

ADDRESSING THE  
INTENTIONAL DESTRUCTION  
OF THE ENVIRONMENT  
DURING WARFARE UNDER  
THE ROME STATUTE OF THE  
INTERNATIONAL CRIMINAL  
COURT

Steven FREELAND



intersentia

Cambridge – Antwerp – Portland

Intersentia Ltd  
Sheraton House | Castle Park  
Cambridge | CB3 0AX | United Kingdom  
Tel.: +44 1223 370 170 | Email: mail@intersentia.co.uk

*Distribution for the UK:*

NBN International  
Airport Business Centre, 10 Thornbury Road  
Plymouth, PL6 7 PP  
United Kingdom  
Tel.: +44 1752 202 301 | Fax: +44 1752 202 331  
Email: orders@nbninternational.com

*Distribution for the USA and Canada:*

International Specialized Book Services  
920 NE 58th Ave. Suite 300  
Portland, OR 97213  
USA  
Tel.: +1 800 944 6190 (toll free)  
Email: info@isbs.com

*Distribution for Austria:*

Neuer Wissenschaftlicher Verlag  
Argentinierstraße 42/6  
1040 Wien  
Austria  
Tel.: +43 1 535 61 03 24  
Email: office@nww.at

*Distribution for other countries:*

Intersentia Publishing nv  
Groenstraat 31  
2640 Mortsel  
Belgium  
Tel.: +32 3 680 15 50  
Email: mail@intersentia.be

Addressing the Intentional Destruction of the Environment during Warfare under  
the Rome Statute of the International Criminal Court  
Steven Freeland

© 2015 Intersentia  
Cambridge – Antwerp – Portland  
www.intersentia.com | www.intersentia.co.uk

Cover illustration: Francisco de Goya (1746-1828), Etching, Plate 41 from 'Los  
desastres de la guerra'

ISBN 978-1-78068-314-0  
D/2015/7849/54  
NUR 824

British Library Cataloguing in Publication Data. A catalogue record for this book is  
available from the British Library.

No part of this book may be reproduced in any form, by print, photoprint, microfilm or any  
other means, without written permission from the publisher.

# CONTENTS

Introduction.....	1
-------------------	---

## Chapter One

<b>The Imperative to Regulate the Intentional Destruction of the Environment during Warfare under International Criminal Law .....</b>	<b>5</b>
--	----------

1.1. Introduction – Intentional Environmental Destruction as a part of Warfare.....	5
1.2. Impact of Environmental Destruction on Human Security and Conflict.....	8
1.3. Intentional Targeting of the Environment during Warfare and the Development of International Criminal Justice.....	14
1.4. The Need for Legal Regulation .....	23
1.4.1. National Law .....	25
1.4.2. Regional Law .....	27
1.4.3. International Law, Armed Conflict and the Environment.....	29
1.5. International Criminal Law as a Regulatory Mechanism .....	34
1.6. Could State Criminal Responsibility Apply? .....	36
1.6.1. State Criminal Responsibility? .....	37
1.6.2. Individual Criminal Responsibility .....	43
1.7. Key Questions .....	45

## Chapter Two

<b>Regulation of the Intentional Destruction of the Environment during Warfare under Treaty Law .....</b>	<b>47</b>
---	-----------

2.1. Introduction – Treaties under International Law .....	47
2.2. International Humanitarian Law ( <i>Jus in Bello</i> ) – Relevant Treaty Provisions.....	49
2.2.1. 1868 St. Petersburg Declaration .....	59
2.2.2. 1899 Hague Conference Conventions and Declarations.....	60
2.2.3. 1907 Hague Convention IV Respecting the Laws and Customs of War on Land .....	62
2.2.4. 1925 Geneva Protocol for the Prohibition of the Use in War of Asphyxiating, Poisonous and Other Gases, and of Bacteriological Methods of Warfare.....	65

2.2.5.	1949 Geneva Conventions .....	68
2.2.6.	1954 Hague Convention for the Protection of Cultural Property in the Event of Armed Conflict .....	73
2.2.7.	1972 Biological Weapons Convention .....	74
2.2.8.	1976 Convention on the Prohibition of Military or Any Other Hostile Use of Environmental Modification Techniques .....	76
2.2.9.	1977 Additional Protocol I .....	81
2.2.10.	1981 Certain Conventional Weapons Convention .....	92
2.2.11.	1993 Chemical Weapons Convention .....	96
2.2.12.	1997 Ottawa Convention on the Prohibition of the Use, Stockpiling, Production and Transfer of Anti-Personnel Mines and on Their Destruction .....	98
2.2.13.	1999 Second Protocol to the Hague Convention of 1954 for the Protection of Cultural Property in the Event of Armed Conflict .....	100
2.3.	Applicability of International Environmental Law Treaties .....	101
2.3.1.	Development of International Environmental Law Treaties ....	102
2.3.2.	Applicability during Warfare? .....	105
2.3.3.	Liability and State Responsibility rather than Criminal Responsibility .....	111
2.4.	Conclusion .....	115

### Chapter Three

#### **Regulation of the Intentional Destruction of the Environment during Warfare under Customary International Law .....**

119

3.1.	Introduction – Customary International Law within International Law .....	119
3.2.	Fundamental Customary Rules of the <i>Jus in Bello</i> .....	130
3.2.1.	Principle of Military Necessity .....	131
3.2.2.	Principle of Distinction .....	141
3.2.3.	Principle of Proportionality .....	150
3.2.4.	The Fundamental Customary <i>Jus in Bello</i> Rules are Important but Insufficient .....	159
3.3.	Additional Protection? ICRC Study – Rules Relating to ‘The Natural Environment’ .....	160
3.3.1.	ICRC Study – Rule 43 .....	163
3.3.2.	ICRC Study – Rule 44 .....	164
3.3.3.	ICRC Study – Rule 45 .....	168
3.4.	A General Customary Obligation to Take Account of the Environment during Armed Conflict? .....	171
3.5.	Conclusion .....	175

## Chapter Four

### Regulation of the Intentional Destruction of the Environment during Warfare under the Existing Rome Statute Regime . . . . . 177

- 4.1. Introduction – The Core International Crimes in the Rome Statute . . . . 177
- 4.2. Finalization of the Rome Statute and Establishment of the ICC. . . . . 180
- 4.3. Jurisdiction of the Court – A Brief Overview. . . . . 185
- 4.4. Applicability of the Rome Statute to the Intentional Destruction of the Environment during Warfare . . . . . 189
  - 4.4.1. Intentional Destruction of the Environment as Genocide? . . . . 190
  - 4.4.2. Intentional Destruction of the Environment as a Crime against Humanity? . . . . . 199
  - 4.4.3. Intentional Destruction of the Environment as a War Crime? . . 204
    - 4.4.3.1. Article 8(2)(b)(iv) . . . . . 204
    - 4.4.3.2. Other War Crimes within Article 8 of the Rome Statute 213
- 4.5. Conclusion . . . . . 215

## Chapter Five

### Incorporating Crimes against the Environment into the Rome Statute . . . . 219

- 5.1. The Need for a *Sui Generis* Crime of Crimes against the Environment. . 219
  - 5.1.1. Revisiting the Imperative to more effectively Address the Intentional Destruction of the Environment during Warfare under International Criminal Law . . . . . 219
  - 5.1.2. A *Sui Generis* Crime – Crimes against the Environment. . . . . 226
    - 5.1.2.1. Why a Stand-Alone Crime? . . . . . 226
    - 5.1.2.2. Why ‘During Armed Conflict’? . . . . . 228
- 5.2. Crimes against the Environment – An International Crime? . . . . . 234
- 5.3. Crimes against the Environment – A Definition for the Rome Statute . . 239
  - 5.3.1. The Applicable Approach to Defining Crimes against the Environment . . . . . 239
  - 5.3.2. Definition of Crimes against the Environment . . . . . 245
    - 5.3.2.1. Proposed article 8 *ter* of the Rome Statute . . . . . 245
      - 5.3.2.1.1. Discussion . . . . . 246
        - 5.3.2.1.1.1. Paragraph 1 (article 8 *ter*(1)) . . . . 246
        - 5.3.2.1.1.2. Paragraph 2 (article 8 *ter*(2)) . . . . 274
      - 5.3.2.1.2. Associated Amendments to the Rome Statute. . . . . 279
      - 5.3.2.1.3. Associated Amendments to the Elements of Crimes . . 279
        - 5.3.2.1.3.1. Amendment to the Explanatory Note . . . . . 279
          - 5.3.2.1.3.1.1. Discussion . . . . . 280
        - 5.3.2.1.3.2. Proposed Elements of Crimes for Crimes against the Environment . . . . . 280
          - 5.3.2.1.3.2.1. Discussion . . . . . 281

5.4. Comparison with article 8(2)(b)(iv) – ‘Righting the Wrongs’ .....	282
5.5. Procedure for Amending the Rome Statute and the Elements of Crimes.....	283
5.6. Final Reflections – A ‘Work in Progress’.....	285
<i>Appendix I</i> .....	289
5.3.2.2. Associated Amendments to the Rome Statute.....	289
5.3.2.2.1. Amendment to article 5(1) .....	289
5.3.2.2.2. Amendment to article 8(2)(b)(iv) and the Associated Elements of Crimes .....	289
5.3.2.2.3. Amendment to article 9(1) .....	290
5.3.2.2.4. Inclusion of article 15 <i>quater</i> .....	290
5.3.2.2.5. Amendment to article 20(3) .....	291
<i>Appendix II</i> .....	293
5.3.3. Paragraph 3 – <u>Not</u> Included in Final Version of article 8 <i>ter.</i> .	293
5.3.3.1. Discussion .....	293
<i>Bibliography</i> .....	297
<i>Curriculum Vitae</i> .....	353