

AT THE FRONTIERS OF STATE RESPONSIBILITY

Human Rights Research Series, Volume 95.

The titles published in this series are listed at the end of this volume.

AT THE FRONTIERS OF STATE RESPONSIBILITY

Socio-economic Rights and
Cooperation on Migration

Annick PIJNENBURG



INTERSENTIA

Cambridge – Antwerp – Chicago

Intersentia Ltd
8 Wellington Mews | Wellington Street
Cambridge | CB1 1HW | United Kingdom
Tel.: +44 1223 736 170
Email: mail@intersentia.co.uk
www.intersentia.com | www.intersentia.co.uk

Distribution for the UK and the rest of the world (incl. Eastern Europe):

NBN International
1 Deltic Avenue, Rooksley
Milton Keynes MK13 8LD
United Kingdom
Tel.: +44 1752 202 301 | Fax: +44 1752 202 331
Email: orders@nbninternational.com

Distribution for Europe:

Lefebvre Sarrut Belgium NV
Hoogstraat 139/6
1000 Brussels
Belgium
Tel.: +32 3 680 15 50 | Fax: +32 3 658 71 21
Email: mail@intersentia.be

Distribution for the USA and Canada:

Independent Publishers Group
Order Department
814 North Franklin Street
Chicago, IL60610
USA
Tel.: +1 800 888 4741 (toll free) | Fax: +1312 337 5985
Email: orders@ipgbook.com

At the Frontiers of State Responsibility. Socio-economic Rights and Cooperation on
Migration

© Annick Pijnenburg 2021

The author has asserted the right under the Copyright, Designs and Patents Act 1988, to be identified as the author of this work.

No part of this book may be reproduced, stored in a retrieval system, or transmitted, in any form, or by any means, without prior written permission from Intersentia, or as expressly permitted by law or under the terms agreed with the appropriate reprographic rights organisation. Enquiries concerning reproduction which may not be covered by the above should be addressed to Intersentia at the address above.

Cover design and image by Danny Juchtmans / www.dsigngraphics.be

ISBN 978-1-83970-148-1 (paperback)

ISBN 978-1-83970-149-8 (PDF)

D/2021/7849/64

NUR 828

British Library Cataloguing in Publication Data. A catalogue record for this book is available from the British Library.

PREFACE

In the interest of readability, sources are referenced as follows:

- Treaties, case law and other oft-cited output of treaty monitoring bodies, notably general comments, as well as oft-cited UN documents such as the ARSIWA and the Global Compacts for Migration and on Refugees are referenced in full at first mention and in abbreviated form afterwards;
- All other sources are referenced in full at the start of each chapter and cross-referenced within the chapter;
- Hyperlinks are provided in the bibliography.

This thesis takes into account legal, empirical and scholarly developments until 1 September 2020.

All web addresses were accurate as at 8 December 2020.

ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

Numerous persons have accompanied me on the journey that preceded the publication of this book and helped me navigate the ups and downs that inevitably accompany the writing of a PhD thesis. While it is impossible to do justice to everyone, the following persons and institutions contributed most directly to the realisation of this book.

First of all, I would like to thank Tilburg Law School for funding my PhD research. I am also grateful to the members of my PhD committee, Prof. Mark Gibney, Prof. Elspeth Guild, Dr. Maarten den Heijer, Prof. Nicola Jägers and Prof. Nikolas Rajkovic, for engaging with my work and for their insightful comments.

My deepest thanks go to my supervisors, Professor Conny Rijken and Professor Thomas Gammeltoft-Hansen. I owe the single greatest debt of gratitude to Conny, without whom this book would not have seen the light of day. I will be forever grateful that she offered me the opportunity to write a PhD proposal under her supervision and let me find my own way in the academic world. Her endless energy and unwavering optimism made my whole PhD trajectory all the more enjoyable. Thomas's insightful feedback greatly improved the quality of my work. I am grateful for our discussions, his visit to Tilburg and his invitation to undertake a research stay at the Raoul Wallenberg Institute.

I am also grateful to all the people at Tilburg Law School who accompanied me throughout the past five years, many of whom have become close friends, especially Alice, Anna, Daniela, Lisa, Lukasz, Mariëtte, Marissa and Rachel. Thanks to the Netherlands Network for Human Rights Research, the Refugee Law Initiative and various events I have had the privilege of meeting many brilliant scholars in my field. Among them, Dr. Maarten den Heijer, Dr. Daria Davitti, Mary Dickson, Mariana Gkliati, Lynn Hillary, Asher Hirsch, Dr. Nataša Nedeski, Amélie Poméon, Dr. Vladislava Stoyanova and Dr. Nik Tan deserve a special mention. My research stay at the Raoul Wallenberg Institute was easily one of the highlights of my PhD trajectory, and I would like to thank all my colleagues from Lund for making it both enjoyable and enriching.

While this book signals the end of my PhD journey, I am extremely fortunate in having found a new home at Radboud University Nijmegen. I am grateful to my Nijmegen colleagues for enabling me to finish my PhD while starting my new position and for making me feel immediately welcomed. My paranymphs, Dr. Lize Glas and Dr. Amy Weatherburn, deserve special thanks for accompanying me from the very beginning to the very end of my PhD journey.

On a personal note, I want to thank my friends and family, near and far, for their interest and support throughout the past years. Lieve Mieke en Noud, ik ben eeuwig dankbaar voor alles wat jullie voor me hebben gedaan, tot op de dag van vandaag. Dankzij jullie heb ik kansen gekregen die me hebben gebracht waar ik nu ben, en zonder jullie aanmoediging en steun had ik nooit zoveel bereikt. Querido Carlos, gracias por estar a mi lado, apoyarme a lo largo de todos estos años, y darle color a la vida.

Utrecht, February 2021

CONTENTS

<i>Preface</i>	v
<i>Acknowledgements</i>	vii
<i>List of Abbreviations</i>	xiii
<i>List of Tables</i>	xv

Chapter I.

Introduction	1
1. Migration Control and Socio-economic Rights	1
2. Aim and Research Questions	3
3. Scope of the Study	5
3.1. Scientific Relevance	5
3.2. Definitions and Limitations	8
4. Sources	14
4.1. International Conventions and Judicial Decisions	15
4.2. International Custom	16
4.3. General Principles of Law	17
4.4. Scholarship	18
4.5. Soft Law	20
5. Methodology	22
5.1. Interpreting International Human Rights Law	22
5.2. The Approach in this Study	25
5.2.1. Using Due Diligence to Interpret Human Rights Obligations ..	26
5.2.2. The Role of Subsequent Practice	28
5.2.3. Legal Interpretation in a Charged Political Context	33
6. Structure of the Volume	35

Chapter II.

Socio-economic Rights and Cooperative Migration Control Policies	37
1. Introduction	37
2. The Socio-economic Rights of People on the Move in Partner States	39
2.1. The Mediterranean	39
2.2. The Asia Pacific	43
2.3. The Americas	47
2.4. Concluding Observations on the Socio-economic Rights of People on the Move in Partner States	49

3.	Cooperative Migration Control Policies	50
3.1.	Rationales and Drivers of Migration Control	50
3.2.	The Development of Cooperative Migration Control	54
3.3.	Multiple Forms of Cooperation	60
3.3.1.	People Transfers	60
3.3.2.	The Provision of Funding, Equipment and Training	63
3.3.3.	Information Sharing	66
3.3.4.	Diplomatic Relations and Development Aid	67
3.4.	The Relation between Socio-economic Rights and Migration Control ..	69
4.	Conclusion	71

Chapter III.

Conceptualising State Obligations Towards People on the Move..... 73

1.	Introduction	73
2.	The Relation between Socio-economic Rights and Civil and Political Rights. . .	74
3.	Due Diligence and State Obligations towards People on the Move	81
4.	Core Socio-economic Rights and State Obligations towards People on the Move	89
5.	Non-discrimination and State Obligations towards People on the Move	95
6.	The Role of Territory, Jurisdiction, and ‘International Assistance and Cooperation’ in Delimiting State Obligations.	102
6.1.	The Role of Jurisdiction	102
6.2.	The Role of Territory	104
6.3.	The Role of ‘International Assistance and Cooperation’	107
7.	Conclusion	111

Chapter IV.

The Obligations of Partner States

1.	Introduction	113
2.	The Scope of Partner States’ Obligations towards People on the Move	115
2.1.	The Availability of Resources	115
2.2.	The Progressive Realisation of Socio-economic Rights	119
2.2.1.	The Obligation to Take Steps	119
2.2.2.	Non-retrogression and Limitations	122
3.	Partner States’ Obligations Regarding Specific Socio-economic Rights.	125
3.1.	The Right to an Adequate Standard of Living	126
3.2.	The Right to Health	130
3.3.	The Right to Education	132
3.4.	The Right to Work and Rights at Work	134
3.5.	The Right to Social Security	137
4.	Conclusion	138

Chapter V.

The Obligations of Sponsor States	141
1. Introduction	141
2. Sponsor States' Direct Extraterritorial Obligations	142
2.1. Traditional Models of Extraterritorial Jurisdiction	143
2.1.1. The Spatial Model	144
2.1.2. The Personal Model	146
2.1.3. The Effects Model	149
2.2. The Functional Model of Jurisdiction	152
2.3. Sponsor State Jurisdiction in the Context of Cooperative Migration Control	158
3. Sponsor States' Global Obligations in the Context of Cooperative Migration Control	164
3.1. International Assistance and Cooperation in International Human Rights Law	165
3.2. Can Cooperative Migration Control Trigger Obligations of International Assistance and Cooperation?	169
3.3. Can Sponsor States Discharge their Global Obligations through Cooperation on Migration Control?	173
4. Conclusion	179

Chapter VI.

State Responsibility and Cooperative Migration Control	181
1. Introduction	181
2. State Responsibility and Human Rights Violations	182
2.1. State Responsibility and International Human Rights Law	182
2.2. The Role of Jurisdiction and Attribution in Determining State Responsibility	185
3. The Responsibility of Partner States	190
3.1. Responsibility for the Conduct of State Organs	190
3.2. Responsibility for the Conduct of Non-State Organs	192
3.2.1. Attribution under the Law on State Responsibility	192
3.2.2. Attribution under International Human Rights Law	194
3.3. Concluding Observations on the Responsibility of Partner States	197
4. The Responsibility of Sponsor States	198
4.1. Direct Responsibility for Breaches of Direct Obligations	199
4.2. Direct Responsibility for Breaches of Global Obligations	203
4.3. Derived Responsibility	205
4.3.1. Complicity	206
4.3.2. Direction and Control	213
4.3.3. Coercion	214
5. Conclusion	216

Chapter VII.

Shared Responsibility and Cooperative Migration Control 219

1. Introduction 219

2. Independent Responsibility in the Context of Cooperative Migration Control . . . 220

3. Shared Responsibility in the Context of Cooperative Migration Control 224

 3.1. Concurrent Responsibility in the Context of Cooperative Migration Control 226

 3.1.1. Concurrent Responsibility for Breaches of Direct Human Rights Obligations 227

 3.1.2. Derived Responsibility as Concurrent Responsibility 228

 3.1.3. Concurrent Responsibility for Breaches of Global Obligations? . . 230

 3.2. Joint Responsibility in the Context of Cooperative Migration Control 232

 3.2.1. Joint Responsibility of Multiple Sponsor States 233

 3.2.2. Joint Responsibility of a Sponsor and a Partner State 234

4. Responsibility Gaps in the Context of Cooperative Migration Control 239

5. Conclusion 243

Chapter VIII.

Conclusion 245

1. Looking back: Key Findings 245

 1.1. Summary of the Main Conclusions 245

 1.2. Answering the Main Research Question 250

 1.3. Applying the Assessment Framework 252

2. Looking again: Further Insights 253

 2.1. Interaction between International Human Rights Law and the Law on State Responsibility 253

 2.2. Assistance and Cooperation 256

 2.3. Causation 257

 2.4. Time 259

3. Looking ahead: Avenues for Further Research 261

Postscript: Cooperative Migration Control, Socio-economic Rights and the COVID-19 Pandemic 263

Summary 265

Table of Cases and Decisions 271

Table of Treaties and UN Documents 279

Bibliography 285

LIST OF ABBREVIATIONS

AComHPR	African Commission on Human and Peoples' Rights
ACHPR	African Charter on Human and Peoples' Rights
ACHR	American Convention on Human Rights
ARIO	Draft Articles on the Responsibility of International Organisations
ARSIWA	Draft Articles on the Responsibility of States for Internationally Wrongful Acts
CAT	Convention against Torture and Other Cruel, Inhuman or Degrading Treatment or Punishment
CCTE	Conditional Cash Transfer for Education
CEDAW	Convention on the Elimination of All Forms of Discrimination against Women
CEDAW Committee	Committee on the Elimination of Discrimination against Women
CERD	Committee on the Elimination of Racial Discrimination
CESCR	Committee on Economic, Social and Cultural Rights
CJEU	Court of Justice of the European Union
CMW	Committee on the Protection of the Rights of All Migrant Workers and Members of their Families
CRC	Convention on the Rights of the Child
CRC Committee	Committee on the Rights of the Child
CRPD	Convention on the Rights of Persons with Disabilities
DCIM	Department for Combatting Illegal Migration (Libya)
DGMM	Directorate General for Migration Management (Turkey)
ECHR	European Convention on Human Rights
EComHR	European Commission of Human Rights
ECOSOC	United Nations Economic and Social Council
ECtHR	European Court of Human Rights
ESSN	Emergency Social Safety Net
EU	European Union
HRC	Human Rights Committee
IAComHR	Inter-American Commission on Human Rights
IACtHR	Inter-American Court of Human Rights
ICCPR	International Covenant on Civil and Political Rights
ICERD	International Convention on the Elimination of All Forms of Racial Discrimination

ICESCR	International Covenant on Economic, Social and Cultural Rights
ICJ	International Court of Justice
ICPED	International Convention for the Protection of All Persons from Enforced Disappearance
ICRMW	International Convention on the Protection of the Rights of All Migrant Workers and Members of Their Families
ICTY	International Criminal Tribunal for the former Yugoslavia
IDP	Internally displaced person
IOM	International Organisation for Migration
LFIP	Law on Foreigners and International Protection (Turkey)
MIDAS	Migration Information and Data Analysis System
MOU	Memorandum of Understanding
MRT	Moldovan Republic of Transdniestria
NGO	Non-governmental organisation
OHCHR	United Nations Office of the High Commissioner for Human Rights
RPC	Regional Processing Centre
TPR	Temporary Protection Regulation (Turkey)
UN	United Nations
UNHCR	Office of the United Nations High Commissioner for Refugees
UNSMIL	United Nations Support Mission in Libya
VCLT	Vienna Convention on the Law of Treaties

LIST OF TABLES

Table 1: Responsibility questions (general)	188
Table 2: Responsibility questions (partner States)	190
Table 3: Responsibility questions (sponsor States' direct obligations).	199
Table 4: Responsibility questions (sponsor States' global obligations)	204

