors .......................................................... 647
Bibliography .......................................................... 657