

TRAPPED IN A RELIGIOUS MARRIAGE

Human Rights Research Series, Volume 86.

The titles published in this series are listed at the end of this volume.

TRAPPED IN A RELIGIOUS MARRIAGE

A human rights perspective
on the phenomenon of marital captivity

Benedicta DEOGRATIAS

 INTERSENTIA

Cambridge – Antwerp – Chicago

Intersentia Ltd
8 Wellington Street
Cambridge | CB1 1HW | United Kingdom
Tel.: +44 1223 736 170 | Fax: +44 1223 736 169
Email: mail@intersentia.co.uk
www.intersentia.com | www.intersentia.co.uk

Distribution for the UK and Ireland:

NBN International
Airport Business Centre, 10 Thornbury Road
Plymouth, PL6 7 PP
United Kingdom
Tel.: +44 1752 202 301 | Fax: +44 1752 202 331
Email: orders@nbninternational.com

Distribution for Europe and all other countries:

Intersentia Publishing nv
Groenstraat 31
2640 Mortsel
Belgium
Tel.: +32 3 680 15 50 | Fax: +32 3 658 71 21
Email: mail@intersentia.be

Distribution for the USA and Canada:

Independent Publishers Group
Order Department
814 North Franklin Street
Chicago, IL60610
USA
Tel.: +1 800 888 4741 (toll free) | Fax: +1312 337 5985
Email: orders@ipgbook.com

Trapped in a Religious Marriage. A human rights perspective on the phenomenon of marital captivity

© Benedicta Deogratias 2020

The author has asserted the right under the Copyright, Designs and Patents Act 1988, to be identified as authors of this work.

No part of this book may be reproduced, stored in a retrieval system, or transmitted, in any form, or by any means, without prior written permission from Intersentia, or as expressly permitted by law or under the terms agreed with the appropriate reprographic rights organisation. Enquiries concerning reproduction which may not be covered by the above should be addressed to Intersentia at the address above.

Cover image: © David Clarke – Unsplash

ISBN 978-1-78068-842-8 (paperback)

ISBN 978-1-78068-843-5 (PDF)

D/2020/7849/107

NUR 828

British Library Cataloguing in Publication Data. A catalogue record for this book is available from the British Library.

CONTENTS

<i>List of Frequently Used Abbreviations</i>	xi
--	----

Chapter 1

Introduction to Marital Captivity	1
1.1. A human rights approach to marital captivity.....	1
1.2. Terminological clarification.....	6
1.3. The causes and consequences of marital captivity.....	9
1.3.1. Marital captivity as a women's issue.....	10
1.3.2. The consequences of a situation of marital captivity.....	12
1.3.2.1. Restrictions in establishing new relationships.....	12
1.3.2.2. Difficulties in leaving a violent environment.....	13
1.3.2.3. Exploitation of the weak position of the trapped wife.....	15
1.3.2.4. Cross-border complications.....	16
1.4. Marital captivity in human rights discourse.....	17
1.5. Adopting a human rights approach to marital captivity.....	21
1.5.1. The selected human rights.....	22
1.5.2. Over-arching principles of human rights law.....	25
1.6. Methodology.....	26
1.6.1. Methods of interpreting human rights instruments.....	26
1.6.2. Scope and limitations.....	31
1.7. Outline.....	33

Chapter 2

Religious Barriers to Divorce	37
2.1. Christianity, divorce and marital captivity.....	38
2.1.1. Marriage dissolution in the Catholic faith.....	39
2.1.2. Marriage dissolution and marital captivity in the Protestant faith.....	41
2.1.3. Marital captivity and multiple normative systems.....	42
2.2. Hinduism, divorce and marital captivity.....	44
2.2.1. Non-existent or impossible?.....	45
2.2.2. Marital captivity and competing normative systems.....	47
2.3. Islam, divorce and marital captivity.....	48
2.3.1. Repudiation, divorce by mutual consent and divorce with the intervention of religious authorities.....	49
2.3.2. Marital captivity and competing normative systems.....	52

2.4.	Judaism, divorce and marital captivity	54
2.4.1.	Divorce in Judaism	55
2.4.2.	Marital captivity and competing normative systems	58
2.5.	Marital captivity to a religious marriage	59

Chapter 3

Marital Captivity in the Netherlands	61	
3.1.	State-Church relations	62
3.1.1.	The historical context	63
3.1.2.	Secularism and State neutrality in the Dutch context.	65
3.1.3.	Growing religious suspicion	67
3.2.	Religiosity and the organisation of religious communities.	69
3.2.1.	Christian communities.	69
3.2.2.	Jewish communities	71
3.2.3.	Muslim communities	72
3.2.4.	Hindu communities	73
3.2.5.	The status of religious communities.	75
3.3.	Marriage, divorce and marital captivity	77
3.3.1.	Public discourse on marital captivity.	79
3.3.2.	The role of the State in religious divorces	81
3.4.	Measures for addressing marital captivity.	82
3.4.1.	Civil law	86
3.4.2.	Criminal law.	90
3.4.3.	Alternative measures	91
3.5.	Concluding remarks	92

Chapter 4

Marital Captivity and the Freedom of Religion	97	
4.1.	Reasons and motives to oppose the dissolution of a religious marriage.	99
4.2.	The legal framework	100
4.3.	Religious rules and practices that enable marital captivity	101
4.3.1.	Religious rules that limit both spouses' or women's possibilities to dissolve the religious marriage	102
4.3.2.	Application and enforcement of restrictive and discriminatory rules within the religious community	104
4.3.2.1.	The regulation of religious divorces as internal affairs.	107
4.3.2.2.	State interference in religious affairs related to divorce.	109
4.4.	Individuals' right to freedom of religion	112
4.4.1.	Religious manifestations	114
4.4.1.1.	Manifestation in worship, teaching, observance and practice	116
4.4.1.2.	Conscientious objection	117

4.4.1.2.1.	ICCPR	118
4.4.1.2.2.	ECHR.....	121
4.4.2.	Opposition and non-cooperation to divorce as a religious manifestation	123
4.4.2.1.	International and regional case law.....	123
4.4.2.2.	National case law	125
4.4.2.2.1.	The Netherlands.....	125
4.4.2.2.2.	France	128
4.4.2.2.3.	The United Kingdom.....	131
4.4.2.3.	A right to oppose or withhold cooperation in a religious divorce?	134
4.4.2.4.	The implications of recognising divorce denial as a religious manifestation	136
4.4.3.	Conscientious objection to divorce	138
4.5.	State's obligations and limitations to the freedom of religion and belief	139
4.5.1.	State's obligations.....	140
4.5.2.	Interference with the religious freedom	141
4.5.2.1.	The limitation clauses	142
4.5.2.1.1.	Prescribed by law	143
4.5.2.1.2.	Pursuing a legitimate aim	144
4.5.2.1.3.	Necessary (in a democratic society)	145
4.5.2.1.4.	Margin of appreciation	146
4.5.2.2.	State interference in situations of marital captivity	146
4.6.	Concluding remarks	148
Chapter 5		
The Right to Divorce.....		
		151
5.1.	The legal framework on marriage and divorce	155
5.2.	A right to divorce.....	157
5.2.1.	Divorce in human rights law	158
5.2.1.1.	General comments	158
5.2.1.2.	Case law	159
5.2.1.3.	Concluding observations.....	164
5.2.1.4.	Preparatory works	165
5.2.2.	Equality at the dissolution of marriage	170
5.2.3.	No implied right to divorce	174
5.3.	A right to divorce or not to divorce?.....	175
5.3.1.	Acknowledging a right to divorce.....	176
5.3.2.	Moral barriers and competing interests	179
5.3.3.	Divorce and the right to marry.....	181
5.3.3.1.	The ECtHR position on divorce and the right to remarry.....	182
5.3.3.2.	Effective protection of the right to remarry.....	184
5.4.	Concluding remarks: The right to dissolve a religious marriage?	186

Chapter 6	
The Trapped Spouse's Rights	191
6.1. Personal autonomy	192
6.1.1. The notion of personal autonomy in human rights law	194
6.1.2. The trapped spouse's personal autonomy	197
6.2. The trapped spouse's human rights	197
6.2.1. The right to remarry	198
6.2.1.1. The right to remarry subsequent to a divorce	199
6.2.1.2. Religious, formal and informal marriages	201
6.2.1.3. The right to remarry for trapped spouses	205
6.2.2. The right to private life	206
6.2.2.1. The legal framework	206
6.2.2.1.1. 'Privacy' and 'private life'	207
6.2.2.1.2. The physical and social dimensions	208
6.2.2.1.3. Limitation grounds	209
6.2.2.2. Interpersonal relationships, social life and personal development	210
6.2.2.2.1. The right to establish relationships with others	210
6.2.2.2.2. Personal development	214
6.2.2.2.3. Concluding remarks	215
6.2.2.3. The trapped spouse's private life	216
6.2.3. The freedom of movement	217
6.2.3.1. Terminological clarifications	217
6.2.3.2. Transnational aspects of marital captivity	217
6.2.3.3. The legal framework	220
6.2.3.4. Three freedoms	221
6.2.3.4.1. Movement within the territory of a country	222
6.2.3.4.2. The right to leave	223
6.2.3.4.3. The right to enter	224
6.2.3.5. The freedom of movement in situations of marital captivity	227
6.2.4. Right to the highest attainable standard of health	227
6.2.4.1. The legal framework	228
6.2.4.1.1. Defining 'health'	229
6.2.4.1.2. Limitations to the right to health	230
6.2.4.2. The right to attain the highest standard of health	230
6.2.4.3. Health and marital captivity	232
6.3. States' obligations to protect the trapped spouse's right	232
6.3.1. Types of obligations	234
6.3.1.1. Negative obligations	235
6.3.1.2. Positive obligations	237
6.3.2. Marital captivity and States' obligations	243
6.3.2.1. Protection from violations of the State and private actors	244

6.3.2.2.	Addressing the causes of marital captivity.	246
6.3.2.3.	Ensuring the freedom of movement	247
6.3.2.4.	Guaranteeing the trapped spouse's health	248
6.4.	Concluding remarks	249
Chapter 7		
Violence Against Women		
7.1.	The legal framework	253
7.2.	Conceptual clarifications	261
7.2.1.	Violence against women as gender-based violence	261
7.2.2.	'Violence' in violence against women	262
7.3.	The characteristics of VAW	267
7.3.1.	The root cause of VAW	267
7.3.1.1.	Patriarchy.	269
7.3.1.2.	Gender inequality.	271
7.3.1.3.	Practices that are harmful to women	273
7.3.1.4.	Concluding remarks.	273
7.3.2.	Violence as a means and consequence	274
7.3.3.	Settings and agents	276
7.3.3.1.	Family, community and State level	276
7.3.3.2.	Agents of VAW: Perpetrators, victims, bystanders and the State.	278
7.3.4.	The nature of VAW	280
7.4.	Marital captivity as a form of violence against women	281
7.5.	Marital captivity, intimate partner violence and forced marriage.	285
7.5.1.	Intimate partner violence.	286
7.5.2.	Forced marriage.	287
7.5.3.	Similarities and differences	289
7.6.	States' obligations in relation to VAW	292
7.6.1.	The principle of due diligence in the context of VAW	297
7.6.1.1.	The duty to prevent.	301
7.6.1.1.1.	The commitment of the State.	302
7.6.1.1.2.	Involvement of all stakeholders and sectors	304
7.6.1.1.3.	Addressing the structural factors and eliminating the causes of VAW	306
7.6.1.2.	The duty to protect	308
7.6.1.3.	The duty to investigate alleged violence and to punish those responsible.	311
7.6.1.4.	Providing reparations	313
7.6.1.5.	Monitoring, data collection and international cooperation?	315
7.6.2.	States' obligations in the context of marital captivity	315
7.6.2.1.	Measures on the individual level	316

7.6.2.2. Measures for the religious communities.	317
7.6.2.3. Measures for State agents and professionals	320
7.6.2.4. Cooperation on national and international level	322
7.7. Concluding remarks	323
Chapter 8	
Conclusions	325
8.1. Human rights that are affected in a situation of marital captivity	327
8.2. State’s human rights obligations	331
8.3. Striking a balance between competing rights and interests	335
8.3.1. Religious manifestations that undermine women’s rights and gender equality.	336
8.3.2. Respecting religious groups that engage in discriminatory practices against women	337
8.3.3. Gender equality vs. the freedom of religion and the rights of others . . .	339
8.3.4. Secularism as a barrier for State intervention?	340
8.4. The advantages of a human rights approach to marital captivity	341
8.5. Measures to protect from and prevent marital captivity.	346
8.5.1. General measures	346
8.5.2. Preventive measures	348
8.5.3. Protective measures	350
<i>Bibliography</i>	353
<i>Curriculum Vitae</i>	393

LIST OF FREQUENTLY USED ABBREVIATIONS

ACHR	American Convention on Human Rights
ACHPR	African Charter on Human and Peoples' Rights
CEDAW	Convention on the Elimination of all forms of Discrimination Against Women
CEDAW Committee	Committee on the Elimination of Discrimination Against Women
CESCR	Committee on Economic, Social and Cultural Rights
CRC Committee	Committee on the Rights of the Child
CSW	Commission on the Status of Women
DEVAW	Declaration on the Elimination of Violence Against women
DCC	Dutch Civil Code
ECHR	European Convention on Human Rights
ECmHR	European Commission of Human Rights
ECtHR	European Court of Human Rights
HRC	Human Rights Committee
ICCPR	International Covenant on Civil and Political Rights
ICESCR	International Covenant on Economic, Social and Cultural Rights
IPV	Intimate partner violence
NGO	Non-Governmental Organisation
SGP	Staatkundig Gereformeerde Partij
VAW	Violence Against Women
VCLT	Vienna Convention on the Law of Treaties
UDHR	Universal Declaration of Human Rights

