PRIVATISATION AND HUMAN RIGHTS IN THE AGE OF GLOBALISATION

KOEN DE FEYTER
FELIPE GÓMEZ ISA
(EDS.)

University of Deusto
Institute of Human Rights Pedro Arrupe
Maastricht Centre for Human Rights
intersentia
Antwerp – Oxford
Privatisation and Human Rights in the Age of Globalisation
Koen De Feyter and Felipe Gómez Isa (eds.)

© 2005 Intersentia
Antwerp – Oxford
http://www.intersentia.com

ISBN 90-5095-422-7
D/2005/7849/9
NUR 828

No part of this book may be reproduced in any form, by print, photoprint, microfilm or any other means, without written permission from the publisher.
PREFACE

The book you hold is the result of a joint research project on Privatization and Human Rights under the auspices of the Center for Human Rights (University of Maastricht, the Netherlands) and the Institute of Human Rights Pedro Arrupe (University of Deusto, Basque Country, Spain).

The research project gathered academics from different parts of the world and combined both a theoretical and a practical approach to a very controversial issue of contemporary international and national economic relations: privatisation as one of the main ingredients of the current process of globalisation. This project aspires to fill a gap in the analyses made of privatisation so far, which mostly take an economic approach. Only recently research has started on the potential human rights implications of privatisation.

The project was launched in 2003. A very fruitful author’s conference was convened on the premises of the European Inter-University Center for Human Rights and Democratisation (EIUC, Venice, Italy). Taking into account the comments made by the authors and invited guests, we initiated the editorial review process that led to the publication of Privatisation and Human Rights in the Age of Globalisation. At the occasion of the publication of the book, a Conference took place in Maastricht on the 25th February 2005, with the presence of most of the contributors. The book has also served as the basis for a specialized course in the framework of the European Master Degree in Human Rights and Democratisation at the Institute of Human Rights of the University of Deusto.

We would like to take the opportunity to thank all people that participated in the long process of completion of this book. We would like to explicitly mention the staff of the Maastricht Center for Human Rights under the academic guidance of Professor Fons Coomans, and under the administrative coordination of Chantal Kuypers. Our publisher, Intersentia, showed great interest in the project from the beginning, and offered unrelenting support in all stages of production of the book.

Felipe Gómez Isa and Koen De Feyter
Bilbao and Venice
January 2005
# TABLE OF CONTENTS

**PREFACE** ................................................................. v

**PRIVATISATION AND HUMAN RIGHTS: AN OVERVIEW**  
KOEN DE FEYTER and FELIPE GÓMEZ ISA ....................... 1

Human rights ............................................................. 2
State obligations ......................................................... 3
Private actors ............................................................ 5
International and domestic law ........................................ 6
Economic globalisation .................................................. 7

**GLOBALISATION, PRIVATISATION AND HUMAN RIGHTS**  
FELIPE GÓMEZ ISA ....................................................... 9

1. Globalisation as a multidimensional process .................. 10
2. Consequences of the current process of globalisation .......... 13
   2.1. The reduction of the role of the state ...................... 13
       2.1.1. Privatisation and human rights ....................... 14
   2.2. The increasing role of transnational corporations .......... 23
   2.3. The impact on cultural identities .......................... 25
3. The necessary globalisation of human rights .................. 27

**HUMAN RIGHTS AND THE PRIVATISATION OF PUBLIC UTILITIES AND ESSENTIAL SERVICES**  
COSMO GRAHAM ........................................................... 33

1. Scope of the paper: issues of definition ...................... 35
   2.1. Positive obligations ........................................ 41
   2.2. Rights of access in national constitutions or human rights documents ................................................. 42
   2.3. What is a public body? ................................. 43
3. Access to services in Britain .................................... 50
   3.1. Access to utility services .............................. 50
   3.2. Access to energy services ............................... 52
   3.3. Universal service in water ............................... 53

Intersentia    vii
3.4. Universal service in telecommunications ................ 55
4. Conclusions ........................................... 55

PRIVATISATION OF CORRECTIONS: A VIOLATION OF U.S. DOMESTIC LAW, INTERNATIONAL HUMAN RIGHTS, AND GOOD SENSE
IRA P. ROBBINS ......................................... 57

1. Introduction ........................................... 57
2. Advantages and criticisms ................................ 59
3. U.S. constitutional issues ................................ 63
  3.1. State action ........................................ 63
    3.1.1. Public-function test ........................... 64
    3.1.2. Close-nexus test .............................. 65
    3.1.3. State-compulsion test .......................... 67
  3.2. U.S. Supreme Court approach ........................ 68
  3.3. Delegation ........................................ 69
  3.4. Other important legal and policy issues ................. 72
4. International human rights violations ...................... 75
  4.1. Staffing ........................................... 76
  4.2. Staff training and experience ........................ 79
  4.3. Medical access ..................................... 81
  4.4. Prisoner programs .................................. 83
  4.5. Specific populations: Juveniles and asylum seekers .... 85
  4.6. Government responsibility ........................... 86
5. Symbolism: the hidden issue ................................ 88
6. Conclusion ............................................ 89

PRIVATISATION, PRISONS, DEMOCRACY AND HUMAN RIGHTS: THE NEED TO EXTEND THE PROVINCE OF ADMINISTRATIVE LAW
ALFRED C. AMAN, JR. ..................................... 91

1. Introduction ........................................... 91
2. The democracy problem ................................... 96
3. State centric and denationalised aspects of globalisation ...... 100
4. Delegations to the market ................................ 103
  4.1. Privatisation ...................................... 103
  4.2. Private prisons .................................... 105
  4.3. Regulating private prisons: Towards a model statute .... 107
    4.3.1. Privatisation, cost, democracy and inequality .... 108
SPECIAL PROTECTION IS A MATTER OF HUMAN RIGHTS:
EXPLORING THE ICESCR RIGHT TO SOCIAL SECURITY
IN THE CONTEXT OF GLOBALISATION

LUCIE LAMARCHE ....................................... 129

1. Introduction .......................................... 129

2. From the right to social security “stricto sensu” to the
   right to social protection ................................ 131
   2.1. Social security ‘stricto sensu’ ........................ 132
       2.1.1. Protected classes of persons ................... 135
       2.1.2. The level of benefits .......................... 135
       2.1.3. Choice of social security systems .............. 136
       2.2. Social security in trouble: the globalisation era .... 138
       2.3. Social security that includes “other workers”: a first yield
            for the ILO’s work .................................. 142
       2.4. Social security as a component of social protection:
            a second yield for the ILO’s work ................. 144

3. The requirements of the human right to social protection:
   the obligations of state and non-state actors in the context
   of globalisation ........................................ 148
   3.1. Poverty as a human rights issue and the right to
        social protection: does it walk the talk? ............ 149
       3.1.1. Poverty and human rights ....................... 149
       3.1.2. The ICESCR and poverty ........................ 152
       3.1.3. ICESCR and the right to social security and to
              social protection ............................... 157
   3.2. Putting the state back in social protection’s issues: ... and
        who else? ......................................... 163
   3.3. Back to basics: monitoring the violation of the human right
        to social protection and to social security ......... 168
       3.3.1. Positive obligations of the state parties to the
              ICESCR as an obligation of means ............... 168
       3.3.2. Positive obligations of the state parties to the
              ICESCR as an obligation of results ............... 169

Intersentia ix
### Table of Contents

1. **The social security reform process: the struggle between tradition and privatisation**
   - The inherited situation ........................................ 176
   - Winds of privatisation ........................................ 178
   - The aftermath: how the new system was implemented .... 182
   - Was there any role for a 'social rights' discourse in the whole reform process? .............................. 187
2. **Some successful challenges of market-oriented reforms** ...... 195
   - The 'Social Security Solidarity Act' under judicial challenge ........................................ 195
   - The case of worker’s compensation for injury and occupational disease ............................... 198
   - Privatisation retirees’ health insurance ................ 200
   - The challenge of market-oriented reforms regarding water services in Argentine provinces ............. 201
3. **Brief conclusions** ...................................... 203

### IS PRIVATISATION OF HEALTH CARE A HUMAN RIGHTS PROBLEM?

1. **Medical care and the right to health** .............................. 208
2. **Privatisation of medical care – some oft-voiced concerns** ...... 212
   - What is health care privatisation? ............................. 212
   - Privatisation and austerity ..................................... 214
   - Privatisation and ability to pay. Health as a merit good . . . 217
   - The commodification problem ................................. 219
   - The accountability problem ................................. 221
3. **A qualified endorsement for privatisation** ............................ 225
4. **Conclusion** ........................................... 227
# Table of Contents

## PRIVATISATION OF EDUCATION AND THE RIGHT TO EDUCATION

**Fons Coomans and Antenor Hallo de Wolf** ........................................... 229

1. Introduction .......................................................... 229
2. The content of the right to education as a human right ............ 230
   2.1. The scope and meaning of Article 13 ICESCR ................. 230
   2.2. The core content of the right to education .................. 231
      2.2.1. The ‘core content’ concept ................................... 231
      2.2.2. Elements of the core content of the right to education ... 232
   2.3. A typology of obligations relating to the implementation of the right to education ................................... 237
   2.4. Some observations on the relationship between privatisation and violations of obligations resulting from the right to education ........................................... 239
3. Privatisation of education: definition of means ....................... 241
   3.1. Methods of education privatisation .............................. 243
      3.1.1. Privatisation of education through alternative funding ........................................... 244
      3.1.2. Privatisation of education through the delegation of school management and instructional services ........................................... 246
      3.1.3. Privatisation of education through the delegation of regulation and monitoring ........................................... 250
   3.2. Liberalisation in trade in services and education privatisation ........................................................................................................... 250
4. Analysis of potential human rights issues ................................. 253
5. Concluding remarks ......................................................... 256

## PRIVATISATION AND THE RIGHT TO ACCESS TO WATER

**Anton Kok** ......................................................................................... 259

1. Introduction ........................................................................... 259
2. Establishing a right to water at international level ..................... 259
3. International human rights documents and privatisation .............. 263
4. National constitutions and privatisation ..................................... 263
5. Privatisation as it relates to access to water .............................. 264
6. Establishing the accountability of the state and private parties ....... 267
   6.1. International level .......................................................... 267
   6.2. National level ................................................................. 268
   6.3. Remedies ........................................................................... 272

Intersentia, 2005
## Table of Contents

6.3.1. ‘Sufficient’ water .................................. 272
6.3.2. ‘Access’ to water .................................. 274
6.3.3. Progressive realisation ............................ 277
6.3.4. ‘Respect, protect, promote and fulfil’ ........... 278
6.3.5. An argument based on unfair discrimination/
equality ................................................... 282

7. Conclusion ........................................... 286

### INDIGENOUS PEOPLES AND NATURAL RESOURCES UNDER THE INTER-AMERICAN SYSTEM OF HUMAN RIGHTS.
BETWEEN PRIVATISATION AND THE EXERCISE OF HUMAN RIGHTS

**Mikel Berraondo López** .................................. 289

1. Privatisation, indigenous peoples and human rights ........ 289
2. Natural resources in the context of privatisation and
  indigenous peoples .................................... 299
3. Indigenous property rights concerning resources: new
  spaces of privatization in the inter-American context of
  human rights ......................................... 312
4. Conclusion ........................................... 322

**NOTE ON CONTRIBUTORS** .............................. 325