

THE LIABILITY OF PUBLIC AUTHORITIES IN
COMPARATIVE PERSPECTIVE

THE LIABILITY OF
PUBLIC AUTHORITIES IN
COMPARATIVE PERSPECTIVE

Edited by

Ken OLIPHANT



intersentia

Cambridge – Antwerp – Portland

Intersentia Ltd
Sheraton House | Castle Park
Cambridge | CB3 0AX | United Kingdom
Tel.: +44 1223 370 170 | Fax: +44 1223 370 169
Email: mail@intersentia.co.uk
www.intersentia.com | www.intersentia.co.uk

Distribution for the UK and Ireland:

NBN International
Airport Business Centre, 10 Thornbury Road
Plymouth, PL6 7 PP
United Kingdom
Tel.: +44 1752 202 301 | Fax: +44 1752 202 331
Email: orders@nbninternational.com

Distribution for Europe and all other countries:

Intersentia Publishing nv
Groenstraat 31
2640 Mortsel
Belgium
Tel.: +32 3 680 15 50 | Fax: +32 3 658 71 21
Email: mail@intersentia.be

Distribution for the USA and Canada:

International Specialized Book Services
920 NE 58th Ave. Suite 300
Portland, OR 97213
USA
Tel.: +1 800 944 6190 (toll free) | Fax: +1 503 280 8832
Email: info@isbs.com

The Liability of Public Authorities in Comparative Perspective

© The editor and contributors severally 2016

The editor and contributors have asserted their right under the Copyright, Designs and Patents Act 1988, to be identified as authors of this work.

No part of this book may be reproduced, stored in a retrieval system, or transmitted, in any form, or by any means, without prior written permission from Intersentia, or as expressly permitted by law or under the terms agreed with the appropriate reprographic rights organisation. Enquiries concerning reproduction which may not be covered by the above should be addressed to Intersentia at the address above.

Artwork on cover: Cossacks, Wassily Kandinsky (1866–1944) © Tate, Londen 2016

ISBN 978-1-78068-238-9
D/2016/7849/127
NUR 822

British Library Cataloguing in Publication Data. A catalogue record for this book is available from the British Library.

PREFACE

This title on the liability of public authorities in comparative perspective inaugurates a new series of books by the European Group of Tort Law under the name *Principles of European Tort Law*. The Group was established in 1992 and consists of scholars from several European countries and beyond. It aims to contribute to the enhancement and harmonisation of tort law in Europe through the framework provided by its Principles of European Tort Law (PETL), published in 2005, and its related and ongoing research, and in particular to provide a principled basis for rationalisation and innovation at national and EU level. The Group reconvened in 2009 to work on expanding the PETL's scope and updating and refining its content in the light of subsequent scholarly debates and developments in national and EU law. One part of this work programme is to publish a series of preliminary studies on topics not addressed in the initial edition of the PETL, of which public authority liability is one.

The topic of public authority liability was adopted by the Group at a meeting in Prague in October 2010, at which I was appointed project leader. The project began formally at the Group's next meeting, in Vienna in April 2011, at which we discussed my draft project description and questionnaire (including case studies). The documents were amended in light of that discussion. The issues raised by the questionnaire, and the possible drafting of principles of public authority liability, were then discussed in several subsequent meetings of the Group: in Geneva (October 2011); Vienna (April 2012); Lausanne (October 2012); Graz (April 2013); and three more times in Vienna (April 2014, April 2015 and March 2016). Public presentations were made by Group members in conjunction with the Geneva and Graz meetings.

Initial drafts of the reports contained in this volume were first submitted in 2011, then revised in the light of editorial feedback and Group discussions as the project proceeded, taking account of more recent developments where necessary.

The Group gratefully acknowledges the ongoing financial and organisational support it receives from the European Centre of Tort and Insurance Law (ECTIL) and Institute for European Tort Law, both in Vienna. On behalf of the Group, I would like to thank the current director of both institutions, Ernst Karner, and his predecessor at ECTIL, Helmut Koziol, and of course their staff – particularly Donna Stockenhuber, for language editing, Kathrin Karner, for copy editing, Lisa Zeiler, for meeting organisation, and Eva Ondreasova and Vanessa Wilcox,

for general organisational assistance. I also thank my colleagues in the Group for their support and collaborative endeavours over the duration of this project, especially those who organised meetings in their own countries and procured the funding to support them.

At Intersentia, Ann-Christin Maak was indefatigably enthusiastic and extraordinarily patient, Rebecca Pound was a most careful and efficient copy-editor, and Melanie Hamill led us with minimum fuss and maximum effectiveness through the production process. They made a brilliant team and I would extend to them my personal thanks for an exceedingly enjoyable collaboration.

Ken Oliphant
Bristol, August 2016

CONTENTS

| | |
|------------------------------|----|
| <i>Preface</i> | v |
| <i>List of Authors</i> | xi |

Introduction

| | |
|--------------------|---|
| Ken OLIPHANT | 1 |
|--------------------|---|

| | |
|----------------------------|---|
| Questionnaire | 5 |
|----------------------------|---|

PART I.

PUBLIC AUTHORITY LIABILITY OUTLINED

Austria

| | |
|-----------------------|----|
| Bernhard A KOCH | 19 |
|-----------------------|----|

Belgium

| | |
|-----------------------|----|
| Isabelle DURANT | 51 |
|-----------------------|----|

Czech Republic

| | |
|-------------------|----|
| Luboš TICHÝ | 81 |
|-------------------|----|

Denmark

| | |
|--------------------|-----|
| Vibe ULFBECK | 105 |
|--------------------|-----|

England and Wales

| | |
|--------------------|-----|
| Ken OLIPHANT | 127 |
|--------------------|-----|

France

| | |
|--|-----|
| Duncan FAIRGRIEVE and François LICHERE | 155 |
|--|-----|

Germany

| | |
|---------------------|-----|
| Ulrich MAGNUS | 177 |
|---------------------|-----|

Greece

| | |
|-------------------------|-----|
| Eugenia DACORONIA | 195 |
|-------------------------|-----|

| | |
|--|------------|
| Israel | |
| Israel GILEAD | 225 |
| Italy | |
| Giovanni COMANDÉ and Luca NOCCO | 251 |
| The Netherlands | |
| Anne KEIRSE | 295 |
| Norway | |
| Bjarte ASKELAND | 331 |
| Poland | |
| Ewa BAGIŃSKA | 351 |
| Portugal | |
| Maria José REIS RANGEL DE MESQUITA | 387 |
| South Africa | |
| Johann NEETHLING | 421 |
| Spain | |
| Miquel MARTÍN-CASALS and Jordi RIBOT | 463 |
| Switzerland | |
| Pierre WIDMER and Bénédicte WINIGER | 507 |
| The United States | |
| Michael D GREEN and Jonathan CARDI | 537 |
| European Union | |
| Piotr MACHNIKOWSKI | 559 |
| The Liability of Public Authorities: an Economic Analysis | |
| Jef DE MOT and Michael FAURE | 587 |
| PART II. CASE STUDIES | |
| Case 1. Negligent Safety Certification (Maladministration) | 621 |
| Case 2. Wrongfully Cancelled Licence (Improper Administrative Decision) | 661 |

Case 3. Missing Warning (Improper Administrative Omission – Omission following Prior Creation of Risk) 699

Case 4. Fireworks Store (Improper Administrative Omission – Pure Omission) 731

Case 5. Unfounded Criminal Charges (Prosecutorial and Judicial Acts) . . . 761

Case 6. Unpasteurised Cheese (Possibly Improper Regulatory Act – Improper Regulatory Omission) 793

Case 7. Police Cross-fire (Properly Conducted Administrative Activities).. 823

PART III. CONCLUSIONS

The Liability of Public Authorities in Comparative Perspective
Ken OLIPHANT. 849

LIST OF AUTHORS

Bjarte Askeland

Professor of Private Law, University of Bergen, Norway

Ewa Bagińska

Professor of Civil Law, University of Gdańsk, Poland

Jonathan Cardi

Professor of Law, Wake Forest School of Law, United States

Giovanni Comandé

Professor of Private Comparative Law, Scuola Superiore Sant'Anna, Pisa, Italy

Eugenia Dacoronia

Associate Professor of Civil Law, University of Athens, Greece

Jef De Mot

Senior Research Fellow, Research Foundation Flanders, University of Ghent, Belgium

Isabelle Durant

Professor of Private Law, Catholic University of Louvain, Louvain-la-Neuve, Belgium

Duncan Fairgrieve

Senior Fellow in Comparative Law, British Institute of International and Comparative Law, London, United Kingdom; Associate Professor, University of Paris-Dauphine PSL, France

Michael Faure

Professor of Comparative and International Environmental Law, Maastricht University; Professor of Comparative Private Law and Economics, Erasmus School of Law, Rotterdam, The Netherlands

Israel Gilead

Emeritus Professor of Law, Hebrew University of Jerusalem; Professor, Sha'arey Mada Umishpat Academic Center, Israel

Michael D Green

Williams Professor of Law, Wake Forest University School of Law, United States

Anne Keirse

Professor of Private Law, Utrecht University; Judge at the Court of Appeal, Amsterdam, The Netherlands

Bernhard A Koch

Professor of Civil and Comparative Law, University of Innsbruck, Austria

François Lichère

Professor of Public Law, University of Aix-Marseilles, France

Piotr Machnikowski

Professor of Civil Law, University of Wrocław, Poland

Ulrich Magnus

Emeritus Professor of Law, University of Hamburg; Affiliate Researcher, Max Planck Institute for Comparative and International Private Law, Hamburg; Judge (retired) at the Court of Appeal, Hamburg, Germany

Miquel Martín-Casals

Professor of Civil Law, University of Girona, Spain

Johann Neethling

Senior Professor of Private Law, University of the Free State, Bloemfontein; Emeritus Professor, University of South Africa, Pretoria, South Africa

Luca Nocco

Postdoctoral Researcher, Scuola Superiore Sant'Anna, Pisa, Italy

Ken Oliphant

Professor of Tort Law, University of Bristol, United Kingdom

Maria José Reis Rangel de Mesquita

Associate Professor, Faculty of Law, University of Lisbon, Portugal

Jordi Ribot

Professor of Civil Law, University of Girona, Spain

Luboš Tichý

Professor of European, International Private and Civil Law, Charles University, Prague, Czech Republic

Vibe Ulfbeck

Professor of Private Law, University of Copenhagen, Denmark

Pierre Widmer

Emeritus Professor, Swiss Institute of Comparative Law, Lausanne/Berne,
Switzerland

Bénédict Winiger

Professor of Law, University of Geneva, Switzerland

