

## CHILDREN'S ACCESS TO JUSTICE



CHILDREN'S ACCESS  
TO JUSTICE

A Critical Assessment

*Edited by*

Mona PARÉ

Mariëlle BRUNING

Thierry MOREAU

Caroline SIFFREIN-BLANC

 INTERSENTIA

Cambridge – Antwerp – Chicago

Intersentia Ltd  
8 Wellington Mews  
Wellington Street | Cambridge  
CB1 1HW | United Kingdom  
Tel: +44 1223 736 170  
Email: mail@intersentia.co.uk  
www.intersentia.com | www.intersentia.co.uk

*Distribution for the UK and  
Rest of the World (incl. Eastern Europe)*  
NBN International  
1 Deltic Avenue, Rooksley  
Milton Keynes MK13 8LD  
United Kingdom  
Tel: +44 1752 202 301 | Fax: +44 1752 202 331  
Email: orders@nbninternational.com

*Distribution for Europe*  
Lefebvre Sarrut Belgium NV  
Hoogstraat 139/6  
1000 Brussels  
Belgium  
Tel: +32 (0)800 39 067  
Email: mail@intersentia.be

*Distribution for the USA and Canada*  
Independent Publishers Group  
Order Department  
814 North Franklin Street  
Chicago, IL 60610  
USA  
Tel: +1 800 888 4741 (toll free) | Fax: +1 312 337 5985  
Email: orders@ipgbook.com

## Children's Access to Justice. A Critical Assessment

© The editors and contributors severally 2022

The editors and contributors have asserted the right under the Copyright, Designs and Patents Act 1988, to be identified as authors of this work.

No part of this book may be reproduced, stored in a retrieval system, or transmitted, in any form, or by any means, without prior written permission from Intersentia, or as expressly permitted by law or under the terms agreed with the appropriate reprographic rights organisation. Enquiries concerning reproduction which may not be covered by the above should be addressed to Intersentia at the address above.

This book is also made available in French as *L'accès des enfants à la justice : bilan critique*, published by Dalloz in 2022.

Artwork on cover: Tanor / Shutterstock

ISBN 978-1-83970-197-9

D/2022/7849/13

NUR 820

British Library Cataloguing in Publication Data. A catalogue record for this book is available from the British Library.

## ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

This volume results from a partnership entitled *Children's Access to Justice and Vulnerability* involving researchers and institutions across four countries, including the University of Ottawa, Leiden University, Université catholique de Louvain, Aix-Marseille University and the University of Bordeaux. It could not have happened without the active collaboration of all partners involved. We are grateful to the Social Sciences and Humanities Research Council of Canada (SSHRC) for funding this partnership development project.

In particular, this book is a product of the conference organized by the University of Ottawa's Interdisciplinary Research Laboratory on the Rights of the Child (IRLRC) entitled *Children's Access to and Participation in Justice*, held online on 21 and 22 May 2021, with the help of the partnership's researchers and collaborators.

We thank all those who contributed to the conference's very rich exchanges, and especially the authors who wrote contributions for this volume. We acknowledge the following for their financial or logistical support, contributing to the success of the conference and the ensuing publication: SSHRC, *Accès au droit et à la justice* (ADAJ), the University of Ottawa and the Civil Law Section and Human Rights Research and Education Centre, the Embassy of France, Canada, whose contribution helped to ensure that the contributions written in French could be translated into English. We are grateful for the collaboration between Intersentia and Dalloz, allowing for the publication of all the contributions in English and in French. We also thank all students who helped along the way, with a special thanks to Myrto Giannakopoulou, LL.L. candidate at the University of Ottawa, who helped us to finalize the contributions for publication.

Finally, thank you to Ann-Christin Maak-Scherpe from Intersentia for taking on this project, and Rebecca Moffat for overseeing the production of the book.



# CONTENTS

<i>Acknowledgements</i> .....	v
<i>List of Contributors</i> .....	xiii

<b>Introduction: A Critical Review of Access to Justice for Children</b> Mona PARÉ, Mariëlle BRUNING, Thierry MOREAU and Caroline SIFFREIN-BLANC .....	1
--	---

## PART I. CHILDREN'S ACCESS TO JUSTICE IN CHILD PROTECTION PROCEEDINGS

### **The Practice of Hearing the Child in Child Protection Proceedings in France**

Caroline SIFFREIN-BLANC and Adeline GOUTTENOIRE .....	13
1. Introduction .....	13
2. The Existence of the Hearing of the Child .....	15
3. Conditions to be Heard: The Notion of Discernment .....	17
4. The Conduct of the Hearing .....	19
5. The Impact of Children's Opinions on the Ruling .....	21
6. Conclusion: The Essential Nature of Hearing the Child .....	22

### **Child Participation in Dutch Family Law and Child Protection Proceedings**

Mariëlle BRUNING, Daisy SMEETS and Apollonia BOLSCHER .....	25
1. Introduction .....	25
2. The Current Position of Minors in Dutch Family Law and Child Protection Proceedings .....	27
3. Children's Procedural Rights in Practice .....	29
4. Concluding Observations and Recommendations .....	35

<b>Children’s Voices on their Right to be Heard in the Field of Child Protection in Belgium (<i>Communauté française</i>): Highlighting of Blind Spots Regarding the Place and Role of the Parents</b>	
Coline MOREAU and Thierry MOREAU .....	39
1. Introduction .....	39
2. The Legal Framework for Child Assistance and Protection Procedures .....	41
3. The Research Methodology.....	45
4. The Relationship between the Young People’s Right to be Heard and their Parents.....	46
5. Some Blind Spots Brought to Light .....	51
6. Conclusion.....	53
<b>The Significance and Effectiveness of Children’s Participation in Judicial Child Protection Procedures in Quebec, Canada</b>	
Mona PARÉ.....	55
1. Introduction .....	55
2. Significance and Importance of Children’s Participation in Child Protection Proceedings .....	56
3. Effectiveness of Participation .....	60
4. Improvements Relating to the Significance and Effectiveness of Participation .....	62
5. Conclusion.....	66
<b>PART II. CHILDREN’S ACCESS TO JUSTICE IN JUDICIAL AND NON-JUDICIAL PROCEDURES</b>	
<b>Children’s Access to and Participation in the Family Justice System in France: Limits, Paradoxes and Recommendations</b>	
Blandine MALLEVAEY.....	71
1. Introduction .....	71
2. Children’s Limited Access to Family Court in the Case of Pre-Existing Proceedings .....	73
3. Access by the Child to the Family Court: Impossible in the Absence of Pre-Existing Proceedings.....	78
4. Concluding Thoughts.....	81



**Child Participation in Family Dispute Resolution in Canada**

Rachel BIRNBAUM and Nicholas BALA . . . . . 83

- 1. Introduction . . . . . 83
- 2. Statutory Provisions for Children’s Involvement . . . . . 85
- 3. Different Ways of Hearing Children . . . . . 86
- 4. Indirect Modes of Children’s Participation . . . . . 87
- 5. Direct Modes of Children’s Participation . . . . . 89
- 6. Advantages and Disadvantages of the Different Methods. . . . . 91
- 7. Empirical Research into the Different Ways Children are Heard . . . . 93
- 8. Conclusion. . . . . 95

**Access to Criminal Justice for Minors in France**

Philippe BONFILS . . . . . 97

- 1. Introduction . . . . . 97
- 2. Access to Criminal Justice for Young Offenders. . . . . 99
- 3. Access to Criminal Justice for Minors Who are Victims. . . . . 103
- 4. Conclusion. . . . . 108

**Children’s Access to Justice in Jersey: Obstacles and Impediments**

Deborah MCMILLAN . . . . . 109

- 1. Introduction and Methodology . . . . . 110
- 2. Background . . . . . 111
- 3. Findings of the Legislative Gap Analysis. . . . . 112
- 4. Cultural and Structural Obstacles . . . . . 114
- 5. What the Children’s Commissioner Can Do . . . . . 121
- 6. Conclusion. . . . . 121

**Children’s Access to Procedural Justice in School Discipline Processes in Ontario, Canada**

Jean-Frédéric HÜBSCH . . . . . 123

- 1. Introduction . . . . . 123
- 2. Progressive Discipline Law and Policy. . . . . 125
- 3. Practicing Progressive Discipline . . . . . 130
- 4. Access to Justice and Fairness in School Discipline. . . . . 134
- 5. Conclusion. . . . . 135

**Children’s Rights to Access Justice at the International Level:  
Challenge and Opportunity**

Ursula KILKELLY ..... 139

1. Introduction ..... 139

2. The Child as a Legal Actor under the Convention on the Rights  
of the Child ..... 140

3. The Emergence of Child-Friendly Justice ..... 143

4. Barriers to Children’s Access to Justice ..... 145

5. International Remedies for Breaches of Children’s Rights ..... 147

6. Conclusion ..... 151

**PART III. OBSTACLES TO CHILDREN’S ACCESS TO JUSTICE  
AND AVENUES FOR SOLUTIONS**

**Children’s Access to and Participation in the Justice System in Light  
of National Characteristics**

Kamel KHIARI ..... 155

1. Introduction ..... 155

2. Children’s Access to and Participation in Justice in Light  
of the Political Realities ..... 157

3. Children’s Access to and Participation in the Justice System  
in Light of Economic Realities ..... 160

4. Children’s Access to and Participation in the Justice System  
in Light of Security Realities ..... 162

5. Children’s Access to and Participation in the Justice System  
in Light of Cultural Realities ..... 164

6. Conclusion ..... 167

**Impediments to Access by the Children of Indigenous Peoples  
to the Justice System in Cameroon**

Eléazar Michel NKOUE´ ..... 169

1. Introduction ..... 169

2. The Impediments Involving Cameroon’s Judicial System ..... 172

3. Impediments Involving the Socio-Cultural Context  
of the Indigenous Peoples of Cameroon ..... 177

4. Conclusion ..... 181

<b>The Transition Towards Child-Friendly Communication in the Justice System: ‘And You, Are You Listening to Me?’</b>	
Marine BRAUN.....	183
1. Introduction .....	183
2. Child-Friendly Justice Requires Child-Friendly Communication .....	187
3. Some Child-Friendly Communication Techniques.....	189
4. Conclusion.....	194
<b>Legal Representation as a Necessary Element of Children’s Access to and Participation in Family Justice</b>	
Caterina TEMPESTA.....	197
1. Introduction .....	197
2. The Right to Legal Representation: International and Regional Human Rights Standards.....	198
3. Child Participation in Judicial Processes.....	202
4. Not All Methods of Hearing from the Child are Created Equally .....	206
5. Conclusion.....	209
<b>Access to Justice in Protection of Young People in Quebec: The Current Status and Recommendations from those Primarily Concerned – The Children</b>	
Malika SAHER .....	211
1. Introduction .....	211
2. Current Status .....	213
3. Recommendations for Effective Implementation of Children’s Right to Participation.....	220
4. Conclusion.....	222
<b><i>Photovoice</i> as a Tool for Indigenous Children’s Participation in the Justice System</b>	
Fanny JOLICOEUR .....	225
1. Introduction .....	225
2. <i>Photovoice</i> .....	226

3. The Use of <i>Photovoice</i> with Indigenous Communities to Foster a Culturally Safe Research Approach . . . . .	229
4. Conclusion . . . . .	236

**PART IV. CRITICAL REFLECTIONS ON CHILDREN’S ACCESS TO JUSTICE**

**The Risks of Unanticipated Consequences from Children’s Participation in the Justice System**

Thierry MOREAU . . . . .	241
1. Introduction . . . . .	241
2. Children at the Heart of a Dialectical Tension . . . . .	242
3. The Risks of Unanticipated Consequences of Children’s Access to the Justice System . . . . .	243
4. The Best Interests of the Child as Bulwark against Unanticipated Consequences: From a Vague and Blurred Concept to the Requirement of Methodological Rigor . . . . .	250
5. Conclusion . . . . .	253

**Concluding Remarks on Children’s Access to and Participation in Justice**

Adeline GOUTTENOIRE . . . . .	255
-------------------------------	-----

## LIST OF CONTRIBUTORS

**Nicholas (Nick) Bala** has been a professor of law at Queen's University in Kingston, Canada since 1980, focussing his work on issues related to children and families involved in the justice system. Much of his research is interdisciplinary, and he has undertaken collaborative projects with psychologists, social workers, criminologists, and health professionals. He has published extensively, and his work is often quoted by all levels of court in Canada, including the Supreme Court of Canada, and has also been cited by courts in the United States, Britain, New Zealand, Singapore, and Australia. Professor Bala was elected a Fellow of the Royal Society of Canada in 2013, and in 2019 became a Distinguished University Professor at Queen's University.

**Rachel Birnbaum** Ph.D., RSW, LL.M., is a professor at King's University College at Western University in London, Ontario. Her primary areas of teaching and research focus on children and families, social work ethics and the law, and research methods. She has presented nationally and internationally on parenting assessments, child legal representation, children's participation in family disputes, and on the intersection between law and social work. She is a member of The Royal Society of Canada, College of New Scholars, Artists, and Scientists, and recipient of several research awards.

**Apollonia Bolscher** is a lecturer and researcher at the Child Law Department of Leiden Law School. She teaches Children's Rights and Family Law in the Dutch LL.B. program and the LL.M. Child Law program. She publishes on child participation in legal proceedings and children's rights issues. She recently completed a multi-disciplinary research project commissioned by the Dutch Ministry of Justice and Safety about the procedural position – including the right to be heard – in family and child protection proceedings.

**Philippe Bonfils** is a professor at Aix-Marseille University, where he is Honorary Dean of the Faculty of Law and Political Science, and a member of the Private Law and Criminal Sciences Laboratory. He is a lawyer at the

Bar of Marseille. His law practice, teaching, and research focus on criminal law and minors in criminal justice – as victims and as young offenders. He is co-author, with Adeline Gouttenoire, of *Droit des mineurs* (2021, 3rd edition), published by Dalloz.

**Marine Braun** is an independent expert on access to justice and juvenile justice issues. Formerly a lawyer at the Brussels Bar (Belgium), and project manager for civil society organisations (Defence for Children International) and international organisations (United Nations – UNDP, IOM), over the past 10 years she has contributed to reforming and improving justice models by promoting access to and quality of justice systems for children in several European and African countries. Her current initiative consists of the development of a unique practical tool that identifies language and attitude techniques for professionals in the justice system.

**Mariëlle Bruning** is a full professor of Child Law at Leiden Law School. She is the founder of the Leiden Child Law Department and the program director of the Dutch LL.M. Child Law and teaches Child Protection in the LL.M. Advanced Studies in International Children’s Rights program. Her research focuses on youth care, child protection, children in alternative care, violence against children, child participation in legal proceedings, and children’s rights. Bruning is an honorary deputy (juvenile) judge at the Amsterdam District Court.

**Adeline Gouttenoire** is a professor at the University of Bordeaux. She is the director of CERFAPS (European Research Centre for Family, Insurance, Personal, and Health Law) and of the Institute of Minors. She is president of the Gironde Departmental Observatory for Child Protection. She publishes on family law, child protection, and children’s human rights. She is co-author with Philippe Bonfils of *Droit des mineurs* (2021, 3rd edition), published by Dalloz.

**Jean-Frédéric (J-F) Hübsch** is a Ph.D. student at the University of Ottawa’s Faculty of Law and a member of the University’s Interdisciplinary Research Laboratory on the Rights of the Child. His research focuses on integrating children’s rights into education law, with a particular focus on how rights-respecting pedagogies can inform education law and policy. He is a licensee of the Law Society of Ontario and from 2015 to 2020 was counsel with the Office of the Ontario Ombudsman, where his work focused on education law, municipal law, administrative tribunals, and French-language services. He is an active member of the Ontario Bar Association’s Education Law and Child and Youth Law sections.

**Fanny Jolicoeur** is a doctoral candidate in law at the Université du Québec à Montréal. She holds a certificate in journalism as well as a bachelor's and master's degree in social work. Her current research interests focus on issues related to Aboriginal governance of youth protection and more specifically on the point of view of the Innu children of Uashat mak Mani Utenam on the concept of the child's interest. She is the research co-ordinator of project 14 *Accès au Droit et à la Justice* (ADAJ). Finally, she has worked as a social worker for over 15 years.

**Kamel Khiari** has a doctorate in law (LL.D.). He is a lawyer and associate professor of law and economy at Sainte-Anne University (Nova Scotia, Canada).

**Ursula Kilkelly** (Ph.D.) is a professor of law at University College Cork in Ireland, where she is Head of the College of Business and Law. Her expertise is in international children's rights law and youth justice. She has published several monographs, edited collections, and over 60 journal articles in these areas. She is co-editor, with Professor Stefaan Pleysier of KU Leuven, of *Youth Justice*, the Sage journal. In 2010, she founded the Child Law Clinic, which provides research services to those litigating children's rights. She is chairperson of the Board of Management of Ireland's national facility for the detention of children referred by the courts.

**Blandine Mallevaey** is a professor at the Faculty of Law of the Catholic University of Lille (France). She is holder of the Chair 'Childhood and Families', at the Centre for Research on the Relationship between Risks and Law. She specializes in civil and criminal law concerning persons, family, and children. She created and directs the Master 2 in Child and Family Law as well as the University Diploma in the Rights and Best Interests of the Child. Since 2020, she has been a member of the Council of Europe's working group on the protection and best interests of children whose parents are separating. She co-authored the report *Feasibility study of the protection of the best interest of the child in parental separations proceedings* (2021) with Nuala Mole.

**Deborah McMillan** is Commissioner for Children and Young People in Jersey. She is a former Director for Children's Services in Wales and worked for the Welsh Government as a professional advisor working with ministers to develop expertise around Adverse Childhood Experiences, and supported a cross-government policy agenda around well-being and poverty. Throughout her career, Deborah has been involved in developing

early intervention and prevention, and shaping the way services are delivered for children, young people, and their families. As the first commissioner in Jersey, Deborah is putting in place the building blocks to make long-lasting change and to make life better for the island's children and young people.

**Coline Moreau** has a master's degree in law from the UCLouvain in Belgium. She is currently a full time Ph.D candidate in Criminology at the Social Sciences Faculty of the University of Ottawa. She is member of the Canada Research Chair in Legal Traditions and Penal Rationality directed by Professor A. Pires. She conducts her research in the areas of criminal law, criminology and human rights. She is particularly interested in the topics of sentencing and enforcement as well as innovation and obstacles to innovation in criminal law reform. In addition, she conducts research into children's law concerning the effectiveness of children's rights. She is also invested in the discovery of leadership and has been assistant for a leadership course at the University of Ottawa.

**Thierry Moreau** has a doctorate in law, is an extraordinary professor at the UCLouvain, and has been a lawyer in Belgium for more than 30 years. He teaches at the university and practises at the bar in the fields of children's rights, youth welfare and protection law, criminal law, prison law and ethics. He is the director of the *Centre interdisciplinaire des droits de l'enfant* (Interdisciplinary Centre for the Rights of the Child). After having been a member and then president for more than 20 years of the Commission of deontology of youth assistance of the *Communauté française* of Belgium, he is currently president of the Advisory Committee relating to the detention centre for minors of this same Community. He is regularly consulted as an expert in his fields of specialization by political bodies. He has written several books and articles on these subjects.

**Eléazar Michel Nkoué** holds a doctorate in international law from the University of Grenoble Alpes. He is an assistant lecturer at the University of Yaoundé II, Faculty of Legal and Political Sciences in Cameroon. He is a member of the Center for studies and research in international and community law. His research focuses on environmental law, the rights of Indigenous peoples, human rights, and international law.

**Mona Paré** is a full professor at the University of Ottawa, Faculty of Law, Civil Law Section, and Vice-Dean for Graduate Studies. She holds a Ph.D. in Law from Queen Mary College, University of London. She is a founding member and director of the Interdisciplinary Research Laboratory of the



Rights of the Child. Her research and teaching concentrate on children's rights and international human rights. She is leading a partnership project on children's access to justice, funded by the Social Sciences and Humanities Research Council of Canada (SSHCR), which has led to the publication of this book.

**Malika Saher** is a lawyer-mediator at the Hochelaga and Garage à musique community social pediatrics centres, which are administered by the Fondation Dr Julien. The mission of the latter is to make community-based social pediatrics care and services accessible to the greatest number of children in vulnerable situations. She is also currently an LL.M. candidate.

**Caroline Siffrein-Blanc** is *maître de conférences* in private law and criminal sciences at the University of Aix-Marseille, Faculty of Law and Political Science. She is a member of the Private Law and Criminal Sciences Laboratory. She specializes in family and children's law, and her teaching and research focus on filiation, the evolution of families, the place of the child in the separation of his or her parents, the voice of the child in court and the protection of the child in educational assistance. She publishes widely in these areas.

**Daisy Smeets** is an assistant professor of Forensic Family Science at the Institute of Education and Child Studies at Leiden University. Her focus is on pedagogical insights regarding legal and forensic procedures, such as the well-being of foster children after out-of-home placements, or how the police talk to children in sexual abuse cases. Recently, she collaborated on a multi-disciplinary research project about the procedural position – including the right to be heard – in family and child protection proceedings.

**Caterina Tempesta**, B.A., LL.B., LL.M., is senior counsel at the Office of the Children's Lawyer (OCL) of the Ontario Ministry of the Attorney General where she provides legal representation to children and youth at all levels of court in Canada. She has frequently written and presented on issues relating to children and the law and contributed to the development of the Canadian Bar Association's Child Rights Toolkit, a resource for legal professionals to better understand and implement a child's rights-based approach in practice. In 2019, she obtained her LL.M. in Advanced Studies in International Children's Rights from Leiden University.

