PATENTS AS PROTECTION OF TRADITIONAL MEDICAL KNOWLEDGE?
European Studies in Law and Economics Series

2. Behavioural Economics in Consumer Policy, Hanneke Luth
4. Competition and Innovation in the EU Regulation of Pharmaceuticals: The Case of Parallel Trade, Claudia Desogus
5. The Law and Economics of Organ Procurement, Firat Bilgel
6. Law and Economics in the RIA World: Improving the use of economic analysis in public policy and legislation, Andrea Renda
7. Regulatory Competition in European Corporate and Capital Market Law, Lars Hornuf
8. Economic Criteria for Criminalization: Optimizing Enforcement in Case of Environmental Violations, Katarina Svatikova
PATENTS AS PROTECTION OF TRADITIONAL MEDICAL KNOWLEDGE?

A Law and Economics Analysis

Petra Ebermann
ACKNOWLEDGMENTS

This book was in large parts written while I was a research assistant at the Institute of Law and Economics at the University of Hamburg. A number of people have contributed to the final success of this project and I want to take the opportunity to thank them.

First of all, I am especially grateful to my supervisor Thomas Eger for his time, helpful comments and advice and likewise to Hans-Bernd Schäfer who kindly agreed to act as second reviewer and handled the review process very efficiently whilst offering appropriate critique. My colleagues at the Institute were supportive at all times and provided well appreciated comments and inspiration. Amongst them, I would like to mention Katharina Greczszuk and Katherine Walker explicitly who have also become good friends of mine during this time. I wish to thank the editors of the scientific series ‘European Studies in Law and Economics’ for giving me the opportunity to publish this book in this series: Michael G. Faure, Luigi A. Franzoni and Patrick C. Leyens. I thank the Max Planck Institute of Intellectual Property and Competition Law in Munich for allowing me to conduct parts of my research at their library. I am especially indebted to Inga Ebermann and Tanja Friedrich for their active support, valuable comments and advice and Gabor Gottlieb and Paul Stange for providing practical and technical support at all times.

Most importantly, I want to take the opportunity to thank my parents, my sister (once more) and Patrick Hauser for their support, patience, kindness and constant encouragement.
CONTENTS

Acknowledgments .................................................................................. v

Introduction .......................................................................................... 1

PART 1.
TRADITIONAL MEDICAL KNOWLEDGE, BIOLOGICAL DIVERSITY
AND INTELLECTUAL PROPERTY RIGHTS ........................................... 9

Chapter 1.
The Concept of Traditional Medical Knowledge and the Impact of
Biotechnology ....................................................................................... 11

1.1. A Definition of Traditional Medical Knowledge ......................... 11
  1.1.1. Traditional and Indigenous Knowledge ................................. 11
  1.1.2. Traditional Medical Knowledge ........................................... 13
  1.1.3. General Characteristics of Traditional Medical Knowledge ...... 14
    1.1.3.1. Traditional Knowledge Holders ..................................... 15
    1.1.3.2. Creation and Preservation ............................................. 15
    1.1.3.3. Ownership ................................................................. 15

1.2. The Role of Natural Resources in Pharmaceutical R&D ............. 16

1.2.1. Overview .............................................................................. 16

1.2.2. Pharmaceutical Biotechnology .............................................. 17

1.2.3. Bioprospecting Research Project .......................................... 19

1.3. The Value of Pharmaceutical Biotechnology and Traditional Medical
Knowledge ......................................................................................... 21

1.3.1. The Value of Pharmaceutical Biotechnological R&D ............ 21

1.3.2. The Value of Traditional Medical Knowledge ........................ 22

Chapter 2.
The Convention on Biological Diversity .................................................. 25

2.1. Biological Diversity ...................................................................... 25

2.1.1. Loss of Biodiversity ............................................................ 25

2.1.2. Consequences of Biodiversity Loss ..................................... 26

2.2. Main Objectives of the CBD ....................................................... 27

2.2.1. Conservation and Sustainable Use ....................................... 28
Contents

2.2.2. Access to Biological Resources and Benefit Sharing .......... 30
   2.2.2.1. National Sovereignty ........................................ 31
   2.2.2.2. The Tragedy of the Commons .............................. 32
   2.2.2.3. The Role of Property Rights in Access and
             Benefit-Sharing Regulation .............................. 33
2.3. Article 8 (j) CBD .................................................. 35
   2.3.1. The Elements of Traditional Knowledge Protection ............ 35
   2.3.2. Relationship with the Objectives ................................ 35
   2.3.3. Form of Protection ............................................. 37
       2.3.3.1. Protection by Intellectual Property Rights .............. 37
       2.3.3.2. Positive and Negative Approaches to Protection ........ 38

Chapter 3.
Trade-Related Intellectual Property Rights and Traditional Medical
Knowledge ................................................................. 39

3.1. The TRIPS Agreement ............................................. 39
   3.1.1. Introduction ..................................................... 40
       3.1.1.1. The International Legal Developments .................... 40
       3.1.1.2. The Economic Rationale of Intellectual Property
                  Protection ................................................ 41
   3.1.2. Objectives of the TRIPS Agreement ............................ 43
       3.1.2.1. Promotion of Free Trade .................................. 44
       3.1.2.2. Promotion of Economic Development ...................... 45
       3.1.2.3. Intellectual Property Rights and Developing
                  Countries .................................................. 47
   3.1.3. General Principles of Non-Discrimination ...................... 52
       3.1.3.1. National Treatment ......................................... 52
       3.1.3.2. Most-Favoured-Nation Clause ............................ 52
3.2. The International Legal and Economic Framework of Patents ........ 53
   3.2.1. Historical Development of Today’s Patent Laws ............... 54
   3.2.2. Overview on TRIPS Rules on Patents ........................... 54
       3.2.2.1. Patentable Subject Matter ................................. 55
       3.2.2.2. Rules on Biotechnological Inventions and Biological
                 Resources .................................................. 56
       3.2.2.3. Disclosure ................................................ 57
       3.2.3. The Economic Underlyings of Patenting ..................... 57
           3.2.3.1. The Incentive-to-Invent Theory ....................... 57
           3.2.3.2. Patent Scope ......................................... 59
3.3. The Interaction Between Traditional Medical Knowledge, the TRIPS
     Agreement and the CBD ............................................. 61
   3.3.1. Traditional Knowledge in the TRIPS Context .................. 61
   3.3.2. Intellectual Property Rights and the CBD ..................... 62
3.3.2.1. Article 8 (j) CBD – Preservation of and Respect for the Knowledge, Innovations and Practices of Traditional Communities ........................................... 62
3.3.2.2. Conservation and Sustainable Use of Biodiversity ................. 63
3.3.2.3. Article 15 CBD – Access to Genetic Resources and Fair and Equitable Benefit Sharing ......................................................... 63
3.3.2.4. Article 16 CBD – Access to and Transfer of Technology ..................... 63
3.4. Summary of the Main Results of Part 1 ........................................... 64

PART 2.
THE STATUS QUO – PROTECTION OF TRADITIONAL MEDICAL KNOWLEDGE AND BIOTECHNOLOGICAL INVENTIONS UNDER CURRENT PATENT LAW ........................................... 67

Chapter 1.
Patentability Criteria in the US and the EU ......................................... 71
1.1. Legal Foundations for (Biotechnological) Patents in the US and the EU .................................................................................... 72
1.1.1. Sources of US Patent Law ....................................................... 72
1.1.1.1. The Constitution .......................................................... 72
1.1.1.2. Federal Statutes and Regulations .................................... 72
1.1.1.3. Case Law ................................................................. 73
1.1.2. European Patent Law ......................................................... 74
1.1.2.1. The European Patent Convention .................................... 74
1.1.2.2. The Biotechnology Directive ........................................... 75
1.1.2.3. National Laws and Court Decisions .................................. 76
1.2. Substantive Patent Requirements ................................................. 76
1.2.1. Products of Nature ............................................................ 76
1.2.1.1. US Patent Law ......................................................... 77
1.2.1.2. European Patent Law .................................................. 79
1.2.2. Novelty .............................................................................. 82
1.2.2.1. The State of the Art in US Patent Law ......................... 82
1.2.2.2. The European Approach to Novelty ................................ 84
1.2.3. Inventive Step and Non-Obviousness ..................................... 85
1.2.3.1. US Patent Law – Non-Obviousness ................................ 86
1.2.3.2. European Patent Law – Inventive Step ............................ 89
1.2.4. Utility and Industrial Application .......................................... 91
1.2.4.1. US – Utility ............................................................ 91
1.2.4.2. EU – Industrial Application ......................................... 93
1.3. Specification ............................................................................ 94
1.3.1. Disclosure of the Invention ............................................... 94

Intersentia ix
Chapter 2.
Biotechnological Patents on Pharmaceutical Drugs Developed in Bioprospecting Research Projects ................................. 101

2.1. The Patentability of Biotechnological Inventions Using Traditional Medical Knowledge .............................................. 101
  2.1.1. Natural Products Doctrine .................................................. 101
  2.1.2. Traditional Medical Knowledge as Invalidating Prior Art ..... 102
    2.1.2.1. The Neem Patents .................................................... 103
    2.1.2.2. Analysis of the Prior Art Assessment in the Neem Proceedings .................................................... 104
    2.1.2.3. The Standard of Disclosure ........................................ 105
  2.1.3. Non-Obviousness in Bioprospecting Research Projects ...... 106
    2.1.3.1. US Patent Law: The Standard of Non-Obviousness in the Aftermath of KSR .............................................. 107
    2.1.3.2. The Inventive Step Requirement in Europe: Neem and Hoodia .............................................................. 109
  2.2. Analysis of the Results ........................................................ 112
    2.2.1. The Importance of Patents for Pharmaceutical R&D .......... 112
    2.2.2. The Predictability of the Outcomes of Patent Proceedings ... 114

Chapter 3.
The Rights of the Providers of Traditional Medical Knowledge ........ 117

3.1. The Patentability of Traditional Medical Knowledge ................ 117
  3.1.1. Products of Nature ......................................................... 117
  3.1.2. Novelty and Non-Obviousness .......................................... 118
  3.1.3. Formal Requirements ..................................................... 120
  3.2. The Owner of the Patent: The Concept of Joint Inventorship .... 120
    3.2.1. Legal Definition of Joint Inventorship .............................. 121
      3.2.1.1. Requirements for Joint Inventorship in US Patent Law ................. 121
      3.2.1.2. Joint Inventorship Under the EPC .................................. 122
    3.2.2. Joint Inventorship of Traditional Knowledge Groups and Pharmaceutical Companies ............................... 124
  3.3. Analysis of the Results ..................................................... 127
    3.3.1. The Public Good Problem .............................................. 127
PART 3.
PROTECTING AND REWARDING TRADITIONAL MEDICAL
KNOWLEDGE CONTRIBUTIONS UNDER PROPERTY AND
LIABILITY REGIMES ......................................................... 135

Chapter 1.
The Property Rights-based Approach to Protection .......................... 139

1.1. The Construction of Traditional Knowledge Rights ......................... 139
  1.1.1. Novel Interpretation of Existing Norms ................................ 139
    1.1.1.1. Invention .................................................. 140
    1.1.1.2. Novelty and Inventive Step ............................... 140
  1.1.2. Sui Generis Systems – Definition of New Rights for Indigenous
         Peoples .......................................................... 141

1.2. Implementation of Article 8 (j) CBD Through Traditional Knowledge
    Rights ................................................................. 144
  1.2.1. Interpretation and Infringement .................................... 144
    1.2.1.1. Literal Infringement .................................... 145
    1.2.1.2. The Doctrine of Equivalents ................................ 145
    1.2.1.3. Implications for the Right of Traditional Knowledge
             Providers ...................................................... 148
  1.2.2. Economic Analysis – The Effects of Patents in Cumulative
        Innovation Scenarios ............................................. 149
    1.2.2.1. Optimal Allocation of Rights and Division of Profits .... 149
    1.2.2.2. Hold-Up and Anticommons ................................ 151
    1.2.2.3. Conclusion ................................................. 153

1.3. Co-Operation Between Indigenous Groups and Pharmaceutical
    Companies and Joint Inventorship ...................................... 154
  1.3.1. Modification of the Requirements .................................... 154
  1.3.2. The Rights of Joint Inventors .................................... 155
    1.3.2.1. Use of the Patented Invention ............................ 155
    1.3.2.2. Sharing of Profits ....................................... 156
    1.3.2.3. Discussion ............................................... 156

1.4. Conclusion on the Property Rights Approach .............................. 157