INTERNATIONAL LAW IN DOMESTIC COURTS: RULE OF LAW REFORM IN POST-CONFLICT STATES
SERIES ON TRANSITIONAL JUSTICE

The Series on Transitional Justice offers a platform for high-quality research within the rapidly growing field of transitional justice. The research is, of necessity, inter-disciplinary in nature, drawing from disciplines such as law, political science, history, sociology, criminology, anthropology, and psychology, as well as from various specialized fields of study such as human rights, victimology, and peace studies. Furthermore, the research is international in outlook, drawing on the knowledge and experience of academics and other specialists in many different regions of the world.

The series is aimed at a variety of audiences who are either working or interested in fields such as crime and justice; human rights; humanitarian law and human security; conflict resolution and peace building. These audiences include academics, researchers, students, policy makers, practitioners, non-governmental organizations, and the media.

All books published within the series are subject to a double-blind peer review by recognized authorities in the field.

The General Editors of the Series are:

– Prof. Stephan Parmentier (Catholic University of Leuven, Belgium)
– Prof. Jeremy Sarkin (United Nations Working Group on Enforced or Involuntary Disappearances)
– Prof. Elmar Weitekamp (University of Tübingen, Germany)

The general editors receive the support from an Editorial Committee and an Advisory Board, consisting of internationally renowned academics and practitioners.

Published titles within the series:
2. Laura Stovel, Long Road Home, Building Reconciliation and Trust in Post-War Sierra Leone (2010), 978-94-000-0028-5
5. Antoine Buyse (ed.), Margins of Conflict. The ECHR and Transitions to and from Armed Conflict (2011), 978-94-000-0157-2

Series on Transitional Justice, Volume 9
INTERNATIONAL LAW IN DOMESTIC COURTS: RULE OF LAW REFORM IN POST-CONFLICT STATES

Edda Kristjánsdóttir
André Nollkaemper
Cedric Ryngaert
(editors)
International Law in Domestic Courts: Rule of Law Reform in Post-Conflict States
Edda Kristjánsdóttir, André Nollkaemper and Cedric Ryngaert (editors)
© 2012 Intersentia
Cambridge – Antwerp – Portland
www.intersentia.com  |  www.intersentia.co.uk

Distribution for the UK:
Hart Publishing Ltd.
16C Worcester Place
Oxford OX1 2JW
UK
Tel.: +44 1865 517 530
Email: mail@hartpub.co.uk

Distribution for Austria:
Neuer Wissenschaftlicher Verlag
Argentinierstraße 42/6
1040 Wien
Austria
Tel.: +43 1 535 61 03 24
Email: office@nwv.at

Distribution for the USA and Canada:
International Specialized Book Services
920 NE 58th Ave. Suite 300
Portland, OR 97213
USA
Tel.: +1 800 944 6190 (toll free)
Email: info@isbs.com

Distribution for other countries:
Intersentia Publishing nv
Groenstraat 31
2640 Mortsel
Belgium
Tel.: +32 3 680 15 50
Email: mail@intersentia.be

International Law in Domestic Courts: Rule of Law Reform in Post-Conflict States
Edda Kristjánsdóttir, André Nollkaemper and Cedric Ryngaert (editors)

© 2012 Intersentia
Cambridge – Antwerp – Portland
www.intersentia.com  |  www.intersentia.co.uk


GPRC
Guaranteed Peer Reviewed Content

NUR 828


No part of this book may be reproduced in any form, by print, photoprint, microfilm or any other means, without written permission from the publisher.
PREFACE

This volume is the product of a working group on the international rule of law and international law in domestic courts, which commissioned a number of chapters on post-conflict situations.1

The editors wish to thank the authors who responded to the invitation to participate in this project, some of whom are promising new voices in their field and others who are established experts, but all of whom have acquired a deep and personal first-hand knowledge of the legal cultures they write about. The Rule of Law Working Group also deserves acknowledgment for the initial conceptual discussions that led to the present collection. Aristotle Constantenides and Cyprus Law School deserve thanks for accommodating the first meeting in Nikosia; Rosemary Byrne, likewise, hosted a meeting at Trinity College in Dublin. Special thanks go to Martine van Trigt for organization and support not only of a meeting in Amsterdam but throughout the life of the project. Sincere thanks also to Belinda Macmahon and Scarlet Wagner for their editorial work on the manuscript.

---

1 The Working Group was funded by the COST Action ISO602 on International Law in Domestic Courts (European Cooperation in the field of Scientific and Technical Research), an intergovernmental framework for European Co-operation in the field of Scientific and Technical Research, allowing the co-ordination of nationally funded research on a European level.
# CONTENTS

*Preface* ................................................................. v

Introduction  
Edda Kristjánsdóttir, André Nollkaemper  
and Cedric Ryngaert .................................................. 1

Lost in Transition? Domestic Courts, International Law and Rule of Law *À la Carte*  
Stéphane Beaulac ......................................................... 17

1. Introduction .......................................................... 17  
2. The United Nations and the Rule of Law ....................... 19  
3. Interlegality and International Rule of Law Complementarity 21  
4. The Thin-Thick Rule of Law Spectrum and its Limits .......... 25  
5. Rule of Law *À la Carte* and Recommendations of the Chef .... 31

International Law in the Russian Courts in Transitional Situations  
Sergei Yu. Marochkin ..................................................... 35

1. Introduction .......................................................... 35  
2. A Brief Look at the Period Prior to the Breakdown of the USSR .... 36  
3. Transition to a New State and Legal Order and to a New Constitution 39  
   3.1. From “Putsch” in 1991 and the Breakdown of the USSR to  
        the Adoption of the New Constitution of Russia .......... 39  
   3.2. The Constitution of Russia 1993 and International Law .... 40  
4. The Role of the Courts in Entrenchment of International Norms in  
   the Legal Order of Russia ......................................... 42  
   4.1. The Norms of International Law as a Framework for Legislation  
        and for its Implementation ..................................... 43  
   4.2. The Norms of International Treaties in Determining the  
        Applicable Law and as a Basis of the Decision in the Case .... 45  
   4.3. Generally Recognized Principles and Norms of International  
        Law in Judicial Decisions ..................................... 47  
   4.4. Recommendations and Decisions of Bodies of International  
        Organizations, Acts of International Conferences ......... 50

Intersentia v

Personal copy of ()
## Contents

1. Introduction .......................................................... 59
2. South African Constitutional Law During and After Apartheid ......... 61
   2.1. The ‘Thin’ Rule of Law During Apartheid ...................... 61
   2.2. International Law in the New Constitution .................... 63
   2.3. The Bill of Rights and Reasons for a ‘Thick’ Conception of Rule of Law .................................................... 65
      2.3.1. Justiciable Economic and Social Rights .................. 65
      2.3.2. Inspiration from International Law ....................... 66
3. Evaluating the Empowerment of Courts to Address ESR ................. 68
   3.1. If and How International Norms Have Been Used ............. 68
   3.2. Similarities and Differences Between the South African ESR Jurisprudence and International Normative Developments .... 70
      3.2.1. Non-Application of Relevant ESR Provisions ........... 70
      3.2.2. Rejection of the Minimum Core Concept ................. 71
      3.2.3. South African Jurisprudence Influences the Optional Protocol to the ICESCR ........................................ 73
   3.3. Whether Entrenching International ESR Norms Has Led to Concrete Improvements ........................................... 74
4. Identifying Lessons From a Glass Half Empty ........................ 75
   4.1. Process and Actors ................................................. 76
   4.2. Legal Tradition and a Shared Belief in the Relevance of Law.... 77
5. Conclusion ..................................................................... 78

## Thickening the Rule of Law in Transition: The Constitutional Entrenchment of Economic and Social Rights in South Africa

Evelyne SCHMID .......................................................... 59

1. Introduction .......................................................... 59
2. South African Constitutional Law During and After Apartheid ......... 61
   2.1. The ‘Thin’ Rule of Law During Apartheid ...................... 61
   2.2. International Law in the New Constitution .................... 63
   2.3. The Bill of Rights and Reasons for a ‘Thick’ Conception of Rule of Law .................................................... 65
      2.3.1. Justiciable Economic and Social Rights .................. 65
      2.3.2. Inspiration from International Law ....................... 66
3. Evaluating the Empowerment of Courts to Address ESR ................. 68
   3.1. If and How International Norms Have Been Used ............. 68
   3.2. Similarities and Differences Between the South African ESR Jurisprudence and International Normative Developments .... 70
      3.2.1. Non-Application of Relevant ESR Provisions ........... 70
      3.2.2. Rejection of the Minimum Core Concept ................. 71
      3.2.3. South African Jurisprudence Influences the Optional Protocol to the ICESCR ........................................ 73
   3.3. Whether Entrenching International ESR Norms Has Led to Concrete Improvements ........................................... 74
4. Identifying Lessons From a Glass Half Empty ........................ 75
   4.1. Process and Actors ................................................. 76
   4.2. Legal Tradition and a Shared Belief in the Relevance of Law.... 77
5. Conclusion ..................................................................... 78

## Judicial Activism and the Use of International Law as Gap-Filler in Domestic Law: The Case of Forced Disappearances Committed During the Armed Conflict in Nepal

Rishikesh WAGLE .......................................................... 83

1. Introduction .......................................................... 83
2. Place of International Law in the Nepalese Legal System .......... 86
   2.1. Difficulty in Recognizing a Treaty as a Part of the Domestic Law. 87
   2.2. Influence of International Human Rights Law in the Nepalese Legal System .................................................. 89

viii Interseintia
3. The Dhakal Case ................................................................. 92
  3.1. Background ............................................................... 92
  3.2. Judicial Activism to Fulfil the Obligations under International
       Human Rights Law ....................................................... 93
  3.3. Obligation of the State under Domestic and International Law
       in Post-Conflict Situations and the Role of Courts .............. 94
       3.3.1. Recognition of ’Right to Truth’ as a Fundamental Right ... 96
       3.3.2. Obligation of the State to Provide Relief to the Victims ... 97
       3.3.3. Obligation to Initiate Legal Proceedings Against
               Perpetrators ......................................................... 98
  3.4. Order for Introducing Separate Legislation to Deal with
       Enforced Disappearances ................................................ 99
  3.5. Application of the Disappearance Convention for Dealing
       with the Past in Nepal .................................................... 100
  3.6. Factors that Empowered the Court to Come to the Decision ... 103
4. Conclusion ................................................................. 104

International Law and Iraqi Courts
Haider Ala Hamoudi ............................................................. 107
  1. Introduction – Promising Conditions and Unfulfilled Promise .... 107
  2. Traditional Approaches ................................................ 111
  3. The CPA and International Law ......................................... 113
  4. The Final Constitution and the Rejection of International Law in
     Domestic Proceedings ................................................... 116
  5. Conclusion ................................................................. 121

Constitutionalism without Governance: International Standards in
the Afghan Legal System
Ebrahim Afsah ................................................................. 125
  1. Introduction: The Role of Law in Stabilising Conflict .............. 125
  2. Political Context of Reconstruction ................................ 128
  3. Institutional Context of Reconstruction ............................ 133
  4. Functional Assumptions and Cultural Norms ....................... 136
  5. Ideal and Reality of Statehood ....................................... 139
  6. Statehood as a Prerequisite of Constitutionalism ................. 141
  7. Constitutionalism without a State? .................................. 145
     7.1. Institutions Matter .................................................. 146
     7.2. Decrepit Justice System .......................................... 148
  8. Conclusion ................................................................. 150
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Contents</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Understandings of International Law in Rwanda: A Contextual Approach</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Nicola PALMER</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1. Introduction</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2. The Role of Law during Transitions: A Contextual Perspective</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3. International Law in Post-Genocide Rwanda</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.1. International Criminal Law and the Security of the Rwandan</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>State</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.2. International Human Rights Law in Rwanda</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.3. Mitigating the Tensions in International Law and Dealing</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>with an Impossible Caseload</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4. International Law and the Legal Culture of the National Courts</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5. Conclusion</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Virtuous Flexibility. The Application of International Human Rights</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Norms by the Bosnian Human Rights Chamber</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Antoine BUYSE</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1. Introduction</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2. The Genesis of a new Institution</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3. The Scope of Human Rights – Flexibility in Practice</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4. Interpreting Substantive Obligations</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5. Conclusions</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>War Crimes Chamber of the Court of Bosnia and Herzegovina: Seeding</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>“International Standards of Justice”?</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Katerina UHLÍŘOVÁ</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1. Introduction</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2. Rule of Law versus ‘Rule of Ethnicity’</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.1. First Constitutional Moment: Dayton Peace Agreement and the</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Nature of the New Constitution</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.2. Role of International Law in the New Constitution</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.3. New Constitution found to be in Breach of the European</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Convention on Human Rights: How Ethnicity in BiH Still Matters</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.4. Effects of the Constitutional Framework on Harmonization of</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Criminal Legislation in BiH: Implications for Prosecution of</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>International Crimes</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3. The Establishment of the War Crimes Chamber of the Court of hum</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Bosnia and Herzegovina as a Contribution to the Rule of Law</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Efforts in BiH</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.1. Establishment of the WCC</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Personal copy of ()
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Section</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>3.2. Contribution of International Personnel at the WCC to Rule of Law Efforts in BiH</td>
<td>208</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.3. Legal Basis of the WCC and the Applicable Law</td>
<td>210</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.4. Application of Joint Criminal Enterprise by International (ICTY) and National Court (WCC): Will JCE Survive the Transplantation into Domestic Law?</td>
<td>213</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.4.1. Rasević and Todović Case (JCE Applied)</td>
<td>214</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.4.2. Vuković Case (JCE Not Applied)</td>
<td>216</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4. Conclusion: the Rule of Law Still in the Making</td>
<td>217</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Prosecution of War Crimes in Bosnian Cantonal and District Courts: the Role of the Rule of Law
Sanja Popovic ............................................ 221

1. Introduction ............................................. 221
2. Background: From the Trenches to The Hague and Then Back Again ... ............................................. 223
   2.1. Entity Judiciaries ............................................. 225
3. To Prosecute a War Crime: Determining the Appropriate Legal Standard ............................................. 228
   3.1. Determining the Domestic Legal Standard ............................................. 229
   3.2. Applicable Law: International or Domestic? ............................................. 231
4. Specific Problems in the Cantonal and District Courts in Applying International Criminal Law ............................................. 232
   4.1. Can International Law Make Concession for Inadequate Evidence at Local Level? ............................................. 233
   4.2. Witness Issues ............................................. 234
   4.3. Sentencing ............................................. 236
5. Lessons from Bosnia ............................................. 237

War Crimes Prosecution in a Post-Conflict Era and a Pluralism of Jurisdictions: the Experience of the Belgrade War Crimes Chamber
Sharon Weill and Ivan Jovanović ............................................. 241

1. Introduction ............................................. 241
2. The Establishment of the Belgrade War Crimes Chamber ............................................. 243
   2.1. Between Internal Democratic Changes and External Pressure: a Background ............................................. 243
   2.2. Serbian War Crimes Chamber and War Crimes Prosecution Office ............................................. 245
      2.2.1. Structure ............................................. 246
      2.2.2. Jurisdiction ............................................. 247
      2.2.3. Relationship with the ICTY ............................................. 247
Contents

2.3. Legal Framework for the War Crimes Trials .......................... 249
   2.3.1. Relationship between International and Municipal Law . 249
   2.3.2. Substantive Criminal Law ................................. 250
2.4. Strengthening the capacity of the War Crimes Chamber ............ 252
3. The First Years of the Belgrade War Crimes Chamber: an Assessment . 253
   3.1. Case studies .............................................. 254
      3.1.1. The Anton Lekaj Case .................................. 254
      3.1.2. 'The Scorpions' Case ................................... 257
      3.1.3. The Ovčara Case ....................................... 262
   3.2. Patterns and Trends ........................................ 264
      3.2.1 Legal Framework for Application of International Law . 264
      3.2.2. The Ability of the WCC to Enforce International Law . 264
      3.2.3. The Willingness of the WCC to Apply International Law . 265
4. Conclusion ...................................................... 267

The Treatment of Occupation Legislation by Courts in Liberated Territories
   Eyal Benvenisti and Michal Saliternik ............................... 269
1. Introduction ..................................................... 269
2. Occupations during World War II .................................. 270
   2.1. Bulgarian Occupation of Greece: The Komotini Case .......... 271
   2.2. German Occupation of Luxembourg: The Case of Guy H ...... 274
   2.3. Allied Occupation of Italy: The Du Ban Case ................ 275
4. Coalition Occupation of Iraq: The Trial of Saddam Hussein ....... 278
5. UN Administrations .............................................. 279
   5.1. UN Transitional Administration in East Timor: The Dos Santos Case .................. 281
   5.2. UN Interim Administration Mission in Kosovo: The Thermostystem Case ........... 283
6. Lessons Learned ................................................ 285
7. Conclusion ...................................................... 288

The Use and Abuse of International Law: Choice of Applicable Criminal Law in Post-Conflict East Timor
   Yaël Ronen ....................................................... 291
1. Introduction ..................................................... 291
2. Background ....................................................... 292
3. The Role of International Law in Post-transition Determinations of the Law of East Timor .............................. 295
4. The Role of International Law: Pre-October 1999 Law and the dos Santos Affair ............................................................... 298
5. Legal Factors in the Determination of East Timor’s Domestic Law ................................................................. 302
7. Conclusion ......................................................................................................................................................... 309

Concluding Observations
Edda Kristjánsdóttir, André Nollkaemper and Cedric Ryngaert ................................................................. 311

1. Constitutional Moments .......................................................... 312
   1.1. Types of Transition .......................................................... 312
   1.2. Moments in Time ............................................................ 314
2. Form and Substance of Empowerment ........................................ 315
3. Actors ......................................................................................... 319
4. Limitations ................................................................................ 321
5. Effects ......................................................................................... 326