DENIALISM AND HUMAN RIGHTS

Edited by
Roland Moerland
Hans Nelen
Jan Willems

intersentia
Cambridge – Antwerp – Portland
ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

This book contains a selection of papers that were presented during the multidisciplinary conference 'Denialism and Human Rights'. This conference was organised by the Maastricht Centre for Human Rights on 22 and 23 January 2015. All the participants we spoke to afterwards emphasised that they had enjoyed the pleasant academic atmosphere, the debates, and the high quality of the presentations. Their enthusiasm reinforced our intention to bring the most interesting papers together in a book.

The conference could not have been organised without the financial support of a number of institutions. We are indebted to the Maastricht Centre for Human Rights, the Research Fund of the Maastricht Faculty of Law, the Limburg University Fund/SWOL, the Netherlands Organisation for Scientific Research (NWO), and Studium Generale for their donations.

The organisational support of Chantal Kuypers and Khalidah Ahmadi during the conference was invaluable. Khalidah was also a great help to us throughout the whole preparation period. We also want to thank Julie Peeters for her assistance in providing the layout for this book.

What we hoped to achieve with the conference was a reflection on denialism and human rights from a variety of angles and disciplines, and, additionally, to stress the relevance of the concept of denial to the contemporary debate on human rights issues. Without doubt, thanks to the contributions of the speakers and participants the conference served these purposes. This book elaborates on the central theme of the conference, and, hopefully, will further enhance the debate on denialism and human rights.

June 2016

Roland Moerland
Hans Nelen
Jan Willems
CONTENTS

Acknowledgements ........................................................................................................... v

Chapter I.
Introduction
   Roland Moerland, Hans Nelen and Jan Willems ...................................................... 1
   1. Rationale of this Book .......................................................................................... 2
   2. The Present Volume .............................................................................................. 3
      2.1. Introduction ................................................................................................... 3
      2.2. Themes and Contributions .......................................................................... 4

Chapter II.
Denialism and the Problem of Indifference
   Willem De Haan ...................................................................................................... 9
   1. What Is Denial? ..................................................................................................... 11
   2. What Is Denialism? .............................................................................................. 13
   3. Indifference .......................................................................................................... 16
   4. The Mass Media .................................................................................................. 18
   5. Human Rights Organisations ............................................................................ 19
   6. Tackling the Problem of Indifference ................................................................ 20
   7. Denialism and Critical Criminology .................................................................. 22

Chapter III.
Denial and Acknowledgment in Public Responses to Information about Human Rights Violations
   Irene Bruna Seu ....................................................................................................... 25
   1. Introduction .......................................................................................................... 25
   2. Denial .................................................................................................................... 27
   3. Socio-Cultural Vocabularies of Denial: ‘In Countries Like That’ .................... 31
   4. ‘Switching Off’ – Denial as Self-Protective Defence Mechanism ................. 34
   5. Acknowledgement ............................................................................................... 36
   6. Manageable Emotions ....................................................................................... 36
   7. Meaningful Understanding ............................................................................... 39
   8. Morally Significant ............................................................................................. 42
   9. Conclusions .......................................................................................................... 46

Intersentia
PART I.
CHILDREN’S RIGHTS

Chapter IV.
Diagnosing and Dispelling Denialism Regarding Children

James G. Dwyer

1. Forms of Denialism Regarding Children
   1.1. Moral Denialism
      1.1.1. Family Formation
      1.1.2. Dissolution of Family Relationships
      1.1.3. Authority over Non-Autonomous Persons
   1.2. Conceptual Denialism
   1.3. Descriptive Denialism
   1.4. Empirical Denialism

2. Overcoming Denialism Regarding Children

Chapter V.
Too Close to Home? The Denial of Prejudice and Discrimination against Children

Jan C.M. Willems

1. Introduction
2. The Denial of Juvenile Ageism
   2.1. Personal Denial: Moral Denialism and Childism
   2.2. Cultural Denial: Conceptual Denialism and Parentiarchy
   2.3. Official Denial: Descriptive Denialism and Transism
   2.4. Academic Denial: Empirical Denialism and Adultism
   2.5. The Juvism Onion
   2.6. Denial, Denialism, and Denialisms

3. Ten Child Abuse Denialisms
   3.1. Denialism 1: Defining Child Abuse
   3.2. Denialism 2: The Scale of Child Abuse
   3.3. Denialism 3: The Seriousness of Child Abuse
   3.4. Denialism 4: The Love Myth
   3.5. Denialism 5: The Blood-Tie Myth
   3.6. Denialism 6: The Resilience Myth
   3.7. Denialism 7: The Child Protection Myth
   3.8. Denialism 8: Immunity and Impunity Denial
   3.10. Denialism 10: Denial in Human and Children’s Rights Research

4. Conclusion
Chapter VI.
Denial of Developmental Needs of Foster Children by Dutch Youth Care Services
A.M. Weterings, in collaboration with Jan C.M. Willems ........... 97

1. Introduction ......................................................... 97
2. The Start of a Transgenerational Cycle as Shown by Research on the Development of Foster Children ....................... 99
   2.1. Descriptions of the Development of Some Children Shortly after their Arrival in Foster Families .................. 100
   2.2. Reflection ...................................................... 101
3. Attachment Security is Necessary for Adequate Development ...... 103
4. The Relationship of the Child with his Foster Parents and his Parents . 106
   4.1. Relationship with Foster Parents ........................... 106
   4.2. Influence of ‘Parent Contact’ ............................... 107
5. Loyalty of the Foster Child to his Parents .......................... 109
6. Contra-Indicators for Reunification ................................ 110
   6.1. The History between the Foster Child and his Parent ...... 111
   6.2. The Relationship between the Child and his Foster Parents . 111
   6.3. The Relationship between the Child and his Parent ........ 112
   6.4. Reactions of the Child During and after the Visits to his Parent .. 112
   6.5. The Policy Objective that the Foster Child Should Eventually Return to his Parent ................................. 112
   6.6. An Example of Unjustified Reunification: Ben, 3½ Years Old . . 113
7. Breaking the Transgenerational Cycle of Parental Neglect:
The Pedagogical Decision Model for Foster Care ..................... 113
   7.1. Early Results of the PDM Programme ........................ 115
   7.2. An Example: Lisa, 1 Year and 4 Months Old ................ 116
   7.3. First Evaluation of the PDM Programme with the PSI Questionnaires ............................................ 117
   7.4. Concluding Remarks .......................................... 117
8. Conclusion ......................................................... 118

Chapter VII.
Crime in the Intercountry Adoption Industry: Towards a Broader Definition of Child Trafficking
Elvira Loibl .............................................................. 119

1. Introduction ......................................................... 119
2. The Intercountry Adoption System’s Underbelly ..................... 121
4. The Prismatic Analysis of the Dimensions of Child Trafficking
   for the Purpose of Adoption ............................................. 128
   4.1. Individual and Social Harm ..................................... 128
   4.2. Invisibility of Harm .............................................. 132
   4.3. Lack of Public Agreement on Seriousness. .................... 134
   4.4. Low Probability of Severe Social Response ................... 139
5. Towards a Broader Definition of Child Trafficking .................. 141

PART II.
GENOCIDE

Chapter VIII.
The BBC Documentary 'Rwanda's Untold Story': Acknowledging Genocide or Denying It?
Roland Moerland ......................................................... 147
1. Introduction ............................................................ 147
2. Denial in Theory ...................................................... 151
   2.1. Genocide, Denial and Annihilation ............................ 151
   2.2. Genocide Denial .................................................. 153
   2.3. Denial of Genocide .............................................. 154
   2.4. 'Denial' in Effect ................................................. 155
   2.5. Genocide Denialism ............................................. 156
   2.6. The Object of Denial ............................................. 156
3. Denial at Work .......................................................... 158
   3.1. An Official Genocide Denial Discourse ....................... 158
   3.2. Recycling Official Genocide Denial ............................ 160
4. The BBC Documentary 'Rwanda's Untold Story' ....................... 163
   4.1. Vantage Point .................................................... 163
   4.2. Nature and Direction of Violence ............................. 166
   4.3. Number of Victims .............................................. 166
   4.4. The Downing of the Plane ..................................... 169
5. Rwanda's Untold Story – Acknowledging Genocide or Denying It? ... 170
6. Concluding Remarks .................................................... 173

Chapter IX.
Fighting NS Ideology and Holocaust Denial in Austria: Past and Present Perspectives
Johannes Keiler .............................................................. 175
1. Introduction ............................................................ 175
2. Criminalising Denial and Extremist Ideology ....................... 177
3. The NS Prohibition Act or the Long and Rocky Road to Coming to Terms with the Past .................................................. 179
4. Fighting Right-Wing Extremism, NS Ideology and Denial of the Holocaust: Present Perspective .................. 183
   4.1. The NS Prohibition Act: Introduction .................. 184
   4.2. The Prohibition Act: The Offences .................. 185
      4.2.1. Re-Establishing, Participation in, Supporting or Promoting a NS Organisation .................. 186
      4.2.2. Acts of Violence, Carried out as a Means to Re-engage with NS Activity .......................... 188
      4.2.3. The Catch-All Provision of §3g .................. 189
      4.2.4. Denial of the NS Holocaust and Other NS Crimes ..... 192
5. Concluding Remarks ................................................. 195

Chapter X.
The Holocaust and its Denial: A Paradigm in our Historical Culture
Georgi Verbeeck ......................................................... 199
1. History and Memory ................................................. 199
2. Holocaust Denial ................................................... 201
3. Scholarly and Legal Response .................................. 202
4. Defence .............................................................. 203
5. Criticism ............................................................. 204
   5.1. General ......................................................... 204
   5.2. Role of Historians ........................................... 205
   5.3. Freedom of Speech ......................................... 206
   5.4. Tactics ........................................................ 206
   5.5. Speech Act .................................................. 207
6. Use and Abuse of the Holocaust Paradigm .................. 208
   6.1. Political Usage .............................................. 209
   6.2. ‘Lessons from the Past’ ..................................... 210
   6.3. Desensitisation ............................................... 211
7. Epilogue ........................................................... 212

Chapter XI.
Can the Law Understand the Harm of Genocide Denial?
Rob Kahn ............................................................... 215
1. Introduction ......................................................... 215
2. Survivors .......................................................... 219
   2.1. Who Does Genocide Denial Harm? ...................... 219
   2.2. Human Dignity as a Measuring Stick ................. 220
   2.3. Harms to Victims ........................................... 222
# Contents

3. Jews, Armenians and Tutsi (Among Others) .......................... 224
4. Which Speech Acts are Hateful? ........................................ 227
5. Additional Harms of Genocide Denial: Threats and Falsity ........ 229
   5.1. Threats to Society at Large ..................................... 229
   5.2. Genocide Denial as Harmful Falsity ............................ 231
6. Conclusion: The Importance of Context ............................. 233

Chapter XII.  
On the Breaking of Consensus: The Perinçek Case, the Armenian Genocide and International Criminal Law  
Sévane Garibian  .................................................... 235

1. Introductory Remarks .................................................. 238
2. A ’Clear Basis in Law’: Revisiting the Origins of the Nuremberg Statute .................................................... 241
3. ’Facts … Clearly Established by an International Court’:  
   An Overview of the First Attempt at International Prosecution .... 244
4. Conclusion ........................................................................ 248

PART III.  
(INTER)NATIONAL ORGANISATIONS

Chapter XIII.  
Denial of Genocide by Bystanders in International Politics  
Fred Grünfeld ............................................................... 253

1. Introduction ....................................................................... 253
2. Bystanders at National and International Level ..................... 255
3. Research Results of the Role of Bystanders in Gross Human Rights Violations .................................................... 256
4. Knowledge and Action .................................................... 257
5. Denialism: Literal, Interpretive and Implicatory Denial ............ 259
6. Labelling Genocide Rejected ............................................ 260
7. Socio-Psychological Filter ............................................... 263
8. Conclusions ....................................................................... 264

Chapter XIV.  
International Organisations and Denialism: The Case of the African Union  
Konstantinos D. Magliveras .................................................. 267

1. Introduction ....................................................................... 267
2. Why the Case of the African Union is Different ..................... 270
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Chapter</th>
<th>Title</th>
<th>Pages</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>3.</td>
<td>The Intense Problems Facing Africa and the Ensuing Challenges</td>
<td>271</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Posed for the AU</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.</td>
<td>The Genocide in Darfur and the Case of Hissène Habré</td>
<td>273</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5.</td>
<td>The International Criminal Law Section of the African Court</td>
<td>278</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>of Justice and Human Rights as a Further Example of the AU’s Denial</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6.</td>
<td>Are there Mitigating Factors for the Denialism Shown by the AU?</td>
<td>281</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7.</td>
<td>Conclusion</td>
<td>283</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>-------</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Chapter XV.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Killing Through the State in the Colombian War and Getting Away</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>with Murder: An Exploration of Organisational Crime and Its Denial</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Michael Reed Hurtado</td>
<td>285</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1.</td>
<td>A Glimpse into the COLAR Sham-KIAs</td>
<td>288</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1.1.</td>
<td>Killing in the Colombian War and Sham-KIAs</td>
<td>288</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1.2.</td>
<td>Sham-KIAs in 2002–2008: The Variation in Modality</td>
<td>295</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.</td>
<td>Turning on the Heat: Body Counting and Kill Quotas</td>
<td>299</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.1.</td>
<td>Bureaucratic Killing and Denial</td>
<td>300</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.2.</td>
<td>Kill, Take No Prisoners: Connivance and Conformity</td>
<td>303</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.3.</td>
<td>Snatching the Body Count Policy</td>
<td>305</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.</td>
<td>Controlled Acknowledgement + Individual Responsibility = Successful Denial!</td>
<td>309</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.</td>
<td>A Word in Conclusion: Accounting for Organisational Engagement</td>
<td>312</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>-------</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>PART IV.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>NEW PENOLOGY</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>-------</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Chapter XVI.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Jim Crow 3.0: Denial, Human Rights, and American Racialised Mass Incarceration</td>
<td>317</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Cecil J. Hunt, II</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1.</td>
<td>Introduction</td>
<td>317</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.</td>
<td>Jim Crow in America</td>
<td>319</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.</td>
<td>Denial and Mass Incarceration</td>
<td>322</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.</td>
<td>Racialised Mass Incarceration</td>
<td>324</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5.</td>
<td>Drivers of Mass Incarceration</td>
<td>328</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5.1.</td>
<td>The War on Drugs</td>
<td>328</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5.2.</td>
<td>Racial Profiling</td>
<td>330</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6.</td>
<td>Conclusion</td>
<td>334</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Intersentia xiii
Chapter XVII.
Justifying Acts of Denialism: The Case of Prisoner Disenfranchisement in the UK
Samantha Morgan-Williams ................................................. 337

1. Introduction ................................................................. 337
2. Denialism and Human Rights: Political Denialism .................. 338
   2.1. Prisoner Disenfranchisement in the UK ..................... 340
   2.2. Prisoner Disenfranchisement Case Law before the ECtHR .... 341
   2.3. Developments 2014–2015 ........................................... 345
3. Justifications for the Ban on Prisoner Voting Rights ............... 347
   3.1. Civic Death Argument and Historical Justifications ......... 348
   3.2. The Civic Virtue Argument ......................................... 351
   3.3. The Social Contract ................................................. 352
   3.4. Achieving Sentencing Aims ....................................... 354
5. Conclusion ................................................................. 362

PART V.
SOCIAL, ECONOMIC AND CULTURAL RIGHTS

Chapter XVIII.
Poverty, Just World Thinking and Human Rights Law: A Study of the Relevance of Denial for Normative Legal Research
Gustavo Arosemena .......................................................... 367

1. Introduction ................................................................. 367
2. Characterising Denial ...................................................... 368
3. The Sidelining of Poverty in International Human Rights Law .... 370
4. Flimsy Excuses .............................................................. 372
5. Explaining the Flimsy Excuses: Belief in Just a World ............ 375
6. The Incompleteness of BJW and the Need for Normative Standards . 377
   6.1. The Explanation–Justification Gap ............................... 377
   6.2. The Inescapable Need for Normative Standards ............. 378
   6.3. The Particular Aims of Law ....................................... 380
   6.4. The Dangers of Undermining Academic Communication .... 381
7. The Continuing Relevance of Denial .................................. 381
   7.1. The Identification of Value ....................................... 382
   7.2. Undermining Some Forms of Political Liberalism ........... 383
8. Conclusions .................................................................... 385
Chapter XIX.
Genocide Denial and Refugees: A Lack of Protection in International Law?
Regina Menachery Paulose ................................. 387

1. Introduction ................................................. 387
2. Genocide Convention ................................. 388
   2.1. Groups ................................................. 389
   2.2. Intent ................................................. 390
   2.3. Genocide Denial ........................................... 391
3. Refugee Convention ................................. 393
   3.1. Well Founded Fear – Persecution ....................... 393
   3.2. Nexus ................................................. 394
   3.3. Causes of Flights or Provision for Prevention ............ 395
   3.4. Asylum Process and Denialism ......................... 396
   3.5. Exclusion .............................................. 397
4. Tying in the Conventions – Bangladesh ................ 398
   4.1. Genocide .............................................. 398
   4.2. Refugees .............................................. 400
5. Conclusion: Potential Solutions ....................... 401

Chapter XX.
Climate Justice: Climate Change and Human Rights
Zoi Alozi ......................................................... 403

1. Introduction ................................................. 403
2. Connecting Human Rights to Climate Change ................ 407
3. Climate Change and Human Rights: Reasons of Silence ........ 412
4. Conclusive Remarks ........................................... 415

Chapter XXI.
A State in Denial: The 'Intentional' Sexual Transmission of HIV in South Africa
Annelize Nienaber .............................................. 419

1. Introduction ................................................. 419
2. Stanley Cohen’s States of Denial .............................. 420
3. The Criminal Law Element of Fault in Relation to HIV Transmission to Sexual Partners ................... 421
4. North Gauteng High Court’s Judgment in Phiri v. S. ........ 425
5. A State in Denial: Implications of Culpability for the Unlawful Transmission of HIV During Sexual Intercourse ..... 427
6. Conclusion ................................................. 434
## Contents

Chapter XXII.
Olympic Idealism and Human Rights Infringements: How Athletes Cope with an Uncomfortable Reality
Radka Babjaková, Sharon Deten, Jennífer Etoré, Kim Geurtjens, Roland Moerland and Hans Nelen ................................. 437

1. Introduction ................................................................. 437
2. Olympic Idealism and Human Rights ..................................... 440
3. Denial at Work .............................................................. 444
4. Theoretical Reflection ..................................................... 447
5. Epilogue .................................................................. 449

Chapter XXIII.
Denialism and Human Rights: an Afterword
David Nelken ................................................................. 453

1. Defining Denialism: Going Beyond ‘Cohen’s States of Denial’ ........... 455
2. Connecting Denialism and Human Rights: The Harm of Denial and Harm by Denial ....................................................... 464
3. Responding to Denialism: Putting the World to Rights ................. 473

About the Authors ............................................................. 483