A SHORT HISTORY OF LEGAL VALIDITY AND INVALIDITY
A SHORT HISTORY OF LEGAL VALIDITY AND INVALIDITY

Foundations of Private and Public Law

Maris Köpcke
For Josep Maria P.
ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

This short book has a long history, which colleagues in different countries have been part of. Kristin Boosfeld, John Finnis, Birke Häcker, Nils Jansen, Ewan Smith, Paul Yowell and Reinhard Zimmermann at various stages provided very valuable comments on drafts of this book. I benefitted from the feedback of the audiences at the Oxford Comparative Law Discussion Group, the Max-Planck-Institut für ausländisches und internationales Privatrecht, and the Westfälische Wilhelms-Universität Münster, where I was invited to present parts of the manuscript. Brian Lapsa and José Manuel Royo generously helped with the Latin. Ann-Christin Maak-Scherpe, of Intersentia Cambridge, inspired the format and title of this book, and was in every way a receptive and knowledgeable publisher. Writing up the book was made possible by the support of a Research Fellowship at the Programme for the Foundations of Law and Constitutional Government of the Oxford Faculty of Law.

Cover and inside illustrations are by my mother, Trini Tinturé.

MKT
April 2019
# CONTENTS

*Acknowledgements* ..................................................... vii  
*Abbreviations of Classical Works.* ........................................ xi  
*A Story in a (Very Allegorical) Picture* ................................. xiii  

**Chapter 1. Introduction** ............................................. 1  
**Chapter 2. Our Technique of Legal Validity** ............................. 11  
   I. Beyond ‘Validity’ Talk ............................................. 11  
   II. Six Main Features ............................................... 14  

**Chapter 3. Roman Private Law: Rowing Against the Tide** ................. 23  
   I. Ulpian’s Enigmatic Classification .................................. 24  
   II. The *ius civile* Tide .............................................. 31  
   III. Changing *obligationes* by Saying So .......................... 33  

**Chapter 4. Roman Law-Making: Power Usurped** .......................... 39  
   I. Legislation by Popular Assemblies ................................ 41  
   II. Senate’s Veto .................................................... 43  
   III. Praetorian Law .................................................. 45  
   IV. *Senatusconsulta* ............................................... 46  
   V. Imperial Law ..................................................... 47  

**Chapter 5. Gratian’s *Decretum* (Mid-12th): A Novel Use** .............. 51  
   I. Justinian’s Legacy .................................................. 51  
   II. Gratian’s Innovation ............................................. 54  
   III. Validity of Transactions ....................................... 56  
   IV. Validity of Enactments ......................................... 61  

**Chapter 6. The *Decretals* (Mid-13th): The Terminology Settles** ........ 65  
   I. The Pope Takes Charge ........................................... 65  
   II. Acts that Determine Validity .................................... 68
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Chapter 7. Bartolus (Mid-14th): From a World State to a World of States</th>
<th>73</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>I. The New Place of Law</td>
<td>73</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>II. Validity of Transactions</td>
<td>76</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>III. The Dilemma Concerning Enactments</td>
<td>82</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>IV. The Venetian Statute</td>
<td>85</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>V. Overcoming the Dilemma</td>
<td>91</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Chapter 8. Suarez (Early 17th): Inherent Legal Power</th>
<th>99</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>I. The School of Natural Law</td>
<td>99</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>II. Validity of Transactions</td>
<td>101</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>III. Validity of Enactments</td>
<td>108</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>IV. A Troubling Contact Point</td>
<td>111</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Chapter 9. Codes and Constitutions (19th Onwards): The Tables are Turned</th>
<th>115</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>I. Savigny on Transactions</td>
<td>116</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>II. Codifying Private Law</td>
<td>124</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>III. The Rechtsstaat</td>
<td>128</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Chapter 10. Conclusion</th>
<th>137</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>I. Taking Stock</td>
<td>137</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>II. Validity’s Power</td>
<td>140</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Bibliography                                                               | 147|
Index                                                                     | 153|
## ABBREVIATIONS
### OF CLASSICAL WORKS

#### ROMAN LAW
- **Institutes of Gaius**
- **Rules of Ulpian**
- **Code of Justinian**
- **Digest of Justinian**
- **Institutes of Justinian**

#### MEDIEVAL CANON LAW
- **Gratian, Concordia Discordantium Canonum**, Parts I and III
- **Gratian, Concordia Discordantium Canonum**, Part II
- **Decretals of Pope Gregory IX**

#### LATER WORKS
- **Bartolus, Commentaria in primam Digesti veteris partem, ad Digestum 1, 1, 9**
  - Bartolus, *Commentary to Justinian's Digest*, 1, 1, 9, s. [section] 1
- **Bartolus, Commentaria in primam Digesti veteris partem, ad Digestum 1, 3, 23**
  - Bartolus, *Commentary to Justinian's Digest*, 1, 3, 23, s. [section] 31
Abbreviations of Classical Works

Bartolus, *Commentaria in primam Codicis partem, ad Codex 1, 1, 1*

F de Suarez, *Tractatus De Legibus ac Deo Legislatore* (Coimbra: 1612)


Bartolus, *Commentary to [Justinian's] Code, 1, 1, 1*, s. [section] 13


Savigny, *System*, para [paragraph] 23
A STORY IN A (VERY ALLEGORICAL) PICTURE