

Corporate Human Rights Obligations:
in Search of Accountability

To my parents Maryon and Theo Jägers

SCHOOL OF HUMAN RIGHTS RESEARCH SERIES, Volume 17

The titles published in this series are listed at the end of this volume.

Corporate Human Rights Obligations:
in Search of Accountability

Nicola M.C.P. Jägers

INTERSENTIA
Antwerpen – Oxford – New York

This Volume is an adapted version of a dissertation defended at Utrecht University on 2 October 2002.

Nicola M.C.P. Jägers
Corporate Human Rights Obligations: in Search of Accountability

CRC prepared by: G.J. Wiarda Institute, Utrecht University Institute for Legal Studies, Boothstraat 6,
3512 BW Utrecht

ISBN 90-5095-240-2
D/2002/7849/35
NUR 828

© 2002 INTERSENTIA
www.intersentia.com

Behoudens uitzondering door de wet gesteld, mag zonder schriftelijke toestemming van de rechthebbende(n) op het auteursrecht c.q. de uitgevers van deze uitgave, door de rechthebbende(n) gemachtigd namens hem (hen) op te treden, niets uit deze uitgave worden verveelvoudigd en/of openbaar gemaakt door middel van druk, fotocopie, microfilm of anderszins, hetgeen ook van toepassing is op de gehele of gedeeltelijke bewerking. De uitgevers zijn met uitsluiting van ieder ander onherroepelijk door de auteur gemachtigd de door derden verschuldigde vergoedingen van kopiëren, als bedoeld in artikel 17 lid 2 der Auteurswet 1912 en in het KB van 20-6-'64 (Stb. 351) ex artikel 16b der Auteurswet 1912, te doen innen door (en overeenkomstig de reglementen van) de Stichting Reprorecht te Amsterdam.

Niets uit deze uitgave mag worden verveelvoudigd en/of openbaar gemaakt door middel van druk, fotocopie, microfilm of op welke andere wijze ook, zonder voorafgaande schriftelijke toestemming van de uitgevers.

No part of this book may be reproduced in any form, by print, photo copy, microfilm or any other means, without written permission from the publishers.

ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

‘Business needs human rights and human rights need business.’ This was put forward by Mary Robinson, the High Commissioner for Human Rights in 1998 and the idea seems to be gaining ground. The topic of corporate responsibility for human rights has received mounting attention from many different sides, including the business community, since I started my research four years ago. It would seem that a process has started that cannot be reversed. I hope that this book will contribute to the ongoing debate in this evolving field of international law.

During the course of my research I have met many interesting people that were willing to give me their time and share their thoughts with me. I have greatly benefited from their insights in the subject. Several people I would like to mention specifically, as they have been indispensable for this project. Foremost, my supervisor Professor Fried van Hoof to who I owe a great deal. His ever lucid comments and support were of fundamental importance for this dissertation. I am indebted also to Professor Willem van Genugten for his willingness to become involved in the project. His suggested improvements were invaluable. My appreciation furthermore goes to Professor Peter Baehr, Professor Andrew Clapham, Professor Adriaan Dorrestijn, Professor Cees Flinterman, and Dr. Ian Seiderman for their willingness to read and comment on the final manuscript. In the preparation of the book for publication I was assisted by Peter Morris, who scrupulously corrected my English, and by Irnsje Veerman and Willemien Vreekamp who most efficiently generated the layout of the book. I thank them for their contributions. I am particularly pleased that I was able to conduct this research at the Netherlands Institute of Human Rights (SIM) which has proven to be a friendly and stimulating environment. My colleagues have been indispensable during the often solitary work. My thanks especially goes to Saskia Bal for her help in tracking down books and for the invaluable information in the SIM databases. I am also indebted to Maeycken Hoeneveld for taking care of the paperwork and removing other potential obstacles. Special thanks go to Yvonne Donders and Manon van Dooren and not only for agreeing to be my *paranymfs*.

I owe a particular debt of gratitude to three people who have patiently stood by me through the trials and tribulations of writing this dissertation. First and foremost, Conrad who has unconditionally supported me in this endeavor and has made sure that I never lost sight of more important things in life. And, finally, my parents who time and time again have been able to induce me to believe that nothing is impossible and for that I would like to dedicate this book to them.

TABLE OF CONTENTS

Acknowledgements	v
Abbreviations and Acronyms	xiii
Chapter I	
General Introduction	1
1 Introduction	1
2 Globalisation	1
3 Globalisation and Human Rights	6
4 Research Objective	10
5 Defining Corporations	11
6 Structure of the Study	12
PART A	
HUMAN RIGHTS OBLIGATIONS FOR CORPORATIONS: A THEORETICAL FRAMEWORK	
Chapter II	
Issues of Doctrine	19
1 Introduction	19
2 The Legal Status of Corporations Under International Law	19
2.1 Subjects of International Law	20
2.2 Rejection of the Subject-Object Dichotomy	22
2.3 Defining International Legal Personality	23
2.4 Do Corporations have Legal Personality?	27
2.4.1 Material Rights	27
2.4.2 Proceedings	30
2.4.3 Material Duties	32
2.4.4 Responsibility and Examinations	33
2.5 Concluding Remarks	34
3 <i>Drittwirkung</i>	36
3.1 Introduction	36
3.2 The Concept of <i>Drittwirkung</i>	36
3.3 Arguments in Favour of <i>Drittwirkung</i>	38
	vii

Table of Contents

3.3.1 Nature of Human Rights	39
3.3.2 General Provisions in the International Bill of Rights	40
3.4 Concluding Remarks	44
Chapter III	
Applicable Norms	45
1 Introduction	45
2 Applicable Norms	45
2.1 Peremptory Norms	46
2.2 Analysis of Specific Provisions	48
2.2.1 Object and Purpose of the International Bill of Rights	50
2.2.2 Tentative List of Norms Applicable to Corporations	51
2.3 Concluding Remarks	70
Chapter IV	
Human Rights Obligations of Corporations	75
1 Introduction	75
2 Tripartite Typology	76
2.1 Obligation to Respect	79
2.2 Obligation to Protect	82
2.3 Obligation to Fulfil	84
3 Corporate Human Rights Obligations following from the Right to Food, Health, Life and the Prohibition of Slavery and Forced Labour	85
3.1 Right to Food	85
3.1.1 Respect	85
3.1.2 Protect	86
3.1.3 Fulfil	86
3.2 Right to Health	87
3.2.1 Respect	87
3.2.2 Protect	87
3.2.3 Fulfil	88
3.3 Right to Life	88
3.3.1 Respect	88
3.3.2 Protect	89
3.3.3 Fulfil	90
3.4 Prohibition of Slavery and Forced Labour	90
3.4.1 Respect	90
3.4.2 Protect	91
3.4.3 Fulfil	91
4 An Excursion into an Additional Type of Corporate Obligations: The Duty not to Co-Operate	92

PART B**AVENUES FOR ENFORCEMENT AND IMPLEMENTATION****Chapter V**

Non-Judicial Supervision	99
1 Introduction	99
2 International Codes Directly Regulating Corporate Conduct	99
3 Background	100
4 The OECD Guidelines for Multinational Enterprises	101
4.1 Content	102
4.2 Supervision	106
4.3 Concluding Remarks on the OECD Guidelines	109
5 ILO ‘Tripartite Declaration of Principles Concerning Multinational Enterprises and Social Policy’	109
5.1 Content	111
5.2 Supervision	112
5.3 Concluding Remarks on the ILO Tripartite Declaration	115
6 The Legal Status of the International Codes	115
7 The United Nations	119
7.1 The Draft UN Code of Conduct on Transnational Corporations	119
7.1.1 Content	121
7.1.2 Supervision	122
7.2 Current Activities within the United Nations with Regard to Corporations and Human Rights	124
7.2.1 The UN Sub-Commission on the Promotion and Protection of Human Rights	124
7.2.2 The Global Compact	128
7.3 Concluding Remarks on the United Nations	130
8 Developments at the European Level	130
9 Selfregulation	132

Chapter VI

State Responsibility	137
1 Introduction	137
2 The State Responsibility Doctrine: the Classical View	138
3 The Work of the International Law Commission on State Responsibility	139
3.1 Attribution of Conduct to the State	140
3.2 State Responsibility for Private Acts	143
4 State Responsibility under International Human Rights Law	145
5 Case-law of the Supervisory Bodies	150
5.1 European Court of Human Rights	150

Table of Contents

5.2	Inter-American Commission and Court	155
5.3	The African Commission	157
5.4	The Human Rights Committee	157
5.5	The Committee on Economic, Social and Cultural Rights	160
5.6	The International Labour Organisation	161
5.7	Concluding Remarks on the Case-law	164
6	Responsibility of the Host and the Home State	165
6.1	Principles of Territoriality and Actual/Effective Control	166
6.2	Extraterritorial Activities of State Organs	168
6.3	Extraterritorial Activities of Non-State Entities	169
6.4	Treaties Regulating Extraterritorial Activities of Corporations	172
7	Concluding Remarks	174
Chapter VII		
Accountability at the National Level		177
1	Introduction	177
2	Invoking International Law in Domestic Courts	178
3	Civil Litigation in the United States: the International Tort	179
3.1	Evolution of the Alien Tort Claims Act	180
3.2	The Alien Tort Claims Act and Corporations	183
3.3	Legal Doctrines Limiting the Applicability of the Alien Tort Claims Act	196
3.4	Concluding Remarks on the Alien Tort Claims Act	200
4	Civil Litigation in the Home State	203
4.1	Civil Litigation in the United Kingdom	204
4.2	Concluding Remarks on the Civil Litigation in the United Kingdom	209
4.3	Possibilities for Civil Litigation in the Netherlands	210
4.4	Civil Litigation in Other Home States	211
5	Civil Liability versus Criminal Responsibility	212
6	Extraterritorial Jurisdiction	214
7	Concluding Remarks	215
Chapter VIII		
Judicial Enforcement at the International Level		217
1	Introduction	217
2	International Human Rights Mechanisms	217
3	International Criminal Tribunals and Corporate Criminal Responsibility	220
3.1	The International Military Tribunals in Nuremberg and Tokyo	222
3.2	International Convention on the Suppression and Punishment of the Crime of Apartheid	225
3.3	International Criminal Tribunal for the former Yugoslavia	225
3.4	International Criminal Tribunal for Rwanda	226

3.5	The Permanent International Criminal Court	227
3.6	Concluding Remarks on International Criminal Law Mechanisms	232
4	Enforcement of Human Rights through Trade Agreements	232
4.1	The World Trade Organisation	233
4.2	Concluding Remarks on the World Trade Organisation	236
4.3	The North American Free Trade Agreement	237
4.3.1	The NAFTA Side Agreements	238
4.3.2	Follow-up	239
4.4	Concluding Remarks on the NAFTA	241
5	Concluding Remarks on International Judicial Mechanisms	241

PART C

SUMMARY, CONCLUSIONS AND RECOMMENDATIONS

Chapter IX

	Summary, Conclusions and Recommendations	245
1	Introduction	245
2	Summary	245
3	Conclusions	255
3.1	Can Corporations have Human Rights Obligations seen from a Conceptual Point of View?	255
3.2	Do Corporations have Human Rights Obligations?	256
3.3	What Kind of Corporate Human Rights Obligations can be discerned?	256
3.4	Can Corporate Human Rights Obligations be enforced?	256
3.5	How can the Supervision of Corporate Human Rights Obligations be improved?	257
3.6	Final Observations	258
	Samenvatting	261
	Selected Bibliography	271
	Table of Cases	291
	Selected United Nations Documents	297
	Index	303
	Curriculum Vitae	309

ABBREVIATIONS AND ACRONYMS

AC	Appeal Cases (Law Reports, UK)
ACHPR	African Charter on Human and Peoples' Rights
ACHR	American Convention on Human Rights
All ER	All England Law Reports
ATCA	Alien Tort Claims Act
CEDAW	Convention on the Elimination of All Forms of Discrimination Against Women
CERD	Convention on the Elimination of All Forms of Racial Discrimina- tion
CIME	Committee on Investment and Multinational Enterprises (OECD)
CLC	Commercial Law Cases
ECHR	European Convention on Human Rights
ECtHR	European Court of Human Rights
EcomHR	European Commission on Human Rights
ESC	European Social Charter
EU	European Union
F. 2d	Federal Reporter (second series) (USA, Courts of Appeals)
F. 3d	Federal Reporter (third series) (USA, Courts of Appeals)
FDI	Foreign Direct Investment
F. Supp.	Federal Supplement (USA, Federal District Courts)
GA	General Assembly (UN)
GAOR	General Assembly Official Records
GATT	General Agreement on Tariffs and Trade
HRC	Human Rights Committee
IACHR	Inter-American Court of Human Rights
IAComHR	Inter-American Commission on Human Rights
ICC	International Criminal Court
ICCPR	International Covenant on Civil and Political Rights
ICESCR	International Covenant on Economic, Social and Cultural Rights
ICSID	International Centre for the Settlement of Investment Disputes
ICJ	International Court of Justice
ICJ Rep.	International Court of Justice Reports
IcomJ	International Commission of Jurists
ICSID	International Centre for the Settlement of Investment Disputes

Abbreviations and Acronyms

ICTR	International Criminal Tribunal for Rwanda
ICTY	International Criminal Tribunal for the former Yugoslavia
ILC	International Law Commission
ILM	International Legal Materials
ILO	International Labour Organisation
IMT	International Military Tribunal
Lloyds Rep.	Lloyd's Law Reports (UK)
MAI	Multilateral Agreement on Investments
MNCs	Multinational Corporations
MNEs	Multinational Enterprises
NAALC	North American Agreement on Labor Cooperation
NAFTA	North American Free Trade Agreement
NIEO	New International Economic Order
NGO	Non Governmental Organisation
OAS	Organisation of American States
OAU	Organisation of African Unity
OECD	Organisation for Economic Cooperation and Development
PCIJ	Permanent Court of International Justice
TLR	Times Law Reports (UK)
TNCs	Transnational Enterprises
UDHR	Universal Declaration of Human Rights
UN	United Nations
UNCC	United Nations Compensation Commission
UNCLOS	United Nations Convention on the Law of the Sea
UNCTAD	United Nations Conference on Trade and Development
UNCTC	United Nations Commission on Transnational Corporations
UNRIAA	United Nations, Reports of International Arbitrary Awards
UNTS	United Nations Treaty Series
UK	United Kingdom
USA	United States of America
US	United States
U.S.	United States Supreme Court Reports
VCLT	Vienna Convention on the Law of Treaties
V.R.	Victorian Reports
WHO	World Health Organisation
WIR	World Investment Report
WLR	Weekly Law Reports (UK)
WTO	World Trade Organisation
YBILC	Yearbook of the International Law Commission