

PROTECTING TRANS RIGHTS IN THE AGE
OF GENDER SELF-DETERMINATION

PROTECTING TRANS RIGHTS
IN THE AGE OF GENDER
SELF-DETERMINATION

Edited by
Eva BREMS
Pieter CANNOOT
Toon MOONEN

 INTERSENTIA
Cambridge – Antwerp – Chicago

Intersentia Ltd
8 Wellington Mews
Wellington Street | Cambridge
CB1 1HW | United Kingdom
Tel: +44 1223 736 170
Email: mail@intersentia.co.uk
www.intersentia.com | www.intersentia.co.uk

*Distribution for the UK and
Rest of the World (incl. Eastern Europe)*
NBN International
1 Deltic Avenue, Rooksley
Milton Keynes MK13 8LD
United Kingdom
Tel: +44 1752 202 301 | Fax: +44 1752 202 331
Email: orders@nbninternational.com

Distribution for Europe
Lefebvre Sarrut Belgium NV
Hoogstraat 139/6
1000 Brussels
Belgium
Tel: +32 (0)800 39 067
Email: mail@intersentia.be

Distribution for the USA and Canada
Independent Publishers Group
Order Department
814 North Franklin Street
Chicago, IL 60610
USA
Tel: +1 800 888 4741 (toll free) | Fax: +1 312 337 5985
Email: orders@ipgbook.com

Protecting Trans Rights in the Age of Gender Self-Determination
© The editors and contributors severally 2020

The editors and contributors have asserted the right under the Copyright, Designs and Patents Act 1988, to be identified as authors of this work.

No part of this book may be reproduced, stored in a retrieval system, or transmitted, in any form, or by any means, without prior written permission from Intersentia, or as expressly permitted by law or under the terms agreed with the appropriate reprographic rights organisation. Enquiries concerning reproduction which may not be covered by the above should be addressed to Intersentia at the address above.

Artwork on cover: Christina Rahm Art / Alamy Stock Photo

ISBN 978-1-83970-019-4
D/2020/7849/64
NUR 828

British Library Cataloguing in Publication Data. A catalogue record for this book is available from the British Library.

CONTENTS

<i>List of Cases</i>	vii
<i>List of Authors</i>	xi

Introduction

Eva BREMS, Pieter CANNOOT and Toon MOONEN	1
1. Gender Variation as a Human Rights Issue	1
2. Trans Rights in the Age of Gender Self-Determination	3
3. Book Overview	7

The Limits to Gender Self-Determination in a Stereotyped Legal System: Lessons from the Belgian Gender Recognition Act

Pieter CANNOOT	11
1. The Legal Recognition of Gender Identity	13
2. Analysis of the Belgian Sex/Gender Registration Framework	22
3. Conclusion	52

From Assigning Sex to Affirming Gender: Remarks on an Ongoing Evolution Affecting Gender Identification

Benjamin MORON-PUECH	55
1. Introduction	55
2. The Origin of Trans Difficulties Regarding Gender Identification	58
3. The Ongoing Shift from Sex Assignment to Gender Affirmation	64
4. Final Questions	68

The Insufficiency of Gender Recognition Acts: The Example of Schooldays in Norway

Anniken SØRLIE	73
1. Introduction	73
2. Legal Gender Recognition for Children: The European Context	75
3. Being Transgender at School	80
4. A Look Forward	90

Developments in German Civil Status Law on the Recognition of Intersex and Non-Binary Persons: Subversion Subverted
 Jens T. THEILEN 95

1. Introduction 95
 2. Developments in German Civil Status Law 97
 3. Shifting Rationales for Legal Gender Recognition 108
 4. Outlook 117

Framing Equality: Debating Protected Grounds in the Field of Trans and Non-Binary Rights
 Peter DUNNE 121

1. Introduction 121
 2. Terminology 123
 3. Background and Context 124
 4. Disability 128
 5. Sex 134
 6. Trans-Specific Grounds 138
 7. Conclusion 143

‘True Sex’: The Law and Confirmation of One’s Sex
 Petr AGHA 145

1. Introduction 145
 2. Trans Identities in the Czech Context 147
 3. Trans Identities from the Perspectives of Trans People 157
 4. Identity Categories 162
 5. Conclusion 166

Index 171

LIST OF CASES

INTERNATIONAL AND SUPRANATIONAL CASE LAW

EUROPEAN COURT OF HUMAN RIGHTS

ECtHR 22 October 1981, 7525/76, <i>Dudgeon v. the United Kingdom</i> , Series A no. 45	27
ECtHR 17 October 1986, 9532/81, <i>Rees v. the United Kingdom</i>	27, 64
ECtHR 27 September 1990, 10843/84, <i>Cossey v. the United Kingdom</i>	27
EComm.HR, 9 September 1992, <i>Filip Reyntjens</i> , No. 16810/90	61
ECtHR 30 July 1998, 22985/93 and 23390/94, <i>Sheffield and Horsham</i> <i>v. the United Kingdom</i>	27
ECtHR 11 July 2002, 28957/95, <i>Christine Goodwin</i> <i>v. the United Kingdom</i>	5, 27, 64, 77, 111, 122, 125
ECtHR 12 June 2003, 35968/97, <i>Van Kück v. Germany</i>	25, 27, 77, 111
ECtHR 23 May 2006, 32570/03, <i>Grant v. the United Kingdom</i>	28
ECtHR 5 June 2009, 29002/06, <i>Schlumpf v. Switzerland</i>	133
ECtHR 10 March 2015, 14793/08, <i>Y.Y. v. Turkey</i>	27–28, 77, 111
ECtHR 12 May 2015, 73235/12 <i>Identoba and Others v. Georgia</i>	126
ECtHR 6 April 2017, 79885/12, 52471/13, 52596/13, <i>A.P., Garçon</i> <i>and Nicot v. France</i>	5, 27–28, 32–34, 41, 68, 77, 111, 133, 156
ECtHR 17 January 2019, 29663/16, <i>X v. the Former Yugoslav Republic</i> <i>of Macedonia</i>	5, 27–28, 34–35
ECtHR 7 July 2020, 41701/16, <i>Y.T. v. Bulgaria</i>	5

COURT OF JUSTICE OF THE EUROPEAN UNION

<i>P v. S and Cornwall County Council</i> C-13/94 [1996] ECR I-2143	126, 135
Opinion of Advocate General Jacobs, C-423/04 [2005]	136
<i>X, Y and Z v. Minister voor en Asiel</i> [2014] 2 C.M.L.R. 16	140

EUROPEAN COMMITTEE OF SOCIAL RIGHTS

<i>Transgender Europe and ILGA-Europe v. the Czech Republic</i> , 15 May 2018.	33
--	----

INTER-AMERICAN COURT OF HUMAN RIGHTS

IACtHR 24 November 2017, Advisory Opinion OC-24/17 6, 25, 125

UN HUMAN RIGHTS COMMITTEE

G v. Australia Communication No. 2172/2012 (CCPR/C/119/D/2172/2012)
(UN HRC, 15 June 2017) 126

NATIONAL CASE LAW

AUSTRIA

Verfassungsgerichtshof [Constitutional Court] (Austria) 15 June 2018, G 77/2018-9. . . . 49

BELGIUM

Grondwettelijk Hof [Constitutional Court] (Belgium) 20 October 2004, 159/2004 49
Grondwettelijk Hof [Constitutional Court] (Belgium) 19 June 2019,
99/2019 5, 12, 43, 68, 131
Rechtbank Antwerpen [Tribunal Antwerp] (Belgium) 16 September 2019,
19/1297/B 42

CANADA

*Commission des droits de la personne et droits de la jeunesse v. Maison des jeunes,
CT and AT*, Québec Human Rights Tribunal (2 July 1998) 134

CZECH REPUBLIC

Judgment of the Municipal Court in Prague file No. 3 A 153/2017 of 14 May 2018 152
Judgment of the Supreme Administrative Court No. 2 As 199/2018-37,
dated 30 May 2019 152

FRANCE

Cass. civ. (France), 4 May 2017, No. 16.17-189 62, 113

GERMANY

Federal Constitutional Court of Germany, 1 BvR 3295/07 (11 January 2011)	122
Federal Court of Justice, Decision of 22 June 2016, Appl. No. XII ZB 52/15.	99
Federal Constitutional Court of Germany, 2019/16 (10 October 2017)	49, 131, 138

HONG KONG

<i>W v. Registrar of Marriages</i> [2013] HKCFA 39.	122
---	-----

INDIA

<i>National Legal Services Authority (NALSA) v. Union of India and others</i> Supreme Court of India, Writ Petition (Civil) No. 400 of 2012 (15 April 2014)	122
--	-----

IRELAND

<i>Hannon v. First Direct Logistics Ltd, Equality Tribunal of Ireland</i> (18 April 2011)	128
<i>Foy v. Registrar General of Births, Deaths and Marriages (No 2)</i> [2007] IEHC 470.	122

NEPAL

Supreme Court of Nepal, Writ No. 917 of the year 2064 BS (2007 AD) (21 December 2007)	124
--	-----

NETHERLANDS

Rechtbank Limburg [Tribunal Limburg] (the Netherlands) 28 May 2018, ECLI:NL:RBLIM:2018:4931	50
--	----

PAKISTAN

Supreme Court of Pakistan, Constitution Petition No. 43 of 2009 (22 March 2011)	124
---	-----

SOUTH KOREA

Supreme Court of South Korea, En Banc Order 2004Seu42 (22 June 2006)	122
--	-----

UNITED KINGDOM

High Court of Justice (United Kingdom) 22 June 2018, CO/2704/2017	50
Court of Appeal (civil division) 10 March 2020, <i>R on the application of Christie Elan-Cane v. Secretary of state for the Home Department</i> , EWCA Civ 363	50

UNITED STATES OF AMERICA

<i>MT v. JT</i> 355 A.2d 204 (N.J. Super. Ct. App. Div. 1976)	122
<i>Jean Doe v. Bell</i> 2003 WL 355603 (9 January 2003)	128
<i>Glenn v Brumby</i> : 'Extending Protection from Sex-Based Discrimination to Transsexuals in the Eleventh Circuit' (2012) 21	136
<i>Macy v. Holder</i> No. 0120120821, 2012 WL 1435995 (E.E.O.C., 20 April 2012)	134
<i>Ashton Whitaker V. Kenosha Unified School District</i> (16-3522) [2017]	90

LIST OF AUTHORS

Petr Agha

Director of the Centre for Law and Public Affairs, Researcher at the Institute of State and Law, Czech Academy of Sciences, and Senior Lecturer at the Faculty of Law of Charles University in Prague, Czech Republic

Eva Brems

Senior Full Professor of human rights law at the Human Rights Centre of Ghent University, Belgium

Pieter Cannoot

Postdoctoral Researcher at ConstitUGent and the Human Rights Centre of Ghent University, and Visiting Professor at the University of Antwerp, Belgium

Peter Dunne

Senior Lecturer at the University of Bristol Law School, United Kingdom

Toon Moonen

Assistant Professor of constitutional law at ConstitUGent and the Human Rights Centre of Ghent University, Belgium

Benjamin Moron-Puech

Lecturer at the Laboratory of Legal Sociology, Panthéon-Assas University, Paris, France

Anniken Sørli

Associate Professor at Østfold University College, Faculty of Health and Welfare, Norway

Jens T. Theilen

Research Associate at Helmut Schmidt University, Hamburg, Germany

