The French Contract Law Reform
A Source of Inspiration?
The French Contract Law Reform
A Source of Inspiration?
The French Contract Law Reform: A Source of Inspiration?
© S. Stijns and S. Jansen (eds.) 2016

The author has asserted the right under the Copyright, Designs and Patents Act 1988, to be identified as author of this work.

No part of this book may be reproduced, stored in a retrieval system, or transmitted, in any form, or by any means, without prior written permission from Intersentia, or as expressly permitted by law or under the terms agreed with the appropriate reprographic rights organisation. Enquiries concerning reproduction which may not be covered by the above should be addressed to Intersentia at the address above.

Cover image: Gautherot Pierre (1765/1769-1825), Jean Etienne Marie, comte Portalis, ministre des Cultes de 1804 à 1807 (1746-1807) © RMN-Grand Palais (Château de Versailles) / Gérard Blot.

D/2016/7849/106
NUR 822

CONTENTS

Introduction
Sophie Stijns and Sanne Jansen .......................................................... 1

The Reform of the French Law of Obligations: How Long will the Belgians
Remain Napoleon's Most Loyal Subjects?
Sander Van Loock ................................................................. 7

1. Introduction ........................................................................ 7
2. Historical antecedents ......................................................... 8
3. Incentives for the reform and the first reform projects ............. 10
   3.1. Incentives ................................................................. 10
   3.2. Initial reform projects .................................................. 12
4. Chronicle of a Reform Foretold ............................................. 14
   4.1. Reform by ordinance ................................................... 14
   4.2. Criticism ................................................................. 16
5. Overview ........................................................................... 17
   5.1. Incentives and aims of the reform .................................. 17
   5.2. General overview ....................................................... 18
   5.3. Appreciation ............................................................ 23
6. Belgium ............................................................................. 24
7. Conclusion: Brief lessons from the French reform ................. 26

Pre-Contractual Phase: Reflections on the Attractiveness of the New French
Rules for the Parties to International Commercial Transactions
Ekaterina Pannebakker .............................................................. 29

1. Introduction ................................................................. 29
2. Pre-contractual phase in the ordonnance .............................. 31
   2.1. The new rules .......................................................... 31
   2.2. The background of the new rules .................................. 34
      2.2.1. Evolution of case law .......................................... 34
      2.2.2. International influence ...................................... 37
### Nullity in the Ordonnance

**Frederik Peeraer**

1. Introduction ......................................................... 49
2. Overview of the ordinance's approach ............................. 50
3. The concept of nullity ................................................ 51
   3.1. Essential aspects and distinction with other remedies .... 51
   3.2. The *summa divisio* between absolute and relative nullity 53
   3.3. The recognition of partial nullity ........................... 57
      3.3.1. Requirements ............................................. 57
      3.3.2. Scope ..................................................... 58
4. The use of nullity ................................................. 59
   4.1. Too much nullity .............................................. 60
   4.2. Not enough nullity ............................................ 61
5. The enforcement of nullity ......................................... 61
   5.1. Judicial enforcement ........................................... 62
      5.1.1. Principle ................................................ 62
      5.1.2. Criticism ................................................ 62
   5.2. Obstacles to the enforcement of nullity ..................... 65
      5.2.1. Prescription ............................................. 65
      5.2.2. Confirmation ............................................. 65
      5.2.3. Regularisation? .......................................... 66
6. General appreciation ............................................... 67
   6.1. A textbook example of *Begriffsjurisprudenz* ................ 67
   6.2. Are there any lessons for Belgium and the Netherlands? .... 68
7. Conclusion ........................................................... 70

### A Tale of Novelty and Continuity: Exploring the Future Judicial Control of Employment Contracts in the French Contract Law Reform

**Candida Leone**  ........................................................... 73

1. Introduction .................................................................. 73
2. What’s new? The new Civil code provisions and the existing rules 75
   2.1. Clauses creating “a significant imbalance” .................. 75
   2.2. The penumbra of unfair terms control ......................... 80
Contents

3. Possible headings of unfair terms control in French labour law ............................... 82
   3.1. The general provision of Article L. 1121–1 Code du Travail ............................ 82
   3.2. The regime of clauses de variation ............................................................. 83
   3.3. The judge-made regime of certain clauses .................................................. 85
4. Conclusion ............................................................................................................. 87

Introducing Imprévision into French Contract Law – A Paradigm Shift in
Comparative Perspective
   Tobias Lutzi ............................................................................................................ 89

1. Introduction .......................................................................................................... 89
2. Imprévision as an exception to pacta sunt servanda .......................................... 90
   2.1. The principle of pacta sunt servanda and its exceptions .............................. 90
   2.2. The exception for imprévision ..................................................................... 93
3. Current approaches to imprévision .................................................................... 94
   3.1. The French approach: no exception for imprévision ..................................... 94
   3.2. The English approach: extension of the impossibility exception ............... 98
   3.3. The German approach: development of a separate exception ..................... 99
      3.3.1. The doctrine of the basis of the transaction ........................................... 100
      3.3.2. Reception in other legal systems and instruments ............................... 102
      3.3.3. The codification of 2002 .................................................................... 103
4. The French reform ............................................................................................. 105
   4.1. The doctrinal importance of the French reform .......................................... 107
   4.2. The practical shortcomings of the reform proposal .................................... 109
   4.3. The provision finally adopted .................................................................... 111
5. Conclusion .......................................................................................................... 112

Commercial Impracticability and the Missed Opportunity of the French Contract
Law Reform: Doctrinal, Historical and Law and Economics Arguments –
Comment on Lutzi’s Introducing Imprévision into French Contract Law
   Janwillem (Pim) Oosterhuis .................................................................................... 113

1. Introduction .......................................................................................................... 113
2. The German commercial impracticability excuse and legal doctrine .................. 115
3. Long use and wide spread reception: lessons from legal history ...................... 118
4. Practical implications: which remedy is more efficient? .................................... 120
   4.1. Efficient contracting: reduction of transaction costs ex ante ...................... 121
   4.2. Contractual fairness, efficiency and financial loss ..................................... 122
   4.3. Reduction of transaction costs ex post: discharge or adjustment? ............. 124
5. Conclusion .......................................................................................................... 128
Price Reduction under the French Contract Law Reform

Sanne Jansen ................................................................. 131

1. Introduction ............................................................. 131

2. Road-map to price reduction: projet Catala, projet de la Chancellerie and projet Terré ............................................. 133
   2.1. No price reduction under the Catala project, but a partial termination .......................................................... 133
   2.2. No price reduction under the project of the Chancellerie (2008) .............................................................. 134
   2.3. Price reduction and partial termination under the Terré project .............................................................. 135
      2.3.1. Price reduction ....................................................... 135
      2.3.2. Partial termination .................................................... 137

3. Price reduction under the ordonnance ................................................................. 138
   3.1. General ................................................................. 138
   3.2. Conditions of application ................................................. 140
      3.2.1. Contracts and the meaning of 'price' ................................. 140
      3.2.2. Partial non-performance and seriousness of the non-performance .......................................................... 142
      3.2.3. Excused and (un)excused non-performance? .......................... 143
      3.2.4. Relation between price reduction and other remedies .......................................................... 145
   3.3. Role of the judge and of the parties ............................................. 147
      3.3.1. Role of the parties ....................................................... 147
      3.3.2. Role of the judge ......................................................... 148
   3.4. Calculation method ....................................................... 150
   3.5. Other characteristics ..................................................... 153
      3.5.1. Price reduction before and after the payment of the price .......................... 153
      3.5.2. Price reduction as a defence and as a claim of the creditor .......................................................... 154
      3.5.3. Combination with damages ............................................. 154
      3.5.4. No restitution ........................................................... 154
   3.6. Material partial termination ................................................. 155

4. Conclusion ................................................................. 156

The Measure of Damages in the French Contract Law Reform – Lessons from far more Inspiring Systems

Brecht Verkempinck ......................................................... 157

1. Belgian Civil Code .......................................................... 157
   1.1. Need for innovation ..................................................... 157
   1.2. New French legal framework as a godsend? ......................................................... 158

2. French contract law reform ................................................. 158
   2.1. A lost chance ........................................................... 158
   2.2. Lack of innovation ....................................................... 159
   2.3. Non-inclusion of several basic compensation principles ......................................................... 160

3. Drafting prerequisites ..................................................... 162
   3.1. Necessity ................................................................. 162
   3.2. Clear, simple and precise rules ............................................. 163
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Section</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>3.3. Legal-linguistic consistency</td>
<td>164</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.4. References</td>
<td>165</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4. Belgium 2020: new provisions on contractual damages</td>
<td>166</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.1. Basic structure of legal framework</td>
<td>166</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.2. Introductory provision on the location of contractual damages</td>
<td>167</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.3. Basic measure of contractual damages</td>
<td>168</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.3.1. Principle of full compensation</td>
<td>168</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.3.2. Date of assessment</td>
<td>170</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.3.3. Expectation interest</td>
<td>171</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.3.4. Non-pecuniary loss</td>
<td>174</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.3.5. Lost chances</td>
<td>177</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.3.6. Reliance interest</td>
<td>178</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.3.7. Equitable assessment of damages</td>
<td>181</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.3.8. Gain-based measure of damages</td>
<td>182</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.4. Limits on principle of full compensation</td>
<td>184</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.4.1. Foreseeability</td>
<td>184</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.4.2. Avoidability</td>
<td>189</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.4.3. Indirectness</td>
<td>195</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5. Conclusion</td>
<td>196</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Set-off in the French Reform of the Law of Obligations: a Tale of Missed Opportunities?
Matthias E. Storme                                                      201

1. The role and definition of set-off                                    201
2. The requirements for set-off: failure to distinguish the requirements for the active and the passive claim 202
3. Automatic set-off?                                                    202
4. Obligational aspects and requirements                                 203
4.1. Requirements for the active claim                                  204
4.2. Requirements for the passive claim                                 204
5. Property law aspects                                                  205
5.1. Requirements for the active claim                                  205
5.2. Requirements for the passive claim                                 205

Fundamental Rights in the French Contract Law Reform
Chantal Mahé                                                          209

Abbreviations                                                           209
1. Introduction                                                          209
2. The non-codification of a general clause on contractual infringements of any FR 212
2.1. The abandonment of a general clause common to all types of contracts 212
2.2. The abandonment of a general clause common to all fundamental rights 214
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Contents</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>2.3. Upholding <em>direct</em> horizontal effects of FR in the contractual context</td>
<td>217</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.3.1. The implicit rejection of FR <em>indirect</em> interpersonal effects</td>
<td>218</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.3.2. The upholding of the <em>direct</em> interpersonal effects of FR</td>
<td>219</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3. Legal consequences of contractual infringements of FR</td>
<td>221</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.1. The <em>Cour de cassation</em> long-standing case law on proportionality</td>
<td>222</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.2. The deadlock of the unqualified invalidity</td>
<td>224</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4. A missed opportunity to codify</td>
<td>227</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5. Lessons to be learned from the French experience</td>
<td>228</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>