

Successive and Additional Measures to the TRC
Amnesty Scheme in South Africa:
Prosecutions and Presidential Pardons

SCHOOL OF HUMAN RIGHTS RESEARCH SERIES, VOLUME 57.

The titles published in this series are listed at the end of this volume.

Successive and Additional Measures to the TRC
Amnesty Scheme in South Africa:
Prosecutions and Presidential Pardons

Hendrik J. Lubbe



Cambridge – Antwerp – Portland

Intersentia Ltd
Trinity House | Cambridge Business Park | Cowley Road
Cambridge | CB4 0WZ | United Kingdom
Tel.: +44 1223 393 753 | mail@intersentia.co.uk

Hendrik J. Lubbe
Successive and Additional Measures to the TRC Amnesty Scheme in South Africa:
Prosecutions and Presidential Pardons

This volume is an adapted version of a thesis defended at Tilburg University on
13 December 2010.

This research has been made possible by the Law School of Tilburg University.

Cover image © The Nelson Mandela Capture Site

Photo taken by Jonathan Burton - themidlandsphotographer.weekly.com

This structure was designed by Marco Cianfanelli and comprises 50 poles, each
between 5 and 10 metres high. At a distance of 35 metres, a portrait of Mandela
comes into focus. This monument marks 50 years since Mandela was arrested just
outside Howick, on 5 August 1962.

ISBN 978-1-78068-116-0
D/2012/7849/90
NUR 828

© 2012 Intersentia
www.intersentia.com, www.intersentia.co.uk

British Library Cataloguing in Publication Data. A catalogue record for this book is
available from the British Library.

No part of this book may be reproduced in any form, by print, photocopy, microfilm or any
other means, without written permission from the publishers.

To Professor Willem van Genugten

PREFACE

The question of how societies in transition should respond to systematic or widespread violations of human rights, seeking recognition for victims and promoting possibilities for peace, reconciliation and democracy in the context of transitional justice has received renewed interest. Over time, the experiences in various societies undergoing major transformation have expanded and diversified the discipline, which will continue to develop, because each society has its own unique context and circumstances to which this flexible discipline can adapt by involving a combination of complementary judicial and non-judicial strategies.

The process of transformation, reconciliation, development and reconstruction of South African society had not been finalised when the TRC and the Amnesty Committee reached the end of their mandates in 1998 and 2003 respectively. It is therefore imperative that all initiatives post-TRC should be approached in such a manner that they complement and build upon the work of the TRC, and it is therefore necessary, as this book aims to do, to encourage and contribute to the debates on the little progress South Africa has made pertaining to successive measures in the form of post-TRC prosecutions, and on the implementation of controversial additional measures in the form of Presidential pardons in the aftermath of the TRC's amnesty scheme, by investigating, analysing and critically evaluating the manner in which it has unfolded.

The question of prosecuting *apartheid*-era crimes is politically loaded, according to critics, as some believe that prosecutions are necessary to conclude the TRC process while others feel they could prevent reconciliation. Similarly, Presidential pardons are regarded by some as necessary to accommodate those convicted of *apartheid*-era crimes who for various reasons did not participate in the TRC, and are regarded by others as inappropriate, unconstitutional and not in accordance with international law.

Clearly these issues are controversial, a fact which gives rise to the formation of diverse opinions about them. More important is the fact that future societies in transition could benefit from a consideration of South Africa's achievements and shortcomings and the challenges it currently faces. How this matter unfolds is therefore of particular interest to the international community, since societies' choices of ways in which to deal with past abuses are more likely to be effective if they are based on a serious examination of other societies' experiences as they emerged from a period of abuse. This may reduce the likelihood of repeating avoidable errors – errors that transitional societies can hardly afford to make.

CONTENTS

Preface	vii
Acknowledgements	xiii
List of abbreviations	xv
CHAPTER 1 INTRODUCTION	
1 Contextual background	1
2 Relevance of the book	6
3 Objective of the book	6
4 Scope and limitations of the book	7
5 Research methodology	8
6 Outline and overview of chapters	9
7 Note on citations	11
CHAPTER 2 THE DILEMMA OF HOW TO DEAL WITH CRIMES COMMITTED BY THE OFFICIALS AND AGENTS OF A PREDECESSOR REPRESSIVE REGIME AND ITS OPPOSITION	
1 Introduction	13
2 Transitional justice: Dealing with crimes of the past	15
2.1 Initial measures	18
2.1.1 Prosecutions	18
2.1.2 Truth commissions	18
2.1.3 Prosecutions and truth commissions pursued simultaneously	22
2.2 Successive and additional measures	24
3 The international position on prosecutions and truth commissions: A South African perspective	25
3.1 Initial measures: International law duties to prosecute versus the TRC's amnesty scheme	25
3.1.1 The law of treaties	28
3.1.2 Customary international law	30
3.1.3 Does a duty to prosecute rule out amnesty?	31
3.2 Theoretical developments of the relationship between amnesty and prosecutions	32

3.3	The relevance of initial considerations for successive and additional measures	35
4	Countries that employed truth commissions	36
4.1	General	36
4.2	South Africa	36
4.2.1	The Truth and Reconciliation Commission	36
4.2.2	AZAPO v President of the Republic of South Africa 1996 4 SA 671 (CC)	37
5	Countries that employed successive and/or additional measures to a truth commission	38
5.1	General	40
5.2	South Africa	40
5.2.1	Introduction	40
5.2.2	Prosecutions	44
5.2.3	Further amnesty and Presidential pardons	47
6	Conclusion	51

**CHAPTER 3 A DECADE AFTER THE TRC IN SOUTH AFRICA:
THE NATIONAL PROSECUTING POLICY RELATING TO POST-
TRC PROSECUTIONS**

1	Introduction	57
2	The process followed in amending the National Prosecuting Policy	57
3	The policy amendments	60
3.1	Part A: Introduction	61
3.2	Part B: Procedural arrangements	63
3.3	Part C: Criteria governing the decision to prosecute	65
4	Challenge on the validity of the policy amendments: The <i>Nkadimeng</i> challenge	66
4.1	Background	66
4.2	Introduction	66
4.3	The plain meaning of the policy amendments	69
4.4	An “effective” immunity?	70
4.5	Legal challenges	71
4.5.1	The rule of law and separation of powers	71
4.5.2	The Bill of Rights	73
4.5.3	Administrative law	78
4.5.4	International law	85
4.5.5	Regional human rights instruments	93
4.5.6	Foreign law	96
4.6	The court’s decision and the effect thereof	97
5	Conclusion	99

CHAPTER 4 SUBSTANTIAL AND PROCEDURAL ISSUES RELATING TO POST-TRC PROSECUTIONS AND APPROPRIATE SENTENCING	
1	Introduction 103
2	Crimes in question 104
3	“Classes” of offenders of “ <i>gross human rights violations</i> ” that should be investigated and possibly prosecuted 106
4	Obstacles in the way of successful prosecutions 112
4.1	Organisational and financial constraints of the NPA 113
4.1.1	Organisational constraints 113
4.1.2	Financial constraints 113
4.2	Evidentiary constraints 115
4.2.1	The relationship and cooperation between the NPA, SAPS and the Hawks 116
4.2.2	The availability and reliability of witnesses and evidentiary material 117
4.2.3	Section 31(3) of the PNURA 120
4.2.4	Plea and sentence agreements 125
4.2.5	Indemnity agreements 134
5	Sentencing 139
5.1	The CSVR’s Alternative Prosecution Policy Framework 139
5.2	Judicial recognition of restorative justice 142
6	Conclusion 147
CHAPTER 5 THE SPECIAL DISPENSATION ON PRESIDENTIAL PARDONS	
1	Introduction 151
2	Challenge on the constitutionality of the Special Pardons Process 154
2.1	The scope of the Special Pardons Process 155
2.2	Objections to the Special Pardons Process 156
2.3	Legal challenges 166
2.3.1	Administrative action and the common law duty to act fairly 168
2.3.2	Rule of law 177
2.3.3	Bill of Rights 179
2.3.4	International law 182
2.4	The court’s decision and the effect thereof 183
3	The <i>Chonco</i> -case 184
4	The <i>Albutt</i> -case 186
5	Recent developments 188

Contents

6	Presidential pardons in Argentina	189
6.1	Background	189
6.2	Scrutiny of Presidential pardons: Argentina and South Africa	190
6.2.1	Argentina	190
6.2.2	South Africa	192
7	Conclusion	195
 CHAPTER 6 CONCLUSION		
1	Synopsis of findings and recommendations	199
2	The way forward	204
3	Concluding remarks	204
	Summary	207
	Bibliography	211
	Cirriculum Vitae	233
	School of Human Rights Research Series	235

ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

First and foremost I would like to extend my sincerest gratitude to Professor Willem van Genugten. Our paths crossed in 2007 on his annual visit to the North-West University, Potchefstroom Campus, in South Africa (NWU). At the time I had finalised my research proposal, in which he showed significant interest. He immediately offered to become part of my study and ever since he has been a valuable source of knowledge, guidance, motivation and inspiration. I dedicate this book to him as a token of my appreciation for the opportunity and his belief in me. My other two promoters, Professors Gerrit Ferreira and Marc Groenhuijsen, also deserve special mention. Thank you for your guidance, support and valuable input.

I am grateful to Tilburg University (UVT), the Dean of the Law Faculty and the Department of European and Public International Law, for accepting me as a Ph.D candidate as well as for the generous support which enabled me to broaden my horizons. I am extremely proud of my association with UVT. Not only was I inspired to reach my full potential, but I was also empowered to do so. This privilege has undoubtedly made a positive contribution to my professional and personal development.

I am indebted to the NWU and its Law Faculty, which I had the benefit of using as my base. I am particularly thankful for the pleasant working environment and the platform it provided, and especially for the generous support.

I am grateful to the following institutions for their open-handed financial support: Leids Universiteits Fonds and in particular the Herman J Coster Fonds, Stichting Neerlandia, Van Ewijk-Stigting, Nederlands-Zuid-Afrikaanse Vereniging (NZAV) and especially the Stichting Studiefonds.

Thank you to Ms. Femke Bijleveld and Ms. Sietske Trommelen from UVT for all their administrative assistance, Ms. Petra Gainsford, Ms. Danelle Kamffer and Ms. Chandré Anne Botha for their diligence and perseverance in formatting the text, Prof. Alan Brimer for his accurate language editing and Ms. An Vermaercke and Mr. Tom Scheirs from Intersentia for their assistance and support in the process of publishing this book.

I would like to sincerely thank my mother, my partner and friends for their unconditional love and support. Lastly, a special thank you goes to the Van Raaijs in The Hague who, over the years, became my Dutch family. They opened their hearts and home to me and without their support this journey would not have been as easy.

The Hague, September 2012

LIST OF ABBREVIATIONS

ANC	African National Congress
AWB	<i>Afrikaner Weerstandsbeweging</i>
AZAPO	Azanian Peoples Organisation
CARA	Criminal Assets Recovery Account
CAT	UN Committee Against Torture
CCRC	Criminal Cases Review Commission
CPA	<i>Criminal Procedure Act 51 of 1977</i>
CSVR	Centre for the Study of Violence and Reconciliation
DOJ&CD	Department of Justice & Constitutional Development
DPP	Director of Public Prosecutions
ECHR	European Commission on Human Rights
HRC	Human Rights Committee
ICC	International Criminal Court
ICCPR	<i>International Covenant on Civil and Political Rights</i>
ICTJ	International Center for Transitional Justice
ICTR	International Criminal Tribunal for Rwanda
ICTY	International Criminal Tribunal for the Former Yugoslavia
IFP	<i>Inkatha</i> Freedom Party
KZN	<i>KwaZulu-Natal</i>
MK	<i>Umkhonto we Sizwe</i> (Spear of the Nation)
NDPP	National Director of Public Prosecutions
NGO	Non-Governmental Organisation
NIA	National Intelligence Agency
NICRO	The National Institute for Crime Prevention and the Reintegration of Offenders
NP	National Party
NPA	National Prosecuting Authority
PAC	Pan Africanist Congress
PAJA	<i>Promotion of Administration of Justice Act 3 of 2000</i>
PCLU	Priority Crimes Litigation Unit
PNURA	<i>Promotion of National Unity and Reconciliation Act 34 of 1995</i>
SAPS	South African Police Services
ToR	Terms of Reference
TRC	Truth and Reconciliation Commission
UN	United Nations
UNCHR	United Nations Commission on Human Rights

