THE LEGAL STATUS
OF TRANSSEXUAL AND
TRANSGENDER PERSONS

Edited by
Jens M. SCHERPE

intersentia
Cambridge – Antwerp – Portland
In memory of
Owen Jessep
PREFACE

This book is the result of a research project conducted under the auspices of the Centre for Medical Ethics and Law (CMEL) of the University of Hong Kong, which involved a major international conference on 6 and 7 September 2013 at the University of Hong Kong. It was conceived and planned during my CSAH/CSHSS Early Career Fellowship at the Centre for Research in the Arts, Social Sciences and Humanities (CRASSH), and I am very grateful to the Centre for providing me with the opportunities to work on and discuss my ideas at a very early stage with colleagues from a great number of disciplines. I am equally grateful to my referees for my application for this fellowship, Prof. John Bell (Faculty of Law, University of Cambridge) and Dr Jude Browne (The Jessica and Peter Frankopan Director of the University of Cambridge Centre for Gender Studies), not only for their references but also their continuing support. The project also built on a previous event, the Symposium ‘Challenging Gender, Gender Challenges’, held as the St John’s College Martin Lectures at the University of Hong Kong on 11 December 2010 and very generously supported by St John’s College/University of Hong Kong and particularly the Master of the College, Rev. Dr Eric Chong.

The support the project has received in Hong Kong was overwhelming, and I would like to thank (in no particular order) Prof. Scott Veitch, Prof. Philip Beh, Prof. Johannes Chan, Prof. Marco Wan (all of the University of Hong Kong), Dr Chih-hsing Ho (now at the Academia Sinica, Taiwan), Dr Anthony Ng (Wyng Foundation), Michael Vidler (Vidler & Co), Rev. Dr Eric Chong (Master of St. John’s College/University of Hong Kong), the students of the 2013 ‘Comparative Family Law’ class at the University of Hong Kong, Earl Deng (barrister-at-law, Chambers of Denis Chang QC SC), Marco Chan, Au Yun Ling, and particularly Polly Yiu who at the time was the administrator of the Centre for Medical Ethics and Law (CMEL) and who managed the conference with all its difficulties with almost superhuman efficiency.

I would also like to thank the chairpersons of the conference panels Dr Albert Yuen, Michael Vidler, Dr Keith Hotten, Dr York Chow (in his capacity as the chairperson of the Equal Opportunities Commission), Tim Amos QC, The Honourable Anna Wu and Dr Margaret Ng for their excellent work in ensuring that the speakers stuck to their allocated time and for leading the extremely interesting discussions with the audience.

Massive thanks are also owed to all contributors for their patience – finalising this project, for a number of reasons, took much longer than expected – not least because the laws in this area are in a state of flux and I endeavoured to have the
book be as up-to-date as possible. That is why reports on Denmark, Argentina and Taiwan were added at a later stage.

The Isaac Newton Trust and Philomathia Social Sciences Research Programme awarded grants which were essential in paying for the required editorial assistance. The editing was undertaken by Peter Dunne, who I first met when he was an LLM student at the University of Cambridge and who currently is writing his PhD at Trinity College Dublin on 'The Legal Recognition of Gender Identity: A Human Rights Model'. There could not have been a person on this planet more suited to providing the editorial assistance for this project, and I am extremely grateful for Peter's hard work. However, Peter soon provided much more for this project, and in our discussions of the chapters and the editing his vast expertise in the field was absolutely invaluable. Therefore it was only a logical step for me to ask him to become the co-author of the final chapter. I was delighted that he accepted, and the co-authorship proved to be enormously fruitful and I truly enjoyed our many – very detailed – discussions about the issues.

The publisher, Intersentia, of course is the world’s leading publishing house for comparative family law, and I was delighted when Hans Kluwer (despite initial scepticism!) agreed to publish the book and would like to thank him for being willing to take the risk. At Intersentia’s Cambridge office the book project was managed perfectly by Ann-Christin Maak-Scherpe and Rebecca Pound, and I am particularly grateful for their tolerance and understanding when the project was delayed several times.

On a personal level this project was a difficult one in many ways. One of them was that I was subjected to verbal abuse by a significant number of people merely because I was undertaking this project. The abuse ranged from simple insults to more serious ones but also included threats to me personally. On the other hand I have also received many very personal and very supportive letters and emails (for which I am very grateful and would like to thank the writers again). But these reactions just confirmed that the discussions contained in this book are of great importance, and certainly not only for the persons concerned but for societies as a whole, and that made me even more determined to get this book published. I sincerely hope that the present book will make a positive contribution to the discussions on this issue around the globe, and hopefully a contribution to improve the lives of those directly concerned.

Jens M. Scherpe
Cambridge, 15 October 2015

1 I would also like to use this opportunity to mention and recommend a non-academic publication on transgender issues – indeed a children’s book: ‘Introducing Teddy’, written by Jessica Walton and illustrated by Dougal MacPherson (self-published in 2015, and to be published by Bloomsbury in 2016).
CONTENTS

Preface ................................................................. vii
List of Contributors ................................................ xiii

Introduction
  Jens M. Scherpe ................................................... 1

PART I. MEDICAL/PSYCHOLOGICAL VIEWS .................... 9

Transgenderism and Transsexuality: Medical and Psychological Viewpoints
  Friedemann Pfäfflin ............................................ 11

PART II. CHRISTIAN VIEWS .................................. 25

Transgenderism and the Christian Church: An Overview
  Duncan Dormor .................................................. 27

Metamorphosis and (Trans) Migrations: Spiritual Dimensions of Gender Transition
  Christina Beardsley ......................................... 77

PART III. LEGAL VIEWS ..................................... 101

Questionnaire ....................................................... 103

Europe ............................................................... 107

Belgium and the Netherlands
  Walter Pintens .................................................. 109

Czech Republic
  Barbara Havelková ........................................... 125

Denmark
  Natalie Videbæk Munkholm .................................. 147

Intersentia ix
Contents

England and Wales
  Stephen Gilmore ................................................... 183

Germany
  Anatol Dutta ....................................................... 207

Ireland
  Brian Sloan ........................................................ 223

Italy
  Maria Giovanna Cubeddu Wiedemann ............................... 249

Spain
  Josep Ferrer Riba and Albert Lamarca Marquès ................. 261

Sweden
  Jameson Garland .................................................. 281

Turkey
  Yeşim M. Atamer .................................................. 313

Asia ................................................................. 333

Hong Kong Special Administrative Region
  Athena Nga-chee Liu ................................................ 335

Japan
  Yuko Nishitani ..................................................... 363

Singapore
  Terry Sheung-Hung Kaan ........................................... 391

Taiwan
  Chih-hsing Ho .................................................... 425

Australia and New Zealand .......................................... 441

Varieties of Decision-Making: Reflections on Deciding Re Kevin
  Richard Chisholm .................................................. 443

Australia
  Rachael Wallbank .................................................. 457
New Zealand
   Elisabeth MCDONALD and Jack BYRNE 527

North and South America 569

Argentina
   Laura María GIOSA, María Victoria SCHIRO and Peter DUNNE 571

USA
   Jameson GARLAND 585

PART IV. CONCLUSION 613

Comparative Analysis and Recommendations
   Jens M. SCHERPE and Peter DUNNE 615
LIST OF CONTRIBUTORS

Yeşim M. Atamer
Istanbul Bilgi University, Turkey

Christina Beardsley
Chelsea & Westminster Hospital, London and St Mary’s University, Twickenham, London, England

Jack Byrne
Consultant, TransAction, Auckland, New Zealand

Richard Chisholm
ANU College of Law, Australia; formerly a Judge of the Family Court of Australia

Maria Giovanna Cubeddu Wiedemann
University of Trieste, Italy

Duncan Dormor
University of Cambridge, England

Peter Dunne
Trinity College Dublin, Ireland

Anatol Dutta
University of Regensburg, Germany

Josep Ferrer Riba
Universitat Pompeu Fabra, Barcelona, Spain

Jameson Garland
Uppsala University, Sweden

Stephen Gilmore
King’s College London, England

Laura María Giosa
Universidad Nacional de Centro de la Provincia de Buenos Aires, Argentina
List of Contributors

Barbara Havelková  
University of Oxford, England

Chih-hsing Ho  
Academia Sinica, Taipei, Taiwan

Terry Sheung-Hung Kaan  
University of Hong Kong, Hong Kong

Albert Lamarca Marquès  
Universitat Pompeu Fabra, Barcelona, Spain

Athena Liu  
University of Hong Kong, Hong Kong

Elisabeth McDonald  
Victoria University of Wellington, New Zealand

Natalie Videbæk Munkholm  
Aarhus University, Denmark

Yuko Nishitani  
Kyoto University, Japan

Friedemann Pfäfflin  
Ulm University, Germany

Walter Pintens  
University of Louvain, Belgium, and Saarland University, Germany

Jens M. Scherpe  
University of Cambridge, England, and University of Hong Kong, Hong Kong

Maria Victoria Schiro  
Universidad Nacional de Centro de la Provincia de Buenos Aires, Argentina

Brian Sloan  
University of Cambridge, England

Rachael Wallbank  
Accredited Specialist Family Law Practitioner (LSNSW) and Principal of Wallbanks Legal, Australia