LEGAL DESIGN OF CARBON CAPTURE AND STORAGE
Energy & Law Series

1. European Energy Law Report I, Martha M. Roggenkamp and Ulf Hammer (eds.)
2. The Regulation of Power Exchanges in Europe, Martha M. Roggenkamp and François Boisseleau (eds.)
5. European Energy Law Report IV, Martha M. Roggenkamp and Ulf Hammer (eds.)
6. A Functional Legal Design for Reliable Electricity Supply, Hamilcar P.A. Knops
8. European Energy and Law Report VI, Martha M. Roggenkamp and Ulf Hammer (eds.)
10. Legal Design of Carbon Capture and Storage – Developments in the Netherlands from an International and EU Perspective, Martha M. Roggenkamp and E. Woerdman (eds.)
LEGAL DESIGN OF CARBON
CAPTURE AND STORAGE

Developments in the Netherlands
from an International and
EU Perspective

Edited by
Martha M. Roggenkamp
Edwin Woerdman

intersentia
Antwerp – Oxford – Portland
Distribution for the UK:
Hart Publishing Ltd.
16C Worcester Place
Oxford OX1 2JW
UK
Tel.: +44 1865 51 75 30
Fax: +44 1865 51 07 10

Distribution for Switzerland and
Germany:
Schulthess Verlag
Zwingliplatz 2
CH-8022 Zürich
Switzerland
Tel.: +41 1 251 93 36
Fax: +41 1 261 63 94

Distribution for the USA and Canada
International Specialized Book Services
920 NE 58th Ave Suite 300
Portland, OR 97213
USA
Tel.: +1 800 944 6190 (toll free)
Tel.: +1 503 287 3093
Fax: +1 503 280 8832
Email: info@isbs.com

Distribution for other countries:
Intersentia Publishers
Groenstraat 31
BE-2640 Mortsel
Belgium
Tel.: +32 3 680 15 50
Fax: +32 3 658 71 21

The Energy & Law Series
The Energy & Law Series is published in parallel with the Dutch series Energie & Recht.
Members of the editorial board are:
Prof. Dr. Martha M. Roggenkamp, Groningen Centre of Energy Law, University of
Groningen and Brinkhof Advocaten, Amsterdam (editor in chief)
Prof. Dr. Kurt Deketelaere, University of Leuven and Honorary Professor at University of
Dundee
Dr. Tom Vanden Borre, European Commission DG TREN and University of Leuven

Legal Design of Carbon Capture and Storage – Developments in the Netherlands
from an International and EU Perspective
Edited by Martha M. Roggenkamp and Edwin Woerdman

© 2009 Intersentia
Antwerp – Oxford – Portland
www.intersentia.com

D/2010/7849/2
NUR 828

No part of this book may be reproduced in any form, by print, photoprint, microfilm or any other
means, without written permission from the publisher.
# TABLE OF CONTENTS

LIST OF ABBREVIATIONS ................................................... xvii

LIST OF AUTHORS .......................................................... xxi

FOREWORD ........................................................................... xxiii

INTRODUCTION

**Martha M. Roggenkamp and Edwin Woerdman**

1. The Groningen Centre of Energy Law ............................. xxv
2. The Relevance of Carbon Capture and Storage ................. xxvi
3. Legal Research on Carbon Capture and Storage ................ xxvi
4. Outline of the Book ........................................................ xxviii
5. Acknowledgements ...................................................... xxix

**PART I**

**GENERAL**

**CHAPTER I**

**INTRODUCTION TO THE CCS CHAIN: TECHNOLOGICAL ASPECTS AND SAFETY RISKS**

**Wilbert Grevers and Lennart Luten** ............................. 3

1. Introduction ............................................................... 3
2. The CCS Chain .......................................................... 6
   2.1. Introduction ....................................................... 6
   2.2. CO\textsubscript{2} Capture ....................................... 6
   2.3. CO\textsubscript{2} Transport ....................................... 8
   2.4. CO\textsubscript{2} Storage .......................................... 9
   2.5. Combination ..................................................... 11
3. Risks ............................................................................. 11
4. Conclusion ............................................................... 14
PART II
INTERNATIONAL AND EU LAW

CHAPTER II
CHALLENGING COMPLEXITIES OF CCS IN PUBLIC INTERNATIONAL LAW

Marcel Brus ................................................................. 19

1. Introduction ......................................................... 19
2. CO\textsubscript{2} Storage Within the Territory of a State ............ 21
   2.1. Sovereignty and International Law ............................. 22
   2.2. Issues of International State Responsibility and Liability ...... 23
   2.3. Taking a Precautionary Approach .............................. 25
   2.4. Public Participation ............................................. 28
   2.5. Some Concluding Observations ................................. 29
3. CO\textsubscript{2} Storage Offshore .................................. 29
   3.1. Are the Rules on the Exclusive Economic Zone or on the Continental Shelf Applicable to Offshore Storage of CO\textsubscript{2}? ... 30
      3.1.1. The Exclusive Economic Zone .............................. 30
      3.1.2. The Continental Shelf ...................................... 32
      3.1.3. CO\textsubscript{2} Storage and International Customary Law ... 33
      3.1.4. Conclusion .................................................. 35
   3.2. Limitations on Rights to CO\textsubscript{2} Storage in the Continental Shelf ................................. 35
      3.2.1. General Standards ......................................... 35
      3.2.2. Dumping of Wastes and Other Matter at Sea .............. 36
   3.3. Conclusion ..................................................... 45
4. CCS and Cross-border Storage Capacity ............................ 47
   4.1. Introduction .................................................... 47
   4.2. Cross-border CO\textsubscript{2} Storage as Natural Resource Exploitation .................. 47
      4.2.1. Unintentional Cross-border Storage ....................... 48
      4.2.2. Intentional Cross-border Storage ......................... 49
   4.3. Cross-border Storage and the Regulation of Export of Waste .. 52
5. CO\textsubscript{2} Storage and the Climate Change Regime .................. 55
6. CCS as a Shared Responsibility .................................... 57
7. Conclusion ......................................................... 59
# Table of Contents

## CHAPTER III
### CCS UNDER THE PROJECT-BASED KYOTO MECHANISMS
#### Anatole Boute ...................................................... 61

1. Introduction ...................................................... 61
2. Background ...................................................... 64
   2.1. The Clean Development Mechanism ......................... 64
   2.2. Joint Implementation ....................................... 67
   2.3. Integrating CCS in the CDM and JI: Current State of Discussion  69
3. Additionality ................................................... 71
   3.1. Introduction ................................................ 71
   3.2. Baseline Scenario .......................................... 72
   3.3. Investment, Barrier and Common Practice Analyses ............ 74
4. Emission Reductions ........................................... 75
   4.1. Baseline Emissions .......................................... 75
   4.2. Project Emissions .......................................... 78
   4.3. Leakage Emissions .......................................... 80
5. Permanence ..................................................... 81
   5.1. Introduction ................................................ 81
   5.2. Seepage and Site Selection .................................. 82
   5.3. Liability and Responsibility ................................ 84
   5.4. Multi-Jurisdictional and Multi-Project Aspects ............... 88
6. Monitoring Methodologies ....................................... 90
7. Sustainable Development ......................................... 92
8. Conclusion ..................................................... 93

## CHAPTER IV
### CCS IN THE EUROPEAN EMISSIONS TRADING SCHEME
#### Edwin Woerdman and Oscar Couwenberg ......................... 97

1. Introduction ...................................................... 97
2. Make, Buy or Store ............................................. 99
3. When Storing Emissions Frees Up Allowances ..................... 103
4. Providing Efficient Incentives ................................ 106
   4.1. Introduction ................................................ 106
   4.2. Levying a Carbon Tax ....................................... 107
   4.3. Assigning Double Credits .................................. 108
   4.4. Closing the Cost Gap ....................................... 111
   4.5. Imposing an Obligation .................................... 114
   4.6. Evaluating the Options ..................................... 115
# Table of Contents

5. Economic Analysis of the Incentives for Carbon Capture and Storage . . 116  
   5.1. Evaluating the Incentives ........................................... 116  
   5.2. Balancing Pros and Cons .......................................... 119  
   5.3. Considering Leakage .............................................. 121  
6. Conclusion ........................................................................ 123  

## CHAPTER V  
EC COMPETITION LAW AND THE ORGANISATION OF CCS  
Hans Vedder ................................................................. 125  

1. Introduction ................................................................. 125  
2. Climate Change and the Legal Framework for CCS .................. 126  
3. State Aid and the Financing of CCS Development and Infrastructure. . 128  
   3.1. Introduction ............................................................ 128  
   3.2. State Aid for CCS and the Coal Sector Regulation .............. 130  
   3.3. State Aid for CCS and the Environmental Aid Guidelines . . . 131  
   3.4. State Aid for CCS and the R & D & I Aid Guidelines .......... 135  
   3.5. State Aid for CCS and the General Block Exemption Regulation 137  
   3.6. The Mongstad Case on State Aid for CCS ...................... 138  
4. Competition Law Concerns and CCS .................................. 140  
   4.1. Introduction ............................................................ 140  
   4.2. The Market for Gas Storage as a Useful Parallel ............... 146  
   4.3. Vertical Integration in the Energy Sector and CCS .......... 148  
   4.4. Carbon Capturers as Captive Customers ......................... 150  
   4.5. Access to Transport and Storage in the CCS Directive ....... 152  
5. Conclusion ........................................................................ 155  

## CHAPTER VI  
ENVIRONMENTAL LAW AND CCS IN THE EU AND THE IMPACT ON THE NETHERLANDS  
Kars J. de Graaf and Jan H. Jans ................................. 157  

1. Introduction ................................................................. 157  
2. Regulating Large Emitters ............................................... 160  
   2.1. The European Trading Scheme ..................................... 160  
   2.2. The Integrated Approach to Pollution Prevention and Control . 162  
      2.2.1. Scope of the IPPC Directive .................................. 162  
      2.2.2. Obligations Under the IPPC Directive ................... 164  
      2.2.3. New Developments ........................................... 166  

viii
3.4. Governmental Decree on Pipelines ............................................. 196
4. Safety Issues ................................................................. 196
   4.1. Introduction .............................................................. 196
   4.2. Internal Safety ......................................................... 197
   4.3. External Safety and the Protection of Subsoil Infrastructure .... 197
5. CO\textsubscript{2} Pipelines and Ownership Rights ............................... 199
6. Re-use of Pipelines ........................................................... 200
   6.1. Introduction .............................................................. 200
   6.2. Offshore ................................................................. 200
   6.3. Onshore ................................................................. 201
7. Conclusion ................................................................. 202

CHAPTER VIII
REGULATING UNDERGROUND STORAGE OF CO\textsubscript{2}
Martha M. Roggenkamp ......................................................... 205
1. Introduction ................................................................. 205
2. EU Directive on Geological Storage of Carbon Dioxide ................. 206
   2.1. Introduction .............................................................. 206
   2.2. Legal Framework Governing Underground Storage ................. 207
      2.2.1. Introduction .......................................................... 207
      2.2.2. Selecting Storage Sites ........................................... 207
      2.2.3. Awarding Storage Permits ....................................... 208
      2.2.4. Operating a Storage Site ......................................... 210
      2.2.5. Closing a Storage Site ........................................... 211
   2.3. Assessing and Comparing the CCS Directive with the
        Hydrocarbons Licensing Directive .................................... 213
      2.3.1. The Storage Regime ............................................... 213
      2.3.2. Third Party Access ............................................... 216
      2.3.3. Final Comments .................................................. 217
3. Transposition in National Law .............................................. 217
   3.1. Subsoil Storage Regimes in the EU .................................... 217
   3.2. CO\textsubscript{2} Storage in the Netherlands .............................. 218
      3.2.1. Emitters and Storage Potential .................................. 218
      3.2.2. CO\textsubscript{2} Storage Under the Mining Act .................... 219
      3.3.1. An Assessment .................................................... 225
4. Conclusion ..........................
CHAPTER IX
POST-INJECTION LIABILITY FOR ONSHORE CO₂ STORAGE

MARK H. WISSINK ................................................................. 229

1. Introduction ................................................................. 229
  1.1. Post-Injection Liability for Onshore CO₂ Storage ............. 229
  1.2. Risk of Liability vs. Actual Risks ................................. 230
  1.3. The Operator ............................................................ 231
  1.4. Structure of This Chapter .......................................... 232

2. Post-Injection Liability for Leakage and Soil Movements ........... 232
  2.1. Introduction ............................................................ 232
  2.2. Leakage ..................................................................... 233
    2.2.1. Introduction .......................................................... 233
    2.2.2. Damage to the Climate in General: Climate Liability .... 233
    2.2.3. Damage to the Environment and to Third Parties: In Situ Liability ......................................................... 234
    2.2.4. Administrative Law and In Situ Liability ................. 235
    2.2.5. Tort Law and In Situ Liability ................................. 236
  2.3. Soil Movements .......................................................... 237
  2.4. Conclusion ............................................................... 237

3. Liability Under Article 6:162 BW ...................................... 238
  3.1. Introduction ............................................................ 238
  3.2. Breach of Statutory (Permit) Rules ................................. 239
  3.3. Breach of Unwritten Rules of Law ................................. 240
    3.3.1. Introduction .......................................................... 240
    3.3.2. Guarding Against Known Dangers .......................... 241
    3.3.3. Guarding Against Unknown Dangers ...................... 242
    3.3.4. Conclusion .......................................................... 243
  3.4. Infringement of a Right ............................................. 243
    3.4.1. Introduction .......................................................... 243
    3.4.2. Liability as Owner of CO₂ ...................................... 244
    3.4.3. Conclusion .......................................................... 246

4. Liability Under Articles 6:175–177 BW ................................. 246
  4.1. Introduction ............................................................ 246
  4.2. Scope of Application .................................................. 247
  4.3. Article 6:175 BW: Dangerous Substances ....................... 248
    4.3.1. Introduction .......................................................... 248
    4.3.2. Applicability to CO₂ .............................................. 249
    4.4.1. Introduction .......................................................... 251
Table of Contents

4.4.2. Applicability to CO₂ Storage Facilities .......................... 251
4.4.3. Non-Applicability of Article 6:176 BW to CO₂ Storage Facilities After Transposition of the CCS Directive .... 252
4.5. Article 6:177 BW: Mining Activities ...................................... 253
4.6. Defences ................................................................. 254
   4.6.1. In General ......................................................... 254
5. The Horizon for Long-Term Liabilities ........................................ 257
   5.1. Introduction ............................................................. 257
   5.2. When Does Liability End? ............................................. 258
   5.3. Prescription Periods .................................................... 259
   5.4. Conclusion .............................................................. 260
6. Transfer of Responsibility According to the CCS Directive .............. 261
   6.1. Introduction ............................................................. 261
   6.2. A Limited Transfer of Specific Liabilities Under EC law ........ 263
   6.3. Liabilities of the Former Operator Not Affected by the Article 18 Transfer ............................................... 264
   6.4. Conclusion .............................................................. 265
7. Review and Proposal ........................................................... 266
   7.1. Current Legal Responses to Leakages of CO₂ and Soil Movements Under EU Law and Dutch Law ......................... 266
   7.2. Changes to Dutch Liability Law in View of the CCS Directive . 269
8. Conclusion ................................................................. 271

CHAPTER X
THE CONCEPT OF THIRD PARTY ACCESS APPLIED TO CCS

Martha M. Roggenkamp ............................................................. 273

1. Introduction ................................................................. 273
2. Access to CO₂ Transportation and Storage Facilities .................... 274
   2.1. Introduction ............................................................. 274
   2.2. The Access Provision in the CCS Directive ....................... 276
   2.3. Essential Facilities ..................................................... 278
3. Other Access Regimes – A Comparison ..................................... 280
   3.1. The Concept of Third Party and/or Open Access .................. 280
   3.2. TPA to Gas Transmission and Distribution Pipeline Systems ... 282
   3.3. TPA to Gas Storage Facilities ....................................... 284
   3.4. TPA to Upstream (Gas) Pipelines .................................. 285

xii

Intersentia
### Table of Contents

2.2. Property Tax ................................................. 325  
  2.2.1. Capturing CO\textsubscript{2} .................................. 325  
  2.2.2. Transporting CO\textsubscript{2} ................................. 325  
  2.2.3. Storing CO\textsubscript{2} ..................................... 326  

2.3. Transfer Tax ...................................................... 326  
  2.3.1. Capturing CO\textsubscript{2} .................................. 326  
  2.3.2. Transporting CO\textsubscript{2} ................................. 326  
  2.3.3. Storing CO\textsubscript{2} ..................................... 327  

2.4. Value Added Tax .................................................. 327  
  2.4.1. Introduction .................................................. 327  
  2.4.2. Capturing CO\textsubscript{2} .................................. 328  
  2.4.3. Transporting CO\textsubscript{2} ................................. 329  
  2.4.3. Storing CO\textsubscript{2} ..................................... 329  

2.5. Corporate Income Tax ........................................... 329  
  2.5.1. Capturing CO\textsubscript{2} .................................. 329  
  2.5.2. Transporting CO\textsubscript{2} ................................. 336  
  2.5.3. Storing CO\textsubscript{2} ..................................... 337  

2.6. Environmental Tax ............................................... 338  

3. Offshore CCS ....................................................... 338  
  3.1. Introduction .................................................... 338  
  3.2. Corporate Income Tax and Offshore CCS ......................... 339  
  3.3. Wage Tax and Offshore CCS .................................... 339  
  3.4. VAT and Offshore CCS ......................................... 340  

4. An Assessment of the Current Tax Regime in Relation to CCS .............. 341  

5. Possible Tax Incentives for CCS .................................... 343  

6. Conclusion ......................................................... 344  

---

**PART IV**  
**CONCLUSION**

**CHAPTER XIII**  
**LOOKING BEYOND THE LEGAL UNCERTAINTIES OF CCS**  
Martha M. Roggenkamp and Edwin Woerdman .................. 347  

1. Introduction ...................................................... 347  
2. Legal Opportunities for and Legal Barriers to CCS .................. 349  
  2.1. Introduction .................................................... 349  
  2.2. Legal Possibilities ............................................ 350  
  2.3. Legal Barriers ................................................ 351  

---

Personal copy of  ()
3. Legal Uncertainties for CCS .................................................. 352
   3.1. Introduction ......................................................... 352
   3.2. International Level ................................................ 352
   3.3. EU Level ............................................................. 353
   3.4. National Level ..................................................... 355
   3.5. Other Uncertainties ............................................... 358
4. Conclusion ................................................................. 359
LIST OF ABBREVIATIONS

AAU Assigned Amount Units
AIE Accredited Independent Entities
AGRE Act on General Rules for the Environment
AHPL Act on Hindrances of Private Law
AIE Accredited Independent Entities
AMW Act on Management of Water Facilities (Wet Beheer Rijkswaterstaatswerken)
APS Act on Protection of the Soil
Awb Algemene Wet Bestuursrecht (General Administrative Law Act)
Amvb Algemene Maatregel van Bestuur (Order in Council)
BAT Best Available Techniques
BNB Beslissingen in belastingzaken/Nederlandse Belastingrechtspraak (Journal of Dutch tax law jurisprudence)
BREF Best Techniques Reference Documents
BuZa Nederlands Ministerie van Buitenlandse Zaken (Ministry of Foreign Affairs in the Netherlands)
BV Besloten Vennootschap (Limited Liability Company)
BW Burgerlijk Wetboek (Civil Code)
CCS Carbon Capture and Storage
CDM Clean Development Mechanism
CER Certified Emission Reduction
CHP Combined Heat and Power
CIT Corporate Income Tax
CITA Corporate Income Tax Act
CMP Conference of the Parties serving as the Meeting of the Parties to the Kyoto Protocol
CO₂ Carbon dioxide
COP Conference of the Parties to the United Nations Framework Convention on Climate Change
DNA Designated National Authority
DOE Designated Operational Entity
DONG Dansk Olie og Naturgas (Danish Oil and Natural Gas Company)
EBN Energie Beheer Nederland (Dutch State participant in the upstream oil and gas sector)
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Abbreviation</th>
<th>Full Form</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>EC</td>
<td>European Commission</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ECBM(R)</td>
<td>Enhanced Coal Bed Methane Recovery</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ECE</td>
<td>Economic Commission for Europe</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ECLR</td>
<td>European Competition Law Review</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>EEA</td>
<td>European Economic Area</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>EEZ</td>
<td>Exclusive Economic Zone</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>EFTA</td>
<td>European Free Trade Association</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>EGR</td>
<td>Enhanced Gas Recovery</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>EHR</td>
<td>Enhanced Hydrocarbon Recovery</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>EIA</td>
<td>Environmental Impact Assessment</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>EMA</td>
<td>Environmental Management Act</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>EOR</td>
<td>Enhanced Oil Recovery</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>EPC</td>
<td>European Policy Centre</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ERU</td>
<td>Emission Reduction Unit</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ETS</td>
<td>Emissions Trading Scheme</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>EU</td>
<td>European Union</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>EUA</td>
<td>EU Emission Allowance</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>EZ</td>
<td>Nederlands Ministerie van Economische Zaken (Ministry of Economic Affairs in the Netherlands)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>EZH</td>
<td>Elektriciteitsbedrijf Zuid Holland (Electricity production company South Holland)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>FEEM</td>
<td>Fondazione Eni Enrico Mattei (Italian Research Institute in the field of Sustainable Development)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>GALA</td>
<td>General Administrative Law Act (Algemene Wet Bestuursrecht)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>GATT</td>
<td>General Agreement on Tariffs and Trade</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>GBER</td>
<td>General Block Exemption Regulation</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>GDF</td>
<td>Gaz de France</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>GDP</td>
<td>Governmental Decree on Pipelines</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>GHG</td>
<td>Greenhouse Gas</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>HR</td>
<td>Hoge Raad (Supreme Court)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>H₂</td>
<td>Hydrogen</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>H₂O</td>
<td>Water</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ICC</td>
<td>International Chamber of Commerce</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ICCS</td>
<td>Institute of Communication and Computer Systems</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>IEA</td>
<td>International Energy Agency</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ILC</td>
<td>International Law Commission</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ILM</td>
<td>International Legal Materials</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>IPCC</td>
<td>Intergovernmental Panel on Climate Change</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>IPPC</td>
<td>Integrated Pollution Prevention and Control</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ITA</td>
<td>Income Tax Act</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>JI</td>
<td>Joint Implementation</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Abbreviation</td>
<td>Description</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>--------------</td>
<td>-------------</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>KLIC</td>
<td>Kabels en Leidingen Informatie Centrum (Centre for Information on Cables and Pipelines)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>KPI</td>
<td>Kyoto Protocol Implementation</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>LAP</td>
<td>Landelijk Afvalbeheer Plan (Dutch National Waste Management Plan)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ICER</td>
<td>Longterm Certified Emission Reduction</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>LCP</td>
<td>Large Combustion Plants</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>LPG</td>
<td>Liquefied Petroleum Gas</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>MA</td>
<td>Memorie van antwoord</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>NEa</td>
<td>Nederlandse Emissieautoriteit (Dutch Emissions Authority)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>NJ</td>
<td>Nederlandse Jurisprudentie (Dutch Case Law)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>NMa</td>
<td>Nederlandse Mededingingsautoriteit (Dutch Competition Authority)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>NO</td>
<td>Nitrogen Oxide</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>NPM</td>
<td>Nederlandse Petroleum Maatschappij (Dutch Petroleum Company)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>NTE</td>
<td>Nederlands Tijdschrift voor Energierecht (Dutch Journal of Energy Law)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Numby</td>
<td>Not Under My Backyard</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>O₂</td>
<td>Oxygen</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>OCAP</td>
<td>Organic Carbon Dioxide for Assimilation of Plants</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>OECD</td>
<td>Organisation for Economic Cooperation and Development</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>OJ</td>
<td>Official Journal</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>OSPAR</td>
<td>Oslo Parish Convention for the Protection of the Marine Environment of the North East Atlantic</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>OUP</td>
<td>Oxford University Press</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>PDD</td>
<td>Project Design Development</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>PSS</td>
<td>Pipeline Structure Scheme</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>PSV</td>
<td>Pipeline Structure Vision</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>R&amp;D</td>
<td>Research and Development</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>RFF</td>
<td>Resources for the Future</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>RMU</td>
<td>Removal Unit</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>RvdW</td>
<td>Rechtspraak van de Week (weekly overview of jurisprudence)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SEA</td>
<td>Strategic Environmental Assessment</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SME</td>
<td>Small and Medium sized Enterprises</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SO₂</td>
<td>Sulphur Dioxide</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SPA</td>
<td>Spatial Planning Act</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Stb</td>
<td>Staatsblad (Dutch Official Journal)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Stcrt</td>
<td>Staatscourant (Dutch Official Gazette)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>tCER</td>
<td>Temporary Certified Emission Reduction</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>TK</td>
<td>Tweede Kamer (Lower House of Parliament)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Abbreviation</td>
<td>Description</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>--------------</td>
<td>-------------</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>TM</td>
<td>Toelichting Meijers <em>(Memorandum to the draft Civil Code)</em></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>UN</td>
<td>United Nations</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>UNCED</td>
<td>United Nations Conference on Environment and Development</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>UNEP</td>
<td>United Nations Environment Programme</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>UNFCCC</td>
<td>United Nations Framework Convention on Climate Change</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>US/USA</td>
<td>United States / United States of America</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>VAT</td>
<td>Value Added Tax</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>VROM</td>
<td>Nederlands Ministerie van Ruimtelijke Ordening en Milieu <em>(Ministry of Spatial Planning and Environment in the Netherlands)</em></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Wabo</td>
<td>Wet Algemene Bepalingen Omgevingsrecht <em>(The Act on General Planning Provisions)</em></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>WFR</td>
<td>Weekblad voor Fiscaal Recht</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Wms</td>
<td>Wet Milieugevaarlijke Stoffen <em>(Hazardous Substances Act)</em></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Wro</td>
<td>Wet Ruimtelijke Ordening <em>(Spatial Planning Act)</em></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ZEP</td>
<td>Zero Emission Fossil Fuel Power</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
LIST OF AUTHORS

All authors listed below and employed at the University of Groningen are also participating in the Groningen Centre of Energy Law.

**Anatole J.R.T. Boute**

PhD Researcher of Energy Law at the University of Groningen, the Netherlands. Email: a.j.r.t.boute@rug.nl

**Jan N. Bouwman**

PhD, Professor of Tax Law at the University of Groningen, the Netherlands. Email: j.n.bouwman@rug.nl

**Marcel M.T.A. Brus**

PhD, Professor of Public International Law and the Law of International Organisations at the University of Groningen, the Netherlands. Email: m.m.t.a.brus@rug.nl

**Irene J.J. Burgers**

PhD, Professor of International Tax Law and Professor of Economics of Taxation at the University of Groningen, the Netherlands. Email: i.j.j.burgers@rug.nl

**Oscar Couwenberg**

PhD, Professor of Law and Economics at the University of Groningen, the Netherlands, and Director of Mazars Berenschot Corporate Finance BV. Email: o.couwenberg@rug.nl or oscar.couwenberg@mbcf.nl

**Kars J. de Graaf**

PhD, Associate Professor of Administrative and Environmental Law at the University of Groningen and Deputy Judge at the District Courts in Leeuwarden and Assen, the Netherlands. Email: k.j.de.graaf@rug.nl

**Wilbert A.J. Grevers**

PhD, Postdoctoral Research Fellow of Law and Economics at the University of Groningen, the Netherlands. Email: w.a.j.grevers@rug.nl
List of Authors

Avelien Haan
PhD, Co-ordinator of the Course Programme on Public Administration at the Noordelijke Hogeschool Leeuwarden, the Netherlands, and Postdoctoral Research Fellow of Energy Law at the University of Groningen, the Netherlands (as of 1 November 2009). Email: avelien.haan@solcon.nl or a.haankamminga@rug.nl

Jan H. Jans
PhD, Professor of Administrative Law at the University of Groningen, the Netherlands. Email: j.h.jans@rug.nl

Dick A. Lubach
PhD, Professor of Construction Law at the University of Groningen, the Netherlands, and Of Counsel at Damsté Lawyers in Enschede, the Netherlands. Email: d.a.lubach@rug.nl

Lennart Luten
Project Developer at Continental Gas Storage B.V., The Hague, the Netherlands. Email: lennart.luten@continentalgasstorage.com

Ko de Ridder
PhD, Professor of Public Administration at the University of Groningen, the Netherlands. Email: j.de.ridder@rug.nl

Martha M. Roggenkamp
PhD, Professor of Energy Law and Director of the Groningen Centre of Energy Law, University of Groningen, the Netherlands, and Of Counsel at Brinkhof Advocaten in Amsterdam, the Netherlands. E-mail: m.m.roggenkamp@rug.nl or martha.roggenkamp@brinkhof.com

Hans H.B. Vedder
PhD, Associate Professor of European and Economic Law at the University of Groningen, the Netherlands, Member of the Advisory Committee on Appeals to the Netherlands Competition Authority and Honorary Judge at the Leeuwarden Appeals Court, the Netherlands. Email: h.h.b.vedder@rug.nl

Mark H. Wissink
PhD, Professor of Private Law at the University of Groningen, the Netherlands. Email: m.h.wissink@rug.nl

Edwin Woerdman
PhD, Associate Professor of Law and Economics and Co-director of the Groningen Centre of Energy Law at the University of Groningen, the Netherlands. Email: e.woerdman@rug.nl
FOREWORD

It is a pleasure for me to write a Foreword for a book on the legal design for CO₂ Capture and Storage (CCS). The backbone of this book is the threat of climate change and the need to reduce the level of CO₂ emissions, especially in the EU. Whilst the wide deployment of renewable energy sources and improvement of energy efficiency are important policy targets to achieve the desired long-term emission reductions, they cannot result in the phase out of fossil fuel use in the short-term. Even with all the will in the world, radically changing the fuel mix will be a matter of decades rather than years, and during this period of change we will continue to require secure provision of energy.

Within this framework CCS is considered as a bridging technology, which enables the continued use of fossil fuels on the one hand, whilst reducing CO₂ emissions on the other. CCS has the potential to positively impact a wide range of market players. Next to major emitters, such as electricity generators and refineries, pipeline and storage operators will be involved in developing this technology, the importance of which is illustrated by its prominence in the European Commission’s Energy and Climate Package of January 2008.

Nevertheless, we are well aware that CCS is still a new phenomenon that not only faces several technical, social and economic challenges, but also several legal challenges. On 23 April 2009, Directive 2009/31/EC on the geological storage of carbon dioxide entered into force. Although this Directive provides a robust legal framework for implementing CCS in the EU, it is up to the Member States to translate it into national law. This could result in different national solutions across the EU and raises legal issues and questions that need to be addressed.

This book focuses on legal issues concerning the development of CCS in the EU, and the Netherlands in particular. Sixteen authors from the Groningen Centre of Energy Law of the University of Groningen in the Netherlands have combined their knowledge and expertise to present an in-depth overview of the legal issues relating to the CCS value chain. The strength of the book is in its breadth, which covers the relevant pipeline and storage legislation, international law, and also EU competition and environmental law.
The end result is an interesting collection of ideas, suggestions and puzzles that will help lawyers and policymakers to further strengthen and improve the legal framework for CCS.

*Legal Design of Carbon Capture and Storage* is a comprehensive, scientific analysis of the recently adopted legal framework for CCS, including Directive 2009/31/EC on the geological storage of carbon dioxide. The case study on the Netherlands provides an interesting discussion of the legal issues that can be encountered when implementing the Directive into national law. I would like to congratulate the editors and authors for preparing this very useful publication.

Andris Piebalgs  
Energy Commissioner  
European Commission  

Brussels, 6 October 2009
INTRODUCTION

Martha M. Roggenkamp and Edwin Woerdman

Legal Design of Carbon Capture and Storage is the result of the first comprehensive research project initiated by the Groningen Centre of Energy Law, which is part of the Faculty of Law at the University of Groningen in the Netherlands. This research project was carried out between late 2007 and summer 2009, involving 16 researchers active in the Centre with complementary legal and interdisciplinary backgrounds. Part of this research has been presented earlier at the Energy Delta Convention organized in Groningen in November 2008.

1. THE GRONINGEN CENTRE OF ENERGY LAW

The University of Groningen has a special connection with the energy sector. Not only is it situated on top of the Groningen gas field, but it also has close ties with the market parties developing this field. Currently, the University and companies like Gasunie are co-operating in several energy-related organisations such as the Energy Delta Institute and the Energy Valley. Moreover, the Board of the University of Groningen has explicitly chosen “energy” as one of the key areas for its research and education.

The Groningen Centre of Energy Law was established in 2007 by Martha Roggenkamp, following her appointment as the first Dutch professor of energy law at the University of Groningen, and Edwin Woerdman, associate professor of law and economics and a specialist in emissions trading at the same university. The Groningen Centre of Energy Law involves some 25 researchers and co-ordinates all research within the Faculty of Law involving the energy sector, ‘from well head to burner pit’. It includes all legislation and regulation applying to the production, transmission and supply of energy, the promotion of renewable energy sources, the need to secure energy supply, as well as issues concerning climate change and environmental protection. Parties active in the energy sector are increasingly confronted with constantly changing legal issues. The Groningen Centre of Energy Law has the knowledge and expertise to explain and assess these complex questions.

Intersentia
Since its foundation in 2007, the Groningen Centre of Energy Law has participated in several other research institutions. It is, for example, part of the Energy Delta Research Centre, which co-ordinates all energy research within the University of Groningen as a whole. In addition, the Groningen Centre of Energy Law takes part in the newly established Groningen Centre for Law and Governance. The latter Centre focuses on the interaction between public and private law and the function of law in the regulatory state. Energy law is, as explained above, a typical example of such interaction.

2. THE RELEVANCE OF CARBON CAPTURE AND STORAGE

Carbon Capture and Storage (CCS) is a new combination of technologies that may become available to firms that emit CO₂ in the European Union (EU). The aim of this new technique is to capture CO₂ emissions and store it underground in order to avoid their emission in the air and to combat climate change in general. Why did the Groningen Centre of Energy Law choose CCS as its first research topic? There are basically two reasons.

First, CCS will be an essential part of climate policy in the EU. This policy aims at substantial CO₂ emission reductions: a 20% reduction in 2030, and, if a successor to Kyoto can be negotiated, an even higher target, i.e. 30% in 2020 and 60 to 80% in 2050. Various authors predict that CCS will take up about 15% of the greenhouse gas reduction efforts that the EU needs to achieve under the Kyoto Protocol.

Secondly, both the city of Groningen and the Province of Groningen are likely to play a significant role in the development of CCS in the North of the Netherlands. Not only can CO₂ be stored in empty gas fields in and around the Province of Groningen, but CCS demonstration projects are also likely to emerge in the Eemshaven, a major harbour in the North of the Netherlands, where RWE and Nuon will build new (partly) coal-fired power plants.

3. LEGAL RESEARCH ON CARBON CAPTURE AND STORAGE

Directive 2009/31/EC on the geological storage of carbon dioxide, adopted on 23 April 2009, provides a legal framework for developing CCS in the EU. Although
some reports\textsuperscript{1} and individual chapters\textsuperscript{2} have been written on legal issues involving CCS, to our knowledge, no monographs taking a complete legal perspective to CCS have been written so far and certainly not on the ‘CCS Directive’ in the EU. Our book fills that gap in the literature.

When starting our research project, we aimed at examining the legal issues connected to each phase in the CCS chain, i.e. legal issues concerning the capture of CO\textsubscript{2}, the transportation of CO\textsubscript{2}, the permanent storage of CO\textsubscript{2} and any long-term liability connected to it. In addition, we wished to assess the position of CCS in the international climate change regime and the EU emissions trading regime. Some of these issues are also dealt with in the CCS Directive itself. Legal issues and policy questions we have addressed include, for example:

\begin{itemize}
  \item Do coastal states have an exclusive right to regulate carbon storage in their continental shelf and/or exclusive economic zone?
  \item Is CO\textsubscript{2} waste and subject to the EU Waste Directive?
  \item Are the general provisions for third party access sufficient to prevent possible foreclosure arising from vertical integration in the market for CCS?
  \item Who decides whether a potential reservoir is used for either gas or CO\textsubscript{2} storage: the licensee, the operator or the competent authority?
  \item Who is liable for any long-term damage arising from CO\textsubscript{2} storage? And does the transfer of liability to the state remove the (former) storage operator of all liability under national law?
  \item How do we make sure that the emissions trading regime applies to CO\textsubscript{2} leakages from pipelines and storage facilities?
  \item Is the CCS market prone to opportunistic political intervention in such a way that it requires a regulating authority with rule making powers independent of political control?
\end{itemize}

\textit{Legal Design of Carbon Capture and Storage} raises many of such issues and questions. The authors provide analyses or sketch tentative ideas for addressing them. The end result is a collection of conclusions, advices, suggestions and sometimes paradoxes that will hopefully help lawyers and policy makers to further strengthen and improve the legal framework for CCS. We hope that the book will also inspire other scientists and observers to raise legal questions we

\textsuperscript{1} E.g. \textit{Legal Aspects of Storing CO\textsubscript{2}: Update and Recommendations}, 2007, Paris: International Energy Agency (IEA).

forgot to ask or to come up with legal solutions we did not foresee. Only this will bring further both the law and legal science.

The monograph provides a comprehensive, scientific and interdisciplinary assessment of the legal framework for CCS, including Directive 2009/31/EC on the geological storage of carbon dioxide. The legal perspective dominates, dealing with issues that vary from international to national law and from public to private law. Taking into account the fact that the earlier mentioned EU Directive needs to be implemented in national law, we have taken the legal developments in the Netherlands as a case study for any issues which will be raised during such process of implementation. Next to legal discussions, the book also pays attention to technical aspects and economic incentives for CCS. We do not claim to be complete, but we do believe that this aspect makes our book even more relevant to policy makers and also more fascinating to read for scholars interested in, for instance, law and economics or the law and society tradition.

4. OUTLINE OF THE BOOK

The book is organised as follows. It is divided into four parts: (i) General, (ii) International and EU law, (iii) CCS in the Netherlands and (iv) Conclusion.

Part I is of a general nature and deals with the technical aspects and safety risks of the entire CCS chain. We have included a specific chapter covering these issues because we consider such basic information to be helpful, also for lawyers, to understand CCS as a new combination of existing technologies (Chapter 1 by Grevers and Luten).

Part II focuses on both international and EU law. First, the status of CCS is considered, for instance, under various United Nations Conventions (such as the UNFCCC, UNCLOS and OSPAR) (Chapter 2 by Brus). Thereafter we turn more specifically to the Kyoto Protocol as this Treaty is the international background against which the development of CCS should be seen. Therefore, CCS is studied in relation to Joint Implementation (JI) and the Clean Development Mechanism (CDM) under the Kyoto Protocol (Chapter 3 by Boute). We then descend to the EU level and more particularly to Directive 2009/31/EC which forms the backbone of the legal framework for CCS in the EU. First, we consider the incentives for CCS in the context of the EU emissions trading scheme (Chapter 4 by Woerdman and Couwenberg) and thereafter we turn to the impact of EU competition law to CCS (Chapter 5 by Vedder). Finally, the role of EU environmental law in CCS is
taken into account as well as its impact on national law, i.e. the Netherlands (Chapter 6 by Jans and De Graaf).

Part III examines in more detail the development of CCS in the Netherlands. As Directive 2009/31/EC must be transposed into national law by 25 June 2011, we consider this part as a case study on legal issues which may arise while implementing the Directive. Following the analysis in the previous part on environmental law, which to a large extent deals with issues related to capture, we begin this part with an analysis of the legal framework applying to existing and new pipelines for CO₂ transportation, both from a public and private law perspective (Chapter 7 by Lubach). Then, the regulation is studied for underground storage of CO₂ (Chapter 8 by Roggenkamp). After that, attention is paid to post-injection liability for onshore CO₂ storage (Chapter 9 by Wissink). We continue by analysing the application of the concept of third party access to CCS (Chapter 10 by Roggenkamp). Also the role of the competent authority in regulating CCS receives ample attention (Chapter 11 by De Ridder and Haan). Finally, the question is posed whether tax law will act as a barrier or as a tool for promoting CCS (Chapter 12 by Bouwman and Burgers).

In Part IV, some general conclusions are drawn based on the findings in the previous chapters. The editors do not only sketch a number of legal uncertainties that still exist for CCS, but also try to look beyond them by considering the outlines of some remedies which may be necessary in order to obtain an even stronger and more predictable legal framework for CCS (Chapter 13 by Roggenkamp and Woerdman).

5. ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

Finally, the editors wish to thank the authors for their cooperation in preparing this book and their patience with the editors constantly returning to them with difficult questions. We also would like to thank the publisher for his cooperative approach. Finally, we appreciate the help provided by policy makers and market participants. In particular, we wish to thank Scott Brockett of the European Commission, who was so kind to answer some questions on the CCS Directive, Fokke Elskamp of the Ministry of Economic Affairs who came to Groningen to discuss the draft CCS Directive with us, and Klaas Lemstra from the Nederlandse Aardolie Maatschappij (NAM), who commented on the draft chapters. Finally, we would like to thank Sandy Janssen for her assistance in preparing the manuscript of this book. Of course, any remaining omissions and errors are our own.
Last but not least, we hope that this book will be the beginning of more, in-depth research at the Groningen Centre of Energy Law on issues related to CCS and other legal developments concerning the energy sector.