CORRUPTION & HUMAN RIGHTS: INTERDISCIPLINARY PERSPECTIVES

Edited by
Martine Boersma
Hans Neelen

intersentia
Antwerp – Cambridge – Portland
ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

The present volume is the result of the conference ‘Corruption & Human Rights’, organised by the Maastricht Centre for Human Rights on October 22–23, 2009. The editors are indebted to Maastricht University’s Faculty of Law; the Research and Documentation Centre of the Ministry of Justice (WODC); and the Scientific Bureau of the Public Prosecution Service (WBOM) for their financial support for this event. Moreover, the editors wish to thank the other members of the organisational committee, i.e. Fons Coomans, Paul Frielink, Roland Moerland and David Roef, and gratefully acknowledge the continuous efforts of Chantal Kuypers, administrator of the Centre. Finally, all speakers and participants to the conference are thanked for their input.
CONTENTS

Acknowledgements ........................................................................................................... v

Chapter I. General Introduction
   MARTINE BOERSMA and HANS NELEN ......................................................... 1

1. The Problem of Corruption ................................................................. 1
2. Programme of the Conference ‘Corruption & Human Rights’ ............ 2
   2.1. Introduction .................................................................................. 2
   2.2. Keynote Lectures ......................................................................... 2
   2.3. Interdisciplinary Workshops ......................................................... 3
3. Contributions to the Present Volume .............................................. 3

Chapter II. Adopting a Human Rights Approach Towards Combating Corruption
   JOHN HATCHARD .................................................................................. 7

1. Is Corruption a Human Rights Issue? ......................................... 7
   1.1. Definitional Issues ...................................................................... 7
   1.2. Corruption and Human Rights: Some Examples From UNCAC .... 9
      1.2.1. Political Rights .................................................................... 10
      1.2.2. Right to a Fair Trial ............................................................. 11
2. Why Do Existing Anti-Corruption Techniques Require Additional Support? ................................................................. 14
   3.1. Enforcing Constitutional Rights .................................................. 17
   3.2. Utilising National Human Rights Institutions .............................. 19
   3.3. Investigative and Remedial Powers ............................................. 20
4. Some Conclusions ............................................................................... 22

Chapter III. Corruption and Human Rights: Making the Connection
   MAGDALENA SEPÚLVEDA CARMONA and JULIO BACIO-TERRACINO .... 25

1. Introduction ...................................................................................... 25
2. Determining When Human Rights are Violated .......................... 26
   2.1. Three Levels of State Obligations .............................................. 27
   2.2. The Causal Link ......................................................................... 29

Intersentia vii
2.4.4. Abuse of Functions ............................................. 61
2.4.5. Illicit Enrichment ............................................. 61
3. Corruption as a Violation of the ICESCR: Article 2(1) ............... 62
  3.1. Content .................................................................. 62
  3.2. International Human Rights Practice .............................. 66
    3.2.1. Committee on Economic, Social and Cultural Rights .... 66
    3.2.2. Committee on the Rights of the Child ..................... 68
    3.2.3. Former Special Rapporteur on Corruption ............... 69
    3.2.4. Findings .......................................................... 71
  3.3. Taking the Issue Further ........................................... 72
4. Corruption as a Violation of the Right to Education: Article 13 ICESCR .... 74
  4.1. The Right to Education ............................................. 74
    4.1.1. Legal Bases ...................................................... 74
    4.1.2. Normative Content ............................................ 76
    4.1.3. State Obligations ............................................. 77
    4.1.4. Violations ....................................................... 79
  4.2. International Human Rights Practice .............................. 80
    4.2.1. Committee on the Rights of the Child ..................... 80
    4.2.2. Special Rapporteur on the Right to Education ........... 81
    4.2.3. Findings .......................................................... 84
  4.3. Taking the Issue Further ........................................... 84
5. Conclusions and Recommendations .......................................... 87

Chapter V. Health Sector Corruption and Human Rights: A Case Study
  Brigit Toebes ............................................................. 91

  1. The Case Study: Health Sector Corruption in ’Painland’ ............. 91
  2. Introduction: Linking the Case Study with the Analysis in this Chapter ... 94
  3. Why are Health Systems so Prone to Corruption? ..................... 96
  4. Does It Matter How a Health System is Financed and Organised? .... 97
  5. How Do We Define Corruption? ..................................... 99
  6. International Anti-Corruption Legislation ............................ 100
  7. The International Human Rights Framework .......................... 102
  8. Who are the Responsible Actors? ..................................... 104
  9. The State and All Its Agents .......................................... 105
    9.1. The Policy Dimension: From ’AAAQ’ to ’AAAQAP’ ........... 105
    9.2. The Legal Dimension: Obligations to Respect, Protect and Fulfil .... 110
  10. Non-State Actors: Focus on Hospitals and Health Workers .......... 115
  11. The Human Rights Violations in the Case Study ...................... 119
  12. Conclusions .......................................................... 121
## Chapter VI. Post-Hurricane Katrina and Human Rights Violations in New Orleans, Louisiana

**Patrick D. Walsh †, William E. Thornton and Lydia Voigt** .. 125

1. Introduction ........................................... 125  
2. Corruption and Human Rights .................................. 127  
3. Research Related to Disasters and Corruption Facilitation ....... 129  
4. The Katrina Disaster and Human Rights Violations .................. 131  
5. The Katrina Disaster and Corruption and Human Rights Violations in New Orleans .................. 133  
   5.1. Katrina Fraud .................................. 134  
   5.2. FEMA Trailer and Toxic Fume Debacle .................. 137  
   5.3. Housing Authority of New Orleans .................. 138  
   5.4. Police Corruption ............................... 140  
   5.5. Facilitation of Wage Thefts from Immigrant Migrant Workers and Government Facilitation of Human Rights Violations of Migrant Workers .................. 143  
6. The Cost of Corruption and Concluding Comment .................. 149

## Chapter VII. Corruption and Gender Equality: A Human Rights Concern?

**Dorothée de Nève and Tina Olteanu** .................. 153

1. Introduction: Gender and Corruption .................. 153  
2. Perceptions of Corruption ............................... 158  
3. Causes of Corruption .................................. 160  
   3.1. Criminal Attitudes .................................. 161  
   3.2. Power and Corruption ............................... 164  
   3.3. Old Boys’ Networks ............................... 171  
4. Conclusion ........................................... 173

## Chapter VIII. International Financial Institutions, Corruption and Human Rights Violations

**Dawn L. Rothe** .................. 177

1. Introduction ........................................... 177  
2. Crimes of Globalization .................................. 179  
3. International Financial Institutions .................. 181  
4. Cases of Complicity, Facilitation, Corruption and IFI Policies .................. 183  
5. Motivating Factors and Situational Opportunities .................. 190  
6. Concluding Thoughts .................................. 194
Chapter IX. Corruption and Human Rights in Police Work:
One of a Kind?

EMILE KOLTHOFF ................................................................. 197

1. Introduction ................................................................. 197
2. Corruption and Integrity ............................................... 198
3. Integrity ................................................................. 199
4. Integrity Policy for Public Administration in The Netherlands .... 204
5. Police Corruption .......................................................... 207
6. Police Corruption and Integrity Violations in The Netherlands ... 208
7. The Connection Between Corruption and Human Rights .......... 210
9. Conclusion ................................................................. 217

Chapter X. Linking Corruption and Human Rights: An Unwelcome
Addition to the Development Discourse

MORAG GOODWIN and KATE ROSE-SENDER ................................. 221

1. Introduction ................................................................. 221
2. The Rise of Anti-Corruptionism ............................................ 223
3. The Cost of Anti-Corruptionism ............................................ 227
4. But is It Human Rights? Linking Human Rights and Corruption ... 229
5. It's Politics, Stupid .......................................................... 235
6. Conclusion ................................................................. 239

Chapter XI. Corruption and Human Rights: An Afterword

DAVID NELKEN ................................................................. 241

1. How are Corruption and Human Rights Linked? ..................... 242
   1.1. ‘Making’ a Connection ............................................... 242
   1.2. Only Connect? ...................................................... 246
   2.1. Fighting and Re-Framing ............................................ 251
   2.2. But Will It Work? (And Should It?) ............................. 258

About the Authors ............................................................. 263