

The Child in ICC Proceedings

Helen Beckmann-Hamzei



intersentia

Cambridge – Antwerp - Portland

Intersentia Ltd
Sheraton House | Castle Park
Cambridge | CB3 0AX | United Kingdom
Tel.: +44 1223 370 170 | Email: mail@intersentia.co.uk

Helen Beckmann-Hamzei
The Child in ICC Proceedings

ISBN 978-1-78068-339-3
D/2015/7849/103
NUR 828

Cover image: Clara Constanze Otto (2015)

© 2015 Intersentia
www.intersentia.com | www.intersentia.co.uk

British Library Cataloguing in Publication Data. A catalogue record for this book is available from the British Library.

No part of this publication may be reproduced, stored in an automated data system or transmitted in any form or by any means, electronic, mechanical or photocopying, recording, or otherwise, without the prior written permission from the author/publisher.

ACKNOWLEDGMENTS

Generous funding from the Gieskes foundation paved the way for this seven-year study on child participation in the proceedings before the International Criminal Court which was carried out at the Grotius Centre for International Legal Studies, Leiden University.

Being part of the department of Public International Law provided me with the opportunity to discuss the many questions I was confronted with during my research but also enabled me, as a lecturer, to have plenty of fruitful exchanges in the Bachelor and Master programmes. I would therefore like to thank all my colleagues and students for providing me with numerous insights and such valuable feedback. I have always experienced the combination of research and teaching as extremely helpful in developing my own thoughts and views. The wonderful opportunity to spend time at with the Office of Public Council for Victims at the ICC constituted a significant period which enabled me to see the constraints children face when participating in proceedings. Furthermore, the possibility to participate in numerous national and international conferences alongside my teaching obligations enabled me to discuss the topic with many experts in the field far beyond Leiden and the Netherlands.

I am particularly thankful to three persons who accompanied me on my path during the past years. The inspiration and enthusiasm of Karel Wellens triggered and encouraged me to apply for the PhD position at Leiden University. Liesbeth Zegveld's faith in me and her mentoring as my '*Doktormutter*', and Larissa van den Herik's support as my daily supervisor constitute the core pillars of this research project. The numerous meetings in Amsterdam and Leiden always provided me with what I needed and beyond, in order to successfully bring this project to a conclusion.

Words cannot describe how lucky I am to be part of my family and that of Johannes. Thank you for being my fellows in life and being with me on my journey throughout this research project. Most of all, I am thankful to Johannes for being there, taking me as I am and sharing joy and challenges every single day with me. Our children are our future. Since we are so blessed to live in a place where children can grow up without being threatened by any form of armed conflict or large-scale violence, I dedicate this book to all children who find themselves in less child-friendly environments. May this book contribute to the strengthening of their procedural status and encourage adults to implement child-friendly justice.

June 2015

v

CONTENTS

Acknowledgments	v
Contents	vii
List of Abbreviations	xi
Introduction	1
Chapter 1	
Introduction	3
1.1 Introductory observations on the child in international law	3
1.2 The child and the ICC	6
1.3 Research aim, statement of the problem and research questions	8
1.4 Terminology and concepts	11
1.4.1 The child in ICC proceedings	11
1.4.2 Childhood	13
1.4.3 The particular vulnerability of the child	15
1.4.4 The best interests of the child and child-sensitive procedures	16
1.4.5 The evolving capacities of the child	19
1.5 Methodology	20
1.5.1 Sources and approach	20
1.5.2 Relevance of human rights law in ICC proceedings	23
1.6 Structure of the thesis	26
Part I	
The Child in International Criminal Proceedings	29
Chapter 2	
The Child Witness	31
2.1 Introduction	31
2.2 Child witnesses in international criminal proceedings	33
2.3 Rules governing witness testimony during trial proceedings	36
2.4 Ability to provide informed consent and the protection of the child witness	38

2.4.1	Informed consent of the child witness	38
2.4.2	Protection of the child witness	44
2.5	Credibility	52
2.5.1	Factors influencing the credibility of the child witness	53
2.5.1.1	Trustworthiness of the child witness	53
2.5.1.2	Impact of conflict situations and trauma	62
2.5.2	Measures enhancing credibility	67
2.5.2.1	Witness familiarisation	67
2.5.3.2	Age determination	71
2.6	Conclusion	77
Chapter 3		
The Child Victim		79
3.1	Introduction	79
3.2	Views on victim participation	80
3.3	Child victim participation in icc practice	81
3.4	Application of victim requirements to the child	83
3.4.1	Natural person	85
3.4.2	Harm	85
3.4.3	The jurisdiction criterion	86
3.4.4	The causality criterion	87
3.4.5	The evidentiary standard used	88
3.5	Children applying for participation	91
3.5.1	Legal competence of the child to apply for participation	93
3.5.2	Child-specific evidence	99
3.5.3	Categories of child applicants	103
3.6	General modalities of participation	115
3.7	Child-specific modalities of participation: the representation of the child	118
3.7.1	General rules governing the representation of victims	118
3.7.2	Representation of the child	121
3.7.3	Children expressing their views and concerns in the courtroom	126
3.7.4	Legal aid for the representation of the child	133
3.8	Conclusion	135
Chapter 4		
The Child Perpetrator and the Child of a(n) (alleged) Perpetrator		137
4.1	Introduction	137
4.2	Recruitment of child soldiers	138
4.3	Prosecuting the child	139
4.4	Being the child of a(n) (alleged) perpetrator	143
4.5	Conclusion	147

Part II	
The Child in International Reparation Practice	149
Chapter 5	
The Child Claimant	151
5.1 Introduction	151
5.2 The child as beneficiary of the right to reparations	153
5.3 Rules and practice governing reparation proceedings	161
5.4 Children claiming reparations before the ICC: current and future challenges	169
5.4.1 Forms of reparations	174
5.4.2 Eligibility	188
5.4.3 Implementation	192
5.5 Conclusion	198
Part III	
Concluding and Comparative Evaluation	201
Chapter 6	
Evaluation and Future Perspectives	203
6.1 Introduction	203
6.2 Evaluation	204
6.2.1 Legal capacity of the child	204
6.2.2 Informed consent of the child	207
6.2.3 Age of the child	209
6.2.4 Protection of the child	211
6.2.5 Credibility of the child	211
6.3 Principal relevance of child participation	213
6.4 Final recommendations and need for further research on child participation in international criminal and reparation proceedings	215
Summary	223
Samenvatting	229
Selected Bibliography	235
Overview of Legislation	275
Overview of Cases	279
Curriculum Vitae	

LIST OF ABBREVIATIONS

ACHR	American Convention on Human Rights
ACHPR	African Convention on Human and Peoples' Rights
ACRWC	African Charter on the Rights and Welfare of the Child
AFRC	Armed Forces Revolutionary Council
AIDS Behav	Aids and Behavior
AJIL	American Journal of International Law
Am. J. Dis. Child	American Journal of Diseases of Children
Annals, AAPSS	Annals of the American Academy of Political and Social Science
ASP	Assembly of States Parties
Beijing Rules	UN Standard Minimum Rules for the Administration of Juvenile Justice
Br J Psychiatry	British Journal of Psychiatry
Br Med J	British Medical Journal
Can J Nurs Res	Canadian Journal of Nursing Research
CAT	Convention against Torture and Other Cruel, Inhuman or Degrading Treatment or Punishment
CEDAW	Convention on the Elimination of all Forms of Racial Discrimination against Women
Child Dev.	Child Development
CMLR	Common Market Law Review
COE	Council of Europe
Colum. L. Rev.	Columbia Law Review
CRC	UN Convention on the Rights of the Child
CRC Committee	UN Committee on the Rights of the Child
DDR	Disarmament, Demobilization and Reintegration
DRC	Democratic Republic of the Congo
ECCC	Extraordinary Chambers in the Courts of Cambodia
ECHR	European Convention of Human Rights and Fundamental Freedoms
ECOSOC	United Nations Economic and Social Council
ECtHR	European Court of Human Rights
EJIL	European Journal of International Law
ETS	European Treaty Series
FIDH	Fédération Internationale des ligues des Droits de l'Homme
FORDHAM INT'L L.J.	Fordham International Law Journal

List of Abbreviations

GA	United Nations General Assembly
GC	General Comment of the CRC Committee
GYIL	German Yearbook of International Law
HRC	Human Rights Committee
HRLR	Human Rights Law Review
HRQ	Human Rights Quarterly
IACHR	Inter-American Court of Human Rights
ICC	International Criminal Court
ICC Statute	Rome Statute of the International Criminal Court (see also, Rome Statute)
ICCPR	International Covenant on Civil, and Political Rights
ICESCR	International Covenant on Economic, Social and Cultural Rights
ICJ	International Court of Justice
ICRC	International Committee of the Red Cross
ICTR Statute	Statute of the International Criminal Tribunal for Rwanda
ICTY	International Criminal Tribunal for the Former Yugoslavia
ICTY Statute	Statute of the International Criminal Tribunal for the Former Yugoslavia
IDP	Internally displaced persons
ILM	International Legal Materials
INT J. Child Right	International Journal of Children's Rights
Int J Ment Health	International Journal of Mental Health
Int J Refugee Law	International Journal of Refugee Law
IJTJ	International Journal of Transitional Justice
Int. Rev. Psychiatry	International Review of Psychiatry
ISIL	Indian Society of International Law
ISQ	International Studies Quarterly
IRRC	International Review of the Red Cross
J CLIN PSYCHIAT	Journal of Clinical Psychiatry
J Int Criminal Justice	Journal of International Criminal Justice
JILPAC	Journal of International Law of Peace and Armed Conflict
J. Traum. Stress	Journal of Traumatic Stress
JPCH	Journal of Paediatrics and Child Health
JPR	Journal of Peace Research
JRS	Journal of Refugee Studies
LJIL	Leiden Journal of International Law
Med Confl Surviv	Journal of Medicine, Conflict and Survival
MONUC	United Nations Organization Mission in the Democratic Republic of the Congo
N Engl J Med	New England Journal of Medicine
Neth. Y.B.I.L.	Netherlands Yearbook of International Law
OAU	Organization of African Unity

OPCV	Office of Public Counsel for Victims
OTP	Office of the Prosecutor
PCIJ	Permanent Court of International Justice
PTSD	Post-traumatic stress disorder
RES	United Nations Resolution
RICR	Revue internationale de la Croix-Rouge
Rome Statute	Rome Statute of the International Criminal Court (see also, ICC Statute)
RPE	Rules of Procedure and Evidence
SC	United Nations Security Council
SCSL	Special Court for Sierra Leone
TFV	Trust Fund for Victims
TIL	The International Lawyer
TRC(s)	Truth and Reconciliation Commission(s)
UDHR	Universal Declaration of Human Rights
UN	United Nations
UNESCO	United Nations Educational, Scientific and Cultural Organization
UNICEF	United Nations Children's Fund
UNTS	United Nations Treaty Series
US	United States
VPRS	Victims Participation and Reparation Section
VWU	Victims and Witnesses Unit
Yb	Yearbook
YIHL	Yearbook of International Humanitarian Law