EASTERN AND WESTERN PERSPECTIVES ON SURROGACY
Eastern and Western Perspectives on Surrogacy
© The editors and contributors severally 2019

The editors and contributors have asserted the right under the Copyright, Designs and Patents Act 1988, to be identified as authors of this work.

No part of this book may be reproduced, stored in a retrieval system, or transmitted, in any form, or by any means, without prior written permission from Intersentia, or as expressly permitted by law or under the terms agreed with the appropriate reprographic rights organisation. Enquiries concerning reproduction which may not be covered by the above should be addressed to Intersentia at the address above.

Image on cover: Radachynskyi Serhii - Shutterstock

D/2019/7849/4
NUR 822

PREFACE AND ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

This book is the culmination of a research project spanning more than three years and events on two continents. It has involved 29 contributors from 19 jurisdictions, coming from the fields of law, medicine and philosophy. A project of this magnitude could not have been undertaken without the generous support of the WYNG Foundation of Hong Kong. It was through their funding that we were able to bring together experts from Europe, Asia, Africa, America and the Middle East at a conference held under the auspices of the Centre for Medical Ethics and Law (CMEL) of the University of Hong Kong and Cambridge Family Law on 9 and 10 September 2016, which served as a foundation for this volume. We wish to thank the Foundation for giving us this opportunity and hope that this book furthers their mission to acquire, exchange, disseminate and apply knowledge to achieve a more advanced and a more caring society. We also wish to particularly thank Au Yun Ling, for her exceptional administrative support in organising the Hong Kong conference, and St John’s College and its Master, Rev. Dr Eric Chong, for providing accommodation for some of our speakers (and authors of this volume).

The Hong Kong conference was followed by a conference on ‘Law and Practice of Surrogacy’, held at Cambridge on 25 and 26 June 2018 and organised jointly by Cambridge Family Law and the Academy of European Law (ERA), with a focus on European developments. We would particularly like to thank Dr Angelika Fuchs, the Head of Section for Private Law at ERA, as well as Tabea Lüth from ERA for the very fruitful and efficient cooperation on this event.

The (probably) final event to which this project is tied, and where the book will be officially launched, will be the ‘International Surrogacy Forum’ in Cambridge on 27 and 28 June 2019, organised jointly by Cambridge Family Law, the International Academy of Family Lawyers and the American Bar Association (ABA) Section of Family Law. We would like to thank, in particular, Anne-Marie Hutchinson OBE, QC (Hon) for taking the initiative on this event and being so supportive throughout the process.

Thanks are also due to Matt Jordan, who provided research and editing assistance for this book as well as support at and for the Cambridge Conferences; Elizabeth Aitken for making sure that our accounts were in order; Shirley Bidgood for her assistance with the booking system; and Daniel Bates for setting up and maintaining the websites.

As always, the collaboration with Intersentia Publishing was wonderful (at least from the editors’ side!), and we would like to thank Rebecca Moffat...
and Ann-Christin Maak-Scherpe for their exceptional support and patience in ensuring that this book was published.

Finally: Surrogacy is ultimately about family, and our thanks go to ours for the unwavering support they have given us over the course of this project. To Ann-Christin, Helma and Lilo, who had to put up with absences, long working nights, telephone conferences when we should have been playing UNO together (but in your father’s defence, it was past bedtime!) and foul moods when things did not go as planned. To Luke, who was uncomplaining when birthdays were missed because of conferences. And to Eva, who was born as the project reached its completion, and over whose sleeping head proofs were finalised.

The Editors
Cambridge/Hong Kong, 20 February 2019
CONTENTS

Preface and Acknowledgements ................................................. v
List of Contributors ................................................................ xi

Introduction
Jens M. Scherpe and Claire Fenton-Glynn .............................. 1

Questionnaire
Jens M. Scherpe and Claire Fenton-Glynn .............................. 7

PART I. WESTERN PERSPECTIVES

THE PROHIBITIVE APPROACH

France
Walter Pintens ................................................................. 17

Germany
Anatol Dutta ................................................................. 35

Germany: A Judicial Perspective
Frank Klinkhammer .......................................................... 49

Spain
Esther Farnós Amorós ...................................................... 59

THE TOLERANT APPROACH

Australia
Mary Keyes ................................................................. 85

Australia: A Judicial Perspective
John Pascoe ................................................................. 105

England and Wales
Claire Fenton-Glynn ........................................................ 115
England and Wales: A Judicial Perspective
   Sir Mark Hedley .................................................. 135

THE REGULATORY APPROACH

Greece
   Eleni Zervogianni ................................................. 147

Israel
   Rhona Schuz ...................................................... 165

South Africa
   Julia Sloth-Nielsen ............................................... 185

New Zealand
   Debra Wilson ..................................................... 203

Portugal
   Rute Teixeira Pedro ............................................. 229

Iceland
   Hrefna Fridriksdottir ........................................... 259

THE FREE MARKET APPROACH

Russia
   Olga A. Khazova ................................................. 281

United States of America
   Naomi Cahn and June Carbone ................................. 307

THE INFLUENCE OF INTERNATIONAL COURTS

European Court of Human Rights
   Paul Beaumont and Katarina Trimmings ....................... 331

PART II. EASTERN PERSPECTIVES

THE PROHIBITIVE APPROACH

China
   Lei Shi .............................................................. 359
Taiwan
Chih-Hsing Ho .......................................................... 377

Singapore
Terry KAAN ............................................................... 397

A TOLERANT APPROACH?

Hong Kong
Daisy CHEUNG ........................................................... 419

REGULATION THROUGH PROFESSIONAL MEDICAL BODIES

Japan
Shinichiro HAYAKAWA ................................................. 441

South Korea
Ock-Joo Kim and Byung-Hwa Lee ................................. 449

FROM FREE MARKET TO REGULATION

India
Prabha KOTISWARAN .................................................... 469

Thailand
Soraj HONGLADAROM .................................................. 499

PART III. COMPARATIVE PERSPECTIVES ON SURROGACY

Surrogacy in a Globalised World: Comparative Analysis and Thoughts on Regulation
Claire FENTON-GLYNN and Jens M. SCHERPE .................. 515

Index ................................................................. 593
LIST OF CONTRIBUTORS

Paul Beaumont
University of Aberdeen, Scotland, United Kingdom

Naomi Cahn
George Washington University, United States of America

June Carbone
University of Minnesota, United States of America

Daisy Cheung
University of Hong Kong, Hong Kong SAR

Anatol Dutta
Ludwig Maximillians University, Germany

Esther Farnós Amorós
Pompeu Fabra University, Barcelona, Spain

Claire Fenton-Glynn
University of Cambridge, England, United Kingdom

Hrefna Friðriksdóttir
University of Iceland, Iceland

Shinichiro Hayakawa
University of Tokyo, Japan

Sir Mark Hedley
England and Wales High Court (retired)

Chih-Hsing Ho
Academia Sinica, Taiwan

Soraj Hongladarom
Chulalongkorn University, Thailand

Terry Kaan
University of Hong Kong, Hong Kong SAR

Mary Keyes
Griffith University, Australia
Olga A. Khazova
The Moscow School of Social and Economic Sciences, Russia; National Research University 'Higher School of Economics', Russia

Ock-Joo Kim
Seoul National University, South Korea

Frank Klinkhammer
Federal Court of Justice, Germany

Prabha Kotiswaran
King's College London, England, United Kingdom

Byung-Hwa Lee
Dongduk Women's University, South Korea

John Pascoe
Family Court of Australia, Australia

Walter Pintens
Catholic University of Leuven, Belgium; Saarland University, Germany

Jens M. Scherpe
University of Cambridge, England, United Kingdom; University of Hong Kong, Hong Kong SAR; University of Aalborg, Denmark

Rhona Schuz
Sha'arei Mishpat Academic Center, Israel

Lei Shi
Southwest University of Political Science and Law, People's Republic of China

Julia Sloth-Nielsen
University of the Western Cape, South Africa; University of Leiden, the Netherlands

Rute Teixeira Pedro
University of Porto, Portugal

Katarina Trimmings
University of Aberdeen, Scotland, United Kingdom

Debra Wilson
University of Canterbury, New Zealand; New Zealand Law Foundation Rethinking Surrogacy Laws Project

Eleni Zervogianni
Aristotle University of Thessaloniki, Greece