DENIALISM AND HUMAN RIGHTS

Edited by
Roland Moerland
Hans NeLEN
Jan Willems

intersentia
Cambridge – Antwerp – Portland
ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

This book contains a selection of papers that were presented during the multidisciplinary conference ‘Denialism and Human Rights’. This conference was organised by the Maastricht Centre for Human Rights on 22 and 23 January 2015. All the participants we spoke to afterwards emphasised that they had enjoyed the pleasant academic atmosphere, the debates, and the high quality of the presentations. Their enthusiasm reinforced our intention to bring the most interesting papers together in a book.

The conference could not have been organised without the financial support of a number of institutions. We are indebted to the Maastricht Centre for Human Rights, the Research Fund of the Maastricht Faculty of Law, the Limburg University Fund/SWOL, the Netherlands Organisation for Scientific Research (NWO), and Studium Generale for their donations.

The organisational support of Chantal Kuypers and Khalidah Ahmadi during the conference was invaluable. Khalidah was also a great help to us throughout the whole preparation period. We also want to thank Julie Peeters for her assistance in providing the layout for this book.

What we hoped to achieve with the conference was a reflection on denialism and human rights from a variety of angles and disciplines, and, additionally, to stress the relevance of the concept of denial to the contemporary debate on human rights issues. Without doubt, thanks to the contributions of the speakers and participants the conference served these purposes. This book elaborates on the central theme of the conference, and, hopefully, will further enhance the debate on denialism and human rights.

June 2016

Roland Moerland
Hans Nelen
Jan Willems
CONTENTS

Acknowledgements ................................................................. v

Chapter I.  
Introduction  
Roland Moerland, Hans Nelen and Jan Willems ....................... 1

1. Rationale of this Book ....................................................... 2
2. The Present Volume ......................................................... 3
   2.1. Introduction ............................................................. 3
   2.2. Themes and Contributions ........................................... 4

Chapter II.  
Denialism and the Problem of Indifference  
Willem De Haan ................................................................. 9

1. What Is Denial? .............................................................. 11
2. What Is Denialism? .......................................................... 13
3. Indifference ................................................................. 16
4. The Mass Media ............................................................ 18
5. Human Rights Organisations ............................................. 19
6. Tackling the Problem of Indifference ................................. 20
7. Denialism and Critical Criminology ................................... 22

Chapter III.  
Denial and Acknowledgment in Public Responses to Information  
about Human Rights Violations  
Irene Bruna Seu ................................................................. 25

1. Introduction ................................................................. 25
2. Denial ......................................................................... 27
3. Socio-Cultural Vocabularies of Denial: ‘In Countries Like That’  31
4. ‘Switching Off’ – Denial as Self-Protective Defence Mechanism  34
5. Acknowledgement .......................................................... 36
6. Manageable Emotions ...................................................... 36
7. Meaningful Understanding ............................................... 39
8. Morally Significant ...................................................... 42
9. Conclusions ................................................................. 46
PART I.
CHILDREN’S RIGHTS

Chapter IV.
Diagnosing and Dispelling Denialism Regarding Children
James G. Dwyer ......................................................... 51
1. Forms of Denialism Regarding Children ...................... 51
   1.1. Moral Denial ................................................. 51
       1.1.1. Family Formation ................................. 54
       1.1.2. Dissolution of Family Relationships ............ 55
       1.1.3. Authority over Non-Autonomous Persons ........ 55
   1.2. Conceptual Denialism ...................................... 56
   1.3. Descriptive Denialism ..................................... 60
   1.4. Empirical Denialism ...................................... 63
2. Overcoming Denialism Regarding Children .................. 66

Chapter V.
Too Close to Home? The Denial of Prejudice and Discrimination against Children
Jan C.M. Willems ....................................................... 69
1. Introduction ......................................................... 70
2. The Denial of Juvenile Ageism ................................. 75
   2.1. Personal Denial: Moral Denialism and Childism ........ 75
   2.2. Cultural Denial: Conceptual Denialism and Parentiarchy ...... 77
   2.3. Official Denial: Descriptive Denialism and Transism ....... 78
   2.4. Academic Denial: Empirical Denialism and Adultism .... 81
   2.5. The Juvism Onion .......................................... 81
   2.6. Denial, Denialism, and Denialisms ..................... 83
3. Ten Child Abuse Denialisms .................................... 85
   3.1. Denialism 1: Defining Child Abuse ...................... 86
   3.2. Denialism 2: The Scale of Child Abuse ................ 87
   3.3. Denialism 3: The Seriousness of Child Abuse .......... 89
   3.4. Denialism 4: The Love Myth ............................ 90
   3.5. Denialism 5: The Blood-Tie Myth ...................... 90
   3.6. Denialism 6: The Resilience Myth ..................... 91
   3.7. Denialism 7: The Child Protection Myth ............... 91
   3.8. Denialism 8: Immunity and Impunity Denial ........ 92
   3.9. Denialism 9: Unfitness Denial (Automatic Competence Myth) .... 93
   3.10. Denialism 10: Denial in Human and Children’s Rights Research .. 94
4. Conclusion .......................................................... 95
4. The Prismatic Analysis of the Dimensions of Child Trafficking
   for the Purpose of Adoption .................................................. 128
   4.1. Individual and Social Harm ........................................... 128
   4.2. Invisibility of Harm ................................................... 132
   4.3. Lack of Public Agreement on Seriousness ....................... 134
   4.4. Low Probability of Severe Social Response ..................... 139
5. Towards a Broader Definition of Child Trafficking ............... 141

PART II.
GENOCIDE

Chapter VIII.
The BBC Documentary 'Rwanda's Untold Story': Acknowledging
Genocide or Denying It?
Roland Moerland ................................................................. 147
1. Introduction ............................................................... 147
2. Denial in Theory .......................................................... 151
   2.1. Genocide, Denial and Annihilation ............................... 151
   2.2. Genocide Denial ...................................................... 153
   2.3. Denial of Genocide ................................................... 154
   2.4. 'Denial' in Effect .................................................... 155
   2.5. Genocide Denialism .................................................. 156
   2.6. The Object of Denial ................................................ 156
3. Denial at Work .............................................................. 158
   3.1. An Official Genocide Denial Discourse ......................... 158
   3.2. Recycling Official Genocide Denial ............................... 160
4. The BBC Documentary 'Rwanda's Untold Story' .................... 163
   4.1. Vantage Point ......................................................... 163
   4.2. Nature and Direction of Violence ............................... 166
   4.3. Number of Victims .................................................. 166
   4.4. The Downing of the Plane ......................................... 169
5. Rwanda's Untold Story – Acknowledging Genocide or Denying It? 170
6. Concluding Remarks ...................................................... 173

Chapter IX.
Fighting NS Ideology and Holocaust Denial in Austria: Past and
Present Perspectives
Johannes Keiler ................................................................. 175
1. Introduction ............................................................... 175
2. Criminalising Denial and Extremist Ideology ...................... 177
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Chapter XII.</th>
<th>On the Breaking of Consensus: The Perinçek Case, the Armenian Genocide and International Criminal Law</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Sévane Garibian</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1.</td>
<td>Introductory Remarks.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.</td>
<td>‘A “Clear Basis in Law”: Revisiting the Origins of the Nuremberg Statute’</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.</td>
<td>‘Facts … Clearly Established by an International Court’:</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>An Overview of the First Attempt at International Prosecution</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.</td>
<td>Conclusion.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>PART III.</th>
<th>(INTERNATIONAL ORGANISATIONS)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Chapter XIII.</td>
<td>Denial of Genocide by Bystanders in International Politics</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Fred Grünfeld</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1.</td>
<td>Introduction.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.</td>
<td>Bystanders at National and International Level</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.</td>
<td>Research Results of the Role of Bystanders in Gross Human Rights Violations</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.</td>
<td>Knowledge and Action</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5.</td>
<td>Denialism: Literal, Interpretive and Implicatory Denial.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6.</td>
<td>Labelling Genocide Rejected</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7.</td>
<td>Socio-Psychological Filter</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8.</td>
<td>Conclusions.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Chapter XIV.</th>
<th>International Organisations and Denialism: The Case of the African Union</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Konstantinos D. Magliveras</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1.</td>
<td>Introduction.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.</td>
<td>Why the Case of the African Union is Different.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
3. The Intense Problems Facing Africa and the Ensuing Challenges Posed for the AU ................................................................. 271
4. The Genocide in Darfur and the Case of Hissène Habré ................. 273
5. The International Criminal Law Section of the African Court of Justice and Human Rights as a Further Example of the AU’s Denialism ................................................................. 278
6. Are there Mitigating Factors for the Denialism Shown by the AU? ... 281
7. Conclusion ............................................................................. 283

Chapter XV.
Killing Through the State in the Colombian War and Getting Away with Murder: An Exploration of Organisational Crime and Its Denial
Michael Reed Hurtado ............................................................... 285

1. A Glimpse into the COLAR Sham-KIAs..................................... 288
   1.1. Killing in the Colombian War and Sham-KIAs....................... 288
   1.2. Sham-KIAs in 2002–2008: The Variation in Modality........... 295
2. Turning on the Heat: Body Counting and Kill Quotas ................. 299
   2.1. Bureaucratic Killing and Denial:......................................... 300
   2.2. Kill, Take No Prisoners: Connivance and Conformity......... 303
   2.3. Snatching the Body Count Policy........................................ 305
3. Controlled Acknowledgement + Individual Responsibility =
   Successful Denial! .................................................................. 309
4. A Word in Conclusion: Accounting for Organisational Engagement......................................................... 312

PART IV.
NEW PENOLOGY

Chapter XVI.
Jim Crow 3.0: Denial, Human Rights, and American Racialised Mass Incarceration
Cecil J. Hunt, II ................................................................. 317

1. Introduction ............................................................................. 317
2. Jim Crow in America .............................................................. 319
3. Denial and Mass Incarceration ................................................. 322
4. Racialised Mass Incarceration ............................................... 324
5. Drivers of Mass Incarceration ............................................... 328
   5.1. The War on Drugs............................................................. 328
   5.2. Racial Profiling................................................................. 330
6. Conclusion ............................................................................. 334
# Chapter XVII.
Justifying Acts of Denialism: The Case of Prisoner Disenfranchisement in the UK

Samantha Morgan-Williams .......................... 337

1. Introduction ........................................... 337
2. Denialism and Human Rights: Political Denialism .......... 338
   2.1. Prisoner Disenfranchisement in the UK ................. 340
   2.2. Prisoner Disenfranchisement Case Law before the ECHR ...... 341
   2.3. Developments 2014–2015 ................................ 345
3. Justifications for the Ban on Prisoner Voting Rights .......... 347
   3.1. Civic Death Argument and Historical Justifications .... 348
   3.2. The Civic Virtue Argument ................................ 351
   3.3. The Social Contract ..................................... 352
   3.4. Achieving Sentencing Aims ................................ 354
5. Conclusion ............................................. 362

# PART V.
SOCIAL, ECONOMIC AND CULTURAL RIGHTS

# Chapter XVIII.
Poverty, Just World Thinking and Human Rights Law: A Study of the Relevance of Denial for Normative Legal Research

Gustavo Arosemena ....................................... 367

1. Introduction ........................................... 367
2. Characterising Denial ................................... 368
3. The Sidelining of Poverty in International Human Rights Law .... 370
4. Flimsy Excuses .......................................... 372
5. Explaining the Flimsy Excuses: Belief in Just a World .......... 375
6. The Incompleteness of BJW and the Need for Normative Standards ..... 377
   6.1. The Explanation–Justification Gap ......................... 377
   6.2. The Inescapable Need for Normative Standards .......... 378
   6.3. The Particular Aims of Law ................................ 380
   6.4. The Dangers of Undermining Academic Communication .... 381
7. The Continuing Relevance of Denial .......................... 381
   7.1. The Identification of Value ............................... 382
   7.2. Undermining Some Forms of Political Liberalism .......... 383
8. Conclusions ............................................. 385
Chapter XIX.
Genocide Denial and Refugees: A Lack of Protection in International Law?
Regina Menachery Paulose ............................................. 387

1. Introduction ......................................................... 387
2. Genocide Convention .............................................. 388
   2.1. Groups ....................................................... 389
   2.2. Intent ......................................................... 390
   2.3. Genocide Denial ............................................. 391
3. Refugee Convention ................................................ 393
   3.1. Well Founded Fear – Persecution .......................... 393
   3.2. Nexus ........................................................ 394
   3.3. Causes of Flights or Provision for Prevention ............ 395
   3.4. Asylum Process and Denialism ............................. 396
   3.5. Exclusion ..................................................... 397
4. Tying in the Conventions – Bangladesh ......................... 398
   4.1. Genocide ....................................................... 398
   4.2. Refugees ...................................................... 400
5. Conclusion: Potential Solutions ................................. 401

Chapter XX.
Climate Justice: Climate Change and Human Rights
Zoi Aliozzi ................................................................. 403

1. Introduction ......................................................... 403
2. Connecting Human Rights to Climate Change ................. 407
3. Climate Change and Human Rights: Reasons of Silence ........ 412
4. Conclusive Remarks ................................................ 415

Chapter XXI.
A State in Denial: The 'Intentional' Sexual Transmission of HIV in South Africa
Annelize Nienaber ...................................................... 419

1. Introduction ......................................................... 419
2. Stanley Cohen's States of Denial .................................. 420
3. The Criminal Law Element of Fault in Relation to HIV Transmission to Sexual Partners ......................... 421
4. North Gauteng High Court's Judgment in Phiri v. S. ............ 425
5. A State in Denial: Implications of Culpability for the Unlawful Transmission of HIV During Sexual Intercourse ......... 427
6. Conclusion .......................................................... 434
# Contents

Chapter XXII.
**Olympic Idealism and Human Rights Infringements: How Athletes Cope with an Uncomfortable Reality**
Radka Babjaková, Sharon Deten, Jenniér Etoré, Kim Geurtjens, Roland Moerland and Hans NeLEN ................................. 437

1. Introduction ................................................ 437
2. Olympic Idealism and Human Rights ......................... 440
3. Denial at Work ............................................ 444
4. Theoretical Reflection ..................................... 447
5. Epilogue .................................................. 449

Chapter XXIII.
**Denialism and Human Rights: an Afterword**
David Nelken ............................................... 453

1. Defining Denialism: Going Beyond 'Cohen’s States of Denial' .... 455
2. Connecting Denialism and Human Rights: The Harm of Denial and Harm by Denial .................................................. 464
3. Responding to Denialism: Putting the World to Rights .......... 473

*About the Authors* ............................................. 483