

R.A. Momberg Uribe

The effect of a change of circumstances on the binding force of contracts

Comparative perspectives

R.A. Momberg Uribe

The effect of a change of circumstances on the binding force of contracts
Comparative perspectives

CRC prepared by C.J.Wiarda Institute for Legal Research, Utrecht University,
Janskerkhof 3, 3512 BK Utrecht, the Netherlands.

Cover photograph © Bbbar - Dreamstime.com

ISBN 978-1-78068-005-7 and 978-94-000-0222-7
D/2011/7849/52
NUR 822

© 2011 Intersentia
Cambridge - Antwerp - Portland
www.intersentia.com

No part of this book may be reproduced in any form, by print, photo print, microfilm or any other means, without written permission from the publisher.

This book is the published version of the Ph.D thesis defended on May 27, 2011.

In loving memory of my mother, Nancy
Your light always shines on me

ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

While sitting just in front of my desk, with such a beautiful view of the Utrecht Dom, thinking that my stay and work in the Netherlands is becoming to an end makes me feel a complex mixture of sadness and satisfaction. Sadness because this wonderful stage of my life is closed, but satisfaction because is ending successfully.

I would like to spend a few paragraphs writing about my feelings and gratitude towards the people who joined me and supported me during the writing of my dissertation. They all contributed to making me feel that I was not alone in this indeed solitary and individual work.

First of all, my gratitude and recognition are extended to my supervisor, Prof. Dr. Ewoud Hondius, who, since the very beginning, has given me his support and confidence to carry out this research. He was always generous in sharing his knowledge and experience and also in giving me guidance, but at the same the necessary liberty to pursue my own intellectual interests.

I would also like to thank the members of the Assessment Committee, Prof. Katharina Boele-Woelki, Prof. Anne Keirse, Prof. Martijn Hesselink, Prof. Jaap Hijma and Dr. Sonja Kruisinga, for their time and willingness to read my manuscript.

When three years ago the Molengraaff Institute became my place of work, I never suspected how comfortable I would feel there. Thanks to all the Molengravers for their kindness. Particularly, my gratitude to my colleagues of the third floor, Sanne-Roos, Chantal, Maaïke, Nora, Fred and Catalin, as they were always keen to create a friendly working environment. I wish also to thank Michael Milo for his friendship and his enthusiastic work with the Ius Commune Research School. In addition, I would like to thank Erik, with whom my son and I enjoyed many fantastic football matches at the Galgenwaard Stadium and which has now resulted in us becoming devoted fans of FC Utrecht.

A special mention deserves to be made of the invaluable work of Peter Morris on the editing of this book. In this sense, my gratitude is also extended to the people of the

Wiarda Institute for making my manuscript camera-ready and for helping me with the last steps in the publication process.

Of course, I am especially grateful to my *paranimfs* Maaïke Steegmans and Merel Jonker, not only because they accepted the task of supporting me on the defence of my thesis during the award ceremony, but especially for giving me their sincere and deep friendship during these years.

I also want to thank to my colleagues at the Faculty of Law of the Austral University of Chile for their support; and to the Rector of the same university, Prof. Dr. Víctor Cubillos, who encouraged me to embark on my doctoral studies and gave me his sincere friendship.

I also express my gratitude towards all my family and friends in Chile, especially to my father Iván, who has always believed unconditionally in me; and to my godmother Marianela and my mother-in-law Charlotte, who give me the necessary strength and affection after the loss of my mother.

To come to the Netherlands implied a big challenge not only personally, but also for my wife Carola, and my children Manuela and Gustavo. They joined me in this adventure asking nothing in return. I have to say that they succeeded in that challenge much earlier than me, and I can proudly say that both my children and my wife are very happy and feel very much at home in the Netherlands. Without their unflinching support, understanding and daily love, this task would have been impossible for me.

We all know that our time in the Netherlands would be limited, but we never imagined how much we would enjoy it. Infinite thanks to all our friends and people who made these years some of the best of our lives. It is very hard for us to say goodbye, but I am sure that this is not a definitive farewell. We are looking forward to seeing you all again.

TABLE OF CONTENTS

Acknowledgements	vii
Abbreviations	xv
PART I	
INTRODUCTION AND HISTORICAL PERSPECTIVES	1
Chapter 1 Introductory remarks	3
1. The origin of this research	3
1.1. The same facts: the natural gas crisis	3
1.2. ...But two contradictory decisions	4
2. <i>Pacta sunt servanda</i> and <i>Rebus sic stantibus</i>	5
3. Scope of the research	7
3.1. The concept of long-term contracts. The relational theory of contract	7
3.2. Exclusion of related legal doctrines	9
3.2.1. Impossibility, <i>force majeure</i> and excessive onerousness	10
3.2.2. Mistake and excessive onerousness	11
3.2.3. <i>Laesio enormis</i> and excessive onerousness	12
3.3. The role of the economic analysis of the law	13
3.4. The role of express clauses dealing with a change of circumstances	14
4. Terminology and concepts	16
5. Hypothesis and methodology	17
5.1. Hypothesis	17
5.2. Comparative method	19
5.3. Jurisdictions selected	19
6. Structure of the research	21
Chapter 2 An historic approach to pacta sunt servanda, impossibility and <i>rebus sic stantibus</i>	23
1. The origins of <i>pacta sunt servanda</i>	23

1.1.	Roman law: No <i>pacta sunt servanda</i> principle	23
1.2.	The glossators: the beginning of a rational and systematic scheme	24
1.3.	From <i>nuda pactio obligationem non parit to pacta sunt servanda</i>	25
2.	Impossibility	27
3.	Change of circumstances	29
3.1.	The philosophical Roman roots and development as an implied condition	29
3.2.	Evolution towards a more objective standard	31
3.3.	The codification and the <i>clausula</i> doctrine	33
4.	Conclusions	38
PART II		41
COMPARATIVE SURVEY		
NATIONAL JURISDICTIONS		
Chapter 3 French law		43
1.	Introduction	43
2.	The provisions of the <i>Code Civil</i> and the traditional legal doctrine	44
3.	The traditional case law	46
4.	Legislative intervention	48
5.	The different approach of French administrative law	50
6.	The approach of modern legal doctrine	52
7.	Modern case law	55
7.1.	The limited recognition of <i>imprévision</i> through the duty to renegotiate	55
7.2.	The rejection of court revision	57
8.	The reform projects	60
8.1.	General remarks	60
8.2.	The regulation of <i>imprévision</i> in the reform projects	62
9.	Conclusions	67
Chapter 4 Italian law		69
1.	Introduction	69
2.	The excessively onerous nature of the performance: <i>eccessiva onerosità sopravvenuta</i>	69
3.	The foundations of <i>eccessiva onerosità</i>	70
4.	The conditions for the application of <i>eccessiva onerosità</i>	71
4.1.	Contracts covered by the provision	72
4.2.	The behaviour of the affected party	74
4.3.	The nature of the events	75
4.3.1.	Supervening events	75
4.3.2.	Extraordinary and unforeseeable events	75
4.4.	Excessive onerosity and the normal risk (<i>alea</i>) inherent in the contract	77
5.	The effects of <i>eccessiva onerosità</i>	80

5.1.	The termination of the contract (<i>risoluzione del contratto</i>)	80
5.2.	An equitable modification of the contract (<i>reductio ad equitatem</i>)	81
5.3.	The remedy in case of contracts with obligations for one party only (article 1468)	84
6.	The theory of the <i>presupposizione</i>	84
7.	Conclusions	88

Chapter 5 Latin American jurisdictions – Chilean and Argentinian law 91

1.	Introduction	91
1.1.	The Latin American system of private law: a civil law system	91
1.2.	The development of private law in Latin America since the nineteenth century	92
1.2.1.	The nineteenth century: Codification as a tool for territorial and juridical unification and the influence of the <i>Code Civil</i>	92
1.2.2.	The twentieth century: The (relative) influence of the United States	94
2.	Chilean law	96
2.1.	The Chilean Civil Code	96
2.2.	The role of case law and legal thinking in the Chilean legal system	97
2.3.	Unexpected circumstances in Chilean law: <i>teoría de la imprevisión</i>	100
2.3.1.	The binding force of contract in Chilean private law Article 1545 of the Civil Code and the rejection of <i>imprevisión</i>	100
2.3.2.	The reinforcement of <i>pacta sunt servanda</i> through property law	101
2.3.3.	Contemporary legal doctrine: good faith as the basis for <i>imprevisión</i>	102
2.3.4.	The discussion about the need of a legal reform	105
2.3.5.	The (failed) project of reform	106
2.3.6.	The situation of Chilean administrative law	107
2.3.7.	The case law	108
3.	Argentinian law	116
3.1.	The Argentinian Civil Code	116
3.2.	The doctrine of <i>stare decisis</i> in Argentinian law	118
3.3.	Unexpected circumstances in Argentinian law: the doctrine of <i>imprevisión</i>	120
3.3.1.	The revision of the contract in the Argentinian Civil Code	120
3.3.2.	Developments in legislation and case law	120
3.3.3.	Act 17.711 and the introduction of <i>imprevisión</i> in the Argentinian Civil Code	121
3.3.4.	The conditions for the application of article 1198	123
3.3.5.	The effects of <i>imprevisión</i>	131
3.4.	A reference to <i>abus de droit</i>	134
4.	Conclusions	136

Chapter 6 The Common law jurisdictions – English and American law	139
1. Introduction. Terminology: frustration, impossibility and impracticability	139
2. English law	140
2.1. Origins of the doctrine of frustration	140
2.2. Frustration in cases of excessive onerosity or impracticability	142
2.2.1. Introduction	142
2.2.2. The rejection of impracticability as a ground for being discharged from a contract: development of the case law	143
2.3. The doctrine of frustration of purpose	147
2.4. The effects of frustration	150
2.4.1. The common law rules in cases of performance rendered before frustration	151
2.4.2. The Law Reform (Frustrated Contracts) Act 1943	153
2.4.3. The rejection of a duty to renegotiate	155
2.5. Conclusions	158
3. American law. The doctrine of impracticability	160
3.1. The concept of impracticability	161
3.2. Impracticability in the UCC and the Restatement (2 nd)	162
3.3. The development of the case law	166
3.3.1. The methods for determining impracticability	166
3.3.2. The foreseeability standard	170
3.3.3. The criticism concerning the foreseeability standard	175
3.4. Frustration of purpose in American law	176
3.5. The effects of impracticability	177
3.5.1. Renegotiation of the contract	177
3.5.2. Adjustment of contract	178
3.6. Conclusions	181
 PART III	 185
COMPARATIVE SURVEY	
INTERNATIONAL INSTRUMENTS OF CONTRACT LAW	
 Chapter 7 International instruments of contract law – the approach of the CISG, the PICC, the PECL and the DCFR	 187
1. Introduction	187
2. The approach of the CISG	188
2.1. The CISG system of exemptions	188
2.2. Gap filling in the CISG	189
2.3. Hardship under the CISG	191
2.4. The approach of the case law	194
3. The approach of non-legislative codifications: the PICC, the PECL and the DCFR	198

3.1. General considerations	199
3.1.1. The general rule	199
3.1.2. Scope of the rules	200
3.2. The conditions for the application of the remedies	201
3.2.1. The effect of changed circumstances on the parties' obligations	201
3.2.2. The change of circumstances must have occurred after the time when the obligation was incurred	203
3.2.3. The debtor did not take into account, and could not reasonably be expected to have taken into account, the change of circumstances	203
3.2.4. The exceptional nature of the change of circumstances	204
3.2.5. Risk allocation	206
3.2.6. The request for renegotiation	209
3.3. Remedies	212
3.4. Conclusions	213
PART IV	217
THE EFFECTS OF A CHANGE OF CIRCUMSTANCES	
Chapter 8 The duty to renegotiate as an effect of changed circumstances	219
1. Comparative assessment. The double role of renegotiation	219
2. Source of the duty	220
2.1. Good faith and the nature of the contractual relationship as a source. An inherent or implied obligation	220
2.2. Express contract provision. The renegotiation clause	224
2.1.1. Concepts	224
2.2.2. Structure and content of the clauses	225
3. Content of the duty to renegotiate. Obligations and rights of the parties	227
3.1. Duty to renegotiate in good faith	227
3.2. Duty to agree or to accept the counterparty proposal	228
3.3. Renegotiation period	230
4. Consequences when renegotiations fail	230
4.1. Termination and damages	230
4.2. Adaptation or revision of the contract by the courts	231
5. Conclusions	234
Chapter 9 The adjustment of the contract as effect of changed circumstances	237
1. Introduction	237
1.1. Comparative assessment	237
1.2. Terminology and the concept of adaptation	238
2. The difficult case for the adaptation of contracts	239
2.1. Foundations	239
2.2. Arguments for and against a judicial adjustment	242

2.2.1. A violation of the principle of the sanctity of contracts and the free will of the parties	243
2.2.2. Lack of expertise on the part of judges	247
2.2.3. Increase in the costs of contracting and litigation	248
2.2.4. Adjustment leads to uncertainty and it is unclear	250
2.2.5. A risk to the whole economic system	251
3. The extent and content of modification. The powers of the court	253
4. Termination of the contract	256
5. Conclusions	258
Chapter 10 Concluding remarks	261
1. The general but not absolute principle of <i>pacta sunt servanda</i>	261
2. Receptive and unreceptive legal systems	263
2.1. Receptive legal systems	263
2.1.1. Scope of the rules	263
2.1.2. Requirements	264
2.1.3. Effects	265
2.2. Unreceptive legal systems	266
2.2.1. The reasons for the rejection	266
2.2.2. Exceptional recognition and limited effects	268
2.3. Evaluation	269
3. An attempt at a synthesis	270
3.1. The advantages of legal recognition	270
3.2. Minimum conditions	272
3.2.1. Scope of application	272
3.2.2. Mandatory nature of the provisions	272
3.2.3. Excessive onerosity	273
3.2.4. Reasonable unforeseen circumstances	273
3.3. The effects of changed circumstances	273
3.3.1. Renegotiation	274
3.3.2. Adaptation	275
3.3.3. Termination	277
4. The political choices	278
Resumen en Español	281
Nederlandse samenvatting	287
Bibliography	299
Table of cases	317
Curriculum vitae	325

ABBREVIATIONS

AC	Appeal Cases
All ER	All England Reports
App.Cas.Law	Reports Appeal Cases
BGB	Bürgerliches Gesetzbuch
BW	Burgerlijk Wetboek
Bull.civ.	Bulletin des arrêts de la cour de cassation rendus en matière civile
Cám. Civil	Cámara Civil
CCiv. y Com.	Cámara Civil y Comercial
CNFed. Civ. y Com.	Cámara Nacional de Apelaciones en lo Civil y Comercial Federal
CA	Cour d'appel, Court of Appeal
CApel.	Corte de Apelaciones
Cass	Cassation; Cassazione
CE	Conseil d'Etat
CISG	United Nations Convention on Contracts for the International Sale of Goods
CNCiv.	Cámara Nacional de Apelaciones en lo Civil de la Capital Federal
CS	Corte Suprema (Argentina)
CNCom	Cámara Nacional de Apelaciones en lo Comercial de la Capital Federal
CNEsp., Civ. y Com.	Cámara de Apelaciones en lo Civil y Comercial
D	Recueil Dalloz
DCFR	Draft Common Frame of Reference
DP	Dalloz Periodique
Eng Rep	English Reports
F.	Federal Reporter
F. 2nd	Federal Reporter, 2nd Series
F.Supp.	Federal Supplement
F. Supp. 2d	Federal Supplement, 2nd Series

Abbreviations

Foro amm.	Il Foro Amministrativo
Foro it.	Il Foro Italiano
Giust. civ.	Giustizia Civile
Giust. civ. mass.	Giustizia Civile Massimario
ICC	International Chamber of Commerce
I.C.J Reports	International Court of Justice Reports
I.L.M.	International legal materials
JCP	Jurisclasser périodique
JNCiv.	Juzgado Nacional de Primera Instancia en lo Civil
KB	King's Bench
L.R.C.P.	Law Reports Common Pleas Cases
L.R.Eq.	Law Reports Equity
Lloyd's Rep.	Lloyd's Law Reports
N.E.2d	North Eastern Reporter, 2nd Series
N.Y.S. 2d	New York Supplement, 2nd Series
N.W.2d	North Western Reporter, 2nd Series
P.	Pacific Reporter
P.2d	Pacific Reporter, 2nd Series
P.3d	Pacific Reporter, 3rd Series
PECL	Principles of European Contract Law
PICC	UNIDROIT Principles of international Commercial Contracts
Q.B.	Queen's Bench
Q.B.D.	Queen's Bench Division
RDC	Revue des Contrats
Riv. dir. comm.	Rivista del Diritto Commerciale e del Diritto Generale delle Obbligazioni
RTDCiv	Revue trimestrielle de droit civil
RDJ	Revista de Derecho y Jurisprudencia
SC Buenos Aires	Suprema Corte de Justicia (Buenos Aires)
S.E.2d	South Eastern Reporter, 2nd Series
S.W.2d	South Western Reporter, 2nd Series
S.W.3d	South Western Reporter, 3rd Series
UCC Rep. Serv. (CBC)	Uniform Commercial Code Reporting Service (Callaghan)
U.S.	United States Reports
WLR	Weekly Law Reports