

Scattered Families
Transnational Family Life of Afghan Refugees
in the Netherlands in the Light of the Human
Rights-Based Protection of the Family

SCHOOL OF HUMAN RIGHTS RESEARCH SERIES, Volume 39.

The titles published in this series are listed at the end of this volume.

Scattered Families
Transnational Family Life of Afghan Refugees
in the Netherlands in the Light of the Human
Rights-Based Protection of the Family

Paulien Muller



Antwerp – Oxford – Portland

The research for this publication was made possible by grants from the Nederlandse Organisatie voor Wetenschappelijk Onderzoek (NWO) and the Wiarda Institute for Legal Research of the Utrecht University.

This book has been defended at Utrecht University on 23 October 2009.

Paulien Muller

Scattered Families. Transnational Family Life of Afghan Refugees in the Netherlands in the Light of the Human Rights-Based Protection of the Family

Cover: Cathy Leijds

Typesetting: G.J. Wiarda Institute for Legal Research, Boothstraat 6, 3512 BW Utrecht

ISBN 978-94-000-0021-6

D/2010/7849/50

NUR 828

© 2010 Intersentia

www.intersentia.com

Behoudens uitzondering door de wet gesteld, mag zonder schriftelijke toestemming van de rechthebbende(n) op het auteursrecht c.q. de uitgevers van deze uitgave, door de rechthebbende(n) gemachtigd namens hem (hen) op te treden, niets uit deze uitgave worden verveelvoudigd en/of openbaar gemaakt door middel van druk, fotocopie, microfilm of anderszins, hetgeen ook van toepassing is op de gehele of gedeeltelijke bewerking. De uitgevers zijn met uitsluiting van ieder ander onherroepelijk door de auteur gemachtigd de door derden verschuldigde vergoedingen van kopiëren, als bedoeld in artikel 17 lid 2 der Auteurswet 1912 en in het KB van 20-6-'64 (Stb. 351) ex artikel 16b der Auteurswet 1912, te doen innen door (en overeenkomstig de reglementen van) de Stichting Reprorecht te Amsterdam.

Niets uit deze uitgave mag worden verveelvoudigd en/of openbaar gemaakt door middel van druk, fotocopie, microfilm of op welke andere wijze ook, zonder voorafgaande schriftelijke toestemming van de uitgevers.

No part of this book may be reproduced in any form, by print, photo copy, microfilm or any other means, without written permission from the publishers.

*Beshnaw az nai (Listen to the nai)*¹

*Listen to the nai that complains about the separation:
'I have been cut off from the reed bed and humans
complain about my sound
The one who is cut off from his roots
seeks throughout his life to recover them.'*

Author: Mawlânâ Djalâl Od-Dîn Balkhi

Composer: Fazel Ahmad Naynawâz

Sung by the famous Afghan singer Mahwash on the CD Radio Kaboul (2003)

1 Nai: this word means both reed and flute.

ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

Shortly after the birth of my second son I started writing this preface. While I wrote down the first lines, my partner was taking care of our little one while his parents looked after the eldest during the weekend. Besides making a start with the thesis again, I was occupied with organizing the yearly reunion of my paternal family members, 23 persons in total, including my aunts and uncles, my cousins and their children. I was particularly looking forward to welcoming my aunt and uncle from the United States who would be present this time. This family gathering formed a nice opportunity to introduce our newborn to the people that were at the basis of my life, simply because they had been there from the start; in person, through long-distance communication, or in the stories that I heard. And once again I was aware of the pervasiveness and importance of family ties in my own life.

Unsurprisingly, the first contacts that I had as a child with refugees in the Netherlands were also through family members: through my mother who taught the Dutch language to newcomers in the Netherlands and through my father whose organization offered assistance to asylum seekers. I sometimes accompanied my parents to noisy and strangely smelling boarding houses and asylum seekers' centres where we were received hospitably in cramped rooms. A recurring ritual during these visits was being shown pictures of family members in far-away countries by people who often radiated an immense loneliness. These contacts, followed by study and research experiences on migration and refugee issues, have prevented me from taking family life for granted, and have finally resulted in this study on scattered refugee families.

There is almost nothing more private than talking about one's own family life, yet this is what I asked my respondents to do. My first and deep thanks go to the Afghan refugees who not only received me in their homes with generous hospitality but also shared part of their life stories with me. The resilience that many of these stories reflected never ceased to impress me.

I conducted my study at the Netherlands Institute of Human Rights (SIM) of the Utrecht University. There I got the academic space to explore what I believe to be an important topic and to do it my own way, taking a social science and bottom up perspective. It was challenging, and at times lonely, to take a rather different approach from most of my direct colleagues, but this process also made me much more aware of my own academic interests, weaknesses and strengths. I want to thank my successive directors Professor Cees Flinterman and Professor Jenny Goldschmidt for giving me the opportunity to do this research and for their support at difficult moments.

The pleasant and constructive spirit of my team of supervisors has been crucial for bringing this research to a good end. I want to thank Professor Bas de Gaay Fortman

for helping me bridge the gap between different disciplines and perspectives and for having faith in my work. I want to thank Professor Arie de Ruijter for his enthusiasm about my fieldwork findings and for helping me determine the possibilities and impossibilities of an anthropologically-oriented study. I want to thank Professor Valentina Mazzucato for always challenging me to improve my work with her positively critical questions and comments. I also want to thank Doctor Hans Werdmölder who was involved as a co-supervisor at the beginning of the project.

Many more persons have contributed to this research, by sharing their academic knowledge, practical experience or relevant contacts with me – in the Netherlands and in Afghanistan. I want to mention Adri Nieuwhof, Maitham al Shebani, Sophia Hagemeyer, Carolien van Ham, Godfried Engbersen, Najla Wassie, Ariane den Uyl, Soheila Mazaheri, Ali Daliry, Philip Muus, Trees Wijn, Fatma Özgümüs, Zeki Shehu, Sander Kramer, Albert Reedijk, Roxanne Smits, Hans van Oosterhout, Geert Lamers, Lowell Melka Teichroew, Harry van den Tillaart, Barbara de la Rive-Box, Jet van Krieken, Ruth de Kanter, Ehsan Turabaz, Monique Goossens, Titia Feldmann, Marzia Masshoor, Patricia Schell, David Engelhard, Veronica Michaud Maturana, Marjan Mensinga, Inge Goorts, Anke Huijboom, Joost den Otter, Bart van den Bosch, Mariko Peters, Nang Arsala, John Langerak, Farid, Haider Abbas, Barna Karimi, mister Sharifi, Robert Zimmerman, and Dr. Spanta. In particular I want to thank Seddiq Mossadeq and Sohaila Alekozai for their generous hospitality and I want to thank my friend and travel companion Xaveri Kerkhofs with whom I shared the impressive experience of visiting Afghanistan. I hereby also want to thank the *Nederlandse Organisatie voor Wetenschappelijk Onderzoek* (NWO) and the Wiarda Institute for providing funding for my trip.

During the inevitably somewhat lonely exercise of ‘doing a PhD’ the two research networks in which I participated provided vital feedback on my work as well as an opportunity to share the ups and downs of academic life. I therefore want to thank the ladies of the Migration & Migrants network: Evelyn Ersanilli, Maria Bruquetas, Simone Boogaarts, Diana van Bergen and Hilje van der Horst, and the members of the Links & Livelihood network: Valentina Mazzucato, Mirjam Kabki, Lothar Smith, Ilse van Liempt, Mayke Kaag, Karin Geuijen and Marina de Regt.

It was a pleasure to work in an environment as diverse and colourful as ‘the SIM family’. I want to thank my colleagues for the pleasant hours that we spent discussing everything from global politics to wedding dresses. I want to mention in particular my roommates Chiseche Mibenge and Fleur van Leeuwen, with whom I shared the joys and grieves of PhD life, and who taught me a great deal about gender and women’s rights along the way.

I thank my friends for being there. If they ever grew bored of inquiring after my progress with regard to the research, they did not show it. But more importantly, they formed a crucial distraction from getting too much absorbed by work and work alone. Some of these friendships date from childhood, some started only recently through the children, most were established somewhere in between, and I cherish them all. Within the setting of this thesis I want to mention my ‘seconds’ in particular. The strength,

intelligence and sense of humour with which Iris Andriessen has completed her doctoral research and continued her professional career has been a true inspiration. As for Jeske de Cock, her coming back from Tanzania felt like a sister returning from abroad and I am grateful for having her nearby again.

I commenced this preface with my family, and I will end with it too. Doing a research on scattered family life only intensified my gratitude for having a warm and wide circle of family members around me that will even be there 'if all else fails' (Finch, 1989). In particular, I want to thank my sister Ank Robinson-Muller because she helped me through difficult moments with her commonsensical and practical view on academic research. I want to thank my parents Meindert Muller and Mariet Muller-Rijs because their unconditional love and support have made me strong. I want to thank Frans Vastenhoud and Hennie Vastenhoud-Frans: without their generous help and presence it would have been impossible to bring a thesis and three children into this world in the same period of time. I want to thank my beautiful sons, Jacob and Simon, for coming into my life, turning everything upside down, and teaching me what family life is really about. I also want to thank our third little one on his way for providing the perfect motivation to finish the book. And finally I want to thank Eric Vastenhoud for encouraging me to take up the challenge of doing a doctoral research, for his never-failing love and support along the way, and for his courage to start our own family together in the meantime.

TABLE OF CONTENTS

Acknowledgements	vii
CHAPTER 1 INTRODUCTION	1
1.1 Fahrat's story	1
1.2 Human rights and the protection of the family	2
1.2.1 Protection of the family	2
1.2.2 Family unity	5
1.2.3 Research question	7
1.3 Theoretical framework	8
1.3.1 The family	9
1.3.2 A transnational perspective	9
1.3.3 Integration	12
1.3.4 The transformation of family patterns	13
1.3.5 Reciprocity and support	15
1.4 Methods of data collection	18
1.4.1 Data sources	18
1.4.2 Fear and distrust	18
1.4.3 Finding respondents	20
1.4.4 Interview setting	21
1.5 Profile of the respondent group	26
1.6 Outline of the book	29
CHAPTER 2 COMING FROM A FRAGMENTIZED SOCIETY TO THE NETHERLANDS	31
2.1 Introduction	31
2.2 Situation in Afghanistan	32
2.2.1 Map of Afghanistan	32
2.2.2 A history of conflict and discord	33
2.2.3 The peoples of Afghanistan	34
2.2.4 Afghan family life	36
2.2.5 From independence up until the present	38
2.2.6 Socio-economic situation	41

2.2.7	Refugees	44
2.3	The Afghan population in the Netherlands	47
2.3.1	Afghans in the West	47
2.3.2	Afghans in the Netherlands; a new refugee group	48
2.3.3	From categorial policy to return policy	48
2.3.4	The position of Afghans in Dutch society	51
2.4	Afghans in the Netherlands and the legacy of conflict	54
CHAPTER 3 FRAGMENTATION BECAUSE OF CONFLICT, WAR AND THE NECESSITY TO FLEE		57
3.1	Introduction	57
3.2	Family life in the ‘good old days’	58
3.3	Fragmentation because of conflict and war	62
3.4	Fleeing and dispersal	67
3.5	Fragmentation through the asylum system	70
3.6	Conclusion	74
CHAPTER 4 FAMILY LIFE IN THE HOUSEHOLD – INTEGRATION, NEGOTIATION AND TRANSFORMATION		77
4.1	Introduction	77
4.2	Structural integration processes	79
4.2.1	Structural integration of the parents	80
4.2.1.1	Education	80
4.2.1.2	Work and income	81
4.2.2	Structural integration of the children	82
4.2.3	Housing situation	85
4.2.4	Structural integration and power shifts	86
4.2.4.1	Husbands and wives	86
4.2.4.2	Parents and children	88
4.3	Socio-cultural tensions within the household	89
4.3.1	Informal contacts and language	90
4.3.1.1	Parents	90
4.3.1.2	Children	91
4.3.2	Relations between men and women	94
4.3.3	Raising the children	97
4.3.4	Marriage	100
4.3.5	Religion	103
4.4	Coping mechanisms	104
4.4.1	Isolation	105

4.4.2	Control	106
4.4.3	Punishment	107
4.4.4	Renegotiating family relations	109
4.5	Conclusion	113
CHAPTER 5 FAMILY LIFE IN THE WEST – A MATTER OF TRUST		117
5.1	Introduction	117
5.2	Family relations as a potential of support	118
5.2.1	Practical support	119
5.2.2	Social support	121
5.2.3	Cultural support	125
5.2.4	Intrafamilial marriages	127
5.3	The perception of family life in the West	129
5.4	Support between nearby compatriots	132
5.4.1	Differences and distrust	132
5.4.2	Practical support	134
5.4.3	Social support	137
5.4.4	Cultural support	139
5.4.5	Familial support only partially replaceable	141
5.5	Conclusion	143
CHAPTER 6 FAMILY LIFE WITH STAY-BEHINDS – BETWEEN REMITTANCES AND RETURN		147
6.1	Introduction	147
6.2	The situation of stay-behinds	148
6.3	Bringing stay-behinds to the West	151
6.4	Sending remittances	157
6.5	Keeping in touch	160
6.5.1	Communication before and after 9/11	160
6.5.2	Long-distance communication	161
6.5.3	Visiting	164
6.6	Return and development	169
6.7	Conclusion	175
6.7.1	Potential for support?	175
6.7.2	Reciprocity	177
6.7.3	Transnationalism, integration and commitment	178

CHAPTER 7 CONCLUSION	181
7.1 Introduction	181
7.2 Main empirical findings	182
7.2.1 The refugee experience of fragmentation	182
7.2.2 Tensions and transformations at the household level	184
7.2.3 Family relations in the West and socio-cultural orientation	186
7.2.4 Family relations with stay-behinds and structural integration	188
7.2.5 Transnational family life: a continuous confrontation with borders	191
7.3 Discussion	191
7.3.1 The extended perception of the family	191
7.3.2 Transnational family life and its multiple engagements	192
7.3.3 Reciprocity as a necessity for family life	193
7.3.4 Integration and transnational ability	194
7.4 Implications from an upstream human rights perspective	196
Samenvatting (summary in Dutch)	201
References	213
Curriculum vitae	223