

The Reach of Human Rights in a Globalising World:
Extraterritorial Application of Human Rights Treaties

To my parents

SCHOOL OF HUMAN RIGHTS RESEARCH SERIES, Volume 32.

The titles published in this series are listed at the end of this volume.

The Reach of Human Rights in a Globalising World:
Extraterritorial Application of Human Rights Treaties

Michał Gondek



Antwerp – Oxford – Portland

This book was defended at Maastricht University on Friday, 25 September 2009

Cover Photograph: End of border fence in Arizona, © iStockphoto.com/mikadx

Michał Gondek
The Reach of Human Rights in a Globalising World: Extraterritorial Application of
Human Rights Treaties

ISBN 978-90-5095-817-2
D/2009/7849/3
NUR 828

© 2009 Intersentia
www.intersentia.com

Behoudens uitzondering door de wet gesteld, mag zonder schriftelijke toestemming van de rechtshebbende(n) op het auteursrecht c.q. de uitgevers van deze uitgave, door de rechtshebbende(n) gemachtigd namens hem (hen) op te treden, niet uit deze uitgave worden verveelvoudigd en/of openbaar gemaakt door middel van druk, fotocopie, microfilm of anderszins, hetgeen ook van toepassing is op de gehele of gedeeltelijke bewerking. De uitgevers zijn met uitsluiting van ieder ander onherroepelijk door de auteur gemachtigd de door derden verschuldigde vergoedingen van kopiëren als bedoeld in artikel 17 lid 2 van de Auteurswet 1912 en in het KB van 20-6-'64 (Stb. 351) ex artikel 16b der Auteurswet 1912, te doen innen door (en overeenkomstig de reglementen van) de Stichting Reprorecht te Amsterdam.

Niets uit deze uitgave mag worden verveelvoudigd en/of openbaar gemaakt door middel van druk, fotocopie, microfilm of op welke andere wijze ook, zonder voorafgaande schriftelijke toestemming van de uitgevers.

No part of this book may be reproduced in any form, by print, photocopy, microfilm or any other means, without written permission from the publishers.

ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

This book is a fruit of my work as a junior researcher at Maastricht Centre for Human Rights, Faculty of Law, Maastricht University. Many people deserve thanks for making that work an appealing and enjoyable experience. In the first place, I would like to thank my supervisors, Professor Menno Kamminga and Professor Fons Coomans for entrusting this research project to me, for their constant support, and for the discussions on the many drafts of different chapters, which were always constructive and inspiring. I would also like to thank the members of the assessment committee who kindly agreed to read and evaluate the dissertation and attend its oral defence.

The research benefited from conversations with several experts: amongst others with Professors Theo van Boven, Walter Kälin, Eibe Riedel and Wouter Vandenhoe, and with Rolf Künnemann of FIAN International. I thank them warmly for sharing their thoughts on the subject. In particular, I want to thank Professor Sigrun Skogly, who also agreed to participate in the oral defence of the thesis.

I would also like to thank Louise Rayar for translating the summary into Dutch, Chantal Kuijpers and Yleen Simonis for preparing the manuscript for publication, Aafke Kok for help with preparing the bibliography, and Katarzyna Dyja and Krzysztof Śmiszek for their comments on the Polish summary. Special thanks go to Jacqueline Schoonheim for her support and inspiration in the art of teaching.

I am very grateful to the many colleagues and friends I met at the Maastricht Centre, the Faculty and the University. They are too many to name here. Nevertheless, I would like to mention some of them. In the first place, I would like to thank Mariolina Eliantonio for the whole shared experience of writing our respective dissertations together; Joakim and Liisa Zander for their friendship and invaluable help in difficult times; and other members of the ‘PhD pack’ of the Law Faculty for their friendship and great company: Melanie De Groof, Antenor Hallo de Wolf, Mieke Olaerts, Carol Ni Giollarnath, Philipp Kiiver, Bram Akkermans, Roland Moerland, Anke Dahrendorf, Bram Van Hofstraeten, Eva Rieter and others. My warm thanks go also to friends from the Faculty of Arts and Social Sciences: Karolina Pomorska, Patrick Bijsmans and Paul Stephenson, for their friendship and the many laughs we have had together.

| Acknowledgements

Last but certainly not least, I thank my sister Marta and my parents Teresa and Zygmunt Gondek – for everything.

Brussels, July 2009

TABLE OF CONTENTS

Acknowledgements	v
List of Abbreviations	xvii
CHAPTER I	
INTRODUCTION	1
1 The subject of the study	1
2 Research questions	5
3 Scope of the study	5
4 Methodology	7
5 Structure	8
CHAPTER II	
THE CONCEPTUAL FRAMEWORK	11
1 Elements of the framework	11
2 Overview of relevant treaty provisions	11
2.1 Civil and political rights	12
2.2 Economic, social and cultural rights	18
3 Characteristics of human rights treaties	18
3.1 General observations	18
3.2 The nature of treaty obligations	19
3.3 The specific nature of human rights treaties	21
3.3.1 Object and purpose and other distinguishing factors	21
3.3.2 Performance	23
3.3.3 Reciprocity - the example of reservations	23
3.3.4 Objective character of obligations and public order function	26
3.3.5 Other features	27
4 The rules of treaty interpretation	29
4.1 Introductory remarks	29
4.2 The Vienna Convention rules of treaty interpretation	29

Table of Contents

4.2.1	The role and character of the Vienna Convention rules	29
4.2.2	General rule of interpretation	30
4.2.3	Supplementary means of interpretation	34
4.3	The Vienna Convention rules as applied to human rights treaties	36
4.3.1	The relationship between the VCLT and human rights treaties	36
4.3.2	Treaty interpretation in light of special characteristics of human rights treaties	38
A.	General	38
B.	The general rule of interpretation of human rights treaties	39
C.	The practice of states and the practice of human rights courts and treaty bodies	41
D.	The value of findings of treaty bodies for the interpretation of the scope of a treaty	41
E.	Other relevant rules of international law	45
F.	Dynamic interpretation	46
G.	Subsidiary means of treaty interpretation	46
5	‘The ordinary meaning’? Jurisdiction in public international law	47
5.1	The meaning and function of jurisdiction in public international law	47
5.2	International law of jurisdiction	49
5.2.1	The case of <i>S.S. Lotus</i>	49
5.2.2	‘Types’ and ‘bases’ of jurisdiction	50
5.2.3	Territorial and extraterritorial jurisdiction: the rule and the exception?	54
5.2.4	The consequences of wrongful exercise of jurisdiction	55
5.3	Jurisdiction in human rights treaties and in general international law: a different purpose	56
6	States’ conduct and the typology of human rights obligations	57
6.1	State conduct required to implement human rights treaties	58
6.2	The tripartite typology of human rights obligations	59
6.2.1	Obligation to respect	60
6.2.2	Obligation to protect	61
6.2.3	Obligation to fulfil	62
7	Extraterritoriality and international humanitarian law	63
7.1	International human rights and humanitarian law: the relationship	63
7.2	Scope of application of international humanitarian law	66
7.2.1	General	66
7.2.2	Scope of application <i>ratione loci</i>	67
7.2.3	Scope of application <i>ratione personae</i>	69
7.2.4	Belligerent occupation and control over territory	70
8	Conclusions	71
CHAPTER III		
DRAFTING HISTORIES: THE BACKGROUND OF THE REFERENCES TO JURISDICTION AND TERRITORY		75
1	Introduction	75
2	The chronology	76
3	The American Declaration of the Rights and Duties of Man	79
4	<i>Travaux préparatoires</i> of the ICCPR and ECHR: cross-fertilization	81

4.1	Introductory remarks	81
4.2	Preparatory phase of drafting the Covenant (1947–1948): reference to ‘jurisdiction’, no reference to ‘territory’	81
4.3	The ECHR: from ‘residing in the territory’ to ‘within the jurisdiction’	84
4.3.1	The drafting at the Consultative Assembly and connections with the work of the UN	84
4.3.2	Later stages of drafting and the reference to jurisdiction	88
4.3.3	<i>Travaux préparatoires</i> of the ECHR: assessment	91
4.4	‘The drafting phase’ of the ICCPR (1949–1954)	92
4.4.1	The US attempts to include the reference to ‘territory’	92
4.4.2	Analysis of the US amendment and the discussion	98
4.4.3	A French attempt to dispose of the notion of territory (1952)	102
4.4.4	The deliberation phase (1954–1966) and the remaining controversies	104
4.4.5	The First Optional Protocol to the ICCPR	106
4.4.6	Subsequent interpretation of the <i>travaux</i> of the ICCPR	107
5	Preparatory work of subsequent international human rights treaties	109
5.1	General	109
5.2	The American Convention on Human Rights	109
5.3	The UN Convention Against Torture	112
5.4	The UN Convention on the Rights of the Child	115
5.4.1	General	115
5.4.2	Changes which led to current Article 2 CRC.	116
6	Conclusions	118

CHAPTER IV

INTERNATIONAL CASE LAW ON EXTRATERRITORIAL APPLICATION OF HUMAN RIGHTS TREATIES

121

1	Introduction	121
2	Searching for an approach: early cases on extraterritorial applicability of human rights treaties	123
2.1	The earliest cases with an extraterritorial element under the ECHR	123
2.2	Interstate cases concerning northern Cyprus before the European Commission of Human Rights	126
2.2.1	Characterization of the situation in northern Cyprus	126
2.2.2	The first decision by the Commission (1975)	127
2.2.3	The second decision by the Commission (1978)	130
2.3	The first cases under the ICCPR	132
2.3.1	Article 2(1) and its early interpretation in the literature	132
2.3.2	Relevance and applicability of Optional Protocol No. 1	133
2.3.3	The ‘passport cases’	134
2.3.4	The case of <i>López Burgos</i>	136
2.4	Early cases in the Inter-American system	139
2.5	The <i>Loizidou</i> case before the European Commission of Human Rights	142
2.6	Further cases before the Inter-American Commission: the impact of <i>Loizidou</i>	143
2.6.1	The <i>Panama</i> case	143

Table of Contents

2.6.2	<i>Coard et al. v. The United States</i> under the American Declaration	144
2.6.3	<i>Saldaño v. Argentina</i> under the American Convention on Human Rights	146
2.7	Cementing the ‘personal approach’ to jurisdiction in the European system: <i>Stocké v. Germany, Drozd and Janousek v. France and Spain</i> and <i>W.M. v. Denmark</i>	147
3	Change of focus and the primacy of territoriality? The cases of <i>Loizidou, Cyprus v. Turkey</i> and <i>Banković</i> in the ECtHR	150
3.1	General observations	150
3.2	Cypriot cases before the Strasbourg Court	151
3.2.1	The <i>Loizidou</i> case before the ECtHR: general	151
3.2.2	<i>Loizidou (Preliminary objections)</i>	151
3.2.3	<i>Loizidou (Merits)</i>	154
3.2.4	<i>Cyprus v. Turkey</i>	156
3.2.5	The Cypriot cases before the European Court of Human Rights: appraisal	160
	A. Occupation and applicability of the ECHR: the test of territorial control (‘effective overall control’)	160
	B. State responsibility and jurisdiction	162
	C. The question of attribution	164
	D. Jurisdiction and responsibility: conclusion	168
3.3	The case of <i>Banković</i>	169
3.3.1	The facts and the issue	169
3.3.2	Arguments of the parties	170
3.3.3	The Court’s ruling	172
	A. Territorial nature of jurisdiction	172
	B. Exceptional extraterritorial applicability of the ECHR	173
	C. ‘Legal space’ of the ECHR	174
3.3.4	<i>Banković</i> : some interim conclusions	178
3.3.5	<i>Alejandro v. Cuba (‘Brothers to the Rescue’)</i> case	179
4	The Post- <i>Banković</i> era: territoriality challenged	181
4.1	Post- <i>Banković</i> case law in the European Court	182
4.1.1	<i>Öcalan, Ilaşcu, Issa</i> – explaining <i>Banković</i>	182
	A. <i>Öcalan</i> : arrest, detention and personal control	182
	B. The <i>Ilaşcu</i> case: territorial and extraterritorial applicability of the ECHR	185
	C. <i>Issa v. Turkey</i> : control over persons outside the ‘legal space’	192
	D. The <i>Pad</i> case: confirmation of applicability beyond the ‘legal space’	194
4.1.2	European cases 2005–2007: continuing trend towards broader extraterritorial application of the ECHR	194
	A. The <i>Haydarie</i> case: family reunification	195
	B. The case of <i>Saddam Hussein</i> : no reference to ‘legal space’	196
	C. The <i>Treska</i> case: affirmation of positive extraterritorial obligation	197
	D. The <i>Danish cartoons</i> case	198
	E. The <i>Marković</i> case: state jurisdiction for the purposes of Article 6 ECHR	199
	F. The <i>Isaak</i> case: affirmation of the Cyprus case law	201

G.	Participation of states parties in UN operations: the <i>Behrami</i> case	203
4.2	Extraterritorial application of UN human rights treaties by the treaty bodies	203
4.3	Jurisprudence of the International Court of Justice	204
4.3.1	General observations	204
4.3.2	Advisory <i>Opinion on the Wall</i> in the Occupied Palestinian Territory	204
A.	The Opinion	204
B.	The applicability of the ICCPR	205
C.	The applicability of the ICESCR	207
D.	The applicability of the CRC	207
4.3.3	The case of <i>Democratic Republic of Congo v. Uganda</i>	207
A.	The case	207
B.	Applicability of human rights treaties during occupation	208
C.	Acts committed during a military intervention	210
4.3.4	The case of <i>Georgia v. Russia</i> : extraterritorial application of the CERD	212
4.3.5	The jurisprudence of the ICJ: appraisal	213
4.4	Developments in the Inter-American system	214
4.4.1	The issue of Guantánamo detainees before the Inter-American Commission of Human Rights	214
A.	Guantánamo Bay and extraterritorial applicability of human rights law	214
B.	Guantánamo detainees and the Inter-American Commission of Human Rights	217
4.4.2	Other extraterritorial cases before the Inter-American Commission	220
4.4.3	Cases under the Inter-American system: appraisal	221
5	Conclusions: international case law on extraterritorial application of human rights treaties	221
5.1	General observations	221
5.2	Early developments in international case law (until mid-1990s)	222
5.3	A switch to a more territorial focus in the European jurisprudence: <i>Loizidou, Cyprus v. Turkey</i> and <i>Banković</i>	224
5.4	Extraterritorial application of human rights treaties post- <i>Banković</i>	225
5.4.1	Jurisdiction	225
5.4.2	Exceptional applicability	226
5.4.3	‘Legal space’ of human rights treaties	227
CHAPTER V		
OTHER OUTPUT OF HUMAN RIGHTS SUPERVISORY BODIES		229
1	Introduction	229
2	Concluding Observations and General Comments	230
2.1	General observations	230
2.2	The ICCPR	231
2.2.1	The Human Rights Committee and the extraterritorial application of the ICCPR	231

Table of Contents

2.2.2	General Comment No. 31	232
2.2.3	The Occupied Palestinian Territories and the periodic reports of Israel	234
A.	Israel's position	234
B.	The position of the Human Rights Committee	235
2.2.4	The United States of America – the ICCPR in the war on terror	239
A.	The US position on the Covenant's extraterritorial applicability	239
B.	The position of the Committee	241
2.2.5	Other state reports	244
A.	The war in the former Yugoslavia (Serbia and Montenegro, Croatia, Bosnia and Herzegovina)	244
B.	Military activities abroad: Poland, Italy and Belgium	245
C.	The United Kingdom report of 2008: the applicability of the ICCPR in Iraq and Afghanistan	246
2.3	The Convention Against Torture	247
2.3.1	Extraterritorial scope of the CAT: general observations	247
2.3.2	General Comment No. 2	249
2.3.3	Recent challenges: the United Kingdom and the United States of America	250
A.	The position of the UK	250
B.	The position of the USA	252
C.	The position of the Committee	253
2.4	The Convention on the Rights of the Child	255
2.5	Non-discrimination treaties: extraterritorial application of the CERD	257
2.6	Other UN mechanisms: the Special Rapporteur on Occupied Palestinian Territories	258
3	Conclusions	260
 CHAPTER VI		
EXTRATERRITORIAL APPLICATION OF HUMAN RIGHTS TREATIES IN STATE PRACTICE		263
1	Introduction	263
2	The ECHR	265
2.1	Before <i>Banković</i>	265
2.2	The controversy over the state practice on derogations under Article 15 ECHR	265
2.3	After <i>Banković</i> : conservative reading of the ECtHR case law	266
2.3.1	The UK: the case of <i>Al-Skeini</i>	266
A.	Introduction	266
B.	Facts and issues in the six joined cases	267
C.	The judgment of the Divisional Court	268
D.	The judgment of the Court of Appeal	271
E.	The judgment of the House of Lords	273
F.	<i>Al Skeini</i> : Conclusions	275
G.	Other UK cases	275
2.3.2	Italy	277
2.3.3	Germany	279
2.3.4	The Netherlands	279

3	The ICCPR	279
3.1	States opposing the extraterritorial applicability of human rights treaties: the USA and Israel	279
3.1.1	The USA	279
3.1.2	Israel	282
3.1.3	The UK	285
3.2	Positions of states before the ICJ in the proceedings leading to <i>The Wall Opinion</i>	286
3.2.1	General remarks	286
3.2.2	Views endorsing extraterritorial application of the ICCPR, ICESCR and CRC	286
3.2.3	Views generally supporting the extraterritorial applicability of human rights law	287
4	Conclusions	289

CHAPTER VII

EXTRATERRITORIAL APPLICATION OF TREATIES ON ECONOMIC, SOCIAL AND CULTURAL RIGHTS

291

1	Introduction: the separate treatment and the rights-based approach	291
2	The relevant provisions of the ICESCR and the CRC	295
2.1	Provisions of the ICESCR	295
2.2	Provisions of the CRC	297
2.3	The wording of the treaties: appraisal	298
3	The <i>travaux préparatoires</i>	299
3.1	Preparatory work of the ICESCR	299
3.1.1	Article 2(1) ICESCR	299
3.1.2	Other ICESCR provisions	301
3.2	The drafting history of Article 4 CRC	302
4	The exercise of control as a basis for extraterritorial obligations	304
4.1	The exercise of control: Israel and the Occupied Palestinian Territories	304
4.2	Israeli position regarding the applicability of the ICESCR in the Occupied Territories	305
4.3	The practice of the Committee on Economic, Social and Cultural Rights on occupation	306
4.3.1	Concluding Observations on Israel's initial report	306
4.3.2	Second periodic report by Israel	308
4.3.3	The Committee on Occupied Territories: appraisal	308
4.3.4	The language of jurisdiction in other examples of the Committee's work	309
4.4	The Advisory Opinion on the Legality of the Wall in the Occupied Palestinian Territory	310
4.4.1	General observations	310
4.4.2	Extraterritorial applicability of the ICESCR	311
4.5	Expert opinions: UN Special Rapporteurs	314
4.6	Conclusions: control as a factor in determining the scope of extraterritorial obligations	315

xiii

Table of Contents

5	International cooperation and assistance as a basis for extraterritorial obligations	316
5.1	The concept of international cooperation and assistance in international law	316
5.1.1	The UN Charter and the origins of the concept of international cooperation	317
5.1.2	The Universal Declaration of Human Rights	319
5.1.3	Other UN Resolutions	320
A.	Declaration on Principles of International Law concerning Friendly Relations and Co-operation among States in accordance with the Charter of the United Nations	321
B.	The Charter of Economic Rights and Duties of States	321
C.	Declaration on the Right of Development	322
D.	Vienna Declaration and Programme of Action	323
E.	United Nations Millennium Declaration	323
5.1.4	The meaning and significance of the concept of international cooperation in international law: appraisal	324
5.2	International cooperation and assistance and the Committee on Economic, Social and Cultural Rights	325
5.2.1	General observations	325
5.2.2	General Comments devoted to general issues	326
5.2.3	General Comments on substantive rights	326
5.3	References in other sources: the Limburg Principles	327
5.4	State practice: the negotiations on the optional protocol to the ICESCR	328
6	Extraterritorial obligations under the treaties on economic, social and cultural rights in context	333
6.1	Introduction	333
6.2	Development cooperation	334
6.2.1	General remarks	334
6.2.2	General Comment No. 2 on international technical assistance measures	336
6.2.3	Obligations of states in international organizations: other General Comments and Concluding Observations of the Committee	338
6.3	Multilateral sanctions	340
6.3.1	International law and human rights restrictions on sanctions	341
6.3.2	Obligations of states in the context of sanctions	343
6.3.3	The General Comment on sanctions	345
7	Extraterritorial obligations under the treaties on economic, social and cultural rights (the right to food and the right to health)	347
7.1	Multifaceted character of rights and a range of corresponding obligations	347
7.2	Extraterritorial obligations: the relation to the obligations of the territorial state	350
7.3	Obligations of developing states (the obligation of states to seek cooperation and assistance from the international community)	352
7.4	Typology of extraterritorial obligations to respect, protect and fulfil economic, social and cultural rights	354
7.4.1	Extraterritorial obligation to respect the right to food and health	354

7.4.2	Extraterritorial obligations to protect	357
7.4.3	Extraterritorial obligations to fulfil	360
A.	General observations	360
B.	Extraterritorial obligations to fulfil (facilitate)	361
C.	Extraterritorial obligations to fulfil (provide)	362
8	Conclusions	363
CHAPTER VIII		
GENERAL CONCLUSIONS		367
1	General remarks	367
2	Jurisdiction in human rights treaties	369
2.1	Relationship with other concepts	369
2.2	Jurisdiction <i>de lege lata</i>	370
2.3	Jurisdiction: the more desirable approach	375
3	Treaties on economic, social and cultural rights	377
4	Concluding thought	379
	Summary in Polish	381
	Summary in Dutch	387
	Bibliography	395
	Index	429
	Curriculum Vitae	437

LIST OF ABBREVIATIONS

ACHR	American Convention on Human Rights
ACHPR	African Charter on Human and Peoples' Rights
adm. dec.	admissibility decision
ADRDM	American Declaration of the Rights and Duties of Man
AJIL	American Journal of International Law
ASIL	American Society of International Law
AP I	First Additional Protocol to Geneva Conventions
AP II	Second Additional Protocol to Geneva Conventions
BYIL	British Yearbook of International Law
CAT	UN Convention Against Torture
CEDAW	UN Convention on the Elimination of All Forms of Discrimination against Women
CERD	UN Convention on the Elimination of All Forms of Racial Discrimination
CESCR	UN Committee on Economic, Social and Cultural Rights
CRC	UN Convention on the Rights of the Child
CUP	Cambridge University Press
ECHR	European Convention on Human Rights
ECommHR	European Commission of Human Rights
ECOSOC	UN Economic and Social Council
ECtHR	European Court of Human Rights
EHR	European Human Rights Reports
EJIL	European Journal of International Law
EWCA	England and Wales Court of Appeal
GA	UN General Assembly
GC	Grand Chamber
GC IV	Fourth Geneva Convention
HRC	UN Human Rights Committee
HRQ	Human Rights Quarterly
IACCommHR	Inter-American Commission on Human Rights
IACtHR	Inter-American Court of Human Rights
ICCPR	International Covenant on Civil and Political Rights
ICESCR	International Covenant on Economic, Social and Cultural Rights
ICJ	International Court of Justice
ICJ Rep.	International Court of Justice Reports
ICLQ	International and Comparative Law Quarterly

List of Abbreviations

ICTR	International Criminal Tribunal for Rwanda
ICTY	International Criminal Tribunal for the former Yugoslavia
IDF	Israeli Defense Force
IHL	international humanitarian law
ILA	International Law Association
ILM	International Law Materials
ILO	International Labour Organization
IRRC	International Review of Red Cross
JIL	Journal of International Law
NILR	Netherlands International Law Review
OAS	Organization of American States
OUP	Oxford University Press
PCIJ	Permanent Court of International Justice
RdC	Recueil des Cours
UDHR	Universal Declaration of Human Rights
UKHL	United Kingdom House of Lords
UN Doc.	United Nations document
VCLT	Vienna Convention on the Law of Treaties
WTO	World Trade Organization
Ybk ECHR	Yearbook of the European Convention on Human Rights
YbkIL	Yearbook of International Law