



Different Paths Towards Sustainable Biofuels?

A Comparative Study of the International, EU, and Chinese Regulation of the Sustainability of Biofuels

Taotao Yue

Different Paths Towards Sustainable Biofuels?

A Comparative Study of the International, EU, and Chinese Regulation of the Sustainability of Biofuels



Intersentia Ltd
Sheraton House | Castle Park
Cambridge | CB3 0AX | United Kingdom
Tel.: +44 1223 370 170 | Fax: +44 1223 370 169
Email: mail@intersentia.co.uk
www.intersentia.com | www.intersentia.co.uk

Distribution for the UK and Ireland:

NBN International
Airport Business Centre, 10 Thornbury Road
Plymouth, PL6 7PP
United Kingdom
Tel.: +44 1752 202 301 | Fax: +44 1752 202 331
Email: orders@nbninternational.com

Distribution for Europe and all other countries:

Intersentia Publishing nv
Groenstraat 31
2640 Mortsel
Belgium
Tel.: +32 3 680 15 50 | Fax: 32 3 658 71 21
Email: mail@intersentia.be

Distribution for the USA and Canada:

International Specialized Book Services
920 NE 58th Ave. Suite 300
Portland, OR 97213
USA
Tel.: +1 800 944 6190 (toll free) | Fax: +1 503 280 8832
Email: info@isbs.com

Different Paths Towards Sustainable Biofuels? A Comparative Study of the International, EU, and Chinese Regulation of the Sustainability of Biofuels
© Taotao Yue 2016

The author has asserted the right under the Copyright, Designs and Patents Act 1988, to be identified as author of this work.

No part of this book may be reproduced, stored in a retrieval system, or transmitted, in any form, or by any means, without prior written permission from Intersentia, or as expressly permitted by law or under the terms agreed with the appropriate reprographic rights organization. Enquiries concerning reproduction which may not be covered by the above should be addressed to Intersentia at the address above.

Cover photograph © MilsArt - ingimage

ISBN 978-1-78068-413-0
D/2016/7849/93
NUR 828

British Library Cataloguing in Publication Data. A catalogue record for this book is available from the British Library.

In loving memory of my grandfathers

ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

People in China say that the world consists of men, women, and female PhDs. This social prejudice is perhaps even more relevant for a female PhD student pursuing her study abroad. With some doubt and hesitation started I the venture of PhD at Maastricht University in 2011, uncertain whether I could ever finish it and what I would achieve. More than four years afterwards, I am glad to have finally accomplished my PhD research while maintaining still a lively and cheery mind. At this moment, it is high time to formally express my sincere gratitude to all the people who have given me support and help in these years.

This dissertation is the outcome of PhD research at Maastricht University with the support of the China Scholarship Council (CSC). I deeply appreciate the Faculty of Law of Maastricht University and CSC for making my PhD research possible. In particular, my heartfelt gratitude goes to my supervisors, Professor Marjan Peeters and Professor Ellen Vos, who gave me the chance of starting the research and who have guided me with enormous patience, inspiration, and knowledge. I would like to express my profound gratitude to Marjan for leading me to the research field of environment and climate law, as well as helping me to find the way, start from scratch, and move gradually forwards. I deeply appreciate her insightful and provoking questions and comments that not only inspire me to accomplish this dissertation but also teach me how to be a researcher. Beyond work, Marjan has continuously encouraged and helped me to be integrated in the life of Maastricht, via inviting me for a number of times to join her family events and local activities. I also extend special thanks to Ellen, my co-supervisor in Maastricht University, for her invaluable comments and guidance with my research as well as her unconditional support towards my career. Their extremely professional approach towards work and sincere commitments dedicated to legal scholarship have set excellent examples for me along the journey of my PhD research and will keep on enlightening me in the future.

I am deeply grateful to the members of the assessment committee: Professor Fons Coomans, Professor Michael Faure, Professor Elisa Morgera, and Professor Zhiping Li. I really appreciate the time and patience they have spent in reading my thesis, in particular their kind encouragement and insightful comments and suggestions which incentivised me to improve my research from various perspectives. Special gratitude goes to Michael who is an 'old friend' of Chinese

people and has provided generous support and inspiring comments for my research within the METRO and the Ius Commune research school. I extend additional thanks to Fons for his efforts in chairing the assessment committee. I also want to express my whole-hearted thanks to all the experts who agreed to sit in the supervisory committee and participate in my defence.

My sincere thanks also go to my colleagues and friends in the Faculty of Law of Maastricht University, as it would not be possible for me to finish this research without their support and help. Sincere thanks are owed to the unconditional help from the METRO team, Yleen Simonis, Chantal Kuypers, Elke Hundhausen, Marina Jodogne, and Marjo Mullers, for their professionalism of dealing with details in both daily work and big events. My profound gratitude also goes to Licette Poll, Ingrid Loontjens, Monique Laenen, Pauline Arends, and Peggy van Wersch who always responded to my questions with great patience and helped me to deal with documents or procedures in each stage of my research. I am especially grateful for the stimulating discussions with Professor Peter Van den Bossche, Professor Menno Kamminga, Professor Chris Backes, Dr. Niels Philipsen, Dr. Laura Tilindyte, Dr. Denise Prévost, Dr. Sarah Schoenmaekers, and Dr. Jing Liu. During the stay in Maastricht, a great deal of friends within the law faculty helped me whenever I faced difficulties in life or at work, whose friendship enriched my life, brought me beautiful memories, and made me feel as if doing PhD research is not a solo task. Heartfelt thanks go to Sandra Nobrega, Ancui Liu, Huizhen Chen, Yuan Gao, Wenqing Liao, Jie Wang, Tianxiang He, Xiahong Chen, Tian Lv, Huilan Zhu, Xiaowei Yu, Jiangqiu Ge, Liang Yu, Liuhu Luo, Yufeng Wu, Bo Chen, Guang Shen, Mengmeng Shi, Mengxing Lv, Yu Zhao, Xi Chen, Yingying Jing, Yaojin Peng, Yu Yan, Yang Gao, Jingjing Fu, Joanne Faggin, Jaqueline Da Silva Albino, Kevine Kindji, Emma Dermawati, Viorelia Gasca, Mehdi Piri Damagh, and Tobias Heldt. Special thanks go to Ancui Liu who has given me enormous help when I was in or out of Maastricht.

I am greatly thankful to the experts and friends outside the Maastricht University for their willingness to share their immense knowledge and brilliant ideas which broadened and deepened my perspectives in the research. Particular thanks go to Professor Tianbao Qin, Dr. Seita Romppanen, Professor Joanne Scott, Professor Kati Kulovesi, Professor Nicolas De Sadeleer, Professor Xi Wang, Professor Carmen G. Gonzalez, Professor Ben Boer, Dr. Wybe Douma, Ignacio Vazquez Larruscain, Dr. Carlo Hamelinck, Dr. Reinier de Man, Max Salomon Janssen, Dr. Yoshiko Naiki, Dr. Lorenzo Squintani, Dr. Federico Ortino, Dr. Leonie Reins, Natascha Trennepohl, Haomiao Du, Dr. Jinshan Zhu, and Yelena Gordeeva. I would like to express additional gratitude to Professor Tianbao Qin, Professor Joanne Scott, Ignacio Vazquez Larruscain, Carlo Hamelinck, and Dr. Reinier de Man for agreeing upon my request of face-to-face interviews. Many thanks go to the UNESCO-UNEVOC and UNFCCC Secretariat for giving me the precious internship opportunities.

Last but not least, my deepest thanks go to my beloved family for fully supporting me throughout the PhD research. I am wholeheartedly indebted for their unconditional support and considerate understanding over the years when I stayed a long distance away and could not spend more time with them, for which I

may never be able to repay in a single lifetime. I sincerely hope that this dissertation would become their pride and also serve as the starting point for my future career!



CONTENTS

ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS	VII
LIST OF ABBREVIATIONS	XVII
LIST OF TABLES	XXI
CHAPTER 1. INTRODUCTION.....	1
1. Research Background	1
1.1. Sustainability Concerns about Biofuels.....	1
1.2. Research on Regulating the Sustainability of Biofuels.....	4
2. Research Questions.....	6
2.1. Definition of Biofuels.....	7
2.2. Inclusion of the Three Dimensions of Sustainability.....	9
2.3. Potential for a Global Inclusive Approach	15
3. Methodology	18
3.1. Study of the International, EU, and Chinese Legal Systems	18
3.2. Comparative Analysis	19
3.3. Analytical Model for Text Analysis.....	22
3.4. Literature and Information Collection	24
4. Structure.....	26
CHAPTER 2. THE INTERNATIONAL REGULATION OF THE SUSTAINABILITY OF BIOFUELS....	29
1. Introduction.....	29
2. Demand for Biofuels: the International Climate Regime.....	31
2.1. Commitments Relating to GHG Emissions	31

2.2.	GHG Emissions Accounting.....	36
2.2.1.	The Role of the IPCC Guidelines	36
2.2.2.	IPCC Guidelines for Complete GHG Emissions Accounting	38
2.2.3.	The Difficulty in Ensuring Complete GHG Emissions Accounting.....	41
2.3.	Other Sustainability Concerns.....	43
2.4.	Interim Conclusion	46
3.	Supply of Biofuels: International Biodiversity and Socio-Economic Rights Regimes	47
3.1.	The International Biodiversity Regime and the Supply of Biofuels.....	47
3.1.1.	General Commitment to Conservation and Sustainable/Wise Use of Biodiversity.....	48
3.1.2.	Specific Guidance on Biofuels and Biodiversity	51
3.1.2.1.	Decisions of the CBD COP.....	52
3.1.2.2.	Resolutions of the Ramsar COP	55
3.1.3.	Interim Conclusion	58
3.2.	International Socio-economic Rights Regime and Biofuels.....	65
3.2.1.	Food Availability	66
3.2.2.	Land Grab	72
3.2.2.1.	Land Rights for Indigenous Peoples	74
3.2.2.2.	Land Rights as Condition for the Enjoyment of the Right to an Adequate Living Standard.....	75
3.2.3.	Interim Conclusion	77
4.	International Trade of Biofuels: The International Trade Regime.....	78
4.1.	Articles I and III of GATT 1994	80
4.2.	Article XX of GATT 1994.....	83
4.3.	Interim Conclusion	86
5.	Conclusion	88
5.1.	Summary of the Main Findings	88
5.2.	Reflection.....	89
CHAPTER 3. EU REGULATION OF THE SUSTAINABILITY OF BIOFUELS		95
1.	Introduction.....	95
2.	EU Regulation of the Demand for Biofuels	97
2.1.	The Sustainability Criteria	98
2.1.1.	GHG Emissions Saving	98
2.1.2.	Land with High Biodiversity Value	105
2.1.3.	Land with High Carbon Stock.....	108
2.1.4.	Agro-environment Protection	110
2.1.5.	The Other Sustainability Concerns	112
2.1.5.1.	Monitoring and Reporting.....	113
2.1.5.2.	Voluntary Schemes	116

2.2.	The Other Regulatory Measures Addressing the Demand for Biofuels.....	121
2.2.1.	Consumption Targets for Renewable Energy	122
2.2.2.	GHG Emissions Targets for Fuels and Vehicles	127
2.2.2.1.	GHG Emission Targets for Fuels	127
2.2.2.2.	Carbon Emission Target for Vehicles	129
2.2.3.	Preferential Tax Treatment	130
2.2.4.	Emissions Trading Scheme	134
2.2.4.1.	Aviation Emission Trading and Biofuels	135
2.2.4.2.	CDM Regulation and Biofuels.....	137
2.3.	Interim Conclusion	139
3.	EU Regulation on the Supply of Biofuels	140
3.1.	Regulation of Biofuels Feedstock from Agriculture.....	141
3.1.1.	Cross-compliance.....	142
3.1.2.	Greening Requirement	145
3.2.	Regulation on Biofuels Feedstock from Other Sources.....	148
3.3.	Interim Conclusion	152
4.	The EU Regulation of International Trade of Biofuels.....	153
4.1.	Sustainability Requirement for Trade of Biofuels	153
4.1.1.	Less Favourable Treatment.....	154
4.1.2.	Extraterritorial Effects	156
4.2.	External Trade Policy and Biofuels.....	159
4.3.	Interim Conclusion	162
5.	Conclusion	163
5.1.	Summary of the Main Findings	163
5.2.	Reflection.....	164
5.2.1.	The Deficiency of the EU’s Sustainability Criteria	164
5.2.2.	Possibility for Adopting More Stringent Sustainability Criteria	167
5.2.2.1.	Exhaustive Harmonisation	168
5.2.2.2.	Complementary or Stricter Criteria through Article 114 TFEU?.....	170
5.2.3.	Inclusive Biofuels Sustainability Regulation in View of the EU’s Commitment to Sustainable Development?	177
CHAPTER 4. CHINESE REGULATION OF THE SUSTAINABILITY OF BIOFUELS		181
1.	Introduction.....	181
2.	Chinese Regulation of the Demand for Biofuels.....	184
2.1.	General Environmental and Socio-economic Principles.....	185
2.2.	The Other Regulatory Measures Addressing the Demand for Biofuels.....	188
2.2.1.	Blend Mandates.....	188
2.2.2.	Consumption Targets	194
2.2.3.	Emissions Standards for Fuels and Vehicles	197
2.2.4.	Preferential Tax Treatment	200

2.2.5.	Emissions Trading Rules.....	203
2.2.5.1.	Emissions Trading and Biofuels.....	204
2.2.5.2.	CDM in China.....	207
2.3.	Interim Conclusion	212
3.	Chinese Regulation of the Supply of Biofuels.....	213
3.1.	Regulation of Biofuels Feedstock from Agriculture.....	214
3.1.1.	Non-food Grain Feedstock.....	214
3.1.2.	Use of Marginal Land.....	218
3.1.3.	No Damage to the Environment	222
3.1.3.1.	Biodiversity.....	222
3.1.3.2.	Carbon Stock.....	225
3.1.3.3.	Agricultural Pollution	226
3.2.	Regulation of Biofuels Feedstock from Other Sources.....	228
3.3.	Interim Conclusion	230
4.	Chinese Regulation of Trade of Biofuels.....	231
5.	Conclusion	234
5.1.	Summary of the Main Findings	234
5.2.	Reflection.....	235
5.2.1.	The Deficiency of the Current Regulation	235
5.2.2.	Possibility for More Stringent Rules.....	237
5.2.3.	Inclusive Sustainability Requirements in View of Sustainable Development?.....	241
5.2.3.1.	Sustainable Development in China	242
5.2.3.2.	‘Sustainable Cultivation’ of Energy Forests	244
CHAPTER 5. COMPARATIVE ANALYSIS AND THE IMPLICATIONS FOR A GLOBAL INCLUSIVE APPROACH.....		247
1.	Introduction.....	247
2.	Comparative Analysis of the Demand for Biofuels.....	247
2.1.	Sustainability Requirements.....	248
2.1.1.	Differences	248
2.1.2.	Similarities	250
2.2.	Blend Mandates and Consumption Targets.....	251
2.2.1.	Differences	252
2.2.2.	Similarities	255
2.3.	Emission Standards for Fuels and Vehicles.....	256
2.3.1.	Differences	256
2.3.2.	Similarities	259

2.4.	Preferential Tax Treatment	262
2.4.1.	Differences	262
2.4.2.	Similarities	264
2.5.	Emission Trading Rules	265
2.5.1.	Emission Trading System	265
2.5.1.1.	Differences	265
2.5.1.2.	Similarities	267
2.5.2.	Clean Development Mechanism	269
2.5.2.1.	Differences	269
2.5.2.2.	Similarities	270
2.6.	Interim Conclusion	271
2.6.1.	Differences	271
2.6.2.	Similarities	272
3.	Comparative Analysis of the Supply of Biofuels.....	273
3.1.	Regulation Addressing the Biodiversity Concern	273
3.1.1.	Differences	273
3.1.2.	Similarities	275
3.2.	Regulation Addressing the Carbon Stock Concern.....	276
3.2.1.	Differences	276
3.2.2.	Similarities	278
3.3.	Regulation Addressing the Local Environment Concern.....	279
3.3.1.	Differences	279
3.3.2.	Similarities	281
3.4.	Regulation Addressing the Socio-economic Sustainability Concerns	282
3.4.1.	Differences	282
3.4.2.	Similarities	284
3.5.	Interim Conclusion	284
3.5.1.	Differences	285
3.5.2.	Similarities	286
4.	Comparative Analysis of the International Trade of Biofuels	287
4.1.	Differences	287
4.2.	Similarities	289
5.	Conclusion	291
5.1.	Summary of the Main Findings	291
5.2.	Reflection.....	292
5.2.1.	Current Differences and Deficiencies in Inclusive Regulation	292
5.2.2.	Challenges for an Inclusive Regulatory Approach.....	295
5.2.3.	'Global Environmental Law' Offers a Prospect?.....	298
5.2.3.1.	Counting Life-cycle GHG Emission of Biofuels: Harmonisation and Integration.....	301
5.2.3.2.	Biodiversity and Food: Harmonisation and Integration from a Collaborative Approach.....	306
5.2.3.3.	Agro-environment and Socio-economic Rights: Transplantation and Convergence	311

CHAPTER 6. GENERAL CONCLUSION	319
1. Main Findings.....	319
1.1. Mapping the International Regulatory Terrain	319
1.2. The Regulatory Approach in the EU	320
1.3. The Regulatory Approach in China	322
1.4. Differences and Similarities.....	323
2. Reflection.....	324
2.1. Fragmented International Regulatory Terrain for the Sustainability of Biofuels	324
2.2. Deficiency in Inclusive Regulation of the Sustainability of Biofuels in the EU	325
2.3. Deficiency in Inclusive Regulation of the Sustainability of Biofuels in China.....	326
2.4. Differences and Challenges	327
3. Recommendations.....	327
4. Final Conclusion and Outlook	329
SUMMARY	331
VALORISATION ADDENDUM	335
1. Societal Relevance	335
2. Target Group	337
3. Activities/Products	338
4. Innovation.....	339
5. Schedule & Implementation	339
RELEVANT DOCUMENTS.....	341
1. Relevant Documents at the International Level.....	341
2. Relevant Documents in the EU	347
3. Relevant Documents in China.....	361
BIBLIOGRAPHY	371
CURRICULUM VITAE	419

LIST OF ABBREVIATIONS

AFOLU	Agriculture, forestry and other land use
AFTF	Alternative Fuel Task Force
AIA	Advance Informed Agreement
ASEAN	Association of Southeast Asian Nations
BEFS	Bioenergy and Food Security
CAEP	Committee on Aviation Environmental Protection
CAP	Common Agricultural Policy
CBD	Convention on Biological Diversity
CCS	Carbon Capture and Storage
CDDA	Common Database on Designated Areas
CDM	Clean Development Mechanism
CER	Certified Emission Reduction
CESCR	Committee on Economic, Social, and Cultural Rights
CFS	Committee on World Food Security
CITES	Convention on International Trade in Endangered Species
CJEU	Court of Justice of the European Union
CMF	Conference of the Parties serving as the Meeting of the Parties
CMS	Convention on the Conservation of Migratory Species in Wild Animals
CN	Combined Nomenclature
CNPC	China National Petroleum Corporation
COP	Conference of Parties
CPC	Communist Party of China
DNA	Designated National Authority
DOE	Designated Operational Entity
EAG	Environmental Advisory Group
EB	Executive Board
ECOSOC	Economic and Social Council
EEA	European Environment Agency
EEA	European Economic Area
EFTA	European Free Trade Association
EIA	Environmental Impact Assessment

List of Abbreviations

EPA	Environmental Protection Agency
ETS	Emission Trading Scheme
EU	European Union
FAME	Fatty Acid Methyl Esters
FAO	Food and Agriculture Organization of the United Nations
FQD	Fuel Quality Directive
FRA	Forest Resources Assessment
GATT 1994	General Agreement on Tariffs and Trade 1994
GBEP	Global Bioenergy Partnership
GHG	Greenhouse gases
GMTF	Global Market-based Measure Technical Task Force
GPG	Good Practice Guidance
GPG-LULUCF	Good Practice Guidance for Land Use, Land-use Change and Forestry
HS	Harmonised System
ICJ	International Court of Justice
ICAO	International Civil Aviation Organization
ICESCR	International Covenant on Economic, Social and Cultural Rights
ICRW	International Convention on the Regulation of Whaling
IEA	International Energy Agency
IFAD	International Fund for Agricultural Development
ILUC	Indirect Land Use Change
ILA	International Law Association
ILO	International Labour Organisation
IMO	International Maritime Organization
IPCC	Intergovernmental Panel on Climate Change
ISO	International Organisation for Standardization
ITPGR	International Treaty on Plant Genetic Resources for Food and Agriculture
IUCN	International Union for the Conservation of Nature
LMO	Living Modified Organisms
LULUCF	Land Use, Land Use Change and Forestry
MARPOL	International Convention for the Prevention of Pollution from Ships
MEA	Multilateral Environmental Agreement
MEF	Major Economies Forum
Mtoe	Million tonnes of oil equivalent
NBSAP	National Biodiversity Strategies and Action Plans
NEA	National Energy Administration
NDRC	National Development and Reform Commission
NGO	Non-governmental Organization
NUTS	Nomenclature Territorial Units for Statistics
NWFP	Non-Wood Forest Product
OECD	Organization for Economic Cooperation and Development
OHCHR	Office of the High Commissioner for Human Rights
PDD	Project Design Documents

PPM	Process and Production Method
RSB	Roundtable on Sustainable Biomaterials
SBSTTA	Subsidiary Body on Scientific, Technical and Technological Advice
SEA	Strategic Environmental Assessment
SIA	Sustainability Impact Assessment
Sinopec	China Petrochemical Corporation
STRP	Scientific & Technical Review Panel
TBT	Technical Barriers to Trade
TEU	Treaty on European Union
TFEU	Treaty on the Functioning of the European Union
UK	United Kingdom
UN	United Nations
UNCCD	United Nations Convention to Combat Desertification
UNCED	United Nations Conference on Environment and Development
UNEP	United Nations Environment Programme
UNFCCC	United Nations Framework Convention on Climate Change
UNIDO	United Nations Industrial Development Organization
US	United States
VAT	Value Added Tax
WCED	World Commission on Environment and Development
WCO	World Customs Organisation
WFP	World Food Programme
WHC	World Heritage Convention
WTO	World Trade Organisation



LIST OF TABLES

Table 1. Sustainability concerns of biofuels	4
Table 2. Analysis on legal status of COP decision from three axes	64
Table 3. GHG emission saving thresholds (Directive 2009/28/EC)	99
Table 4. GHG emission saving thresholds amended in 2015.....	100
Table 5. Comparison between definitions of forested area	278