INTERNATIONAL SOCIAL SECURITY STANDARDS

Current Views and Interpretation Matters

Edited by

Frans PENNINGS

Contributors

Leontine BIJLEVELD
Onno BRINKMAN
Teun DE VRIES
Tineke DIJKHOFF
Ana Gomez HEREDERO
Lauri LEPPIK
Angelika NUßBERGER
Frans PENNINGS
Paul SCHOUKENS

intersentia
Antwerpen – Oxford
International Social Security Standards. Current Views and Interpretation Matters
Frans Pennings (ed.)

© 2007 Intersentia
Antwerpen – Oxford
http://www.intersentia.be

D/2007/7849/107
NUR 825

No part of this book may be reproduced in any form, by print, photoprint, microfilm or any other means, without written permission from the publisher.
# TABLE OF CONTENTS

**PREFACE** ................................. xiii

**LIST OF ABBREVIATIONS** ............................... xv

**CHAPTER 1**  
**AN OVERVIEW OF INTERPRETATION ISSUES OF INTERNATIONAL SOCIAL SECURITY STANDARDS**  
F. Penning ....................................... 1

1.1. Introduction .................................. 1
1.2. The Development of International Social Security Standards .............. 3  
  1.2.1. The Development of ILO Standards .................................... 3  
  1.2.2. The Council of Europe and the Development of Its Standards ........... 5  
1.3. Principles Underlying the Social Security Conventions .................... 7  
1.4. Supervision .................................. 8  
1.5. The Role of Conventions in National Law ................................... 9  
  1.5.1. Before Ratification .................................................. 9  
  1.5.2. After Ratification .................................................. 10  
1.6. The Impact of the Conventions in National Discussions ................... 11  
  1.6.1. The Role of Conventions in Relation to Proposed Changes of National Law ........................................ 11  
  1.6.2. The Issue of Whether Conventions Hinder or Allow Modernisation of Social Security ..................... 13  
1.7. Courts and the Conventions .............................................. 15  
  1.7.1. Introduction .................................................. 15  
  1.7.2. Case 1: Direct Effect in the Case of Cost Sharing by Pregnant Women .................................................. 16  
  1.7.3. Case 2: Direct Effect in the Case of Export of Benefits .............. 18  
  1.7.4. Case 3: Direct Effect of the European Code of Social Security ..... 19  
  1.7.5. Case 4: Direct Effect: Suspension of Benefit ....................... 20  
  1.7.6. Case 5: No Direct Effect in the Case of the Survivors Benefits Act.. 21  
1.8. The Topics of This Book .............................................. 24  
  1.8.1. Introduction .................................................. 24  
  1.8.2. Possibilities for Increasing the Impact of the Conventions ........... 24  

Intersentia
Table of Contents

1.8.3. Methods of Interpretation of the Conventions ................................. 25
1.8.4. The Lack of an Explanatory Memorandum and the Lack of Systematic Access to Interpretations of the Conventions ............... 27
1.8.5. The Interpretations Given by ILO Bodies ......................................... 28
1.8.6. Interpretation Methods and the Room for Modernisation ............... 30
1.9. The Structure of This Book ............................................................... 30

CHAPTER 2
INTERPRETATION OF INTERNATIONAL SOCIAL SECURITY STANDARDS – PROBLEMS AND PROSPECTS
A. Nußberger ................................................................. 33

2.1. Introduction ................................................................. 33
2.2. The Debate on Social Security at the International Level ................. 35
2.3. Different Concepts of Social Security on the International Level ........ 36
   2.3.1. A Narrow Concept of Social Security ......................................... 36
   2.3.2. A Classical Concept of Social Security ....................................... 37
   2.3.3. A Broad Concept of Social Security .......................................... 38
2.4. Different Approaches to the Interpretation of International Social Security Law ................................................................. 40
   2.4.1. Comprehensive Interpretation Versus Treaty Specific Interpretation ................................................................. 40
   2.4.2. Realistic Versus Idealistic Interpretation ................................... 42
   2.4.3. Historical Versus Evolutive Interpretation ................................ 44
2.5. Specific Problems Related to the Interpretation of ILO Social Security Conventions ................................................................. 45
   2.5.1. The Use of Specific Legal Terminology ...................................... 45
   2.5.2. Restriction of the Mandate of the Supervisory Bodies ................ 46
       2.5.2.1. The Mandate of the International Court of Justice ................ 46
       2.5.2.2. The Mandate of the International Labour Office .................. 46
       2.5.2.3. The Mandate of the Committee of Experts on the Application of Conventions and Recommendations .................. 47
2.6. Future Developments of Social Security Standards in International Law .... 48
   2.6.1. The Position of Social Security Standards Within the Normative Policy of the ILO ................................................................. 48
   2.6.2. Stagnation of International Law Making on Human Rights Issues .... 49
   2.6.3. The Lack of Individual Complaints Procedures for Social Rights ... 49
CHAPTER 3
OBJECTIVES AND INTERPRETATION METHODS OF THE CONVENTIONS OF THE COUNCIL OF EUROPE

A. Gomez Heredero .................................................. 51

3.1. The Role of the Council of Europe in Promoting Social Standards ........ 51
3.2. Harmonisation and Co-Ordination Instruments of the Council of
Europe .......................................................... 52
3.3. The European Code of Social Security and the Protocol .................. 53
3.3.1. Historical Background .................................. 53
3.3.2. Aims and Standards .................................... 54
3.3.2.1. The Code ........................................... 54
3.3.2.2. The Protocol ..................................... 56
3.3.3. Supervision Procedure ................................. 56
3.3.3.1. Introduction ....................................... 56
3.3.3.2. The Procedure Dealing with Annual Reports ....... 57
3.3.3.3. The Procedure Concerning Bi-Annual Reports .... 58
3.4. The Impact of the European Code of Social Security and the Protocol
at the National Level .......................................... 58
3.4.1. Introduction .............................................. 58
3.4.2. Do the Norms of the Code and the Protocol Have Direct Effect? ... 59
3.4.3. Impact of the Standards on the Contingencies ................. 60
3.4.3.1. Introduction ........................................ 60
3.4.3.2. Medical Care ....................................... 60
3.4.3.3. Sickness Benefit ................................... 62
3.4.3.4. Unemployment Benefit ............................ 63
3.4.3.5. Employment Injury Benefit ....................... 65
3.4.3.6. Family Benefit ..................................... 67
3.4.3.7. Maternity Benefit .................................. 68
3.5. Development of Social Security – Some Problems of Interpretation and
Reactions to These by the Council of Europe ........................ 68
3.6. Conclusion .................................................. 69

CHAPTER 4
INSTRUMENTS OF THE COUNCIL OF EUROPE AND INTERPRETATION
PROBLEMS

P. Schoukens .......................................................... 71

4.1. Introduction .................................................. 71
4.2. Characteristics of the Standard Setting Instruments of the Council of
Europe .......................................................... 72
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Section</th>
<th>Title</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>4.3</td>
<td>The European Social Charter</td>
<td>74</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.4</td>
<td>The Relation Between the European Court of Human Rights and the European Social Charter</td>
<td>75</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.5</td>
<td>The Supervision of the Charter</td>
<td>77</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.6</td>
<td>Interpretation of the Charter by the European Committee of Social Rights</td>
<td>78</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.7</td>
<td>The European Code of Social Security</td>
<td>79</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.7.1</td>
<td>Introduction</td>
<td>79</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.7.2</td>
<td>The Contents of the Code</td>
<td>81</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.7.3</td>
<td>The Personal Scope of the Code</td>
<td>81</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.7.4</td>
<td>Benefit Conditions</td>
<td>82</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.7.5</td>
<td>Direct Applicability of the Code in National Case Law</td>
<td>84</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.8</td>
<td>Some Interpretation Problems</td>
<td>85</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.8.1</td>
<td>The Term Employee</td>
<td>85</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.8.2</td>
<td>The Definition of Standard Worker</td>
<td>86</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.8.3</td>
<td>The Requirement of Own Contribution by Claimants</td>
<td>86</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.8.4</td>
<td>Qualifying Period and the Preclusion of Abuse</td>
<td>86</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.8.5</td>
<td>Defined Contributions Schemes and the Code</td>
<td>87</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.8.6</td>
<td>The Composition of the Administration of the Schemes and Privatisation</td>
<td>87</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.8.7</td>
<td>Mixed Schemes</td>
<td>87</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.8.8</td>
<td>Statistical Data</td>
<td>88</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.8.9</td>
<td>The All or Nothing Approach</td>
<td>88</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.9</td>
<td>The Value of the Code and Conclusions</td>
<td>89</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5.1</td>
<td>Introduction</td>
<td>91</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5.2</td>
<td>Some Remarks on the Impact of Conventions in General</td>
<td>92</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5.3</td>
<td>Direct Effect of ILO Conventions in Dutch Court Decisions</td>
<td>93</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5.4</td>
<td>Conclusions on the Direct Effect of ILO Conventions in Dutch Case Law</td>
<td>97</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5.5</td>
<td>What is the Meaning of the Views of the Committee of Experts for Judges?</td>
<td>97</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5.6</td>
<td>What Can Be the Role of the International Labour Office for Judges?</td>
<td>98</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5.7</td>
<td>Conclusions and Recommendations</td>
<td>99</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
CHAPTER 6
THE ROLE OF ILO CONVENTIONS AND INTERPRETATION PROBLEMS: EXPERIENCES FROM THE TRADE UNION MOVEMENT

L. Bijleveld ................................................................. 101

6.1. Introduction .................................................. 101
6.2. The Attitude of Trade Unions Towards ILO Standards .......... 102
6.3. The Janus Face – from Principles to Opportunism ................. 104
6.4. No Standard Setting Without Ratification ........................ 105
6.5. Experiences with the Application of Particular Conventions ...... 106
   6.5.1. Convention 121 and Survivors’ Benefits: No Systematic
          Attention of the Union to Non-Compliance ................ 106
   6.5.2. Convention 128 and Survivors Benefits: Difficulties in
          Communication with the Government .................... 108
   6.5.3. Convention 128 and Old-Age Benefits ................... 110
   6.5.4. Convention 103 and Maternity Protection: Putting the Issue
          on the ILO Agenda ........................................ 111
6.6. Need for Modernisation of the Conventions? ....................... 112
6.7. Drafting Conventions in the 21st Century ........................ 113
6.8. Conclusions .................................................. 114

CHAPTER 7
THE ROLE OF INTERNATIONAL SOCIAL SECURITY STANDARDS
FROM A GOVERNMENT’S POINT OF VIEW

O. Brinkman ............................................................... 117

7.1. Introduction .................................................. 117
7.2. Main Features of the Dutch Privatised Sickness Benefit Scheme .... 118
7.3. The Conclusions of the European Committee of Social Rights .... 119
7.4. Social Rights .................................................. 121
7.5. A New Definition of Social Security ................................ 123

CHAPTER 8
EXPERIENCES WITH INTERNATIONAL SOCIAL SECURITY
CONVENTIONS: A POINT OF VIEW FROM CENTRAL AND EASTERN
EUROPEAN STATES

L. Leppik ................................................................. 125

8.1. Introduction .................................................. 125
8.2. Historical Developments ...................................... 126

Intersentia ix
# Table of Contents

8.3. A Revival of the Old Conventions? .................................................. 129
8.4. International Standards in a Broader Perspective ........................ 132
8.5. Attempts to Modernise Social Security Standards ....................... 136

CHAPTER 9
SUMMARY OF THE DISCUSSION SESSIONS ........................................ 139

CHAPTER 10
THE INTERPRETATION OF INTERNATIONAL SOCIAL SECURITY
STANDARDS
   T. Dijkhoff and F. Pennings .......................................................... 149

10.1. Introduction .............................................................................. 149
10.2. The Context of Social Security Conventions .............................. 150
     10.2.1. The Impact of the Conventions in General ..................... 150
     10.2.2. Differences Between Law and Practice ....................... 151
     10.2.3. A Paradox ................................................................. 152
     10.2.4. The Relationship Between Supervision and Interpretation 153
10.3. The Main Problems with Interpreting the Conventions ............... 155
10.4. Different Methods of Interpretation ......................................... 159
     10.4.1. The Concept of Social Security ................................ 159
     10.4.2. Interpretation Methods .............................................. 160
     10.4.3. Different Interpretation Methods Lead to Different Outcomes 162
10.5. The Mandate of the Committee of Experts as Regards Interpretation Matters ................................................................. 163
10.6. Interpretation by National Courts ............................................ 166
     10.6.1. The Relationship Between Interpretations by the Committee and Accepting Direct Effect .............................. 166
     10.6.2. Direct Effect: The Cases on Cost Sharing ...................... 167
     10.6.3. Direct Effect: The Case of Export of Benefits ............... 167
     10.6.4. Direct Effect: Suspension and Wilful Misconduct .......... 169
     10.6.5. Cases in Which No Direct Effect Was Accepted ............ 170
10.7. Conclusions and Recommendations .......................................... 172

BIBLIOGRAPHY .................................................................................. 175
ANNEXES ................................................................. 179

European Code of Social Security and Protocol to the European Code
of Social Security ......................................................... 181
Article 12 of the European Social Charter ................................ 215
Decision 1: Central Appeals Court 29 May 1996 ....................... 217
Decision 2: Central Appeals Court 24 January 2001 .................. 223
Decision 3: Central Appeals Court 4 April 2003 ......................... 231
Decision 4: Central Appeals Court 13 June 2003 ....................... 237
Decision 5: Central Appeals Court 14 March 2003 .................... 243
Decision 6: Central Appeals Court 8 September 2006 ................. 253
Decision 7: Federal Insurance Tribunal (Switzerland) 25 August 1993 . 259
Decision 8: Federal Insurance Tribunal (Switzerland) 21 February 1994 . 269

LIST OF CONTRIBUTORS .................................................. 275

INDEX ................................................................. 277
PREFACE

Nowadays international law plays an important role in many areas of law. This is also true for social security systems, but this area of law appears to have a special status. This can clearly be seen in discussions on the revision of the EC Treaty or the proposed constitutional treaty for the European Union: ‘hands off social security!’ Still, a series of international instruments on social security have been developed in the framework of, in particular, the International Labour Organisation (ILO) and the Council of Europe.

In order to gain more knowledge of the impact and role of these standards, experts from several countries have made a study of the meaning of the instruments in their country. This led to a publication in the spring of 2006 on the impact of international social security standards on national social security law.¹ Since this book touched on many interesting issues, we thought it useful to organise a symposium in order to have an exchange of ideas of experts and persons who are in practice working with the standards. This symposium was held on 3 November 2006 at Tilburg University. It received financial support from the Stichting Instituut Gak, the Netherlands. I am grateful to the speakers at the conference for contributing to the success of the project and to the making of this book.

The present book contains the edited presentations made during the conference. They are preceded by an introduction to the conventions and followed by a chapter in which we put the contributions into perspective and draw some conclusions from them.

In the Annex we include materials which may be useful to the reader. Among these is the European Code of Social Security; since several chapters refer to the code readers may wish to have it within reach. In addition we include the texts of national case law in which conventions were given direct effect or in which such direct effect was denied. The Dutch texts are so far not available in English and we think that it is worthwhile that now also others than Dutch speakers are able to read them.

The book is part of the project 'Europe and social security', funded by the Stichting Instituut Gak, in which four PhD students participate under my supervision. Of them, Tineke Dijkhoff and Maria Korda investigate the contents and meaning of ILO and Council of Europe instruments on social security and study the role of these instruments in some European countries. Barbara Hofman studies whether new developments in Dutch social security are consistent with international standards, which study may also lead to proposals for the reform of these standards. Saskia Montebovi started a study on the effects of cross-border movement on these new forms of social security.²

The first three of the PhD students were already employed at the time of the conference; they supported me very much in organising the conference and in converting the contributions into readable texts. Kees Boos helped me to organise the conference, to edit the book and to correct the texts. Paula Vonk-Cunningham translated judgments 1 to 6 included in the Annex of this book.

Tilburg, 1 November 2007

Frans Pennings (f.j.l.pennings@uvt.nl)

² For more information, see <www.tilburguniversity.nl/faculties/law/departments>, go to social law, research, Europe and social security.
# LIST OF ABBREVIATIONS

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Abbreviation</th>
<th>Full Form</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>AAW</td>
<td>Algemene Arbeidsongeschiktheidswet (National Law Relating to Incapacity for Work)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>AB</td>
<td>Administratiefrechtelijke Beslissingen (Administrative Law Decisions – Dutch magazine)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ABP</td>
<td>Algemene Burgerlijke Pensioenwet (Public Servants’ Superannuation Act)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Anw</td>
<td>Algemene nabestaandenwet (National Survivor Benefits Act)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>AOG</td>
<td>Adjudication Officer’s Guide</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>AOW</td>
<td>Algemene Ouderdomswet (National Old-Age Pension Act)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Awb</td>
<td>Algemene wet bestuursrecht (National Administrative Law Act)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>AWBZ</td>
<td>Algemene Wet Bijzondere Ziektekosten (Exceptional Medical Expenses Act)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>AWW</td>
<td>Algemene Weduwen- en Wezenwet (National Law on Widows and Orphans)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>BW</td>
<td>Burgerlijk Wetboek (Netherlands Civil Code)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>BEU</td>
<td>Wet beperking export uitkeringen (Benefit Restrictions (Foreign Residence) Act)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CEACR</td>
<td>Committee of Experts on the Application of Conventions and Recommendations</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CGTP-IN</td>
<td>General Confederation of Portuguese Workers</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CRvB</td>
<td>Centrale Raad van Beroep (Central Appeals Court)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CS-CO</td>
<td>Committee of Experts on Standard Setting in the Social Security Field</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CS-SS</td>
<td>Committee of Experts on Social Security</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CEE</td>
<td>Central and Eastern European</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CEEC</td>
<td>Central and Eastern European Countries</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>EC</td>
<td>European Community</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ECHR</td>
<td>European Convention for the Protection of Human Rights and Fundamental Freedoms</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ECSR</td>
<td>European Committee of Social Rights</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ECSS</td>
<td>European Convention on Social Security</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>EI</td>
<td>Education International</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ESC</td>
<td>European Social Charter</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>EU</td>
<td>European Union</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>FNV</td>
<td>Federatie Nederlandse Vakbeweging (Netherlands Trade Union Confederation)</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
FYROM    Former Yugoslav Republic of Macedonia
GDP      gross domestic product
HR       Hoge Raad (Supreme Court of the Netherlands)
ICCPR    International Covenant on Civil and Political Rights
ICESCR   International Covenant on Economic, Social and Cultural Rights
CFTU     International Confederation of Free Trade Unions
ICJ      International Court of Justice
IKA      Idryma Kinonikon Asfaliseon (Social Insurance Administration – Greece)
ILC      International Labour Conference
ILO      International Labour Organisation
LAI      (Swiss) Law on Invalidity Insurance
Lisv     Landelijk Instituut Sociale Verzekeringen (National Social Insurance Institute)
NGO      Non-Governmental Organisation
NLG      Nederlandse gulden (Dutch Guilder)
OECD     Organisation for Economic Co-Operation and Development
PSI      Public Services International
RSV      Rechtspraak Sociale Verzekering (Dutch magazine with law reports)
SER      Sociaal-Economische Raad (Dutch Social and Economic Council)
Stb      Staatsblad (Dutch Official Journal)
SVB      Sociale Verzekeringsbank (Social Insurance Bank)
Trb      Tractatenblad (Dutch Treaty Series)
TW       Toeslagenwet (Benefit Supplements Act)
UK       United Kingdom
UN       United Nations
USZO     Uitvoeringsinstelling Sociale Zekerheid voor Overheids- en Onderwijs personeel (Benefits Agency for the Public Service and Education Sector)
Uwv      Uitvoeringsinstituut werknemersverzekeringen (Employees’ Benefits Administration)
Wajong   Wet arbeidsongeschiktheidsvoorziening voor jonggehandicapten (Disablement Assistance Act for the Young Disabled)
WAO      Wet op de arbeidsongeschiktheidsverzekering (Disability Insurance Act)
Wet BEU  Wet beperking export uitkeringen (Benefit Restrictions (Foreign Residence) Act)
WIA      Wet Werk en Inkomen naar Arbeidsvermogen (Work and Income (Capacity for Work) Act)
WWB      Wet Werk en Bijstand (Work and Social Assistance Act)
Zfw      Ziekenfondswet (Health Insurance Act)

List of Abbreviations