HUMAN RIGHTS
AND CONFLICT

Essays in Honour of
Bas de Gaay Fortman

Edited by

Ineke BoerefiJn
Laura Henderson
Ronald Janse
Robert Weaver
CONTENTS

Introduction
Human Rights Before, During, and After Conflict
Ronald Janse ......................................................... 1

PART I.
HUMAN RIGHTS IN PRE-CONFLICT SITUATIONS

Human Rights and the Regulation of the International State System
Duco Hellema .......................................................... 13
1. Introduction ......................................................... 13
2. The Six Principles of the International Legal Order ................. 16
   2.1. Introduction ....................................................... 16
   2.2. Sovereignty and Non-Intervention .......................... 16
   2.3. Self-Determination .......................................... 18
   2.4. Free Trade ....................................................... 21
   2.5. Collective Security ........................................... 23
   2.6. Arms Control and Disarmament ............................ 24
   2.7. International Social Justice ................................. 26
3. Conclusion: Human Rights as Apotheosis? ............................ 27

Structures of Violence
Jolle Demmers ......................................................... 29
1. Introduction ......................................................... 29
2. Unending Failure: The Paradox of State-Making .................. 32
3. The Connection Between Global Neoliberalism and Violent Conflict .... 34
   3.1. State Competence and Conflict .............................. 36
   3.2. Free Market Reforms and Identity Conflicts. ............... 37
   3.3. Post-State Conflicts / Network Wars ...................... 38
4. ‘New Wars’: the Attempt to Frame Structural Flaws as Failures in ‘Governance’ ................................. 40
5. Conclusion ............................................................. 43

Intersentia
Contents

More Than Just a Nice Idea. Equality as an Effective Way to Reduce the Risk of Violent Conflict
Jenny Goldschmidt and Laura Henderson ............................. 45

1. Introduction ................................................................. 45
2. Empirical Evidence Linking Effective Human Rights Standards with Decreased Risk of Violent Conflict ......................... 46
3. Equality ............................................................................. 50
   3.1. The Principle of Equality ........................................... 50
   3.2. Equality in Regional Human Rights Law ....................... 51
       3.2.1. The European Court of Human Rights .................. 52
       3.2.2. The Court of Justice of the European Union .......... 53
       3.2.3. Developments at the European Level .................... 55
4. Positive Obligations .......................................................... 56
   4.1. A General Introduction to the Idea of Positive State Obligations .... 56
   4.2. Positive Obligations – Specific Duties on States ............. 58
       4.2.1. Positive Obligations Under the ECHR ................. 58
       4.2.2. Positive Obligations in European Union Law .......... 61
5. Conclusion ............................................................... 65

Human Rights Violations and Contemporary Violent Conflict.
An Inquiry into Causes and Remedies
Georg Frerks ................................................................. 67

1. Introduction ................................................................. 67
2. Contemporary Conflict .................................................... 68
   2.1. Contemporary Wars as ‘New Wars’? ............................. 68
   2.2. The Different Types of Causes .................................... 70
   2.3. Different Explanatory Approaches ............................ 71
       2.3.1. The Cultural School ........................................... 72
       2.3.2. The Economic School ......................................... 74
       2.3.3. The Political School ........................................... 78
       2.3.4. The Present Position: Converging Towards Consensus? 79
3. Changing War, Changing Peace: The Need for Different Conflict Management Approaches ............................. 81
4. The Relevance for Human Rights ...................................... 84
5. Conclusion ............................................................... 85

Banning Cluster Bombs. Achieving Rights through Activism
Georg Frerks, Miriam Struyk and Roos Boer .......................... 87

1. Introduction ................................................................. 87
2. Background on Cluster Munitions ..................................... 88
   2.1. What is Cluster Munition? ......................................... 88

vi

Intersentia
2.2. Humanitarian Impact ................................................................. 89
3. The Campaign for the Convention on Cluster Munitions .................. 89
  3.1. Negotiations on Protocol V of the CCW and the NGO Response ... 89
    3.1.1. Launch of the CMC .................................................. 90
    3.1.2. CMC Action Beyond Protocol V ............................... 90
  3.2. Action by the European Parliament .................................... 91
  3.3. CMC Strategy and Activities in 2005 and 2006 ....................... 91
  3.4. The Use of Cluster Munitions in the Israel-Hezbollah War ........... 92
  3.5. Disillusionment at the 2006 CCW Review Conference ............... 93
  3.6. The Oslo Process ........................................................... 93
  3.7. Rear-guard Actions in the GGE/CCW and Advocacy after
    the CCM ................................................................. 95
4. Activities in the Netherlands ................................................... 96
  4.1. Political Lobby ............................................................ 96
  4.2. Disinvestment Campaign ............................................... 99
5. Evaluation: Strong and Weak Points in the CMC and IPCN Campaigns 100
6. Conclusion ........................................................................... 103

Constraints and Challenges in Minority Protection. Experience of the OSCE
High Commissioner on National Minorities
  Natalie SABANADZE ............................................................... 107
  1. Introduction ........................................................................ 107
  2. HCNM – Post-Cold War Instrument of Comprehensive Security ...... 108
  3. National Minorities as a Systemic Problem .............................. 112
  4. Geopolitical Constraints of Minority Protection ........................ 119
  5. Normative Constraints of Minority Protection .......................... 123
  6. Conclusion ........................................................................ 127

Early Warning, Non-Intervention and Failed Responsibility to Protect in
Rwanda and Darfur
  Fred GRÜNFELD ................................................................. 129
  1. Introduction ........................................................................ 129
  2. Early Warnings ................................................................. 131
  3. Causes of Conflicts and Atrocities ........................................ 132
  4. Rwanda ............................................................................ 135
    4.1. Early Warnings in Rwanda ............................................ 135
    4.2. Non-Intervention by the UN ....................................... 138
    4.3. The Absence of a Responsibility to Protect .................... 139
  5. Darfur .............................................................................. 141
    5.1. Early Warnings in 2003 and 2004 ................................. 141
    5.2. Continuing Warnings in 2005–2008 ............................. 144
Contents

5.3. Non-Intervention by UN Human Rights Bodies .......................... 148
5.5. No Responsibility to Prevent or React ................................. 155
6. Failed Genocide Prevention and Human Rights Protection in
   Recent Decades ........................................................ 157

Human Security. A Shifting and Bridging Concept that Can Be
Operationalised
Marlies GLASIES ......................................................... 159
1. Introduction ............................................................. 159
2. Key Promoters of the Concept ........................................... 160
3. Human Security as a Paradigm-Shifting Concept ....................... 162
   3.1. Shifting Development ............................................. 162
   3.2. Shifting Security .................................................. 163
   3.3. Shifting Away from 'Humanitarian Intervention' ............... 163
   3.4. A Shift Towards the Subjects of Security ....................... 164
4. Human Security as a Bridging Concept .................................. 165
   4.1. Bridging Security and Development ............................. 165
   4.2. Bridging Realism and Ethics .................................... 166
5. Human Security as an Appropriated Concept? ......................... 167
   5.1. Appropriation for Development .................................. 167
   5.2. Appropriation for Security ....................................... 168
6. Operationalisation: Holistic yet Concrete Human Security Policies .. 171
   6.2. The Human Security Relief Worker: Transformation of
        Humanitarian Policies ........................................... 173
   6.3. The Human Security Spy: Transformation of Intelligence Policies .. 174
   6.4. The Human Security Bureaucrat: Transformation of
        'Institution-Building' ............................................. 175
   6.5. Synthesis: The Human Security Worker ........................... 175

From Acceptable Hazard to Violation of Rights. Upstream Human Rights
Activism in the Sidoardjo Mudflow Case
Irene I. HADIPRAYITNO .................................................. 179
1. Introduction ..................................................................... 179
2. Upstream Approach of Human Rights and Development Hazards ...... 181
3. Description of the Sidoardjo Case ....................................... 182
   3.1. Facts and Impact .................................................. 182
   3.2. Government Responses ............................................ 186
4. The Trajectory of Human Rights Activism in the Sidoardjo Case ....... 188
   4.1. Human Rights Litigation by the Indonesian Legal Aid
        Foundation ......................................................... 188
4.2. The Investigation by the National Commission on Human Rights . 191
5. Human Rights Activism to Combat Development Hazards: Compensating for the Enforcement Deficit in Indonesia ................. 195
6. Concluding Remarks. .................................................. 197

Climate Change, Conflict and the Protection of Vulnerable Collectivities
M.A. Mohamed SALIH ......................................................... 199
1. Introduction ................................................................. 199
2. Climate Change and Vulnerability .................................... 201
3. Climate Change and Conflict .......................................... 203
4. Climate Change and Indigenous Peoples' Human Rights ....... 205
5. Global Climate Governance and the Protection of Vulnerable Collectivities .......................................................... 207
6. Conclusions ................................................................. 211

From Charity to Institutional Development. Reflections on Newmont's Corporate Social Responsibility Strategies and Conflict-Avoidance in Ghana
Radu MARES ................................................................. 213
1. Introduction ................................................................. 213
2. Institutional Development as Part of CSR Strategies ............. 215
3. Community Participation ................................................ 216
   3.1. Newmont's Multistakeholder Committees ...................... 217
   3.2. The Crop Compensation Committee ............................ 219
   3.3. The Ahafo Social Responsibility Agreements (ASRA) Structures... 223
4. Capacities of Local Authorities ......................................... 226
   4.1. Ghana Responsible Mining Alliance ............................ 227
   4.2. Tax Exemption ........................................................ 228
   4.3. Advocacy for Increased Tax Transfers through MDF .......... 230
5. Conclusion ................................................................. 230

Doing Business in Pre-Conflict Areas
Tineke LAMBOOY .............................................................. 233
1. Introduction ................................................................. 233
2. Characteristics of Pre-Conflict Areas ................................. 233
3. Changing Expectations Toward Businesses ......................... 235
   3.1. Criminal Prosecution in the Netherlands as Evidence of Changed Expectations .................................................. 236
   3.2. The Development of Corporate Social Responsibility Standards ... 237
       3.2.1. John Ruggie and the Development of International Standards to 'Protect, Respect and Remedy' ............. 240
3.2.2. Other Human Rights Standards for Businesses
   (OECD, EU, UN, and Investment Fund Standards) .......... 241
4. Local Partnerships .................................................. 243
   4.1. Designing a Partnership ..................................... 246
5. Conclusion ......................................................... 249

Conflict and Rights in Vengeance-Ridden Societies. Moral and Legal
Inferences
   Fatos Tarifa .......................................................... 251
1. Introduction ......................................................... 251
2. Background: Vengeance, Culture and Law .................... 252
3. The Kanun: Its Substance and Reach ............................. 254
   3.1. Origins of the Kanun ......................................... 254
   3.2. Honor and Retaliation in the Kanun ......................... 256
   3.3. The Duty of Hospitality in the Kanun ..................... 260
   3.4. Asserted Jurisdiction and Reach of the Kanun .......... 262
4. Conclusion: Implications for Legal Anthropology ............. 264

PART II.
HUMAN RIGHTS IN CONFLICT SITUATIONS

Human Rights and Humanitarian Action
   Dorothea Hilhorst and Bram J. Jansen .......................... 269
1. Introduction ......................................................... 269
   1.1. Method ....................................................... 270
2. Background: Setting the Stage for Social Negotiation and Casting
   the Actors ........................................................ 270
   2.1. Roles Played by Humanitarian Actors ..................... 270
   2.2. Humanitarian Action as Arenas of Social Negotiation .. 271
3. Two Bodies of Law and a Bundle of Norms ..................... 273
   3.1. International Humanitarian Law ............................. 273
   3.2. Refugee Law and the Role of UNHCR ....................... 274
   3.3. Norms, Codes, and Standards .............................. 275
   3.4. Human Rights and Humanitarianism as Competing
       Frameworks for Global Governance ........................... 277
4. The Political Use of Humanitarian Labels and Languages of Rights .. 277
   4.1. War under the Flag of Humanity ............................ 278
   4.2. The Mediagenic Properties of Human Rights ............... 278
   4.3. Negotiating the Applicability of IHL ....................... 279
5. Rights and Standards in Practice ................................ 281
   5.1. Humanitarian Cruelty ........................................ 281

   x
   Intersentia
5.2. Consumer or Citizen Rights? ........................................ 282
5.3. Negotiating Multiple and Overlapping Rights .................. 284
6. Conclusion .................................................................... 285

Old Cultures Never Die? Cultural Genocide in International Law
Yvonne DONders ............................................................... 287
1. Introduction .................................................................. 287
2. Cultural Genocide: A Definition ...................................... 289
3. (Cultural) Genocide in International Law ......................... 291
   3.1. The Genocide Convention ........................................ 291
   3.1.1. The Definition of Genocide ................................. 291
   3.1.2. Cultural Genocide in the Draft Genocide Convention .... 292
3.2. The Core of Genocide: The Intent to Physically Destroy a Group .. 294
4. Cultural Genocide and Human Rights .............................. 296
   4.1. Cultural Rights in International Human Rights Instruments .... 296
   4.2. Obligations of States ............................................ 297
5. The UN Declaration on the Rights of Indigenous Peoples ... 298
6. Prohibition of the Destruction of Cultural Heritage .............. 300
        in the Event of Armed Conflict ................................. 300
   6.2. UNESCO Instruments on Cultural Heritage .................. 301
7. Concluding Remarks ....................................................... 302

Non-State Actors in Conflict
Anja MIHR ........................................................................ 305
1. Introduction .................................................................. 305
2. Background: Non-State Actors and NGOs in Conflict Situations .. 307
3. The Role(s) of Non-State Actors in Conflicts ...................... 311
   3.1. Becoming an Active Part of the Conflict through Neutrality .. 313
   3.2. Assessment of Non-State Actors in Times of Conflict .......... 316
   3.3. Non-State Actors' Responsibility to Protect .................. 320
4. Conclusion .................................................................... 322

Caught in the Middle of Persistent Conflict. The Rights of Palestinian
Children
Karin ARTS ................................................................. 325
1. Introduction .................................................................. 325
2. Children and Armed Conflict: Increased International Attention
   to the Facts, Law and Monitoring ...................................... 326
   2.1. Exposing the Facts: The Machel Reports ..................... 327

Intersentia xi
2.2. Creating a Normative Framework in Relation to Children Affected by Armed Conflict 329
2.3. International Monitoring 334
3. Palestinian Children: In the Middle of Persistent Conflict 337
4. Action Urgently Needed: Hold Relevant Actors to Account and Develop a Child-Rights Based Approach to Relations with Israel 343

PART III.
HUMAN RIGHTS IN POST-CONFLICT SITUATIONS

How Transitional Are Transitional Politics and Transitional Justice? A Case of Misleading Terminology
Peter R. Baehr 349

1. Introduction 349
2. Dealing with the Past 351
3. Post-Conflict Politics 354
4. Political Aspects of Transitional Justice 356
5. Conclusion 361

Counter-Terrorism, Rule of Law Promotion and the Friends of Yemen
Ronald Janse 363

1. Introduction 363
2. Counter-Terrorism and Rule of Law Promotion 365
3. Diagnosis and Recommendations 370
4. Lacunae 371
5. Conclusion 373

The Role of International Criminal Courts and Tribunals in Post-Conflict Societies
Gentian Zyberi 375

1. Introduction 375
2. The Growth of International Criminal Justice Mechanisms: From the Ad Hoc Tribunals to the ICC and the Hybrid Criminal Courts 377
3. The Challenging Objectives of International Criminal Justice Mechanisms 380
   3.1. Drawing a Line Between Two Different Regimes and Affirming Democratic Transition 384
   3.2. Bringing Those Most Responsible for Mass Atrocity Crimes to Justice 385
   3.3. Providing Justice to Victims and Giving Them a Voice 386
   3.4. Promoting and Strengthening the Rule of Law in Post-Conflict Societies 387
5. Concluding Remarks .......................................................................................................................... 392

Rwanda’s Police Development
Piet van Reenen ................................................................................................................................. 395
1. Introduction ........................................................................................................................................ 395
2. The Context ....................................................................................................................................... 396
   2.1. Crisis and Recovery ....................................................................................................................... 396
   2.2. Human Rights and Integrity ........................................................................................................ 399
3. The Rwandan National Police .......................................................................................................... 400
   3.1. Brief Background on the Rwandan National Police ................................................................. 400
   3.2. The Composition of the Rwandan National Police ..................................................................... 402
4. The Police Development Plan and Foreign Support ........................................................................ 403
   4.1. The Police Development Plan .................................................................................................... 403
   4.2. The Assessment ............................................................................................................................ 403
5. Explaining the Success ....................................................................................................................... 405
   5.1. Unique Factors Contributing to the Success of the Rwandan National Police ......................... 405
       5.1.1. Still a Movement .................................................................................................................... 405
       5.1.2. Kagame’s Hand ...................................................................................................................... 406
       5.1.3. Initial Political Stability and Broad External Support ......................................................... 406
   5.2. General Factors Contributing to the Success of the Rwandan National Police ....................... 407
       5.2.1. Systematic and Long-Term Political Support .................................................................... 407
       5.2.2. A Planned Approach and Partnership ................................................................................. 408
6. The Fragility of Success ...................................................................................................................... 408
7. The Dirty Hands Dilemma .................................................................................................................. 409

Civil and Political Rights in Times of Political Oppression: Rights Without Remedies? The Case of Zambia
Rodger M.A. Chongwe and Nicola Jägers ............................................................................................. 413
1. Introduction ........................................................................................................................................ 413
2. Legal Protection of Human Rights .................................................................................................... 415
3. The Impact of International Human Rights Norms on the Domestic Level ...................................... 416
4. Human Rights Implementation in Former Colonies ......................................................................... 417
5. Case Study of Zambia .......................................................................................................................... 420
   5.1. The Legal Framework ................................................................................................................... 422
   5.2. The Judiciary ................................................................................................................................... 425
   5.3. An Illustration of the Non-Implementation of Civil and Political Rights in Zambia: Chongwe versus Zambia ................................................................. 428

Intersentia xiii
5.3.1. The Obligation to Comply with the Findings of the HRC . . . 430
6. The Meaning of Civil and Political Rights in Absence of a Willing
Domestic State; The Pivotal Role of Civil Society . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . 432
7. Concluding Remarks . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . 434

Role of the Judiciary in the Enforcement of Economic, Social and Cultural
Rights. Experience from Nepal
Kalyan SHRESTHA and Ananda M. BHATTARAI . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . 437
1. Introduction . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . 437
3. Constitutional Position of the Judiciary . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . 439
4. Judicial Approach to Rights. . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . 440
5. Specific Economic, Social and Cultural Rights . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . 443
   5.1. The Right to Food . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . 444
   5.2. Right to Education . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . 446
   5.3. Right to Water . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . 449
   5.4. Right to Health . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . 451
6. Role Played by the Judiciary in the Enforcement of ESC Rights and Its
   Limitations . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . 453
7. Conclusion . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . 457

Loss and Destruction of Property. Post-Conflict Human Rights Responses
from an ECHR Perspective
Antoine BUYSE . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . 459
1. Introduction . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . 459
2. What Are Possessions under the ECHR? . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . 460
3. The Home as the Most Cherished Possession . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . 465
4. The State Duty not to Interfere with Property . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . 469
5. The Positive Obligations of the State Concerning Property . . . . . . . . . . . . . . 478
6. Conclusion . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . 480

The Human Right to Mourning. Social Trauma and Transitional Justice
in Post-Conflict Argentina
Antonius ROBBEN . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . 483
1. Introduction . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . 483
2. Mass Graves and Basic Trust . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . 484
3. Social Trauma and the Pursuit of Justice . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . 486
4. The Complicated Mourning of Disappearances . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . 490
5. Human Rights and the Right to Mourning the Dead . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . 494
The Interface Between Transitional Justice and Reconciliation in the Wake of Civil War. A Case Study of Northern Uganda

Lauren Gould and Cedric Ryngaert .......................... 499

1. Introduction .................................................. 499
2. Background: Conflict in Northern Uganda .................. 502
   2.1. Inter-Group Perceptions and Behaviour Between the LRA, Acholi and GoU .......................... 503
   2.2. Intra-Group Perceptions and Behaviour Between the Acholi and Lower-Ranked LRA Combatants ............ 504
   2.3. Inter-Group Perceptions and Behaviour Between the Acholi and the GoU .......................... 505
3. A Process of Transitional Justice in the Wake of Uganda's Civil War .................................. 506
4. Transitional Justice in Theory and Practice .................. 508
   4.1. The Impact of the ICC Indictments ....................... 508
       4.1.1. Interface Between International Criminal Justice and Reconciliation in Theory ............. 509
       4.1.2. Interface Between International Criminal Justice and Reconciliation in Practice ............. 510
   4.2. The Codification of Traditional Justice .................. 513
       4.2.1. Interface Between Traditional Justice and the Facilitation of Reconciliation in Theory ........ 513
       4.2.2. Interface Between Traditional Justice and the Facilitation of Reconciliation in Practice ........ 514
   4.3. War Crimes Division of the High Court .................. 518
       4.3.1. Interface Between National Criminal Justice and the Facilitation of Reconciliation in Theory .. 519
       4.3.2. Interface Between National Criminal Justice and the Facilitation of Reconciliation in Practice .. 520
5. Conclusion ................................................... 522

Selected Bibliography

Bastiaan de Gaay Fortman ........................................ 525