

TABLE OF CONTENTS

PREFACE AND ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS..... V

CHAPTER 1: PURPOSE AND METHOD OF THE STUDY 1

Introduction 1

1. Reasons for the Development of Property Law by the European Union 4

1.1. The Relationship between Free Movement Law and Property Law..... 6

1.1.1. Free Movement of Goods..... 6

1.1.2. Free Movement of Capital 8

1.1.3. Free Movement of Services..... 8

1.1.4. Free Movement of Persons 9

1.2. Harmonization of other Areas of Private Law..... 9

1.3. Summary 12

2. The *Acquis* Method: Defining EU Property Law..... 13

2.1. Delimiting the Field of Law and Defining its Concepts: the Role of Comparative Research in the *Acquis* Method..... 16

2.1.1. The Comparative Method as Developed by the CJEU..... 17

2.2. The Selection of EU Legislation and Case Law for the *Acquis* Analysis..... 20

2.2.1. Defining Property Law: Introducing the System-Cube 20

2.2.2. The System of Property Rights: a Three-Dimensional Model..... 24

2.2.3. Practical Application of the System-Cube 26

2.2.3.1. A Right of Usufruct..... 27

2.2.3.2. A Non-Possessory Right of Pledge on an Incorporeal Object..... 28

2.2.3.3. Security Rights in Relation to Corporeal Objects..... 28

2.2.3.4. Right of Ownership of Emission Rights..... 29

2.2.3.5. Timeshare of Immovable Property 29

2.2.4. The System-Cube applied to English Law 30

2.2.4.1. Common Law and Equity..... 32

2.2.4.2. Trusts 35

2.2.5. Summary 38

3.	Linguistic Problems: the Method of the Court of Justice of the European Union	38
3.1.	The Semantic Approach and the Contextual Approach	39
	Conclusion	41
	CHAPTER 2: PROPERTY LAW AND THE INTERNAL MARKET	45
	Introduction	45
1.	Cross-border or Purely Internal Situation?.....	48
2.	Horizontal or Vertical Relationships	52
3.	Free Movement of Goods.....	53
3.1.	Definition of 'Goods'	54
3.2.	Mutual Recognition of Property Rights?	56
3.3.	Classifying the Measure: from <i>Keck</i> to <i>Trailers</i>	59
3.3.1.	<i>A de Minimis</i> Requirement in Free Movement of Goods?	65
3.4.	Obstacles to the Free Movement of Goods: the Case of <i>Krantz</i>	67
3.4.1.	Facts of the Case	67
3.4.2.	Arguments of the parties	68
3.4.3.	Opinion of Advocate-General Darmon.....	69
3.4.4.	Judgment of the Court.....	70
3.4.5.	The Obstacles to Free Movement of Goods: Loss of Property Right and Increase in Costs	70
3.5.	The Effect of the Free Movement of Goods on National Property Law	74
4.	Free Movement of Capital	74
4.1.	What Constitutes a Capital Movement?	75
4.2.	Discrimination or Market Access Test: a <i>de Minimis</i> Requirement in Free Movement of Capital?	76
4.3.	Obstacles to the Free Movement of Capital.....	77
4.4.	The Effect of the Free Movement of Capital on National Property Law	81
5.	Free Movement of Services.....	82
5.1.	Directive 2006/48/EC	83
5.2.	Discrimination or Market Access Test: a <i>de Minimis</i> Requirement in Free Movement of Services?.....	85
5.3.	Obstacles to the Free Movement of Services	85
5.4.	The Effect of the Free Movement of Services on National Property Law	86
6.	Free Movement of Persons	87
6.1.	Discrimination or Market Access Test: a <i>de Minimis</i> Requirement in Free Movement of Persons?	87
6.2.	Obstacles to the Free Movement of Persons.....	88
6.3.	The Effect of the Free Movement of Persons on National Property Law	91

7.	Justification Grounds.....	91
7.1.	Proportionality	94
	Conclusion	96
CHAPTER 3: THE EU'S COMPETENCE TO REGULATE PROPERTY LAW		101
	Introduction - The Relationship between European Law and Property Law	101
1.	Article 345 of the Treaty on the Functioning of the European Union.....	102
2.	Methodology of the CJEU	103
3.	Interpretation of Article 345 TFEU	104
3.1.	Linguistics: Prejudice, Prejudge or Preclude?	104
3.2.	History of the Article: Relating to Undertakings or not?.....	106
3.2.1.	Article 345 TFEU as seen from the Point of View of Property Law	110
3.2.2.	Private or Public Property Law?	112
3.3.	'The Treaties' to which Article 345 TFEU Refers	114
3.4.	Combining the Above: a Possible Interpretation of Article 345 TFEU	115
4.	Article 345 TFEU in EU Legislative Work	115
5.	Interpretation of Article 345 TFEU by the Court of Justice of the European Union.....	120
6.	Article 345 TFEU in the Debate on Privatizations and Nationalizations	124
7.	Preliminary Conclusions.....	126
8.	Legal Basis.....	127
8.1.	Subsidiarity and Proportionality	135
	Final conclusions	138
CHAPTER 4: SUBSTANTIVE PROPERTY LAW AND PROPERTY LAW TERMINOLOGY IN PRIMARY AND SECONDARY EU LAW		143
	Introduction	143
Part I - Substantive European Union Property Law		145
1.	Direct EU Property Law	145
1.1.	Regulation 650/2012/EU on International Successions	145
1.2.	Regulation 207/2009/EC on the Community Trade Mark (codified version) and Regulation 6/2002/EC on Community Designs	147
1.3.	Regulation 1346/2000/EC on Insolvency Proceedings	148
1.4.	Directive 2008/48/EC on Credit Agreements for Consumers	151
1.5.	Directive 2006/112/EC on the Common System of Value Added Tax	152

Table of Contents

1.6.	Directive 2002/47/EC on Financial Collateral Arrangements.....	155
1.7.	Directive 2000/35/EC on Combating Late Payments in Commercial Transactions.....	157
1.8.	Directive 93/7/EEC on the Return of Stolen Cultural Objects.....	158
2.	Indirect EU Property Law	159
2.1.	Regulation 881/2002/EC Imposing certain Specific Restrictive Measures Directed against certain Persons and Entities Associated with Usama bin Laden, the Al-Qaida Network and the Taliban.....	159
2.2.	Directive 2003/87/EC Establishing a Scheme for Greenhouse Gas Emission	160
2.3.	Natura 2000.....	162
2.4.	Directive 93/13/EEC on Unfair Terms in Consumer Contracts	163
2.5.	Directive 85/577/EEC on Contracts Negotiated away from Business Premises ('doorstep selling directive')	164
	Part II - Terminology	166
3.	Searching for Property Law Terms.....	166
3.1.	Language of the Search	170
3.2.	TEU and TFEU	171
4.	Defined Property Law Terms	172
4.1.	Right <i>in Re(m)</i> /Real Right/Personal Right.....	172
4.2.	Property/ Assets/ Things/ Objects	174
4.3.	Possessor/Possession	176
4.4.	Transfer/Convey/ Assign/ Cession.....	177
5.	Undefined Property Law Terms	180
5.1.	Owner/Ownership/Proprietor	180
5.1.1.	Retention of Title/Reservation of Ownership.....	182
5.2.	Interest in/Title to.....	182
5.3.	Tenure/Tenancy	183
5.4.	Estate/Fee Simple/Freehold/Leasehold	184
5.5.	Trust/Beneficiary.....	186
5.6.	Numerus Clausus and Limited Property Rights	187
5.6.1.	Security Rights.....	189
5.7.	Movable/Immovable	191
5.8.	Tangible/Corporeal.....	192
5.9.	<i>Lex Rei Sitae</i>	193
	Conclusion	195

CHAPTER 5: OPTIONS FOR THE FUTURE DEVELOPMENT OF EUROPEAN UNION	
PROPERTY LAW	199
Introduction	199
1. Explanation of Terms	200
2. The Commission's 2010 Green Paper	200
3. EU Private International Law – Changing the <i>Lex Rei Sitae</i> ?	202
3.1. Alternatives to the <i>Lex Rei Sitae</i> Rule.....	204
3.1.1. <i>Lex Registrationis</i>	204
3.1.2. <i>Lex Destinationis</i>	205
3.1.3. <i>Lex Contractus</i>	206
3.1.4. Choice of Applicable Property Law	207
3.1.5. Mutual Recognition and Country of Origin Principle	208
3.2. Preliminary Conclusions.....	212
4. Cross-Border or Purely Internal Situations	214
5. Non-Binding Options	215
5.1. Inter-Institutional Agreement on a 'Toolbox' for European Property Law	217
5.2. Legal Basis.....	218
6. Optional Instrument	220
6.1. Legal Basis.....	222
6.2. Regulation or Directive	223
6.3. Opt-In or Opt-Out.....	225
6.4. Optional Instrument and Regulatory Competition	226
6.5. Preliminary Conclusions – an Optional Instrument for EU Property Law?	227
7. Binding Instrument.....	228
7.1. Legal Basis.....	229
7.2. Regulation or Directive	230
7.2.1. Minimum or Maximum, Partial or Full Harmonization.....	233
7.3. European Civil Code	234
8. International Agreement.....	235
8.1. Enhanced Cooperation.....	236
9. Harmonization through Case Law	239
Final Conclusions	240

CHAPTER 6: A FRAMEWORK FOR EUROPEAN UNION PROPERTY LAW	245
Introduction	245
Part I – Status Quo of EU Property Law	247
1. The System-Cube	247
1.1. Dimension One: Content of Property Rights	249
1.2. Dimension Two: Objects of Property Rights	250
1.3. Dimension Three: Time	250
2. The Operating System	250
2.1. Creation	251
2.2. Transfer	251
2.3. Registration.....	251
2.4. Destruction.....	252
2.5. Third Party Effects	252
Concluding Remarks to Part I	252
Part II – Where to?	254
3. An Optional Instrument for EU Property Law	254
3.1. Legal Basis Revisited	255
3.2. Advantages of an Optional Instrument	257
3.3. Interpretation of the Optional Instrument.....	258
4. Operating Rules and Definition of Terms.....	258
4.1. Operating Rules.....	258
4.2. Definition of Terms.....	269
5. EU Property Rights.....	271
5.1. European Primary Right	271
5.1.1. Ownership in the Euratom Treaty	274
5.2. European Security Right	275
5.2.1. Past Proposals and Existing Cross-Border Security Rights	275
5.2.2. Characteristics of the European Security Right	281
5.2.2.1. Possessory or Non-Possessory Security Right	281
5.2.2.2. For what Type of Objects?	282
5.2.2.3. General or Specific Security Right	282
5.2.2.4. Accessory or Non-Accessory Security Right.....	284
5.2.2.5. Registration.....	285
5.3. European Use Right.....	285
5.3.1. Content of the Right.....	286
5.3.2. Time-Limit	287
5.3.3. For what Type of Objects?	288
5.3.4. General or Specific Use Right.....	288
6. The Place of Private International Law in the Optional Instrument.....	288

Concluding Remarks to Part II.....	289
ANNEX TO CHAPTER 4: TERMINOLOGY	293
SAMENVATTING	305
BIBLIOGRAPHY	309
CURRICULUM VITAE	337