

CONTRACT AND PROPERTY WITH  
AN ENVIRONMENTAL PERSPECTIVE



CONTRACT AND PROPERTY  
WITH AN ENVIRONMENTAL  
PERSPECTIVE

Siel DEMEYERE  
Vincent SAGAERT  
(eds.)



INTERSENTIA

Cambridge – Antwerp – Chicago

Intersentia Ltd  
8 Wellington Mews | Wellington Street  
Cambridge | CB1 1HW | United Kingdom  
Tel.: +44 1223 736 170  
Email: mail@intersentia.co.uk  
www.intersentia.com | www.intersentia.co.uk

*Distribution for the UK and Ireland:*  
NBN International  
Airport Business Centre, 10 Thornbury Road  
Plymouth, PL6 7 PP  
United Kingdom  
Tel.: +44 1752 202 301 | Fax: +44 1752 202 331  
Email: orders@nbninternational.com

*Distribution for Europe and all other countries:*  
Intersentia Publishing nv  
Groenstraat 31  
2640 Mortsel  
Belgium  
Tel.: +32 3 680 15 50 | Fax: +32 3 658 71 21  
Email: mail@intersentia.be

*Distribution for the USA and Canada:*  
Independent Publishers Group  
Order Department  
814 North Franklin Street  
Chicago, IL60610  
USA  
Tel.: +1 800 888 4741 (toll free) | Fax: +1312 337 5985  
Email: orders@ipgbook.com

Contract and Property with an Environmental Perspective  
© Siel Demeyere and Vincent Sagaert (eds.) 2020

The authors have asserted the right under the Copyright, Designs and Patents Act 1988, to be identified as authors of this work.

No part of this book may be reproduced, stored in a retrieval system, or transmitted, in any form, or by any means, without prior written permission from Intersentia, or as expressly permitted by law or under the terms agreed with the appropriate reprographic rights organisation. Enquiries concerning reproduction which may not be covered by the above should be addressed to Intersentia at the address above.

ISBN 978-1-78068-865-7  
ISBN 978-1-78068-866-4 (PDF)  
D/2020/7849/63  
NUR 822

British Library Cataloguing in Publication Data. A catalogue record for this book is available from the British Library.

## PREFACE

This book includes the conference proceedings of a conference in September 2019 in Leuven. The Institute for Property Law of the University of Leuven had the opportunity to welcome numerous authoritative legal scholars to debate on the impact of sustainability challenges on the crossroads between contract and property. While environmental issues, and more broadly sustainability, are often conceived as a matter of public law, if a matter of law at all, in recent years, also private law aims to join in. More fundamentally, environmental law could challenge the main division in private law, the division between contract and property. Fundamental rules of traditional private law, with strong historical roots, such as the privity of contracts, the closed system of property rights, the praedial rule with regard to servitudes, etc. are under pressure. The contributions of this book therefore are situated at the point of encounter of at least three fields of law: environment, contract and property. Very often, a fourth field of law joins this encounter: the constitutional protection of ownership plays a major role in the described challenges. The contributions in this book are on the one hand, careful analyses of national laws, and on the other hand, more general views on the interplay between property law and sustainability.

Vincent **Sagaert** provides in his contribution ‘Property Law, Contract Law and Environmental Law: shaking hands with the (historical) enemy’ a general historical and theoretical glance on the development of the fields of law at stake, with property law as the hinge of the analysis. Environmental law and property law are born enemies, but have developed towards a gradual conversation during the last decades. Within private law, contract law and property law were living more apart than together for historical reasons. The contribution demonstrates how this has changed over the decades, and how environmental law even strengthens this development.

Bram **Akkermans** discusses ‘Sustainable Obligations in (Dutch) Property Law’ and frames the current developments in a broader framework of property theory, especially the Human Flourishing Theory, which could provide a basis for further going change. He illustrates this with a discussion of the Dutch qualitative obligation (*kwalitatieve verbintenis*).

Siel **Demeyere** discusses the ‘Contractual regulation of property rights’ and the opportunities in contract and property law to impose obligations on a land

owner, even if the legislator has not provided for a specific legal framework for environmental obligations. For instance, in Belgian law, no specific legal instruments aimed at enhancing sustainability are available in private law.

In ‘Towards Sustainable Real Estate in a Circular Economy’, Benjamin **Verheye** analyses the possibilities of the circular economy for real estate. In the field of real estate, an increasing number of circular initiatives are being developed, but often these initiatives are hindered by existing rules on property law. This contribution, based on Verheye’s award winning article published in the Belgian legal journal *Tijdschrift voor Privaatrecht*, researches to what extent the Belgian building right could be interpreted to circumvent these hindrances.

In many countries, the legislator has recently developed new legal instruments enabling individuals to take on more responsibility for the environment and sustainability in general. Not only are these analyses invaluable for the national law at hand, but also allow to learn from the other systems and to see what works (or what does not work) in given contexts.

Gaëlle **Gidrol-Mistral** demonstrates in her contribution ‘Quebec private law, destined to preserve the environment?’ the diversity of tools available in Québec property law to strive for sustainability: the social trust, the servitude of conservation, and the undivided property affected to a lasting purpose. While the first sounds very promising, the latter two are in practice more effective and more frequently used. She moreover analyses how the current developments put under pressure, and even change, long lasting property law principles such as the (limited) duration of property rights and exclusivity.

Andrew **Steven** discusses ‘Real burdens in Scots law: an environmental perspective.’ These real burdens are embedded in the generally permissive (speaking from a civil law viewpoint) Scottish property law. He provides a close analysis of both conservation burdens and climate change burdens, which are in practice hardly used. After this surprising finding, he suggests how the attractiveness of these burdens can be increased.

Elsabe **Van der Sijde** writes on ‘Positive and negative obligations of landowners in South African law’ from an environmental perspective, with reference to the real life example of endangered ‘fynbos’ and with consideration of the broader societal issues in environmental protection, such as the special environmental concerns in developing regions.

Christopher **Pulman** and Nicholas **Hopkins** analyse in their contribution ‘The Introduction of Conservation Covenants in English Law’ in detail the conservation covenants which may soon become part of the English law body.

Taking into account the most recent developments, they give a broad overview of relevant instruments, both in public and private law, which may not only inspire English lawyers, but also lawyers from other legal systems.

Blandine Mallet-Bricout provides for an extensive overview and critical analysis of ‘The “obligation réelle environnementale” in French law’, interwoven with real life examples. Also the French practice of ‘conservation measures’ and the specific problems arising from it, are addressed.

Christine Godt writes on ‘Environmental Duties in the German Land Register’ and provides interesting insights in the private-public law divide. She also more closely analyses the *beschränkte persönliche Dienstbarkeit* and questions the need for European harmonisation in regard of environmental land burdens.

In ‘Nordic perspectives on contract and property law with an environmental perspective: examples from Norway’, Berte-Elen Konow gives a view on the broader framework of Nordic, more specifically Norwegian, property law, both historically and in terms of more general contract and property law. She moreover shows how courts integrate environmental concerns in specific cases, by referring to more general environmental legislation and how the legislator integrates environmental concerns in older acts.

Many authors are positive towards the statutory legal devices introduced in their national legal system, but also emphasise the need for a further adjustment of the legislative framework and the careful follow up and performance of the measures. The contributions demonstrate the urge of the pressing need for protection and the inadequacy of most current measures.

We hope you enjoy this book, and the ideas and questions it triggers, as much as we did!

Siel DEMEYERE and Vincent SAGAERT





# CONTENTS

*Preface* ..... v

## **Property Law, Contract Law and Environmental Law: Shaking Hands with the (Historical) Enemy**

Vincent SAGAERT ..... 1

§1. Introduction ..... 1

§2. A historical approach: the absence of ‘commons’ in property law ..... 2

    1. Ownership as exclusive dominion ..... 2

    2. Impact on the relation between property law and environmental law . . . 5

§3. The birth of a grey area between contract and property: a gradual conversation between property law and environmental law ..... 6

    1. General analysis ..... 6

    2. The growth of the environmental dimension in property law ..... 8

    3. The virtual content of ownership: internalisation of environmental land burdens ..... 14

    4. Nuisance law as engine for environmental protection? ..... 18

    5. Environmental limitations and the compensation of private owners . 19

§4. What is the impact of the convergence between property law and environmental law on the dualism between contract and property? .... 20

    1. General framework ..... 20

    2. Negative environmental land burdens ..... 22

    3. Affirmative environmental land burdens ..... 24

§5. Conclusion ..... 27

## **Sustainable Obligations in (Dutch) Property Law**

Bram AKKERMANS ..... 29

§1. Introduction ..... 29

§2. Theoretical foundations of property law ..... 30

    1. Utilitarianism ..... 31

    2. Human Flourishing ..... 32

§3. Property and Human Flourishing ..... 34

    1. Obligations of ownership ..... 35

§4. Case study: legal obligations in Dutch law ..... 37

    1. The qualitative duty ..... 37

2.	Sustainable applications of the qualitative duty	39
3.	Qualitative duties revisited	42
§5.	Conclusion	43

**Contractual Regulation of Property Rights: Opportunities for Sustainability and Environmental Protection**

	Siel DEMEYERE	47
§1.	Introduction	47
§2.	Concrete illustration	50
§3.	Contractual regulation and the <i>numerus clausus</i> principle	55
§4.	Limits to contractual regulation	59
	1. Obligations	62
	2. Rights	69
§5.	Conclusion	74

**Towards Sustainable Real Estate in a Circular Economy**

	Benjamin VERHEYE	77
§1.	Introduction: towards future-proof property law	77
§2.	Circular Economy: the essentials	79
§3.	Property Law hindrances (?) to a Circular Economy for real estate	86
	1. Introduction: real estate in a Circular Economy and property law	86
	2. Real-life Circular Economy initiatives in the real estate sector	90
	3. Towards a more holistic approach?	94
	4. The notion ‘immovable’ in Belgian law: three categories	97
	5. Leasing incorporated building parts in a Circular Economy	99
	5.1. Accession to immovables	99
	5.2. Accession to immovables in a Circular Economy: a hindrance	104
	5.3. Alternative solutions to prevent accession to immovables?	108
	6. Leasing of movables used in an immovable, without being incorporated	117
	6.1. Risks connected to leasing movables in a Circular Economy	117
	6.2. The rogue lessee	118
	6.3. Bankruptcy	120
	6.4. Privilege of the real estate lessor	121
§4.	Conclusion	121

**Quebec Private Law, Destined to Preserve the Environment?**

	Gaële Gidrol-MISTRAL	125
§1.	The social trust	130
§2.	Servitude of conservation	133

§3. Undivided property affected to a lasting purpose .....	136
§4. Environmentally compatible property law .....	138
1. Affectation .....	138
2. Duration .....	139
3. Exclusivity .....	140
4. Powers .....	140
§5. Conclusion .....	141
<b>Real Burdens in Scots Law: An Environmental Perspective</b>	
Andrew J M STEVEN .....	143
§1. Introduction .....	143
§2. The common law on real burdens .....	144
§3. The road to feudal abolition .....	147
§4. The Title Conditions (Scotland) Act 2003 .....	149
§5. Conservation burdens .....	150
§6. Climate change burdens .....	155
§7. Assessment .....	159
§8. Conclusion .....	162
<b>Positive and Negative Obligations of Landowners in South African Law: An Environmental Perspective</b>	
Elsabé VAN DER SIJDE .....	163
§1. Introduction .....	163
§2. Overview of the challenges of protecting biodiversity on privately-owned land .....	165
§3. Endangered fynbos in the Western Cape, South Africa .....	167
§4. The biodiversity stewardship programme .....	171
§5. Constitutional framework for positive and negative obligations on landowners in the environmental context .....	176
§6. Evaluation .....	179
§7. Concluding remarks .....	183
<b>The Introduction of Conservation Covenants in English Law</b>	
Christopher PULMAN and Nicholas HOPKINS .....	185
§1. The limitations of current English law .....	186
1. Contractual obligations .....	187
2. Proprietary interests .....	188
2.1. Ownership rights: sale or lease .....	189
2.2. Limited proprietary rights: easements .....	190
2.3. Limited proprietary rights: restrictive covenants .....	191

3.	Statutory mechanisms . . . . .	192
3.1.	Voluntary mechanisms . . . . .	192
a.	Agreements with special effects . . . . .	192
b.	Legislation expanding the scope of restrictive covenants. . . . .	193
c.	Planning consent conditions . . . . .	194
3.2.	Involuntary mechanisms . . . . .	194
a.	Listed buildings . . . . .	195
b.	Designation of an area as a site of special scientific interest. . . . .	195
§2.	The scope and nature of conservation covenants . . . . .	197
1.	Relationship to land . . . . .	198
2.	Voluntary agreements . . . . .	199
3.	Responsible bodies . . . . .	200
4.	Conservation purpose . . . . .	202
5.	Public good . . . . .	204
6.	Effect on third parties . . . . .	205
7.	Judicial oversight . . . . .	206
§3.	Illustration of the use of Conservation Covenants in a planning context . . . . .	206
§4.	Conservation covenants and proprietary interests. . . . .	210
<b>The ‘<i>obligation réelle environnementale</i>’ in French law</b>		
	Blandine MALLET-BRICOUT . . . . .	215
§1.	Issues and implementation of an ORE based on an environmental ethic . . . . .	217
1.	A targeted and sustainable burden on the property . . . . .	218
1.1.	A real burden . . . . .	218
1.2.	A targeted burden . . . . .	220
1.3.	A sustainable burden. . . . .	221
2.	Reciprocal commitments . . . . .	221
3.	A secured act . . . . .	222
3.1.	Securing the content of the contract. . . . .	222
3.2.	Securing third party effectiveness. . . . .	224
3.3.	Compatibility with pre-existing rights on the property concerned . . . . .	224
4.	Legislative incentives . . . . .	225
§2.	Mobilization of the ORE as a compensation measure . . . . .	226
1.	Specific context of the use of a real environmental obligation: ‘compensation measures for damage to biodiversity’. . . . .	227
2.	Implementation of the real environmental obligation as a compensation measure . . . . .	229
§3.	Conclusion . . . . .	232

Appendix .....	233
Article L. 132–3 C. Envir.....	233
Article L. 132–3 C. Envir.....	234
<b>Environmental Duties in the German Land Register</b>	
Christine GODT .....	235
§1. Any problem? Environmental Duties in the German Land Register ...	235
§2. Current practise under §1090 BGB in two areas of environmental law. ...	238
1. Climate Change Regulation .....	238
2. Nature Conservation .....	239
3. Technical Interpretation of §1090 BGB.....	243
§3. Conflicting Principles? .....	245
1. Appurtenant rule .....	246
2. Praedial rule .....	246
3. No positive duties.....	248
4. Rule against perpetuities / rule against unreasonable restraints on alienation .....	249
5. Numerus clausus .....	251
§4. Explaining the German practise of §1090 BGB .....	252
1. The liberal legacy .....	252
2. Circumventing the numerus clausus?.....	253
3. The Modern Regulatory State.....	254
4. Registration.....	258
5. Circumvention of the rule of law (here: planning law)?.....	260
§5. Conclusion: European harmonisation needed? .....	261
<b>Nordic Perspectives on Contract and Property Law with an Environmental Perspective: Examples from Norway</b>	
Berte-Elen Konow .....	267
§1. Characteristics of Nordic contract law and Nordic property law – introductory remarks .....	267
1. Interwoven historic and political development shaping a Nordic legal tradition .....	267
2. Key elements of the common Nordic historical development .....	268
3. Development of a Nordic legal tradition – a ‘nutshell version’ .....	270
4. Trademarks of the Nordic legal tradition.....	273
§2. Contract law: a long and strong Nordic legal tradition .....	274
§3. Property law in the Nordic countries: similar basic principles, but differences in content .....	276

- §4. Can contract law and property law serve as tools to solve climate change challenges? Examples from Norwegian legislation and court practice ..... 278
  - 1. Some starting points ..... 278
  - 2. Integration of environmental considerations in the framework of the Constitution and the Act of Protection of Biodiversity ..... 278
  - 3. Environmental considerations in contract law (Norway) ..... 279
  - 4. Environmental considerations in property law..... 280
    - 4.1. Disputes regarding neighbour law ..... 280
    - 4.2. Disputes regarding servitudes ..... 283
    - 4.3. Co-ownership..... 284
    - 4.4. Contract and property law as tools for sustainable finance? .. 284
- §5. Concluding remarks ..... 285