

Prevention of Genocide under International Law
An analysis of the obligation of states and the United Nations to
prevent genocide at the primary, secondary and tertiary levels

SCHOOL OF HUMAN RIGHTS RESEARCH SERIES, Volume 66

The titles published in this series are listed at the end of this volume.

Prevention of Genocide under International Law
An analysis of the obligations of states and the United Nations to
prevent genocide at the primary, secondary and tertiary levels

Etienne Ruwebana



intersentia

Cambridge – Antwerp – Portland

Intersentia Publishing Ltd.
Sheraton House | Castle Park
Cambridge | CB3 0AX | United Kingdom
Tel.: +44 1223 370 170 | Email: mail@intersentia.co.uk

This work was conducted at the department of Constitutional Law and International Law at the University of Groningen, the Netherlands and it was funded by NUFFIC.

Etienne Ruvebana
Prevention of Genocide under International Law. An analysis of the obligations of states and the United Nations to prevent genocide at the primary, secondary and tertiary levels.

ISBN 978-1-78068-273-0
D/2014/7849/141
NUR 828

Cover illustration © Danny Juchtmans

© 2014 Intersentia
www.intersentia.com | www.intersentia.co.uk

British Library Cataloguing in Publication Data. A catalogue record for this book is available from the British Library.

No part of this book may be reproduced in any form, by print, photoprint, microfilm or any other means, without written permission from the publisher.

ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

This work could not have been started or completed without the support of many people and institutions to whom I am deeply grateful. My first appreciation goes to my promotor Professor Marcel Brus, who has accompanied me all along this long journey. In addition to being academically indispensable at every step of the research, he has also acted socially as a good parent and this will never be forgotten. It is rare to find someone of this double quality and it has been a particular privilege to be supervised by him. I am also grateful to Dr. André de Hoogh who accepted to co-supervise my work. His ideas have been of high importance and have helped me to make it what it is today. My thanks go to the members of the assessment committee, Professors Caroline Fournet, Rianne Letschert and Frans Nelissen for their useful comments on the manuscript.

My gratitude goes also to Nuffic for its financial support. May Erik Haarbrink and Gonny Lakerveld find my thanks for the guidance, advice and management of the Nuffic Scholarship and related arrangements.

Honesty demands to acknowledge that it has been impossible to do this work without being profoundly shaken by this rather sombre topic and field. My background and experience as Rwandan and my readings on genocide have affected my emotional part of my being. This sombreness has however been constantly downplayed by the friendly warmth of my officemates Getahun Mossissa, Lottie Lane and all my colleagues in the department of Constitutional Law and International Law. More specifically, I owe a debt of gratitude to my colleagues for the collegial spirit they showed on the 12th of February 2011. Many thanks also go to one of those colleagues Professor Alfons Dölle and his family for the encouragement and joy to my daughter for many times she needed it. I will always miss Alfons's sense of humour and immeasurable kindness. Many thanks also to my paranympths Dr. Michiel Duchateau and Marlies Hesselman in particular for organising and helping out with the final processes of my PhD. Many thanks to Esther Knot who, with infinite kindness has helped out with the layout of my PhD thesis.

I am thankful to the International Service Desk for the invaluable support in the arrangements of various things. In particular, may Anneke Toxopeus and Marco van der Vinne find my deepest appreciation for their professionalism from which I have benefitted in many ways. May Barbera Folkers of the Housing Office also find my deep gratitude for her service at a time I needed it. Gratitude to the Groningen Graduate School of Law, in particular to Dr. Joop Houtman and Barbara Hallebeek for the support and guidance in my PhD period.

Acknowledgements

I owe a lot to a number of friends for their invaluable support in many ways. Many thanks to Marthin Kok and his wife Marja Kok for being present in my life in Groningen. May Anne-Marie de Brouwer, Willy Makuza, John Kinyoni, Lydia Kuipers, Parfait Rutayisire, Ben T. Twine, Patient Gumiriza, Usta Kaitesi, Felix Ndahinda, Norbert Nsabimana, Patrick Runesha and their families, Kirsten Wolkotte and all the friends in my Church in Groningen also find my gratitude for their warm friendship which made me feel at home. Their presence in my life has been so enabling.

Last but not least, I am heartily grateful to my family. Special thanks must be given to my precious and lovely wife Apolline Kampire for her brave spirit, encouragement, love and care that cannot be evaluated in words. I also thank her for her patience, perseverance and many sacrifices during my long absence from her. Likewise, my thanks go to my daughter Vanessa Uwimanzi who has patiently accepted to pay the sacrifice in many ways. May both join me to hope that there is life after a PhD thesis. In addition, I am immensely thankful to my parents who, not only were the first to open my eyes but also showed my eyes, heart and mind, the way to (and the door of) school. Without that, like many others from the place I was born, I would never have dreamed to achieve this level. I still have the memory of my father holding my arm, accompanying me the very first day to school and I heartily value the way he kept an eye on me until I became capable to understand that I had to reach the destination of the journey he had helped me to start. His big push has been determinant in reaching this destination. He quitted me early, but I honour him all along my way.

Space does not allow me to say more and to name other people whose contribution has been valued. However, may they be assured that they have enough space in my heart. As John F. Kennedy has rightly said, “As we express our gratitude, we must never forget that the highest appreciation is not to utter words, but to live by them”.¹ I will live by that ultimate gratitude.

Groningen, May 2014

¹ John F. Kennedy, Proclamation 3560: Thanksgiving day by the President of the United States of America a proclamation, November 5, 1963, available online at <www.pilgrimhall.org/ThanxProcl1960.htm> (visited on 19 September 2013).

CONTENTS

<i>Acknowledgements</i>	v
<i>List of Abbreviations</i>	xv
Chapter I	
General Introduction	1
1. Research Context	1
2. Research Question	6
3. Objective of the Research	8
4. Sources of the Research	8
5. Structure of the Research	10
Chapter II.	
The Concept of Prevention as Understood in various Fields	11
Introduction	11
1. Prevention in public health	11
1.1. Meaning of prevention in public health	12
1.2. Understanding prevention in public health through examples	15
1.2.1. Prevention of malaria	15
1.2.2. Prevention of international spread of disease	17
1.3. Preliminary conclusions	19
2. Prevention of proliferation of nuclear weapons	19
2.1. Understanding prevention through the rules on non-proliferation of nuclear weapons	20
2.2. The IAEA role in the prevention of proliferation of nuclear weapons	21
2.3. Preliminary conclusions	23
3. Prevention in criminology	23
4. Prevention in international environmental law	26
4.1. Understanding the meaning and purpose of prevention and the preventive measures in environmental law	27
4.1.1. Understanding the meaning and purpose of prevention in environmental law	27
4.1.2. Understanding preventive measures through some international conventions and case-law	28
4.2. Prevention principle v. the lack of certainty of the occurrence of environmental damage and of the power to prevent	32

4.3. Preliminary conclusions	34
5. Prevention of torture	35
5.1. Prevention of torture at the international level	35
5.2. Prevention of torture at the regional level	40
5.2.1. Prevention of torture at the European level	40
5.2.2. Prevention of torture at the American level	41
5.3. Preliminary conclusions	43
Conclusion	43
Chapter III.	
The Concept of Prevention in the Field of Genocide in General	47
Introduction.	47
1. Understanding the factors in the process to genocide	48
1.1. Genocide as an identity-based phenomenon	49
1.2. Difficult life conditions due to economic problems	50
1.3. Deprivation or inequalities in the allocation of scarce resources	51
1.4. Political scarcity	52
1.5. Armed Conflicts	53
1.6. Human rights violations in an atmosphere of impunity	54
1.7. Preliminary conclusions	55
2. Understanding the risks of genocide in different phases of the process to genocide	57
2.1. Social categorisation	57
2.2. Discrimination.	58
2.3. Dehumanisation.	59
2.4. Propaganda for the elimination of the targeted group(s).	60
2.5. Preparation.	64
2.6. Targeted massacres	65
2.7. Elimination (genocide per se)	66
2.8. Absence of action to halt genocide	66
2.9. Denial of genocide and impunity of its perpetrators.	67
2.10. Preliminary conclusions	67
3. Understanding prevention in the process to genocide	68
3.1. Primary prevention of genocide	69
3.2. Secondary prevention of genocide	69
3.3. Tertiary prevention of genocide.	71
3.4. Prevention v. the lack of certainty of the risk of genocide and of the power to prevent	71
3.5. Preliminary conclusions	72
Conclusion	72

Chapter IV	
Prevention of Genocide Under International Law	75
Introduction.	75
1. Origin and definition of genocide: a prevention perspective	75
2. The obligation to prevent genocide: meaning, scope and independence vis-à-vis the obligation to punish	82
2.1. Meaning of prevention and the obligation to prevent genocide: Article I of the Genocide Convention	83
2.1.1. The meaning of prevention in the Genocide Convention.	83
2.1.2. The meaning and scope of the obligation to prevent genocide	84
2.2. Obligation to prevent genocide as a legal obligation (separate from the obligation to punish).	90
2.3. The nature of the obligation to prevent genocide: obligation of means not of result?.	93
2.3.1. The distinction between the obligation of means and the obligation of result	93
2.3.2. Does the application of the distinction by the ICJ match the reality and nature of the obligation to prevent genocide?	95
2.4. Preliminary conclusions	97
3. The bearers of the obligation to prevent genocide	98
3.1. The bearers of the obligation to prevent genocide under the Genocide Convention	98
3.2. The obligation to prevent genocide under customary international law and its bearers.	99
3.3. Preliminary conclusions	103
4. The temporal scope of the obligation to prevent genocide	103
5. Prevention and knowledge of serious risk of genocide and the lack of certainty of its occurrence.	107
5.1. Prevention and knowledge of the serious risk of genocide	107
5.2. Obligation to prevent genocide v. the lack of certainty that genocide will happen.	109
5.3. Preliminary conclusions	110
Conclusion	110
Chapter V.	
The Obligation of Territorial States to Prevent Genocide Under International Law	113
Introduction.	113
1. Territorial scope of the obligation to prevent genocide	113
2. Primary prevention of genocide by territorial states	114

Contents

2.1.	Necessary legislation to give effect to the Genocide Convention . . .	115
2.1.1.	Legal basis and meaning	115
2.1.2.	Content of necessary legislation to give effect to the Genocide Convention	116
2.2.	Is only legislation envisaged at the primary level in order to prevent genocide?	121
2.3.	Preliminary conclusions	123
3.	Secondary prevention of genocide by territorial states	124
3.1.	Preventive measures exercised at a national level.	124
3.1.1.	Judicial measures to prevent genocide	125
3.1.2.	Other measures	136
3.2.	Preventive measures with international character	138
3.2.1.	Prevention by punishing the incitement to commit genocide committed outside its territory	138
3.2.2.	What if the inciting state is developing weapons of mass destruction which could be used to commit genocide against the people of a territorial state?	144
3.3.	Preliminary conclusions	146
4.	Tertiary prevention of genocide by territorial states.	146
4.1.	Who within the state is committing genocide?	146
4.1.1.	When genocide is being committed by the territorial state's organs.	147
4.1.2.	When genocide is being committed by a rebel group (not under the control of the territorial state)	148
4.1.3.	When genocide is being committed by a part of the population of the territorial state	149
4.2.	When genocide is being committed by another state or rebel groups from another state	150
4.2.1.	When a territorial state is victim of aggression by another state with the intention to commit genocide	150
4.2.2.	When genocide is being committed by armed bands or groups operating from another state	152
4.3.	Preliminary conclusions	156
5.	Some challenges common to the prevention at the three levels and how they should be overcome	156
	Conclusion	158
 Chapter VI.		
	Prevention of Genocide by Non-Territorial States Under International Law . . .	161
	Introduction.	161
1.	The territorial scope of the obligation to prevent genocide	161
1.1.	Confronting the obligation to prevent genocide with state sovereignty.	162

1.2.	The ICJ and the territorial scope of the obligation to prevent genocide	167
2.	Capacity of non-territorial states to prevent genocide outside their territories	171
3.	Primary prevention of genocide by non-territorial states: What actions are permitted and required in international law, with what means and to which distance?	173
3.1.	Necessary legislation that may have effect on the prevention of genocide in other states	174
3.1.1.	Legislation that penalises behaviours that may lead to genocide and genocide itself.	174
3.1.2.	Legislation that creates a mechanism to prosecute and punish genocide related crimes committed outside the prosecuting state.	175
3.2.	Other measures	180
3.3.	Preliminary Conclusions	182
4.	Secondary prevention of genocide by non-territorial states: What actions are permitted in international law with what means and to which distance?	182
4.1.	Judicial measures for the prevention of genocide by non-territorial states	183
4.1.1.	Application of the principle of universal jurisdiction in the prevention of genocide	183
4.1.2.	Preventing genocide through the referral of a situation to the ICC and through the execution of its arrest warrants	189
4.2.	Other preventive measures	192
4.3.	Preliminary conclusions	195
5.	Tertiary prevention of genocide by non-territorial states: What actions are permitted in international law with what means and to which distance?	195
5.1.	The prohibition of use of force in the context of genocide	196
5.1.1.	Mainstream views on the prohibition of use of force.	196
5.1.2.	Views in favour of an extensive interpretation of article 2(4).	197
5.2.	Humanitarian intervention and the use of force to put an end to genocide.	200
5.2.1.	Background and definition of humanitarian intervention	201
5.2.2.	Arguments of the proponents of humanitarian intervention in general	202
5.2.3.	Arguments of the opponents of humanitarian intervention in general	204
5.3.	Can the commission of genocide be an independent ground to trigger the use of force to comply with the obligation to prevent genocide by non-territorial states?	207
5.4.	Necessity: a circumstance precluding the wrongfulness of the use of force in case of genocide?	211

5.5.	Threshold needed for the use of force to end genocide under any of the discussed forms	214
5.6.	Preliminary conclusions	217
6.	The use of influence as means to prevent genocide at all levels.	218
6.1.	Definition of influence.	219
6.2.	The use of influence to prevent genocide	219
6.3.	Assessing the capacity to influence.	222
6.4.	Preliminary conclusions	223
7.	Coordination at all three levels of prevention in discharging the obligation of non-territorial states to prevent genocide	223
	Conclusion	226

Chapter VII.

The United Nations and the Obligation to Prevent Genocide Under International Law	229
---	-----

Introduction.	229
-----------------------	-----

1.	The obligation of the United Nations to prevent genocide	230
1.1.	Drafting history of article VIII and how it was interpreted later	230
1.2.	The legal basis for the UN obligation to prevent genocide.	232
1.2.1.	Does the UN obligation to prevent genocide derive from the Genocide Convention as a stand-alone legal basis or from general international law?	232
1.2.2.	The UN obligation to prevent genocide reinforced, enhanced, confirmed and enabled by the purposes and general competence of the United Nations enshrined in the Charter	234
1.3.	Is the obligation of the UN to prevent genocide triggered only if called upon by states?	238
1.4.	Preliminary conclusions	239
2.	The territorial scope of the obligation to prevent genocide by the UN	240
3.	The competence of organs of the United Nations to prevent genocide and when and how they can act.	241
3.1.	The Security Council.	242
3.1.1.	Does the Security Council have the competence to prevent genocide?	242
3.1.2.	When and how can the Security Council act to prevent genocide?	243
3.2.	The General Assembly	257
3.2.1.	Does the General Assembly have the competence to prevent genocide?	257
3.2.2.	When and how can the General Assembly act to prevent genocide?	258

3.3. The Secretariat.	265
3.3.1. Does the Secretariat have the competence to prevent genocide?	265
3.3.2. When and how the Secretariat can act to prevent genocide? . .	266
3.4. The Economic and Social Council (ECOSOC).	274
3.4.1. Does the Economic and Social Council have the competence to prevent genocide?	274
3.4.2. When and how the ECOSOC can act to prevent genocide? . .	275
3.5. The International Court of Justice.	281
3.5.1. The basis of the competence of the ICJ to address the prevention of genocide	281
3.5.2. When and how can the ICJ act to prevent genocide?	282
3.6. Preliminary conclusions	285
Conclusion	285
Chapter VIII.	
Prevention of Genocide and the Concept of the Responsibility to Protect	289
Introduction.	289
1. Background and evolution of the concept of the R2P.	289
2. Prevention of genocide by territorial states under the R2P	293
2.1. Prevention of genocide at the primary level under the R2P	293
2.2. Prevention of genocide at the secondary and tertiary levels under the R2P	297
2.3. Preliminary conclusions	298
3. Prevention of genocide by non-territorial states and by (or through) the United Nations under the R2P	299
3.1. Prevention of genocide at the primary level under the R2P	299
3.2. Prevention of genocide at the secondary level under the R2P	302
3.3. Prevention of genocide at the tertiary level under the R2P.	305
3.4. Preliminary conclusions	311
4. R2P and prevention of genocide: challenges ahead	311
Conclusion	314
Chapter IX.	
Summary and General Conclusions.	317
1. Summary.	317
2. Conclusions and recommendations: Towards a world without genocide? . .	320
<i>Bibliography</i>	325
<i>Samenvatting</i>	347
<i>Curriculum Vitae</i>	357

LIST OF ABBREVIATIONS

ARSIWA	Articles on the Responsibility of States for International Wrongful Acts
AU	African Union
CAT	Convention Against Torture
CDR	<i>Coalition pour la Défense de la République</i> (Coalition for the Defence of the Republic) (Rwanda)
DRC	Democratic Republic of Congo
e.g.	<i>Exempli gratia</i> (for example)
ECHR	European Convention of Human Rights
ECOSOC	Economic and Social Council
ECOWAS	Economic Community for West African States
ECtHR	European Court of Human Rights
Ed (s)	Editor (s)
<i>et al.</i>	<i>et alii/aliae</i> (and others)
<i>etc.</i>	<i>et cetera</i> (and so on)
EU	European Union
FAR	<i>Forces Armées Rwandaises</i> (Rwandese Armed Forces)
FPG	Fund for the Prevention of Genocide
FRY	Federal Republic of Yugoslavia
GA	General Assembly
HRC	Human Rights Council
<i>i.e.</i>	<i>id est</i> (that is)
IAEA	International Atomic Energy Agency
Ibid.	<i>Ibidem</i> (in the same place)
ICC	International Criminal Court
ICCPR	International Covenant on Civil and Political Rights
ICERD	International Convention on the Elimination of All Forms of Racial Discrimination
ICESCR	International Covenant on Economic, Social and Cultural Rights
ICISS	International Commission on Intervention and State Sovereignty
ICJ	International Court of Justice
ICTR	International Criminal Tribunal for Rwanda
ICTY	International Criminal Tribunal for the Former Yugoslavia
ILC	International Law Commission
IMTN	International Military Tribunal of Nuremberg
IPEP	International Panel of Eminent Personalities
M23	<i>Mouvement du 23 Mars</i> (Movement of the 23 rd March)
MRND	<i>Mouvement Républicain National pour le Développement</i> (National Republican Movement for the Development)

List of Abbreviations

NATO	North Atlantic Treaty Organisation
No	Number
OAU	Organisation of African Unity
OHCHR	Office of the United Nations High Commissioner for Human Rights
Op.cit.	<i>Opere citato</i> (in the work cited)
OPCAT	Optional Protocol to the Convention Against Torture
OPG	Organisation for the Prevention of Genocide
P(p).	Page (s)
Para(s)	Paragraph
R2P	Responsibility to Protect
Res.	Resolution
RPF	Rwandese Patriotic Front
RTLML	<i>Radio Television Libre des Mille Collines</i> (Independent Radio and Television of Mille Collines)
SC	Security Council
SG	Secretary-General
STL	Special Tribunal for Lebanon
UDHR	Universal Declaration of Human Rights
UK	United Kingdom
UN	United Nations
UNAMIR	United Nations Assistance Mission for Rwanda
UNEP	United Nations Environmental Program
UNGA	United Nations General Assembly
UNPREDEP	United Nations Preventive Deployment
UNPROFOR	United Nations Protection Force
UNSC	United Nations Security Council
UNSG	United Nations Secretary-General
US/USA	United States
USSR	Union of Soviet Socialist Republics
v.	<i>versus</i>
VCLT	Vienna Convention on the Law of Treaties
Vol.	Volume
WHO	World Health Organisation
WSOD	World Summit Outcome Document