

EU LAW AND THE DEVELOPMENT OF A SUSTAINABLE,
COMPETITIVE AND SECURE ENERGY POLICY

EU LAW AND THE
DEVELOPMENT OF A
SUSTAINABLE, COMPETITIVE
AND SECURE ENERGY POLICY

Opportunities and Shortcomings

Bram DELVAUX



intersentia

Cambridge – Antwerp – Portland

Intersentia Publishing Ltd.
Trinity House | Cambridge Business Park | Cowley Road
Cambridge | CB4 0WZ | United Kingdom
Tel.: +44 1223 393 753 | Email: mail@intersentia.co.uk

Distribution for the UK:

NBN International
Airport Business Centre, 10 Thornbury Road
Plymouth, PL6 7 PP
United Kingdom
Tel.: +44 1752 202 301 | Fax: +44 1752 202 331
Email: orders@nbninternational.com

Distribution for the USA and Canada:

International Specialized Book Services
920 NE 58th Ave. Suite 300
Portland, OR 97213
USA
Tel.: +1 800 944 6190 (toll free)
Email: info@isbs.com

Distribution for Austria:

Neuer Wissenschaftlicher Verlag
Argentinerstraße 42/6
1040 Wien
Austria
Tel.: +43 1 535 61 03 24
Email: office@nww.at

Distribution for other countries:

Intersentia Publishing nv
Groenstraat 31
2640 Mortsel
Belgium
Tel.: +32 3 680 15 50
Email: mail@intersentia.be

EU Law and the Development of a Sustainable, Competitive and Secure Energy
Policy. Opportunities and Shortcomings
Bram Delvaux

© 2013 Intersentia
Cambridge – Antwerp – Portland
www.intersentia.com | www.intersentia.co.uk

ISBN 978-1-78068-064-4
D/2013/7849/9
NUR 828

British Library Cataloguing in Publication Data. A catalogue record for this book is
available from the British Library.

No part of this book may be reproduced in any form, by print, photoprint, microfilm or any
other means, without written permission from the publisher.

ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

This book is an edited, updated and revised version of my doctoral dissertation, defended at the Faculty of Law, *Collegium Falconis*, KU Leuven on 30 September 2011. It is the result of several years of research and experience in the field of European energy law and policy. It signals the end of a journey of discovery, hard labour, patience, challenges, self-doubt and inspired insights. I would never have reached the end of this journey without the continuous inspiration, involvement, help and support of colleagues, friends and family. I would like to express my deepest gratitude to all the people here who made the end of this journey possible, admitting that the list is much longer in reality.

First and foremost, I would like to extend my gratitude to my promotor, Prof. dr. Kurt Deketelaere, for giving me the opportunity to conduct this research project. He has been a source of inspiration from the very beginning to the end of the writing of my book. You were always there for me even at short notice. You believed in me and encouraged me. You have guided me throughout this journey with great commitment, enthusiasm and insight. For me it was a great honour to write this thesis by your side. I hope there are many more years of cooperation to come.

Secondly, I would like to express my gratefulness to my co-promotor, Prof. dr. Ronnie Belmans, whom I have had the pleasure to work with at ELECTA. He introduced me to the world of the technical aspects of energy and energy markets. I would like to thank you for the motivating cooperation of the past years. I could not have completed this book without your support and enthusiasm.

Thirdly, I particularly would like to thank dr. Tom Vanden Borre for his support throughout the writing of this book. I am very grateful that you followed up on its developments, for being part of the jury and your invaluable suggestions and comments. Thank you for comforting me when I was losing faith and all the encouraging conversations we have had in the past years.

Prof. dr. Leigh Hancher, Prof. dr. Wouter Devroe and Prof. dr. Marc Boes, it is my great honour that you all accepted to be a member of my jury. I am very grateful for taking the time and making the effort to read this book thoroughly and providing me with invaluable suggestions and comments.

Many thanks are due to my colleagues at the Faculty of Law and Faculty of Engineering of the KU Leuven and the KU Leuven Energie-instituut. Thank you all for the continuously encouraging discussions and shared inspiration. I am greatly thankful to my colleagues of the IDO project, who supported me throughout the writing of this book. Especially, I would like to thank, Prof. dr. William D'haeseleer, Leonardo, Erik, David and Gerd. I also would like to thank the following current and former colleagues for their support, Prof. dr. Geert Van Calster, Kristof, Leen, Hans, Patrick, Cedric, Peter, Dimitris, Karolien and the mysterious mister Ener Guy. Sincere thanks go to Ann, Katleen, Kathleen, Nathalie, Natacha, Veerle and Marina who took care of all my administrative tasks.

I would also like to express my sincere gratitude to the friends of the Energy Law Research Forum (ELRF) for the support and inspiring reflections and discussions. I would like to thank Kim, Michaël, Henrik, Catherine, Anatole and Nicole in particular.

I am deeply grateful to my friends and their support during the writing of my book. In particular, I would like to thank Gert, Pieter, Davey, Emely and Didier.

I owe special thanks to Ann Groffils for all the efforts she has put in the layout of the book! Thank you very much! Since English is not my mother tongue, I have put the proofreading into the hands of nonkel Johny. For your language revisions, many thanks to you, nonkel Johny!

A heartfelt thank you goes to my parents, for providing me with love, support, encouragement and every opportunity I could ever want. Without them I would not have written this book. I hope that my efforts and accomplishments here reflect how very much my parents have done for me and how dear they are to me. I also would like to thank my sister, parents-in-law, sister-in-law, brothers-in-law and family for all their support during this journey.

Last, but by no means least, my greatest debt and deepest thanks are reserved for my wife Marijke. When the heavy demands of research induced a premature grumpiness, you digested it with a smile. To you go my heartfelt thanks for your patience, love and understanding throughout all these years. I dedicate this work to you and our greatest gifts, our daughter Roos and son Alexander.

Bram DELVAUX – December 2012

CONTENTS

<i>Acknowledgements</i>	v
Chapter 1. General introduction	1
Chapter 2. Objectives of the European energy policy	9
A. Introduction	9
B. European energy policy: historical overview	10
C. Recent developments in the European energy policy	15
1. The European challenges of the new energy era	15
2. The European response to this new energy era	17
(a) Green Energy Paper of 2006	17
(b) 2006 and 2011 Energy Efficiency Action Plans	18
(c) Energy sector inquiry	20
(d) The New Energy Policy for Europe	21
(e) Strategic Energy Technology Plan	23
(f) Energy and Climate Package	24
(g) Second Strategic Energy Review	25
(h) European Energy Programme for Recovery	25
(i) Energy infrastructure priorities for 2020 and beyond	26
(j) A roadmap for moving to a competitive low-carbon economy in 2050	28
(k) Energy roadmap 2050	29
D. The three key objectives of the European energy policy	29
1. Introduction	29
2. Liberalisation process of the internal energy market	30
3. Sustainability and climate change challenge	31
4. Security of energy supply	35
E. An insufficient, incoherent and fragmented EU energy policy	38
F. Concluding remarks	46
Chapter 3. Key EU secondary legislation in the energy field	49
A. Introduction	49
B. Internal market for electricity and gas	50
1. Introduction	50
2. Electricity and Gas Directives and Regulations	50

(a) Electricity and Gas Directives	50
(b) Electricity and Gas Regulations.	54
3. ACER Regulation	57
4. Regulation on data and information on investment projects in energy infrastructure	59
C. Sustainability and climate change	60
1. Introduction	60
2. Measures dealing with the supply of energy.	60
(a) Renewable Energy Directives.	60
(b) Directive on combined heat and power	63
3. Measures dealing with energy demand	64
(a) Directive on energy end-use efficiency and energy services	65
(b) Directive on the energy performance of buildings.	67
(c) Directive on Eco-design for energy-using appliances	68
(d) Directives on efficiency in energy using products	70
i) Household appliances.	70
ii) Office appliances	71
iii) Tyre labelling	73
4. Emission Trading Directive.	73
5. Union framework for the taxation of energy products and electricity.	76
D. Security of energy supply	77
1. Introduction	77
2. Security of energy supply directives and regulations	78
(a) Directives on minimum stocks of crude oil and/or petroleum	78
(b) Security of electricity supply and infrastructure directive and security of natural gas supply directive	79
3. External security of energy supply	82
(a) Energy Charter Treaty.	83
(b) Energy Community Treaty.	83
E. Problems faced with EU secondary legislation in the energy field	85
F. Conclusion	89
Chapter 4. Principles of EU law and legal bases in the TFEU allowing Union action in the field of energy prior to the Lisbon Treaty.	91
A. Introduction	91
B. Energy and the Treaty context: historical overview.	92
1. Introduction	92
2. Treaty establishing the European Coal and Steel Community	93
3. Treaty establishing the European Atomic Energy Community	94
4. Treaty establishing the European Economic Community	96
(a) Adoption of the Single European Act.	97
(b) Adoption of the European Union Treaty.	99

(c) Treaty framework after the adoption of the Treaty of Amsterdam	101
(d) Developments with the adoption of the Treaty of Nice	102
(e) Constitutional Treaty of Europe	102
5. Conclusion	105
C. Division of competences between the Union and its Member States in the energy field	106
1. Introduction	106
2. The principle of attribution of powers	107
(a) Meaning of the principle of attribution of powers on a European level	107
(b) Energy and the principle of attribution of powers	109
3. The principle of subsidiarity	112
(a) Introduction	112
(b) Meaning of the principle of subsidiarity on a European level ...	113
i) Principle of subsidiarity: not without reason	113
ii) Present form and meaning of the principle of subsidiarity ..	115
iii) Subsidiarity test	116
iv) Conclusion	119
(c) Energy and the principle of subsidiarity	121
4. The principle of proportionality	123
(a) Introduction	123
(b) Meaning of the principle of proportionality on a European level	124
(c) Energy and the principle of proportionality	128
5. Conclusion	130
D. The provisions of the TFEU allowing Union action in the field of energy	131
1. Introduction	131
2. The general TFEU provisions and their application in the energy sector	132
(a) Introduction	132
(b) Electricity and gas markets and the limits of the general TFEU provisions	134
i) The application of Article 106 of the TFEU	135
ii) The application of Article 345 of the TFEU	160
(c) The application of the rules on the free movement of goods	170
i) Fiscal barriers to trade or measures having an effect equivalent to customs duties	171
ii) Non-fiscal barriers to trade	181
3. Internal market provisions	222
(a) Meaning of Articles 114 and 115 of the TFEU	222

(b)	Case law of the Court of Justice interpreting Article 114 of the TFEU.....	223
(c)	Article 114 and energy.....	228
(d)	Conclusion	228
4.	Article 113 of TFEU	229
(a)	Meaning of Article 113 of the TFEU.....	229
(b)	Article 113 of the TFEU and energy	229
(c)	Conclusion	230
5.	The environmental law provisions in the TFEU	230
(a)	Introduction	230
(b)	Present environmental competences of the Union.....	231
i)	Objectives of the environmental policy.....	231
ii)	Principles of the environmental policy	242
(c)	Legal basis in the TFEU for environmental measures.....	255
i)	Provisions primarily of a fiscal nature.....	256
ii)	Measures affecting town and country planning, quantitative management of water resources and land use ..	257
iii)	Measures significantly affecting a Member State's choice between different energy sources and the general structure of its energy supply	258
(d)	Derogation clauses of the TFEU in the environmental field.....	261
(e)	Renewable Directive 2009/28/EC and its legal bases	
Articles 192 and 114 of the TFEU	266	
i)	Introduction.....	267
ii)	Legal basis of the Renewable Energy Directive 2009/28/EC.....	268
iii)	Conclusion	275
6.	Loophole Article 352(1) of the TFEU	276
(a)	Meaning of Article 352(1) of the TFEU	276
(b)	Article 352 of the TFEU and energy	277
7.	The trans-European networks provision.....	277
(a)	Meaning of Articles 170–172 of the TFEU.....	277
(b)	Secondary legislation on the basis of Articles 170–172 of the TFEU.....	279
(c)	Conclusion	283
8.	Meaning of Article 122 of the TFEU	283
9.	Impact of case law of the Court of Justice on the adoption of secondary legislation in the energy field	284
(a)	Background.....	284
(b)	The <i>Meroni</i> doctrine and ACER	287
(c)	The adopted text on ACER.....	290
i)	The Agency's set of tasks	291
ii)	Analysis and conclusion.....	296
E.	Conclusion	297

Chapter 5. Union competences in the energy field after the adoption of the Lisbon Treaty.....	301
A. Introduction.....	301
B. Relevant changes to provisions of the TFEU.....	302
1. Categories of Union competence.....	302
(a) Introduction.....	302
(b) Exclusive competences.....	302
(c) Shared competences.....	304
(d) Competence to support, coordinate or supplement.....	310
(e) Since Lisbon, energy is a shared competence.....	311
2. Revised Protocol on the application of the principles of subsidiarity and proportionality.....	313
(a) Role of the national Parliaments.....	313
(b) Compliance with subsidiarity under the revised Protocol.....	319
3. Article 122 of the TFEU and the Lisbon Treaty.....	321
4. Climate change inserted in Article 191 of the TFEU.....	322
5. Foreign direct investment under the Lisbon Treaty.....	323
6. Changes to Article 352(1) of the TFEU.....	326
C. The new Article 194 of the TFEU.....	328
1. Article 194 of the TFEU and the objectives of European Energy Policy.....	329
(a) Meaning of Union policy on energy.....	330
(b) Meaning of “ <i>in the context of the establishment and functioning of the internal market and with regard for the need to preserve and improve the environment</i> ”.....	332
(c) In a spirit of solidarity between Member States.....	333
(d) Ensure the functioning of the energy market.....	336
(e) Ensure security of energy supply in the Union.....	336
(f) Promote energy efficiency and energy saving and the development of new and renewable forms of energy.....	340
(g) Promote the interconnection of energy networks.....	341
(h) Conclusion.....	342
2. The legal basis of European Energy Policy.....	344
(a) Paragraph 2 of Article 194 TFEU.....	344
i) Member State’s right to determine the conditions for exploiting its energy resources.....	345
ii) Choice between different energy sources and the general structure of its energy supply, without prejudice to Article 192(2)(c).....	345
(b) Third paragraph of Article 194 of the TFEU.....	347
3. Declaration 35 on Article 194 of the TFEU.....	348
4. Gas Regulation No 994/2010 and Article 194 of the TFEU.....	349

(a) Background	349
(b) Main features of the Gas Regulation No 994/2010	350
(c) Critical assessment of the Gas Security Regulation No 994/2010	352
5. Concluding remarks with respect to the new energy title	354
D. Article 194 of the TFEU and/or other provisions of the TFEU	355
1. Choice between Article 192 of the TFEU and Article 114 of the TFEU	355
2. Choice between Article 194 of the TFEU and other provisions of the TFEU	358
(a) General remarks	358
(b) Identifying the most appropriate legal basis for energy measures	362
E. Concluding remarks	367
 Chapter 6. Legal and institutional options for a European energy framework	 369
A. Introduction	369
B. Suggestions in legal doctrine and current practices	370
1. Enhanced cooperation	370
2. Reinforced cooperation or in-built closer cooperation – the Schengen model	372
3. Functional or regional cooperation	375
C. Amendments to the provisions of the Treaties	376
1. Procedure for amending the Treaties	376
2. Treaty amendments with respect to energy	378
(a) Article 3 of the TFEU	378
(b) Article 122 of the TFEU	378
(c) Articles 191 and 192 of the TFEU	379
(d) Articles 170–172 of the TFEU	380
(e) Article 194 of the TFEU	380
(f) Article 288 of the TFEU	382
3. Conclusion	386
D. A new energy Treaty on a European level	386
E. Conclusion	391
 Chapter 7. General conclusion	 395
 <i>Bibliography</i>	 403
<i>Index</i>	447