PREFACE

“From Social Competition to Social Dumping” is the title of the collection of papers written on the occasion of the symposium which took place in Antwerp on 20 and 21 November 2014. In this book the phenomenon of social dumping is looked at in the wider context of the liberalized social competition as steered by the European Union. Special attention is paid to the harrowing dumping practices in the road transport sector. Therefore this publication contains a number of testimonies by people who actively fight social dumping. Some of the authors also examine the phenomenon of social dumping in relation to compliance with every worker’s fundamental right to respect for his/her dignity as a human being. In this respect, the underlying question is whether, by tolerating legislation that allows human dignity to be violated by social dumping, the European and national legislators do not infringe on the primary fundamental right…

Marc Rigaux
Jan Buelens
CONTENTS

Preface ............................................................................................................................ v

PART I. CONTRIBUTIONS

Chapter 1.
The Right to Human Dignity at Stake
Marc Rigaux ..................................................................................................................... 3

1. Introduction – a complex social issue shaped and provoked by European law .......................... 3
2. The free labour market and free social competition as the foundations of labour relations ................................................................. 7
   2.1. Free market economy, free labour market and free social competition ......................................................... 7
   2.1.1. Market economy as a reference system ................................................. 7
   2.1.2. The free labour market and the commercialization of labour ......................... 7
   2.1.3. Labour as an object of social competition ............................................. 8
   2.1.4. Free social competition: concept, types and consequences ..................................... 9
   2.2. The free labour market and free social competition: structural legal anchoring ................................................ 10
   2.2.1. Free labour market and free social competition: cornerstones of a legal order ............... 10
   2.2.2. Labour relations and free social competition: market relations and power relations ........................................... 11
   2.2.3. Structural anchoring in law ........................................................................ 12
3. Free social competition, social exploitation and social exclusion ......................................... 12
   3.1. Social exploitation and social exclusion: inevitable consequences of free social competition ......................... 12
   3.2. Social exploitation and social exclusion: proposal of typification ...................................................... 13
4. Free social competition and the right to dignity at work: the necessity of social corrections of the labour market .................................................. 15
   4.1. Functions and objectives of social law ........................................................................ 15
   4.2. Content and scope of the corrections ........................................................................ 15
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Section</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>4.3. Conditions necessary for the application of social corrections</td>
<td>16</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.4. Limits to the corrections</td>
<td>16</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5. Fair and unfair social competition versus social dumping</td>
<td>16</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5.1. Fair and unfair social competition: a legal fact</td>
<td>16</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5.2. Unfair social competition and social dumping: congruous legal concepts?</td>
<td>17</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6. Social dumping and the right to dignity at work</td>
<td>19</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6.1. The right to dignity at work: a primary fundamental right</td>
<td>19</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6.2. The absolute and relative scope of the right to human dignity</td>
<td>19</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6.3. Lack of respect for human dignity, an intrinsic element of social dumping</td>
<td>20</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7. Lack of respect for human dignity (at work): a structural defect of European market law?</td>
<td>20</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Chapter 2.
Human Dignity of Workers and Competition
Wolfgang Däubler

1. Point of departure: the worker treated as an object       | 21   |
2. Mitigating the situation                                    | 21   |
2.1. The indispensable worker                                | 21   |
2.2. Protection by labour law                                 | 22   |
2.3. Collective agreements                                    | 22   |
2.4. Informal rules                                           | 23   |
3. Returning to the market forces                             | 23   |
4. Internationalization of the markets                        | 24   |
5. Using information technology                               | 25   |
6. Proposals to improve the situation                         | 26   |
6.1. Better trade unions?                                     | 26   |
6.2. Mobilizing public opinion                               | 28   |
6.3. Collective action on the Internet                       | 31   |
7. Perspectives                                               | 32   |

Chapter 3.
Social Dumping: A Symptom of the European Construction.
An Exploratory Study of Social Dumping in Road Transport
Jan Buelems and Lies Michielsen

1. Introduction                                               | 33   |
2. The European construction                                 | 36   |
2.1. Treaty on the Functioning of the European Union         | 36   |

viii Intersentia
2.1.1. Separate title on transport in the TFEU: a common transport policy ........................................... 36
2.1.2. Free movement of workers, freedom of establishment and free movement of services ......................... 38
  2.1.2.1. Free movement of workers ................................................................. 38
  2.1.2.2. Freedom of establishment ............................................................... 39
  2.1.2.3. Free movement of services ............................................................. 39
  2.1.2.4. The case law of the Court of Justice ............................................. 40
  2.1.2.5. Restrictions on free movement ....................................................... 41
2.2. The Charter of Fundamental Rights of the European Union ....... 44
2.3. The relation between the internal market and the fundamental social rights .............................................. 45
2.4. Conclusion .................................................................................................................. 45
3. Other European rules and regulations relevant to the road transport sector ...................................................... 46
  3.1. Private international law ...................................................................................... 46
  3.2. Access to the market in the international carriage of goods by roads: Regulation 1071/2009 ..................... 49
  3.3. Cabotage regulations ............................................................................................ 50
  3.4. The Posted Workers and Enforcement Directives .............................................. 52
  3.5. Material law applicable ....................................................................................... 56
  3.6. Conclusion ............................................................................................................. 57
4. Some avenues to combat social dumping in road transport .......... 57
  4.1. Towards an upward harmonization of the various social and fiscal laws of the Member States ................. 58
  4.2. The fundamental social rights must be reinforced .............................................. 58
    4.2.1. Social progress clause ................................................................................. 59
    4.2.2. Fundamental rights test .............................................................................. 59
  4.3. No further liberalization of cabotage rights and harsher cabotage rules .................................................... 59
    4.3.1. No further liberalization ............................................................................. 59
    4.3.2. Harsher cabotage rules .............................................................................. 60
  4.4. New connecting factor in private international law ................. 61
  4.5. Better monitoring of the application of European Regulation 1071/2009 ............................................. 61
  4.6. Conclusion ............................................................................................................. 62
5. Conclusion .................................................................................................................. 62
Chapter 4.
The Territorial Application of Labour Law in the EU Internal Market.
On Legal Rules and Economic Interests
Herwig Verschueren .................................................. 63

1. Introduction ......................................................... 63
2. In principle labour law continues to be a matter of national competence .................................................. 64
3. The territorial application of labour law in cross-border situations ............................................. 66
   3.1. Principle: free movement of workers ............................................. 66
   3.2. The territorial application of labour law and private international law ............................................. 68
   3.3. The territorial application of labour law under pressure as a result of the free movement of services ............................................. 69
      3.3.1. Free movement of services and the territorial application of labour law ............................................. 69
      3.3.2. The Posted Workers Directive ............................................. 70
         3.3.2.1. Objectives and content ............................................. 70
         3.3.2.2. The Member States' ability to organize efficient control of compliance with the applicable employment provisions ............................................. 74
   3.4. The posted workers' position at the crossroads of legal rules and of economic interests ............................................. 77
4. Conclusion .......................................................... 82

Chapter 5.
The Tense Relationship Between Labour Market Rights and Respect for Dignity at Work: European Dimension
Barbara Kresal .......................................................... 85

1. Labour market as an integral part of a broader concept of the market .................................................. 85
2. (Neo)liberal model and the precarisation of society .................................................. 87
3. The European Union is following the same neoliberal trends .................................................. 88
4. Freedom of establishment and freedom of services versus dignity at work, fundamental social rights and free movement of workers .................................................. 94
5. Human rights approach .................................................. 95
6. Conclusion .......................................................... 96
Chapter 6.  
Limiting the Role of Public Authorities in the Deployment of Services.  
The Tense Relationship between Labour Market Rights and Respect for Dignity at Work, Limiting the Role of Public Authorities in the Deployment of Services  
Gian Guido Balandi ................................. 99

1. Social services in general .................................. 99
2. What is the relationship between public and private subjects? ....... 102
3. The limitation of the role of public authorities: effects as regards the citizens ........................................... 103
4. Effects of the limitation as regards employees ....................... 104

Chapter 7.  
Do we Need a New Conflict-of-Laws Rule for Labour in the European Road Transport Sector? Yes We Do  
Fieke van Overbeeke ................................. 107

1. Introduction ............................................. 107
2. Legal framework ........................................ 108
2.1. Freedom of services and freedom of establishment ............ 108
2.2. Conflict of laws – Article 8 Rome I Regulation ............... 109
2.2.1. Article 8(1) Rome I Regulation ......................... 109
2.2.2. Article 8(2), (3) and (4) Rome I Regulation ............. 110
2.2.3. A difficult regime applicable to a difficult sector ........ 111
3. Case law of Article 8 Rome I Regulation ........................ 111
3.1. Koelzsch case – broad habitual workplace principle ........ 112
3.2. Vooggeerd case – confirmation .......................... 113
3.3. Provisional review ..................................... 113
3.3.1. Broad interpretation desirable to mitigate bold flag out operations ........................................... 113
3.3.2. Still, not a solution .................................. 114
3.3.3. Risk of an incorrect interpretation of the Koelzsch elements – Ryanair case ................................. 116
3.3.4. Possibilities through the escape clause? .................. 117
3.3.5. Summary ........................................... 117
3.4. Schlecker case – qualification of the reasoning of the Court in Koelzsch ........................................... 118
3.4.1. Evaluation – effect on road transport situations? .......... 119
4. Final remarks ........................................... 120
Chapter 8.
The Right to Human Dignity: Ultimate Limit to Social Competition
and Market Freedoms

Ferran Camas Roda .......................................................... 123

1. Introduction .......................................................... 123
2. Human dignity in the Charter of Fundamental Rights of the
   European Union ......................................................... 124
3. References to human dignity in the Treaties of the European Union
   and derived legislation .................................................. 127
4. Human dignity as an integrated, transversal assumption ............. 130
   4.1. The effects of dignity in relation to work ....................... 130
   4.2. A threat to labour law: the devaluation of work ............. 131
5. Conclusions .......................................................... 135

PART II. TESTIMONIES FROM THE FIELD

Chapter 9.
The National Legal Battle against Social Exploitation in Austria

Walter Gagawczuk ......................................................... 139

1. The wage system in Austria ........................................ 139
2. The Anti-Wage and Social Dumping Act .......................... 140
3. Applicable law for cross-border employment in the transport sector . 141

Chapter 10.
Fighting the Grey Economy with National Legislation. The Case of Finland

Heini Polamo .......................................................... 143

1. Introduction ......................................................... 143
2. Commercial goods transport and grey economy in Finland ........ 144
3. Finnish hauliers support strong measures to fight the grey economy .. 144

Chapter 11.
The National Legal Battle against Social Exploitation. National
Practices of Finnish Labour Inspection

Jarno Virtanen .......................................................... 147