

EASTERN AND WESTERN PERSPECTIVES ON SURROGACY



EASTERN AND WESTERN  
PERSPECTIVES ON SURROGACY

*Edited by*  
Jens M. SCHERPE  
Claire FENTON-GLYNN  
Terry KAAAN



intersentia

Cambridge – Antwerp – Chicago

Intersentia Ltd  
Sheraton House | Castle Park  
Cambridge | CB3 0AX | United Kingdom  
Tel.: +44 1223 370 170 | Fax: +44 1223 370 169  
Email: mail@intersentia.co.uk  
www.intersentia.com | www.intersentia.co.uk

*Distribution for the UK and Ireland:*

NBN International  
Airport Business Centre, 10 Thornbury Road  
Plymouth, PL6 7PP  
United Kingdom  
Tel.: +44 1752 202 301 | Fax: +44 1752 202 331  
Email: orders@nbninternational.com

*Distribution for Europe and all other countries:*

Intersentia Publishing nv  
Groenstraat 31  
2640 Mortsel  
Belgium  
Tel.: +32 3 680 15 50 | Fax: +32 3 658 71 21  
Email: mail@intersentia.be

*Distribution for the USA and Canada:*

Independent Publishers Group  
Order Department  
814 North Franklin Street  
Chicago, IL 60610  
USA  
Tel.: +1 800 888 4741 (toll free) | Fax: +1 312 337 5985  
Email: orders@ipgbook.com

## Eastern and Western Perspectives on Surrogacy

© The editors and contributors severally 2019

The editors and contributors have asserted the right under the Copyright, Designs and Patents Act 1988, to be identified as authors of this work.

No part of this book may be reproduced, stored in a retrieval system, or transmitted, in any form, or by any means, without prior written permission from Intersentia, or as expressly permitted by law or under the terms agreed with the appropriate reprographic rights organisation. Enquiries concerning reproduction which may not be covered by the above should be addressed to Intersentia at the address above.

Image on cover: Radachynskyi Serhii - Shutterstock

ISBN 978-1-78068-652-3

D/2019/7849/4

NUR 822

British Library Cataloguing in Publication Data. A catalogue record for this book is available from the British Library.

## PREFACE AND ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

This book is the culmination of a research project spanning more than three years and events on two continents. It has involved 29 contributors from 19 jurisdictions, coming from the fields of law, medicine and philosophy. A project of this magnitude could not have been undertaken without the generous support of the WYNG Foundation of Hong Kong. It was through their funding that we were able to bring together experts from Europe, Asia, Africa, America and the Middle East at a conference held under the auspices of the Centre for Medical Ethics and Law (CMEL) of the University of Hong Kong and Cambridge Family Law on 9 and 10 September 2016, which served as a foundation for this volume. We wish to thank the Foundation for giving us this opportunity and hope that this book furthers their mission to acquire, exchange, disseminate and apply knowledge to achieve a more advanced and a more caring society. We also wish to particularly thank Au Yun Ling, for her exceptional administrative support in organising the Hong Kong conference, and St John's College and its Master, Rev. Dr Eric Chong, for providing accommodation for some of our speakers (and authors of this volume).

The Hong Kong conference was followed by a conference on 'Law and Practice of Surrogacy', held at Cambridge on 25 and 26 June 2018 and organised jointly by Cambridge Family Law and the Academy of European Law (ERA), with a focus on European developments. We would particularly like to thank Dr Angelika Fuchs, the Head of Section for Private Law at ERA, as well as Tabea Lüth from ERA for the very fruitful and efficient cooperation on this event.

The (probably) final event to which this project is tied, and where the book will be officially launched, will be the 'International Surrogacy Forum' in Cambridge on 27 and 28 June 2019, organised jointly by Cambridge Family Law, the International Academy of Family Lawyers and the American Bar Association (ABA) Section of Family Law. We would like to thank, in particular, Anne-Marie Hutchinson OBE, QC (Hon) for taking the initiative on this event and being so supportive throughout the process.

Thanks are also due to Matt Jordan, who provided research and editing assistance for this book as well as support at and for the Cambridge Conferences; Elizabeth Aitken for making sure that our accounts were in order; Shirley Bidgood for her assistance with the booking system; and Daniel Bates for setting up and maintaining the websites.

As always, the collaboration with Intersentia Publishing was wonderful (at least from the editors' side!), and we would like to thank Rebecca Moffat

and Ann-Christin Maak-Scherpe for their exceptional support and patience in ensuring that this book was published.

Finally: Surrogacy is ultimately about family, and our thanks go to ours for the unwavering support they have given us over the course of this project. To Ann-Christin, Helma and Lilo, who had to put up with absences, long working nights, telephone conferences when we should have been playing UNO together (but in your father's defence, it was past bedtime!) and foul moods when things did not go as planned. To Luke, who was uncomplaining when birthdays were missed because of conferences. And to Eva, who was born as the project reached its completion, and over whose sleeping head proofs were finalised.

The Editors  
Cambridge/Hong Kong, 20 February 2019

# CONTENTS

<i>Preface and Acknowledgements</i> .....	v
<i>List of Contributors</i> .....	xi

## **Introduction**

Jens M. SCHERPE and Claire FENTON-GLYNN.....	1
--	---

## **Questionnaire**

Jens M. SCHERPE and Claire FENTON-GLYNN.....	7
--	---

## **PART I. WESTERN PERSPECTIVES**

### **THE PROHIBITIVE APPROACH**

#### **France**

Walter PINTENS.....	17
---------------------	----

#### **Germany**

Anatol DUTTA.....	35
-------------------	----

#### **Germany: A Judicial Perspective**

Frank KLINKHAMMER.....	49
------------------------	----

#### **Spain**

Esther FARNÓS AMORÓS.....	59
---------------------------	----

### **THE TOLERANT APPROACH**

#### **Australia**

Mary KEYES.....	85
-----------------	----

#### **Australia: A Judicial Perspective**

John PASCOE.....	105
------------------	-----

#### **England and Wales**

Claire FENTON-GLYNN.....	115
--------------------------	-----

<b>England and Wales: A Judicial Perspective</b>	
Sir Mark HEDLEY .....	135
<b>THE REGULATORY APPROACH</b>	
<b>Greece</b>	
Eleni ZERVOGIANNI .....	147
<b>Israel</b>	
Rhona SCHUZ.....	165
<b>South Africa</b>	
Julia SLOTH-NIELSEN .....	185
<b>New Zealand</b>	
Debra WILSON.....	203
<b>Portugal</b>	
Rute Teixeira PEDRO.....	229
<b>Iceland</b>	
Hrefna FRIÐRIKSDÓTTIR .....	259
<b>THE FREE MARKET APPROACH</b>	
<b>Russia</b>	
Olga A. KHAZOVA .....	281
<b>United States of America</b>	
Naomi CAHN and June CARBONE.....	307
<b>THE INFLUENCE OF INTERNATIONAL COURTS</b>	
<b>European Court of Human Rights</b>	
Paul BEAUMONT and Katarina TRIMMINGS.....	331
<b>PART II. EASTERN PERSPECTIVES</b>	
<b>THE PROHIBITIVE APPROACH</b>	
<b>China</b>	
Lei SHI .....	359



<b>Taiwan</b>	
Chih-Hsing Ho .....	377
<b>Singapore</b>	
Terry KAAH .....	397
A TOLERANT APPROACH?	
<b>Hong Kong</b>	
Daisy CHEUNG .....	419
REGULATION THROUGH PROFESSIONAL MEDICAL BODIES	
<b>Japan</b>	
Shinichiro HAYAKAWA .....	441
<b>South Korea</b>	
Ock-Joo KIM and Byung-Hwa LEE .....	449
FROM FREE MARKET TO REGULATION	
<b>India</b>	
Prabha KOTISWARAN .....	469
<b>Thailand</b>	
Soraj HONGLADAROM .....	499
PART III. COMPARATIVE PERSPECTIVES ON SURROGACY	
<b>Surrogacy in a Globalised World: Comparative Analysis and Thoughts on Regulation</b>	
Claire FENTON-GLYNN and Jens M. SCHERPE .....	515
<i>Index</i> .....	593



## LIST OF CONTRIBUTORS

*Paul Beaumont*

University of Aberdeen, Scotland, United Kingdom

*Naomi Cahn*

George Washington University, United States of America

*June Carbone*

University of Minnesota, United States of America

*Daisy Cheung*

University of Hong Kong, Hong Kong SAR

*Anatol Dutta*

Ludwig Maximilians University, Germany

*Esther Farnós Amorós*

Pompeu Fabra University, Barcelona, Spain

*Claire Fenton-Glynn*

University of Cambridge, England, United Kingdom

*Hrefna Friðriksdóttir*

University of Iceland, Iceland

*Shinichiro Hayakawa*

University of Tokyo, Japan

*Sir Mark Hedley*

England and Wales High Court (retired)

*Chih-Hsing Ho*

Academia Sinica, Taiwan

*Soraj Hongladarom*

Chulalongkorn University, Thailand

*Terry Kaan*

University of Hong Kong, Hong Kong SAR

*Mary Keyes*

Griffith University, Australia

*Olga A. Khazova*

The Moscow School of Social and Economic Sciences, Russia; National Research University 'Higher School of Economics', Russia

*Ock-Joo Kim*

Seoul National University, South Korea

*Frank Klinkhammer*

Federal Court of Justice, Germany

*Prabha Kotiswaran*

King's College London, England, United Kingdom

*Byung-Hwa Lee*

Dongduk Women's University, South Korea

*John Pascoe*

Family Court of Australia, Australia

*Walter Pintens*

Catholic University of Leuven, Belgium; Saarland University, Germany

*Jens M. Scherpe*

University of Cambridge, England, United Kingdom; University of Hong Kong, Hong Kong SAR; University of Aalborg, Denmark

*Rhona Schuz*

Sha'arei Mishpat Academic Center, Israel

*Lei Shi*

Southwest University of Political Science and Law, People's Republic of China

*Julia Sloth-Nielsen*

University of the Western Cape, South Africa; University of Leiden, the Netherlands

*Rute Teixeira Pedro*

University of Porto, Portugal

*Katarina Trimmings*

University of Aberdeen, Scotland, United Kingdom

*Debra Wilson*

University of Canterbury, New Zealand; New Zealand Law Foundation Rethinking Surrogacy Laws Project

*Eleni Zervogianni*

Aristotle University of Thessaloniki, Greece