EUROPEAN FAMILY LAW SERIES

Published by the Organising Committee of the Commission on European Family Law

Prof. Katharina Boele-Woelki (Utrecht)
Prof. Frédérique Ferrand (Lyon)
Prof. Cristina Gonzalez Beilfuss (Barcelona)
Prof. Maarit Jänterä-Jareborg (Uppsala)
Prof. Nigel Lowe (Cardiff)
Prof. Dieter Martiny (Frankfurt/Oder)
Ass. Prof. Velina Todorova (Plovdiv)
Children’s Rights in Intercountry Adoption. A European Perspective
Claire Fenton-Glynn

© 2014 Intersentia
Cambridge – Antwerp – Portland
www.intersentia.com | www.intersentia.co.uk

ISBN 978-1-78068-228-0
D/2014/7849/64
NUR 822


No part of this book may be reproduced in any form, by print, photoprint, microfilm or any other means, without written permission from the publisher.
To Dan and Catriona Simmonds
This book has developed from my doctoral thesis, completed at the University of Cambridge in 2013. During this time, I have benefited enormously from the advice, encouragement, comments and criticisms of many friends and colleagues, both on this manuscript, and in reaction to talks and papers that have been based on it.

In particular, I would like to express my gratitude to my doctoral supervisor, Dr Andrew Bainham, for his willingness to share his time and extensive expertise, and to Dr Jens Scherpe, for his advice and unwavering support in all aspects of academic life over the last four years. I would also like to thank Professor Jonathan Herring for his insightful comments and constructive discussions in examining the thesis.

The research in this book could not have been undertaken without invaluable assistance from many colleagues who helped me to find foreign texts or provided translations: Humberto Cantu Rivera, Tom Coppen, Philippe de Bonneval, Marco Devesas-Campos, Elena Kazamia, Demetrio Maltese, Nora Markard, Sergii Masol, Natasa Mavronicola, and Rumiana Yotova. Thank you for so generously sharing your knowledge and skills.

Finally, thanks must go to Shaun Berg, who gave me my first chance, and helped me to become the lawyer, academic and person I am today.
## CONTENTS

*Acknowledgements* ................................................................. vii
*Table of Cases* ................................................................. xiii

Chapter 1. Introduction ......................................................... 1

1.1. The Importance of Europe .................................................. 6
1.2. Structure of the Book ......................................................... 7

Chapter 2. Combating Abuses: International and Regional Regulation .... 11

2.2. Hague Convention on Protection of Children and Co-operation in Respect of Intercountry Adoption .......................... 16
2.3. Revised European Convention on the Adoption of Children 2008 ... 18
2.4. Proposing Normative Guidelines ........................................... 18


3.1. Subsidiarity in Practice: Waiting Periods and Necessary Conditions ... 22
3.2. Continuity of Culture, Language, Religion and Ethnicity ............ 30
3.3. The Place of Domestic Alternatives ....................................... 34
  3.3.1. Institutional Care: Can It Ever be Appropriate? .................. 35
  3.3.2. Foster Care: Alternative or Smoke-Screen? ....................... 41
3.4. Impact of Intercountry Adoption on the Domestic Child Welfare System ................................................................. 43
  3.4.1. Sending Countries ....................................................... 43
  3.4.2. Receiving Countries .................................................... 47
3.5. Conclusion ................................................................. 48

Chapter 4. Consenting Adults: Giving and Receiving Consent to Adoption 51

4.1. Consent by the Birth Mother ............................................... 53
  4.1.1. How Soon Is Too Soon? The Timing of a Mother’s Consent and its Revocation ................................................... 54
  4.1.2. Promoting Assistance during the Adoption Process ............. 60
  4.1.3. Conclusion ............................................................... 65
Chapter 8. Adoptive Parents: Eligibility, Preparation, and Support ...... 147

8.1. Adoptive Parents and the Rights of Children: Complementary or Contradictory? .................................................. 148
  8.1.1. Intercountry Adoption: An Emerging Market .................. 148
  8.1.2. A Right to a Child? .............................................. 151

8.2. Qualifications of Adoptive Parents ................................. 154
  8.2.1. International Instruments ....................................... 154
  8.2.2. The Age of Adopters: How Old Is Too Old? ................. 155
  8.2.3. Marital Status: Single Adoption .............................. 163
  8.2.4. Marital Status: Unmarried Couples .......................... 166
  8.2.5. Adoption by Same-Sex Couples: Changing Social Perceptions? 169
  8.2.6. Conclusion ....................................................... 172

8.3. Facilitating the Adoption: Counselling, Contact, Monitoring and Support .................................................... 172
  8.3.1. Counselling of Prospective Adoptive Parents .................. 173
  8.3.2. Establishing a Pre-Adoption Relationship ..................... 177
  8.3.3. Post-Adoption Services ......................................... 179

8.4. Conclusion ............................................................ 183


9.1. International Instruments ............................................. 185
  9.1.2. Hague Convention on Intercountry Adoption ............... 188
  9.1.3. Revised European Convention on the Adoption of Children 189

9.2. The Right to Access Information? .................................. 190
  9.2.1. Why Is Access to Information Important for a Child? ...... 190
  9.2.2. The Child’s Access to Information in Europe ................ 191

9.3. Secrecy and Birth Parents ............................................ 197
  9.3.1. Must Information Be Recorded? ............................... 197
  9.3.2. Balancing the Rights of Biological Parents and Children .. 207

9.4. Conclusion ............................................................ 210

Chapter 10. Conclusion ..................................................... 211

List of Legislation .......................................................... 217
Literature ................................................................. 223
Index ........................................................................ 247
# TABLE OF CASES

## EUROPEAN COMMISSION ON HUMAN RIGHTS

*Berrehab v the Netherlands* (Appl. No. 10730/84) Decision of 21 June 1988 ... 69  
*ED v Ireland* (Appl. No. 25054/94) Decision of 18 October 1995 ................. 33  
*MB v United Kingdom* (Appl. No. 22920/93) Decision of 6 April 1994 ........ 69  
*VS v Germany* (Appl. No. 4261/02) Admissibility Decision of 22 May 2007 ............................................................... 59  
*X v Belgium and the Netherlands* (Appl. No. 6482/74) Decision of 10 July 1975 ............................................................... 152, 165, 166  
*X v the Netherlands* (Appl. No. 8896/80) Decision of 10 March 1981 ............ 162  
*X v United Kingdom* (Appl. No. 7626/76) Decision of 11 July 1977 ............. 69

## EUROPEAN COURT OF HUMAN RIGHTS

*Airey v Ireland* (Appl. No. 6289/73) Judgment of 9 October 1979;  
[1979] ECHR 3 ................................................................. 114  
*Anayo v Germany* (Appl. No. 20578/07) Judgment of 21 December 2010;  
[2010] ECHR 393 ................................................................. 69  
*EB v France* (Appl. No. 43546/02) Judgment of 22 January 2008;  
[2008] ECHR 55 ................................................................. 162, 171  
*Evans v United Kingdom* (Appl. No. 6339/05) Judgment of 10 April 2008;  
[2007] ECHR 264 ................................................................. 151  
[2002] ECHR 156 ................................................................. 162, 171  
*Gas and Dubois v France* (Appl. No. 25951/07) Judgment of 15 March 2012 ................................................................. 168  
*Gaskin v United Kingdom* (Appl. No. 10454/83) Judgment of 7 July 1989;  
[1989] ECHR 13 ................................................................. 208  
*Godelli v Italy* (Appl. No. 33783/09) 25 September 2012 ................................ 209  
Children's Rights in Intercountry Adoption

[1996] ECHR 31

Kearns v France (Appl. No. 35991/04) Judgment of 10 January 2008;
[2008] ECHR 1

Keegan v Ireland (Appl. No. 16969/90) Judgment of 26 May 1994;
[1994] ECHR 18

Kutscher v Germany (Appl. No. 46544/99) Judgment of 26 February 2002;
[2002] ECHR 160

Marckx v Belgium (Appl. No. 6833/74) Judgment of 13 June 1979;
[1979] ECHR 2

McMichael v United Kingdom (Appl. No. 16424/90) Judgment of 24 February 1995;
[1995] ECHR 8

Neulinger and Shuruk v Switzerland (Appl. No. 41615/07) Judgement of 6 July 2010;
[2010] ECHR 1053

Nielsen v Denmark (Appl. No. 10929/84) Judgment of 28 November 1988;
[1988] ECHR 23

[2003] ECHR 86

[1992] ECHR 8

P, C and S v the United Kingdom (Appl. No. 56547/00) Judgment of 16 July 2002;
[2002] ECHR 604

Pini and Others v Romania (Appl. No. 78028/01) Judgment of 22 June 2004;
[2005] ECHR 275

R and H v United Kingdom (Appl. No. 35348/06) Judgment of 31 May 2011;
[2011] ECHR 844

[2013] ECHR 199

Rozanski v Poland (Appl. No. 55339/00) Judgment of 18 May 2006;
[2006] ECHR 545

Sahin v Germany (Appl. No. 19301/92) Judgment of 10 April 2001;
[2001] ECHR 266

Saviny v Ukraine (Appl. No. 39948/06) Judgment of 18 December 2008

Schneider v Germany (Appl. No. 17080/07) Judgment of 15 September 2011;
[2011] ECHR 2416

T v United Kingdom (Appl. No. 24724/94) Judgment of 16 December 1999;
[1999] ECHR 170

Todorova v Italy (Appl. No. 33932/06) Judgment of 13 January 2009;
[2009] ECHR 69

V v United Kingdom (Appl. No. 9749/82) Judgment of 8 July 1987;
[1987] ECHR 17

Wagner and JMWL v Luxembourg (Appl. No. 76240/01) Judgment of 28 June 2007;
Walbova and Walla v Czech Republic (Appl. No. 23848/04) Judgment of
26 October 2006 ................................................................. 88
X and Others v Austria (Appl. No. 19010/07) Judgment of 19 February
2013; [2013] ECHR 148. ....................................................... 168, 170
641. .................................................................................. 64
X, Y and Z v United Kingdom (Appl. No. 21830/93) Judgment of 22 April
1997; [1997] ECHR 20 ............................................................ 143
Zaunegger v Germany (Appl. No. 22028/04) Judgment of 3 December

FRANCE

Enfance et Familles v F et A, Court of Appeal of Riom, 16 December 1997
(1998) JCP II 10147. ............................................................... 200
TGI La Roche-sur-Yon (29 July 1993) BICC 1 March 1994, No 302 .......... 143

NETHERLANDS

Valkenhorst II (HR 15 April 1994) NJ 1994 ........................................ 194

NEW ZEALAND


SPAIN

Recurso de Casacion num. 2854/1994, Sentencia del TS de 21 septiembre
1999 ................................................................. 200

UNITED KINGDOM

A Local Authority v GC [2009] 1 FLR 299 ........................................ 57
Birmingham City Council v S [2006] EWHC 3065 (Fam); [2007] 1 FLR
1223 ................................................................................. 66
Flintshire County Council v K [2001] 2 FLR 476 ................................ 81
M (A Minor) [1997] EWCA Civ 2766 ........................................ 41