

THE GLOBAL IMPACT AND LEGACY OF TRUTH COMMISSIONS

## SERIES ON TRANSITIONAL JUSTICE

The Series on *Transitional Justice* offers a platform for high-quality research within the rapidly growing field of transitional justice. The research is, of necessity inter-disciplinary in nature, drawing from disciplines such as law, political science, history, sociology, criminology, anthropology and psychology, as well as from various specialised fields of study such as human rights, victimology and peace studies. Furthermore, the research is international in outlook, drawing on the knowledge and experience of academics and other specialists in many different regions of the world.

The series is aimed at a variety of audiences who are either working or interested in fields such as crime and justice; human rights; humanitarian law and human security; conflict resolution and peace building. These audiences include academics, researchers, students, policy makers, practitioners, non-governmental organisations and the media.

All books published within the series are subject to a double-blind peer review by recognised authorities in the field.

### The General Editors of the Series are:

- Prof. Stephan Parmentier (Catholic University of Leuven, Belgium)
- Prof. Jeremy Sarkin (University of South Africa)
- Prof. Elmar Weitekamp (University of Tübingen, Germany)
- Mina Rauschenbach (Université de Lausanne and University of Leuven) (Associate Editor)

The general editors receive the support from an Editorial Committee and an Advisory Board, consisting of internationally renowned academics and practitioners.

### Published titles within this Series:

10. Bas van Stokkom, Neelke Doorn and Paul van Tongeren (eds.), *Public Forgiveness in Post-Conflict Contexts* (2012), 978-1-78068-044-6
11. Ilse Derluyn, Cindy Mels, Stephan Parmentier and Wouter Vandenhole (eds.), *Re-Member. Rehabilitation, Reintegration and Reconciliation of War-Affected Children* (2012), 97894-000-0027-4
12. Anne-Marie de Brouwer, Charlotte Ku, Renée Römkens and Larissa van den Herik (eds.), *Sexual Violence as an International Crime: Interdisciplinary Approaches* (2012), 978-1-78068-002-6
13. Estelle Zinsstag and Martha Albertson Fineman (eds.), *Feminist Perspectives on Transitional Justice: From International and Criminal to Alternative Forms of Justice* (2013), 978-1-78068-142-9
14. Josep M. Tamarit Sumalla, *Historical Memory and Criminal Justice in Spain. A Case of Late Transitional Justice* (2013), 978-1-78068-143-6
15. Catherine Jenkins (ed.), Max du Plessis (ed.), *Law, Nation building and Transformation The South African experience in perspective* (2014), 978-1-78068-184-9
16. Susanne Buckley-Zistel and Stefanie Schäfer (eds.), *Memorials in Times of Transition* (2014), 978-1-78068-211-2
17. Nico Wouters (ed.), *Transitional Justice and Memory in Europe (1945–2013)*, 978-1-78068-214-3
18. Agata Fijalkowski and Raluca Groseanu (eds.), *Transitional Criminal Justice in Post-Dictatorial and Post-Conflict Societies*, 978-1-78068-260-0
19. S. Elizabeth Bird and Fraser M. Ottanelli (eds.), *The Performance of Memory as Transitional Justice* 978-1-78068-262-4
20. Bo Viktor Nylund, *Child Soldiers and Transitional Justice*, 978-1-78068-394-2
21. Peter Malcontent (ed.), *Facing the Past: Amending Historical Injustices through Instruments of Transitional Justice*, 978-1-78068-403-1
22. Francesca Capone, *Reparations for Child Victims of Armed Conflict: State of the Field and Current Challenges*, 978-1-78068-438-3
23. Cheryl S. White, *Bridging Divides in Transitional Justice: The Extraordinary Chambers in the Courts of Cambodia*, 978-1-78068-440-6

For previous volumes in the series, please visit <http://tj.intersentia.com>

SERIES ON TRANSITIONAL JUSTICE, Volume 24

THE GLOBAL IMPACT  
AND LEGACY OF TRUTH  
COMMISSIONS

*Edited by*  
Jeremy SARKIN



intersentia

Cambridge – Antwerp – Chicago

Intersentia Ltd  
Sheraton House | Castle Park  
Cambridge | CB3 0AX | United Kingdom  
Tel.: +44 1223 370 170 | Fax: +44 1223 370 169  
Email: mail@intersentia.co.uk  
www.intersentia.com | www.intersentia.co.uk

*Distribution for the UK and Ireland:*

NBN International  
Airport Business Centre, 10 Thornbury Road  
Plymouth, PL6 7PP  
United Kingdom  
Tel.: +44 1752 202 301 | Fax: +44 1752 202 331  
Email: orders@nbninternational.com

*Distribution for Europe and all other countries:*

Intersentia Publishing nv  
Groenstraat 31  
2640 Mortsel  
Belgium  
Tel.: +32 3 680 15 50 | Fax: +32 3 658 71 21  
Email: mail@intersentia.be

*Distribution for the USA and Canada:*

Independent Publishers Group  
Order Department  
814 North Franklin Street  
Chicago, IL 60610  
USA  
Tel.: +1 800 888 4741 (toll free) | Fax: +1 312 337 5985  
Email: orders@ipgbook.com

This work is funded by national funds by the Portuguese Foundation for Science and Technology – Project UID/DIR/00714/2013.

The Global Impact and Legacy of Truth Commissions

© The editor and contributors severally 2019

The editor and contributors have asserted the right under the Copyright, Designs and Patents Act 1988, to be identified as authors of this work.

No part of this book may be reproduced, stored in a retrieval system, or transmitted, in any form, or by any means, without prior written permission from Intersentia, or as expressly permitted by law or under the terms agreed with the appropriate reprographic rights organisation. Enquiries concerning reproduction which may not be covered by the above should be addressed to Intersentia at the address above.

Artwork on cover: Author Jan Jordaan, title 'Hurt', medium Linocut, 1999.

From the Universal Declaration of Human Rights – International Print Portfolio,  
Article 5, published by Art for Humanity, South Africa, 1999.

ISBN 978-1-78068-794-0

D/2019/7849/41

NUR 828



British Library Cataloguing in Publication Data. A catalogue record for this book is available from the British Library.

## ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

This volume is the culmination of a process that began with a conference at NOVA University Lisbon, Portugal, in February 2018, when all the authors came together around the themes of the book. Draft chapters were presented. Chapters were then finalised and an internal review process occurred, to which all authors of the book and the editor contributed. A language review of the chapters was also carried out. Later, all the chapters were sent for double blind review by the editor of the TJ Series, after which the chapters were finalised.

There are many to thank for their assistance in this process. NOVA University assisted with support for the conference and the book. At the Law School, the research centre CEDIS and the organisation Jurisnova were very helpful in various ways. The funding agency FCT in Portugal assisted with funding.

Professor Chandra Sriram, who attended the conference and was involved in the book, passed away during the year. She was a major voice on transitional justice and her contributions to the field were very significant.

Jeremy Sarkin  
Lisbon, November 2018



# CONTENTS

<i>Acknowledgements</i> .....	v
<i>List of Contributors</i> .....	.xi

## **Introduction: Contextualising and Understanding the Global Role, Impact and Legacy of Truth Commissions**

Jeremy SARKIN .....	1
1. Introduction .....	1
2. The Impact and Legacy of Truth Commissions .....	19
3. How are Truth Commissions Judged? .....	22
4. Criteria for Truth Commission Impact Analysis .....	27
5. Methodologies to Determine Impact and Legacy .....	33
6. Conclusion .....	40

## **Is Anyone Listening? A Review of the Research on Attitudes Towards Truth Commissions**

Filipa RAIMUNDO and Joana REBELO MORAIS .....	45
1. Introduction .....	45
2. 36 Studies on Attitudes Towards ‘Truth’ and Truth Commissions .....	47
3. The Legacy of Truth Commissions at the Individual Level .....	60
4. Conclusions and Recommendations for Future Research and Action .....	70
Appendix: List of Case Studies by Country .....	71

## **Assessing the Long-Term Impact and Legacy of Truth Commissions**

Anita FERRARA .....	75
1. Introduction .....	75
2. A Framework for Evaluating Long-Term Impact .....	78
3. Understanding the Impact of Truth Commissions on Other Transitional Justice Mechanisms .....	82
4. The Transformative Long-Term Role of Truth Commissions .....	93
5. Conclusion .....	96

## **The Global Textual Legacies of Truth Commissions: Narratives on Sexual Violence in the Reports of Sierra Leone, Liberia, Kenya and Beyond**

Susanne BUCKLEY-ZISTEL .....	99
1. Introduction .....	99
2. Depicting Sexual Violence in Truth Commissions .....	102

3. The Truth Commissions of Sierra Leone, Liberia and Kenya . . . . .	102
4. Narrating the Truth . . . . .	106
5. Analysing Narratives on Wartime Sexual Violence . . . . .	107
6. Conclusion. . . . .	116

**The Implementation Record of Truth Commissions’ Recommendations in Latin America**

Elin SKAAR . . . . .	119
1. Introduction . . . . .	119
2. What Do We Know About Truth Commission Recommendations and Their Implementation Record? . . . . .	121
3. Latin American Truth Commission Reports . . . . .	125
4. A Thousand Recommendations . . . . .	129
5. Implementation Across Latin America . . . . .	132
6. Conclusion. . . . .	138
Appendix: Latin American Truth Commission Reports . . . . .	140

**In the Aftermath of Truth: Implementing Truth Commissions’ Recommendations on Reparations – Following Through for Victims**

Luke MOFFETT . . . . .	143
1. Introduction . . . . .	143
2. The Bond between Reparations and Truth Commissions. . . . .	144
3. Implementation of Reparation Recommendations . . . . .	153
4. Reparations without a Truth Commission . . . . .	164
5. Conclusion. . . . .	166

**Truth Commissions and Social Justice: ‘Wishful Thinking or Not Very Thoughtful Wishing’?**

Brianne MCGONIGLE LEYH . . . . .	169
1. Introduction . . . . .	169
2. Truth Commissions as a Favoured Response . . . . .	173
3. Modesty is a Virtue. . . . .	184
4. Conclusion. . . . .	188

**Transitioning Toward Dignity**

Erin DALY . . . . .	189
1. Introduction . . . . .	189
2. Transitions Toward Dignity. . . . .	191
3. The Architecture and Operations of Truth and Reconciliation Commissions. . . . .	197
4. The Legacies of Truth and Reconciliation Commissions . . . . .	202
5. Conclusion. . . . .	209



**Towards an Understanding of How Truth Commissions Can Use Their Amnesty Powers to Enhance Their Impact and Legacy**

Jeremy SARKIN . . . . . 211

1. Introduction . . . . . 211
2. Understanding Amnesty . . . . . 215
3. The Nature of Amnesty in Truth Commission Processes . . . . . 220
4. The South African TRC as a Benchmark . . . . . 226
5. The Power to Recommend Cases for Amnesty . . . . . 232
6. Truth Commission Amnesty Processes Around the World . . . . . 233
7. Conclusion . . . . . 243

**Truth Commissions in Non-Transitional Contexts: Implications for Their Impact and Legacy**

Eric WIEBELHAUS-BRAHM . . . . . 247

1. Introduction . . . . . 247
2. When are Truth Commissions Created? . . . . . 250
3. What Kind of Impacts Can We Expect from Truth Commissions? . . . . . 251
4. Exploring Truth Commissions in Non-Transitional Contexts . . . . . 254
5. Conclusion . . . . . 266

**Surrogacy and Resistance: Evolving Patterns in Unofficial Truth Commissions and Truth Projects**

Pádraig MCAULIFFE . . . . . 269

1. Introduction . . . . . 269
2. Defining Unofficial Truth Projects . . . . . 275
3. Emerging Critique of Truth Commission Legacies . . . . . 278
4. Asymmetrical Memory: Resistance in Unofficial Truth Projects . . . . . 282
5. Painting Inside the Lines: The ‘Conservative’ Orientation of UTPs . . . . . 286
6. Conclusion . . . . . 292

*Index* . . . . . 293



## LIST OF CONTRIBUTORS

**Susanne Buckley-Zistel** is Professor of Peace and Conflict Studies and Director of the Centre for Conflict Studies, Philipps University Marburg, Germany. She has held positions at King's College, London, the Peace Research Institute Frankfurt and the Free University, Berlin, and fellowships at the Research Center 'Governance in Areas of Limited Statehood' and at the Käte Hamburger Kolleg 'Global Cooperation Research'. Her research focuses on issues pertaining to peace and conflict, violence, gender and transitional justice, and she has co-edited volumes on *Gender in Transitional Justice* (Palgrave, 2012), *Transitional Justice Theories* (Routledge, 2014), *Memorials in Times of Transition* (Intersentia, 2014), *Spatializing Peace and Conflict* (Palgrave, 2016), *Gender, Violence, Refugees* (Berghan, 2017) and *Perpetrators and Perpetration of Mass Violence* (Routledge, 2018).

**Erin Daly** is Professor of Law at Delaware Law School and Co-Director of the Dignity Rights Project. She is the co-author, with Jeremy Sarkin, of *Reconciliation in Divided Societies: Finding Common Ground* (U. Penn, 2006, 2010) and the author of *Dignity Rights: Courts, Constitutions, and the Worth of the Human Person* (U. Penn, 2013). She is the co-editor, with James R. May, of *Encyclopedia of Human Rights and the Environment: Indivisibility, Dignity and Legality* (forthcoming, Edward Elgar) and many other books on environmental constitutionalism. She serves as the Director of the Global Network for Human Rights and the Environment, and as the US National Correspondent for the Centre international de droit comparé de l'environnement (CIDCE). She has served as the Vice President for Institutional Development at the Université de la Fondation Aristide in Haiti.

**Anita Ferrara** is a lecturer in Human Rights Law at the Irish Centre for Human Rights, National University of Ireland, Galway. She completed her PhD in Law at the School of Oriental and African Studies (SOAS), University of London, in 2012. She previously taught at SOAS on justice and reconciliation in post-conflict societies. Before her academic career, Anita worked for United Nations Agencies and NGOs in the field of human rights. She worked at the UN High Commissioner for Human Rights in Santiago, Chile and at the United Nations Development Programme in Gaborone, Botswana. Her research interests include transitional justice, human rights, the impact and legacy of truth commissions, and memory and law, with a particular focus on the Latin American region.

**Pádraig McAuliffe** is a graduate of University College Cork (BCL and PhD). After a brief period in the Legal Division of the Irish Department of Foreign Affairs, he became a lecturer at the University of Dundee in 2009. He became a Senior Lecturer in the School of Law and Social Justice at the University of Liverpool in 2013 and has been Associate Head of the Law School since 2017. He is the author of two books, *Transitional Justice and Rule of Law Reconstruction: A Contentious Relationship* (Routledge, 2013) and *Transformative Transitional Justice and the Malleability of Post-Conflict States* (Edward Elgar, 2017). His interests include transitional justice, the historic institutionalism of socio-economic rights and justice sector reform.

**Brianne McGonigle Leyh** is an Associate Professor at Utrecht University, Netherlands Institute of Human Rights. Her expertise includes human rights, rule of law, victims' rights and transitional justice. She also currently acts as Senior Counsel for the Public International Law & Policy Group and serves on the Advisory Board of the Netherlands Helsinki Committee. Previously she worked as Co-Counsel, Civil Party Lawyer at the Extraordinary Chambers in the Courts of Cambodia (ECCC). She won the International Association of Penal Law (AIDP), American Branch, Book of the Year Award in 2013. She has also been selected as a member of the Utrecht Young Academy. She received her PhD in law from Utrecht University, her Juris Doctorate, cum laude, and Master of Arts in International Relations from American University, and her Bachelor of Arts, cum laude, in the University Professors Program at Boston University.

**Luke Moffett** is a senior law lecturer at Queen's University Belfast, Northern Ireland. He previously worked as a research fellow on the Arts and Humanities Research Council (AHRC) funded project 'Amnesties, Prosecution and the Public Interest in the Northern Ireland Transition.' His PhD examined the role of victims within the International Criminal Court and their ability to participate and claim reparations. His book 'Justice for Victims before the International Criminal Court' was published in 2014. He is the co-editor of the *Research Handbook of Transitional Justice* (Edward Elgar, 2017). He is currently Principal Investigator on the AHRC funded 'Reparations, Responsibility and Victimhood in Transitional Societies' project in six jurisdictions, which explores victim identity and responsibility in reparation mechanisms and the obligations of non-state actors.

**Joana Rebelo Morais** is a PhD student of Comparative Politics at the Institute of Social Sciences, University of Lisbon. She holds an MA in Political Science from ISCTE-IUL. Her Master's thesis was entitled 'The Commission of the Black Book on the Fascist Regime: In Search of the Truth?' ('A Comissão do Livro Negro sobre o Regime Fascista: Em busca da verdade?'). It received an Honorary Mention in the 19th edition of the Mário Soares Foundation – EDP Foundation Award in 2017. Her research interests include democratisations, founding elections and truth commissions.

**Filipa Raimundo** is a research fellow at the Institute of Social Sciences, University of Lisbon, and Guest Assistant Professor in the Department of Political Science and Public Policy at ISCTE-IUL, Lisbon. She holds a PhD in Political and Social Sciences from the European University Institute, Florence. Her PhD dissertation on ‘Post-Transitional Justice: Spain, Portugal and Poland Compared’ received an Honorary Mention in the 2014 edition of the Portuguese Political Science Association PhD Dissertation Award. Her interests include democratisation, transitional justice, authoritarian legacies and political attitudes. Her research work has been published by journals such as *Democratization*, *South European Society and Politics*, and *Mediterranean Politics*, and in edited volumes by Palgrave/Macmillan and Columbia University Press.

**Jeremy Sarkin** is Distinguished Visiting Professor of Law at NOVA University Lisbon, Portugal. He has undergraduate and postgraduate law degrees from South Africa, a Master of Laws degree from Harvard Law School and a Doctor of Laws degree on comparative and international law. He is admitted to practice as attorney in the USA and South Africa. He was a member (2008–2014), and Chairperson-Rapporteur (2009–2012), of the United Nations Working Group on Enforced or Involuntary Disappearances. He served as an acting judge in 2002 and 2003 in the High Court in South Africa. He has published 17 books and more than 300 articles and book chapters. He is a member of a number of journal editorial boards and serves on the boards of a number of NGOs. He regularly assists the United Nations, the European Union, African institutions and others on constitutional, human rights and transitional justice issues.

**Elin Skaar** is a political scientist and senior researcher at the Chr. Michelsen Institute (CMI) in Bergen, Norway. Exploring the intersections between law and politics in Latin America and Africa, her research interests include human rights, transitional justice, and judicial reform. Currently, her main research focus is on Latin American truth commissions. She has for three decades published widely on democratisation processes and human rights. Her publications include *Judicial Independence and Human Rights in Latin America: Violations, Politics, and Prosecution* (Palgrave Macmillan, 2011), *After Violence: Transitional Justice, Peace, and Democracy* (Routledge, 2015, co-authored), and *Transitional Justice in Latin America: The Uneven Road from Impunity towards Accountability* (Routledge, 2016, co-edited). She holds a PhD in political science from the University of California, Los Angeles.

**Eric Wiebelhaus-Brahm** is Associate Professor of Political Science and Coordinator of the Middle Eastern Studies Program at the University of Arkansas at Little Rock. His research agenda focuses on transitional justice, human rights, post-conflict reconstruction, and democratisation. He critically examines the empirical and normative arguments used to justify the introduction of social and economic policies in societies emerging from periods of conflict

and repression. Much of his work has focused on using social science research methods to evaluate transitional justice mechanisms. His research is driven by a normative desire to set more realistic policy expectations, particularly among victims and marginalised groups. He is the author of *Truth Commissions and Transitional Societies* (Routledge, 2010), as well as 11 book chapters and 17 peer-reviewed articles.