Using Human Rights to Change Tradition

*Traditional Practices Harmful to Women’s Reproductive Health in sub-Saharan Africa*
SCHOOL OF HUMAN RIGHTS RESEARCH SERIES, Volume 13

The titles published in this series are listed at the end of this volume.
Using Human Rights to Change Tradition

*Traditional Practices Harmful to Women’s Reproductive Health in sub-Saharan Africa*

Corinne A.A. Packer
This Volume is an adapted version of a dissertation defended at Utrecht University on 5 June 2002.

Corinne A.A. Packer
Using Human Rights to Change Tradition
Traditional Practices Harmful to Women’s Reproductive Health in sub-Saharan Africa

CRC prepared by: G.J. Wiarda Institute, Utrecht University Institute for Legal Studies, Boothstraat 6, 3512 BW Utrecht

ISBN 90-5095-226-7
D/2002/7849/24
NUR 828

© 2002 INTERSENTIA
www.intersentia.com

Behoudens uitzondering door de wet gesteld, mag zonder schriftelijke toestemming van de rechtshhabende(n) op het auteursrecht c.q. de uitgevers van deze uitgave, door de rechtshhabende(n) gemachtigd namens hem (hen) op te treden, niets uit deze uitgave worden verveelvoudigd en/of openbaar gemaakt door middel van druk, fotocopië, microfilm of anderszins, hetgeen ook van toepassing is op de gehele of gedeeltelijke bewerking. De uitgevers zijn met uitsluiting van ieder ander onherroepelijk door de auteur gemachtigd de door derden verschuldigde vergoedingen van copiëren, als bedoeld in artikel 17 lid 2 der Auteurswet 1912 en in het KB van 20-6-'64 (Stb. 351) ex artikel 16b der Auteurswet 1912, te doen innen door (en overeenkomstig de reglementen van) de Stichting Reprorecht te Amsterdam.

Niets uit deze uitgave mag worden verveelvoudigd en/of openbaar gemaakt door middel van druk, fotocopië, microfilm of op welke andere wijze ook, zonder voorafgaande schriftelijke toestemming van de uitgevers.

No part of this book may be reproduced in any form, by print, photo copy, microfilm or any other means, without written permission from the publishers.
I am especially grateful to five persons who were most closely associated with me in the writing of this doctoral thesis. First, to Professor Cees Flinterman, who encouraged me to pursue this research from our first meeting some years ago and very graciously agreed to be my supervisor, offering positive support and input all the way through. His optimism was infectious and helped me remain committed to the task. Second, to Professor Rhoda Howard-Hassmann, who came for a sabbatical to SIM in Utrecht in the hope of catching up on a variety of her own research projects but left with an additional charge as my second supervisor. Her constant encouragement and keen challenges helped me develop, refine and, ultimately, defend my arguments. Third, to John, my husband, who never seemed to have a doubt that I would finish the research, was always willing to listen to me ramble on about it, and put his English editing skills to work in the final days. Finally, to Sébastien and Nicholas, my children, who tolerated my absence as I went to ‘school’ to ‘sing songs’… or so they seemed to think! They put my thesis to good use, making beautiful drawings on the early drafts.

I would also like to express my appreciation to the members of my reading committee (Dr. Augustine Ankomah, Professor Abdullahi An-Na’im, Professor Bas de Gaay Fortman, Professor Jenny Goldschmidt and Professor Titia Loenen) for examining the thesis. Many friends and colleagues furnished me with valuable comments on various chapters, in particular: Juan Amaya-Castro, Zdenka Machnyikova, Wambui Mwangi, Rolanda Oostland and Bahia Tahzib-Lie. As if they didn’t have enough work on their desks already! An additional word of thanks goes to Rolanda and Juan for their careful translation of the summary into Dutch.

Present in these pages are the people who otherwise supported me along the way, in particular: my fellow researchers and the staff at SIM, my parents, my friends outside of university and my sons’ babysitters, particularly Petra Kulhankova and Martha Wanjiku. A final word of thanks goes to Irmsje Veerman for her professional layout of this book.
TABLE OF CONTENTS

Acknowledgements v

Glossary of Acronyms and Abbreviations xiii

Chapter I
Introduction 1
1 The Purpose of the Study 1
2 Defining the Parameters of the Study 2
2.1 The Socio-Cultural Determinants of Women’s Reproductive Health 2
2.2 Human Rights as a Tool for Social Change 2
2.3 Women, Reproductive Health and Harm from Traditional Practices 3
2.4 The Region of Sub-Saharan Africa 5
3 The State of Challenges to Harmful Traditional Practices 9
4 The Structure of the Study 13

Chapter II
The Harmful Traditional Practices in Question and Supporting Customs and Norms 17
1 Introduction 17
2 Traditional Practices Harmful to Women’s Reproductive Health 18
2.1 Female Circumcision 18
2.2 Early Marriage (Early Sexual Activity and Pregnancy) 25
2.3 Dietary Taboos during Pregnancy and Lactation 28
2.4 Practices Relating to Childbirth 29
2.5 Incisions in Pregnant Women 30
2.6 Female Religious Bondage 31
3 Customs and Norms Bolstering Traditional Practices Harmful to Women 31
3.1 Authority of the Husband and Spousal Violence 31
3.2 Extended-Family-Household Structure 32
3.3 Kinship Influence and Intervention in the Name of Lineage 34
3.4 Son Preference 35
3.5 Polygyny 36
3.6 Extra-Marital Sexual Activity 38
3.7 Brideprice (Bridewealth) 40
Table of Contents

3.8 Levirate (Wife Inheritance) Marriage ........................................... 41
3.9 Abduction for Purposes of Rape, Impregnation and Marriage ....... 42
4 Norms Influencing Fertility ......................................................... 42
4.1 Universal Marriage ..................................................................... 43
4.2 Ideal Family Size ....................................................................... 43
5 The Culture of Silence and Superstition ......................................... 44
6 Combined Customs Contributing to HIV/AIDS Infection ............. 46
7 Conclusions ................................................................................. 48

Chapter III
The Rights in Question .................................................................. 49
1 Introduction .................................................................................. 49
2 Situating Harmful Traditional Practices within the Framework of International Human Rights Law ......................... 49
2.1 The Obligations of the State in General ...................................... 49
2.2 The Obligations of the State Particular to Harmful Traditional Practices ......................................................... 53
3 Determining Human Rights Violations by the Nature of the Practice ................................................................. 57
3.1 The Right to Health ................................................................... 58
3.1.1 The Inseparability of the Rights to Life and Health .............. 59
3.1.2 Grey Areas ........................................................................... 60
3.2 The Right to Freedom from Discrimination on the Basis of Gender ................................................................. 61
3.2.1 Grey Areas ........................................................................... 62
3.3 The Right to Freedom from Violence ........................................ 63
3.3.1 Grey Areas ........................................................................... 67
3.3.2 Moving Away from the Blanket Gender-Violence Approach .... 69
3.3.3 A Word on ‘Global’ Ideologies on Gender and Feminism .... 70
3.4 The Rights to Freedom of Thought, Belief, Opinion and Expression ................................................................. 74
3.4.1 Grey Areas ........................................................................... 75
3.5 The Right to Education .............................................................. 77
3.6 The Right to Choose One’s Spouse ........................................... 78
3.7 The Right to Found a Family ...................................................... 78
4 Conclusions .................................................................................. 79

Chapter IV
The Theoretical Value of the Human Rights Approach ................... 81
1 Introduction .................................................................................. 81
2 Over Two Millennia of Theorizing on Human Rights and Moral Wrongs ............................................................. 84
2.1 The Debate in Antiquity .............................................................. 84

viii
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Section</th>
<th>Title</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>2.2</td>
<td>The Debate in the Era of Enlightenment</td>
<td>86</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.3</td>
<td>Contemporary Relativist Arguments</td>
<td>88</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3</td>
<td>Other Factors Influencing Relativism</td>
<td>89</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4</td>
<td>Resolving the Differences</td>
<td>94</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.1</td>
<td>The Pluralist Perspective</td>
<td>96</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5</td>
<td>Have We Over-Theorized?</td>
<td>97</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6</td>
<td>Cross-Cultural Normative Judgements</td>
<td>99</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6.1</td>
<td>Inevitable Cultural Evaluations</td>
<td>100</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6.2</td>
<td>A Model for Understanding</td>
<td>102</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7</td>
<td>Closing the Circle</td>
<td>107</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td><strong>Chapter V</strong></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td><strong>Assessing the African Charter as a Tool for Social Change</strong></td>
<td>109</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td>Introduction</td>
<td>109</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2</td>
<td>Deriving Insight from the <em>Travaux Préparatoires</em></td>
<td>110</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3</td>
<td>Deriving Insight from the African Commission</td>
<td>111</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4</td>
<td>Deriving Insight from the African Charter on the Rights and Welfare of the Child</td>
<td>114</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5</td>
<td>Deriving Insight from Scholarly Argumentation and Interpretation</td>
<td>115</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5.1</td>
<td>The General Situation of Women’s Rights</td>
<td>115</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5.2</td>
<td>Clauses Protecting the African Family, Morals and Traditional Values</td>
<td>116</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5.2.1</td>
<td>Clauses on the Protection of the Family</td>
<td>117</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5.2.2</td>
<td>Clauses on the Protection of African Morals and Traditional Values</td>
<td>120</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6</td>
<td>Deriving Insight from the Unique History and Outlook of the African Region</td>
<td>123</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7</td>
<td>Special Measures to Improve the Protection of Women’s Rights</td>
<td>123</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7.1</td>
<td>Draft Additional Protocol on Women’s Rights</td>
<td>124</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7.2</td>
<td>Special Rapporteur on the Rights of Women</td>
<td>127</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7.3</td>
<td>Considering Alternative Measures</td>
<td>127</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8</td>
<td>The Verdict</td>
<td>129</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td><strong>Chapter VI</strong></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td><strong>Practical Limitations on the Human Rights Approach</strong></td>
<td>131</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td>Introduction</td>
<td>131</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2</td>
<td>Commonly Recommended Strategies and Their Presumed Influence</td>
<td>132</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3</td>
<td>Re-evaluating the Impact of Human Rights Education</td>
<td>134</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4</td>
<td>Questioning the Empowering Force of Human Rights</td>
<td>137</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5</td>
<td>Women’s Groups and Power</td>
<td>139</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5.1</td>
<td>Theories on Women’s Groups and Empowerment</td>
<td>139</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
# Table of Contents

5.2 Some Challenging Evidence 139
6 Formal Education and Social Change 143
6.1 Theories on Education, Reproductive Health and Empowerment 143
6.2 Some Challenging Evidence 144
7 Critical Assessments of the Value of Law and Rights in Africa 149
7.1 Structural Impediments in the Use of Law 149
7.2 Cultural Impediments in the Use of Law 150
7.3 Psychological Impediments in the Use of Law 151
7.4 Recognizing the Limitations of Legislation 153
8 Conclusions 155

## Chapter VII

**Drawing Lessons from Successful and Failed Challenges to Traditional Practices**

1 Introduction 157
2 Chinese Footbinding 158
2.1 The Practice 158
2.2 Its Demise 159
3 *Sati* (Widow Burning) in India 161
3.1 The Practice 161
3.2 Its Demise 163
4 Some African State Initiatives to End Female Circumcision 165
4.1 Egypt 165
4.2 Kenya 165
4.3 The Sudan 167
5 Lessons Drawn 168
5.1 Positive Lessons 168
5.1.1 The Importance of Local Leadership and Support of Opinion Leaders 168
5.1.2 Gaining Public Support for Eradication as the Primary Measure 169
5.1.3 The Role of Outsiders 170
5.2 Negative Lessons 170
5.2.1 Prioritizing Legislation as a Measure 170
5.2.2 Admissibility under Certain Forms or Circumstances 171
5.2.3 Penalizing Those Already Penalized 172
5.2.4 The Persistent Potential of Regression 173
6 Some Key Differences and Their Possible Implications 173

## Chapter VIII

**Key Agents of Change and the Role of the African State**

1 Introduction 175

x
Table of Contents

2 Determining the Most Appropriate Role for the State 175
3 Indigenous Mechanisms 180
3.1 Customary (Family) Law 180
3.2 Religion and Traditional Indigenous Belief Systems 182
3.2.1 Alternative Initiation Rites and the Role of Ceremonial Leaders 186
3.3 The Relationship between the State and Indigenous Mechanisms 188
4 The Media and Other Mechanisms of Communication 189
5 The Roles of Other Actors 190
5.1 Local Interest Groups and Concerned NGOs 190
5.2 Ordinary men 191
5.3 The Monitoring Bodies of the International Human Rights Treaties 194
5.4 Donors 194
5.5 Women’s Rights Advocates, Legal Aid and the Legal Profession 195
6 Conclusions 196

Chapter IX
Summary and Conclusions 199
1 Summary 199
2 Conclusions 205
2.1 The Utility and Effectiveness of the Human Rights Approach 205
2.2 General Recommendations 208

List of Figures, Tables and Boxes
Figure I Sub-Saharan African Countries Where Female Circumcision is Practiced and Percentage Performed on the Total Female Population 19
Figure II Harmful Traditional Practices and the Rights Violated 59
Figure III How Practices Become Targeted for Global Human Rights Action 103
Figure IV The Framework of Relations among Strategies 133
Table I Percentage of Girls Married Prior to Age 19 Years and Under in Senegal, According to Ethnic Group 26
Table II Percentage of Children Living in Extended-Family-Household Structures in a Sample of Sub-Saharan African Countries 34
Table III Percentage of Children Living in Polygynous Households in a Sample of Sub-Saharan African Countries 38
Table IV Express Treaty Obligations Relevant to the Eradication of Harmful Traditional Practices 55
Table V The Legal Literacy Paradigm 135
Box I Pregnancy and Childbirth in a Traditional Rural Setting 29
Box II Lessons from Rural Ghana 187
Annexes

Annex A: Relevant Excerpts of Interpretations by Treaty Bodies 211
II. CEDAW’s General Recommendation No. 19 on Violence against Women (1992) 212
III. CEDAW’s General Recommendation No. 21 regarding Equality in Marriage and Family Relations (1994) 214
IV. The Committee on Economic, Social and Cultural Rights’ General Comment No. 14 on Health (2000) 216

Annex B: Relevant Excerpts of Statements and Strategies from Declaratory Documents 217
I. Declaration of Mexico on the Equality of Women, World Conference on the International Women’s Year (United Nations, 1975) 217
III. Vienna Declaration and Programme of Action, World Conference on Human Rights (United Nations, 1993) 218
IV. Declaration on the Elimination of Violence against Women (United Nations, 1993) 218
VI. Copenhagen Declaration, World Summit for Social Development (United Nations, 1995) 222
VII. Beijing Declaration and Platform for Action, World Conference on Women (United Nations, 1995) 222


Selected Bibliography 231
Index 249
Samenvatting 253
About the Author 259
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Acronym</th>
<th>Description</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>BDPA</td>
<td>Beijing Declaration and Platform for Action</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CCPR</td>
<td>International Covenant on Civil and Political Rights</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CEDAW</td>
<td>Committee on the Elimination of Discrimination against Women</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CESCR</td>
<td>International Covenant on Economic, Social and Cultural Rights</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CRLP</td>
<td>Center for Reproductive Law and Policy</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>HIV/AIDS</td>
<td>Human Immunodeficiency Virus/Acquired Immunodeficiency Syndrome</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>IAC</td>
<td>Inter-African Committee (on Traditional Practices Affecting the Health of Women and Children)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ICPD</td>
<td>International Conference on Population and Development</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>NGO</td>
<td>Non-governmental organisation</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>OAU</td>
<td>Organization of African Unity</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>PRB</td>
<td>Population Reference Bureau</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>STD</td>
<td>Sexually transmitted disease</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>TFR</td>
<td>Total fertility rate</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>UDHR</td>
<td>Universal Declaration of Human Rights</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>UN</td>
<td>United Nations</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>VDPA</td>
<td>Vienna Declaration and Programme of Action</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>WHO</td>
<td>World Health Organization</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>