PROTECTING TRANS RIGHTS IN THE AGE OF GENDER SELF-DETERMINATION
PROTECTING TRANS RIGHTS
IN THE AGE OF GENDER
SELF-DETERMINATION

Edited by
Eva Brems
Pieter Cannoot
Toon Moonen
CONTENTS

List of Cases ................................................................. vii
List of Authors ............................................................. xi

Introduction
Eva Brems, Pieter Cannoot and Toon Moonen .......................... 1
1. Gender Variation as a Human Rights Issue .......................... 1
2. Trans Rights in the Age of Gender Self-Determination ............ 3
3. Book Overview .......................................................... 7

The Limits to Gender Self-Determination in a Stereotyped Legal System: Lessons from the Belgian Gender Recognition Act
Pieter Cannoot ............................................................... 11
1. The Legal Recognition of Gender Identity ............................ 13
2. Analysis of the Belgian Sex/Gender Registration Framework ...... 22
3. Conclusion .................................................................. 52

From Assigning Sex to Affirming Gender: Remarks on an Ongoing Evolution Affecting Gender Identification
Benjamin Moron-Puech ..................................................... 55
1. Introduction .................................................................. 55
2. The Origin of Trans Difficulties Regarding Gender Identification ... 58
3. The Ongoing Shift from Sex Assignment to Gender Affirmation .... 64
4. Final Questions ........................................................... 68

The Insufficiency of Gender Recognition Acts: The Example of Schooldays in Norway
Anniken Sørlie ................................................................. 73
1. Introduction .................................................................. 73
2. Legal Gender Recognition for Children: The European Context ... 75
3. Being Transgender at School ............................................ 80
4. A Look Forward .......................................................... 90
Developments in German Civil Status Law on the Recognition of Intersex and Non-Binary Persons: Subversion Subverted

Jens T. Theilen ................................................................. 95

1. Introduction .............................................................. 95
2. Developments in German Civil Status Law ......................... 97
3. Shifting Rationales for Legal Gender Recognition .................. 108
4. Outlook .................................................................. 117

Framing Equality: Debating Protected Grounds in the Field of Trans and Non-Binary Rights

Peter Dunne ................................................................. 121

1. Introduction .............................................................. 121
2. Terminology ................................................................ 123
3. Background and Context ............................................... 124
4. Disability .................................................................. 128
5. Sex ........................................................................ 134
6. Trans-Specific Grounds ................................................. 138
7. Conclusion .................................................................. 143

‘True Sex’: The Law and Confirmation of One’s Sex

Petr Agha ................................................................. 145

1. Introduction .............................................................. 145
2. Trans Identities in the Czech Context ................................. 147
3. Trans Identities from the Perspectives of Trans People .......... 157
4. Identity Categories ...................................................... 162
5. Conclusion .................................................................. 166

Index ................................................................. 171
LIST OF CASES

INTERNATIONAL AND SUPRANATIONAL CASE LAW

EUROPEAN COURT OF HUMAN RIGHTS

ECtHR 22 October 1981, 7525/76, Dudgeon v. the United Kingdom, Series A no. 45 . . . . . . . 27
ECtHR 17 October 1986, 9532/81, Rees v. the United Kingdom ......................... 27, 64
ECtHR 27 September 1990, 10843/84, Cossey v. the United Kingdom ......................... 27
EComm.HR, 9 September 1992, Filip Reyonjens, No. 16810/90 ......................... 61
ECtHR 30 July 1998, 22985/93 and 23390/94, Sheffield and Horsham
    v. the United Kingdom .................................................................................. 27
ECtHR 11 July 2002, 28957/95, Christine Goodwin
    v. the United Kingdom .................................................................................. 5, 27, 64, 77, 111, 122, 125
ECtHR 12 June 2003, 35968/97, Van Kück v. Germany ......................... 25, 27, 77, 111
ECtHR 23 May 2006, 32570/03, Grant v. the United Kingdom ......................... 28
ECtHR 5 June 2009, 29002/06, Schlumpf v. Switzerland ......................... 133
ECtHR 10 March 2015, 14793/08, Y.Y. v. Turkey ......................... 27–28, 77, 111
ECtHR 12 May 2015, 73235/12 Identoba and Others v. Georgia ......................... 126
ECtHR 6 April 2017, 79885/12, 52471/13, 52596/13, A.P., Garçon
    and Nicot v. France .................................................................................. 5, 27–28, 32–34, 41, 68, 77, 111, 133, 156
ECtHR 17 January 2019, 29663/16, X v. the Former Yugoslav Republic
    of Macedonia .................................................................................. 5, 27–28, 34–35
ECtHR 7 July 2020, 41701/16, Y.T. v. Bulgaria .............................................. 5

COURT OF JUSTICE OF THE EUROPEAN UNION

Opinion of Advocate General Jacobs, C-423/04 [2005] .............................................. 136
X, Y and Z v. Minister voor en Asiel [2014] 2 C.M.L.R. 16 ................................. 140

EUROPEAN COMMITTEE OF SOCIAL RIGHTS

Transgender Europe and ILGA-Europe v. the Czech Republic, 15 May 2018 ................. 33
List of Cases

INTER-AMERICAN COURT OF HUMAN RIGHTS

IACtHR 24 November 2017, Advisory Opinion OC-24/17 .......................... 6, 25, 125

UN HUMAN RIGHTS COMMITTEE

G v. Australia Communication No. 2172/2012 (CCPR/C/119/D/2172/2012)
(UN HRC, 15 June 2017) ................................................................. 126

NATIONAL CASE LAW

AUSTRIA

Verfassungsgerichtshof [Constitutional Court] (Austria) 15 June 2018, G 77/2018-9 . . . 49

BELGIUM

Grondwettelijk Hof [Constitutional Court] (Belgium) 20 October 2004, 159/2004 .... 49
Grondwettelijk Hof [Constitutional Court] (Belgium) 19 June 2019, 99/2019 .......................... 5, 12, 43, 68, 131
Rechtbank Antwerpen [Tribunal Antwerp] (Belgium) 16 September 2019, 19/1297/B .......................... 42

CANADA

Commission des droits de la personne et droits de la jeunesse v. Maison des jeunes,
CT and AT, Québec Human Rights Tribunal (2 July 1998) ......................... 134

CZECH REPUBLIC

Judgment of the Municipal Court in Prague file No. 3 A 153/2017 of 14 May 2018 .... 152
Judgment of the Supreme Administrative Court No. 2 As 199/2018-37,
dated 30 May 2019 ................................................................. 152

FRANCE

Cass. civ. (France), 4 May 2017, No. 16.17-189 ................................. 62, 113
List of Cases

GERMANY

Federal Constitutional Court of Germany, 1 BvR 3295/07 (11 January 2011) ........ 122
Federal Court of Justice, Decision of 22 June 2016, Appl. No. XII ZB 52/15.............. 99
Federal Constitutional Court of Germany, 2019/16 (10 October 2017) ........ 49, 131, 138

HONG KONG

W v. Registrar of Marriages [2013] HKCFA 39.................................................. 122

INDIA

National Legal Services Authority (NALSA) v. Union of India and others Supreme
Court of India, Writ Petition (Civil) No. 400 of 2012 (15 April 2014) ................. 122

IRELAND

Hannon v. First Direct Logistics Ltd, Equality Tribunal of Ireland (18 April 2011) ..... 128
Foy v. Registrar General of Births, Deaths and Marriages (No 2) [2007] IEHC 470.... 122

NEPAL

Supreme Court of Nepal, Writ No. 917 of the year 2064 BS (2007 AD)
(21 December 2007) ................................................................. 124

NETHERLANDS

Rechtbank Limburg [Tribunal Limburg] (the Netherlands) 28 May 2018,
ECLI:NL:RBLIM:2018:4931 .......................................................... 50

PAKISTAN

Supreme Court of Pakistan, Constitution Petition No. 43 of 2009 (22 March 2011) ... 124

SOUTH KOREA

Supreme Court of South Korea, En Banc Order 2004Seu42 (22 June 2006) ....... 122
UNITED KINGDOM

High Court of Justice (United Kingdom) 22 June 2018, CO/2704/2017 .................. 50
Court of Appeal (civil division) 10 March 2020, R on the application of Christie
   Elan-Cane v. Secretary of state for the Home Department, EWCA Civ 363 .............. 50

UNITED STATES OF AMERICA

Glenn v Brumby: 'Extending Protection from Sex-Based Discrimination to
   Transsexuals in the Eleventh Circuit' (2012) 21 ............................................. 136
Ashton Whitaker V. Kenosha Unified School District (16-3522) [2017] ............... 90
LIST OF AUTHORS

Petr Agha
Director of the Centre for Law and Public Affairs, Researcher at the Institute of State and Law, Czech Academy of Sciences, and Senior Lecturer at the Faculty of Law of Charles University in Prague, Czech Republic

Eva Brems
Senior Full Professor of human rights law at the Human Rights Centre of Ghent University, Belgium

Pieter Cannoot
Postdoctoral Researcher at ConstitUGent and the Human Rights Centre of Ghent University, and Visiting Professor at the University of Antwerp, Belgium

Peter Dunne
Senior Lecturer at the University of Bristol Law School, United Kingdom

Toon Moonen
Assistant Professor of constitutional law at ConstitUGent and the Human Rights Centre of Ghent University, Belgium

Benjamin Moron-Puech
Lecturer at the Laboratory of Legal Sociology, Panthéon-Assas University, Paris, France

Anniken Sørlie
Associate Professor at Østfold University College, Faculty of Health and Welfare, Norway

Jens T. Theilen
Research Associate at Helmut Schmidt University, Hamburg, Germany