CULTURE IN THE STATE REPORTING PROCEDURE
OF THE UN HUMAN RIGHTS TREATY BODIES
The titles published in this series are listed at the end of this volume.
CULTURE IN THE STATE
REPORTING PROCEDURE OF
THE UN HUMAN RIGHTS
TREATY BODIES

How the HRC, the CESCR and the
CEDAWCee use human rights as a sword
to protect and promote culture, and as a
shield to protect against harmful culture

Vincent Willem Vleugel

INTERSENTIA
Cambridge – Antwerp – Chicago
Culture in the State Reporting Procedure of the UN Human Rights Treaty Bodies. How the HRC, the CESCR and the CEDAWCee use human rights as a sword to protect and promote culture, and as a shield to protect against harmful culture
© Vincent Willem Vleugel 2020

Cover image: ImageZoo / Alamy Stock Photo

The author has asserted the right under the Copyright, Designs and Patents Act 1988, to be identified as authors of this work.

No part of this book may be reproduced, stored in a retrieval system, or transmitted, in any form, or by any means, without prior written permission from Intersentia, or as expressly permitted by law or under the terms agreed with the appropriate reprographic rights organisation. Enquiries concerning reproduction which may not be covered by the above should be addressed to Intersentia at the address above.

D/2020/7849/46
NUR 828

ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

I can say with certainty that this research would never have started, and would certainly never have been finished, without the support and guidance that I received from many people.

First and foremost, I would like to express my gratitude to my supervisors, Yvonne Donders and Rosanne van Alebeek. Yvonne, you gave me the opportunity to do this research. I consider myself lucky for having you as my supervisor. If needed, you were always there for help and advice. But I am especially thankful for your optimism and motivational qualities. Somehow you always managed to give me the necessary confidence boosts, to find new energy to continue, and to keep going. Rosanne, without you I fear this book would have been a total mess. Numerous times I got lost in the overload of information I gathered, you helped me see the bigger picture.

I would like to warmly thank the members of the reading committee, Professor Ernst Hirsch Ballin, Professor Eva Brems, Professor Cees Flinterman, Professor Carla Zoethout, and Dr Maarten den Heijer, for taking the time to read my work, and for taking part in my defence. I want to say a special thank you to Professor Cees Flinterman, who – as a member of the Human Rights Committee – invited me to Geneva, and gave me the opportunity to see reality in all its complexity, also behind doors that would otherwise have been closed.

Thank you to my two roommates, Vladislav and Katrine. Your presence made PhD-life much more fun. Vlad, you became a good friend. I really enjoyed our café talks after yet another frustrating day at the office.

Thank you to all the colleagues that shared their PhD-journeys with me: Nienke, Isabelle, Natasa, Tim, Anne, Nik, Emma, Maarten, Chris, Heather, Vigjilenca, Enrico, Sanne, Berenice, Or, Stephan, Louwrens. Julie, sharing a supervisor creates a bond. Thanks for your help and support.

Thanks to my friends for always asking me about the (lack of) progress in my research, even when I did not want to talk about it. And thanks for subsequently distracting me from it. Thank you to my two paranymphs, Mien and Steve, for standing by my side on this special occasion.

I would like to thank my parents as well as my sister for always being there, no matter what. Maps, you gave me every opportunity to go where I want to go and to do what I want to do. Thanks for stimulating me to keep studying and discovering, and for keeping me grounded. Thanks for always pampering me when I come by.

Lastly, I want to say thanks to my two girls, who are everything to me. Marlies, thank you for believing in me, for being supportive, and for being you. Iris, I am so happy you are here.
## CONTENTS

**Acknowledgements** ................................................................. v  
**Abbreviations** ........................................................................ xiii  

Note on Citation Formats .............................................................. xiv  
Note on Grammar ........................................................................ xiv  

**Chapter 1**  
**Introduction** ........................................................................... 1  
1 Introduction .................................................................................. 1  
2 Purpose and Significance of the Study ......................................... 5  
3 Research Objective and Questions ............................................. 9  
4 Scope of the Research ............................................................... 10  
5 Structure and Methodology of the Research .............................. 12  

**Chapter 2**  
**Human Rights and Cultural Diversity. Between and Beyond Universalism and Cultural Relativism** .............................................. 17  
1 Introduction .................................................................................. 17  
2 Culture, Cultural Diversity, and Cultural Arguments .................. 18  
3 Cultural Values and Perspectives ................................................ 22  
  3.1 ‘Western bias’ ........................................................................ 23  
  3.2 Arab/Islamic perspective ......................................................... 24  
  3.3 Asian perspective .................................................................. 26  
  3.4 African perspective ............................................................... 29  
4 Universalism and Cultural Relativism: the Dichotomy and Beyond .............................................. 31  
5 Concluding Remarks .................................................................. 40  

**Chapter 3**  
**UN Treaty Bodies. Treaties, Committees, Working Methods** .......... 43  
1 Introduction .................................................................................. 43  
2 The Treaties ................................................................................. 43  
  2.1 International Covenant on Civil and Political Rights (ICCPR) .............................................. 44  
  2.2 International Covenant on Economic, Social and Cultural Rights (ICESCR) .......................... 45
Culture in the State Reporting Procedure of the UN Human Rights Treaty Bodies

2.3 Convention on the Elimination of All Forms of Discrimination against Women (CEDAW) ........................................ 46
2.4 Reservations ...................................................... 47
3 The Committees ..................................................... 53
  3.1 Human Rights Committee (HRC) .............................. 53
  3.2 Committee on Economic, Social and Cultural Rights (CESCR) .... 54
  3.3 Committee on the Elimination of Discrimination against Women (CEDAWCee) ...................................................... 55
4 Working Methods .................................................. 56
  4.1 State reporting procedure ....................................... 57
  4.2 General comments and recommendations ...................... 66
  4.3 Strengthening and enhancing the effective functioning of the treaty body system ........................................... 68
5 Legal Status Treaty Body Output .................................. 69
6 Legitimacy Challenges ............................................. 71
7 Treaty Bodies’ Roles in Reconciling Universality and Diversity .......... 74
8 Concluding Remarks ................................................. 76

Chapter 4
Human Rights as a Sword. To Protect and Promote Cultural Diversity .... 79

1 Introduction .......................................................... 79
2 Cultural Exclusivity: Protecting and Promoting Cultural Distinctiveness and Exclusivity ........................................... 81
  2.1 HRC .............................................................. 82
     2.1.1 Right to self-determination .............................. 82
     2.1.2 Right of members of minorities to enjoy their own culture . 84
     2.1.3 Right to freedom of religion ................................ 90
  2.2 CESCR .......................................................... 91
     2.2.1 Right to self-determination .............................. 91
     2.2.2 Right to take part in cultural life ........................... 95
  2.3 CEDAWCee ..................................................... 105
3 Cultural Inclusivity: Protecting Cultural Diversity through Non-Discrimination and Equality Provisions ........................... 107
  3.1 Non-discrimination and the enjoyment of equality: some preliminary notions .................................................. 107
  3.2 Right to be different: permanent measures to ensure equality by accommodating differences in treatment ...................... 112
     3.2.1 HRC .......................................................... 112
        3.2.1.1 Freedom of religion ..................................... 113
        3.2.1.2 Fair trial .................................................. 113
     3.2.2 CESCR ..................................................... 114
        3.2.2.1 Education .................................................. 114
Chapter 7
Conclusions. How the Treaty Bodies Universalise Human Rights. ................. 337

1  Introduction .................................................................................. 337
2  UN Treaty Bodies’ Role in Protecting and Promoting Positive Aspects of
   Cultural Diversity ................................................................. 338
3  UN Treaty Bodies’ Role in Changing, Challenging and Eradicating
   Negative Aspects of Cultural Diversity ................................. 340
4  Cultural Arguments in the Dialogue .............................................. 341
5  UN Treaty Bodies’ Role in Enhancing Universal Legitimacy of Human
   Rights .................................................................................. 344
6.  Overall Conclusions and Recommendations .......................... 346

Bibliography ................................................................. 349
Summary ......................................................................... 361
Samenvatting .......................................................... 369
# ABBREVIATIONS

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Acronym</th>
<th>Full Form</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>AAA</td>
<td>American Anthropological Association</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>AHRD</td>
<td>ASEAN Human Rights Declaration</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>AIV</td>
<td>Advisory Council on International Affairs of the Netherlands</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CAT</td>
<td>Committee Against Torture</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CEDAW</td>
<td>Convention on the Elimination of All Forms of Discrimination against Women</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CEDAWCee</td>
<td>Committee on the Elimination of Discrimination against Women</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CERD</td>
<td>Committee on the Elimination of Racial Discrimination</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CRTF</td>
<td>Country Report Task Forces</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ECOSOC</td>
<td>Economic and Social Council</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ECtHR</td>
<td>European Court of Human Rights</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>FGM</td>
<td>Female Genital Mutilation</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>HRC</td>
<td>Human Rights Committee</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ICCPR</td>
<td>International Covenant on Civil and Political Rights</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ICERD</td>
<td>International Convention on the Elimination of All Forms of Racial Discrimination</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ICJ</td>
<td>International Court of Justice</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ICESCR</td>
<td>International Covenant on Economic, Social and Cultural Rights</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ILC</td>
<td>International Law Commission</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>LGBT+</td>
<td>sexual and gender identities, such as lesbian, gay, bisexual, transgender and intersex persons</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>LOIPR</td>
<td>List of Issues Prior to Reporting</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>OHCHR</td>
<td>Office of the High Commissioner for Human Rights</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>OIC</td>
<td>Organisation of Islamic Cooperation</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>UDHR</td>
<td>Universal Declaration of Human Rights</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>UN</td>
<td>United Nations</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>UNESCO</td>
<td>United Nations Educational, Scientific and Cultural Organization</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>VCLT</td>
<td>Vienna Convention on the Law of Treaties</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
NOTE ON CITATION FORMATS

The primary material on which the dissertation relies is the Committees’ concluding observations on State party reviews. Due to the large number of citations referring to concluding observations, a short form of citation to the concluding observations is used in the present work, similar to that used by Freeman, Rudolf and Chinkin in The UN Convention on the Elimination of All Forms of Discrimination Against Women. A Commentary, and approved by the Oxford University Press.

NOTE ON GRAMMAR

Specific Concluding Observations are written with capitals; when referring to concluding observations in general, it is written without capitals. Same for general comments and recommendations, and for summary records.

On sexual orientation and gender identity, the LGBT+ is referred to, except where the Committees are quoted.