THE CHILD’S INTERESTS IN CONFLICT

The Intersections between Society, Family, Faith and Culture

Edited by
Maarit JÄNTERA-JAREBORG

intersentia
Cambridge – Antwerp – Portland
PREFACE

This collection consists of nine contributions on situations where the interests of society, family, faith and culture concerning the child’s welfare are in conflict. The focus is thus on one of the burning issues of any pluralistic, multicultural society encountering a diversity of norms, whether legal, cultural or faith-based. The English summary of the Swedish Law Commission’s report *Strengthened Protection against Forced Marriages and Child Marriages*, which formed the basis of Sweden’s 2014 law reform in the field, is included in order to demonstrate societal responses to encountered problems.

My thanks go to all the speakers, chairpersons, and participants at the “Families, Faith and Functions, The Child in the Intersections between Family, Society, Faith and Culture” symposium, held at Uppsala University in May 2013 on the occasion of the fifth anniversary of the university’s multidisciplinary research programme “The Impact of Religion: Challenges for Society, Law and Democracy”. One of the most vital themes of this research programme, funded as a Linnaeus Centre of Excellence (2008–2018) by the Swedish Research Council, is “Family and Society”. I wish to thank, in particular, my dear colleague and co-convener of the symposium Professor Anna Singer, as well as the Wenner-Gren Foundation and FORTE Research Council. Thanks are due also to Karolina Markgren LLM who assisted me with the drafting of the index and the final editing of this volume. All the presentations have been updated and rewritten for the purpose of this publication.

Uppsala, November 2015

Maarit Jänterä-Jareborg
## CONTENTS

*Preface* .................................................. v
*List of Authors* ........................................... ix

### The Child in the Intersections between Society, Family, Faith and Culture

**Maarit Jänterä-Jareborg** ............................................. 1

1. Introduction .................................................. 1
2. Focus on Europe and the Nordic States – but with Global Implications. ............................................. 4
3. How Human Rights Instruments Tackle the Child’s Conflicting Interests ............................................. 8
5. Navigating between Parents’ Convictions and the State’s Interest in Equal Education for All .......................... 15
6. Removal of Children from Parental Care .......................... 18
7. Protecting Children from Marrying .............................. 21
8. Circumcision of Boys: What is at Stake? ......................... 24
10. The Child as the “Sacrificial Lamb” to Society, Family, Religion and Culture ............................................. 30

### Born or Becoming: Children, Religion and Identity

**Jane Mair** .................................................. 31

1. The Badge of Identity ........................................... 31
2. Identity Rights ............................................... 34
3. The Situated Child: the Best and the Least ....................... 39
4. Identifying Relationships: a Case Study ......................... 49
5. The Limits of Labelling .......................................... 53

### State Curriculum and Parents’ Convictions under the European Convention on Human Rights

**Sanna Mustasaari** and **Sanna Koulu** ...................... 55

1. Travelling with Children in Strasbourg .......................... 55
2. Religion and Education: Between Parental and State Authority .... 56
3. The European Court on a Tightrope between the State and the Parents? ........................................... 60
4. Exemption from Education in National Laws ................................. 64
5. Best Interests of the Child: from Universal Rules to Particular Contexts and Back? ........................................... 66
7. Planning Future Travels ................................................ 71

Care Placements of Children Outside their Parental Home – Concerns of Culture
Sanne Hofman and Kirsten Sandberg ........................................... 73
1. Introduction ......................................................... 73
2. The Law ......................................................... 75
3. Cultural Background in the Consideration of Serious Neglect ............ 77
4. Refugee Children ................................................ 77
5. Physical Violence ................................................ 78
6. The Best Interests Assessment ....................................... 79
7. The Placement ..................................................... 80
8. Overall Evaluation ................................................ 83

Child Marriages and the Law – with Special Reference to Swedish Developments
Göran Lambertz ..................................................... 85
1. Introduction ......................................................... 86
2. Some Points of Departure ........................................... 88
3. Legislation or Not? ................................................ 92
4. No Possibility of Exceptions to Marriage Age? ......................... 100
5. Criminalisation? ................................................ 102
6. How Should We Counteract Negative Effects? ......................... 109
7. Closing Remarks ................................................ 110

Circumcision of Young Boys: A Conflict between Parental and Child Rights. The Swedish Experience from a Medical Point of View
Staffan Janson ....................................................... 111
1. Introduction ......................................................... 111
2. The Practice and its Historic Background ................................ 113
3. The Swedish Situation ........................................... 115
4. The 2012 Statement by the American Pediatric Academy ............ 119
5. The Statement of the Scandinavian Ombudsmen ....................... 123
6. Conclusion ......................................................... 124
## Contents

**The Body as Identity Marker. Circumcision of Boys Caught between Contrasting Views on the Best Interests of the Child**  
Marie-Claire Foblets .................................................. 125  
1. Introduction .......................................................... 126  
2. Different Perspectives Associated with the Appraisal of Child Care, Identity and Personhood ............................................. 142  
3. Some Personal Reflections by Way of a Conclusion ............ 161

**Malta Process and Cross-Cultural Aspects in Family Disputes**  
Louise Ellen Teitz ....................................................... 163  
1. Introduction: the Challenges of Cross-Border Family Relationships ... 163  
2. Discussion ............................................................. 167  
3. Conclusion ............................................................ 180

**The Child as the “Sacrificial Lamb” to Society, Family, Religion and Culture. A Comment**  
Esin Örüçü ............................................................... 185

**Annex** .................................................................... 187  
**Index** ...................................................................... 201
LIST OF AUTHORS

Marie-Claire Fobre  
Director at the Max Planck Institute for Social Anthropology (Law and Anthropology Department), Halle, Germany; Professor of Law and Anthropology, Faculty of Law, Catholic University of Leuven, Belgium

Sanne Hofman  
Legal Advisor in Child Rights, Save the Children, Norway; Chair of the Norwegian Forum for the UN Convention on the Rights of the Child

Staffan Janson  
Senior Professor of Public Health at Karlstad University; guest Professor of Pediatrics, Uppsala University

Maarit Jänterä-Jareborg  
Professor of Private International Law and International Civil Procedure, Faculty of Law, Uppsala University; Former Deputy Director of the Research Program ‘The Impact of Religion: Challenges for Society, Law and Democracy’ (Centre of Excellence 2008–2018), Uppsala University, Sweden

Sanna Koulu  
LL.D., Lecturer in Child and Family Law, University of Rovaniemi, Finland

Göran Lambertz  
Justice of the Supreme Court of Sweden; Chair of the Law Commission on strengthened protection from forced marriages and child marriages; former Chancellor of Justice

Jane Mair  
Professor of Private Law, School of Law, University of Glasgow, Scotland

Sanna Mustasaari  
Doctoral candidate, Faculty of Law, University of Helsinki, Finland

Esin Örücü  
Professor Emerita of Comparative Law, University of Glasgow, Scotland, and Erasmus Universiteit Rotterdam, the Netherlands
List of Authors

Kirsten Sandberg
Professor of Law, Department of Public and International Law, University of Oslo, Norway

Louise Ellen Teitz
Professor of Law, Roger Williams University School of Law, Rhode Island, USA; Former First Secretary of The Hague Conference on Private International Law