CONTENTS

ACKNOWLEDGMENTS .................................................................................................................................. v

EDITORIAL
LISA WADDINGTON, GERARD QUINN and EILONÓIR FLYNN .......................................................... 1

PART I: ARTICLES ........................................................................................................................................ 5

DISABILITY AND ACCESS TO JUSTICE IN THE EUROPEAN UNION: IMPLICATIONS
OF THE UNITED NATIONS CONVENTION ON THE RIGHTS OF PERSONS
WITH DISABILITIES
EILONÓIR FLYNN and ANNA LAWSON ........................................................................................................ 7

1. Introduction ............................................................................................................................................... 7
2. Disabling Barriers in Accessing Justice .................................................................................................. 9
3. Conceptualizing Access to Justice ........................................................................................................ 12
3.1. ‘Access’ and ‘Justice’ .......................................................................................................................... 12
3.2. The Substantive Component ............................................................................................................... 13
3.3. The Procedural Component ............................................................................................................... 15
3.4. The Symbolic Component ............................................................................................................... 16
4. The Development of a Right to Access Justice in International Human Rights Law .......................................................... 17
4.1.1. The Right to an Effective Remedy .................................................................................................... 17
4.1.2. The Right to a Fair Hearing ............................................................................................................ 19
4.2. The Emergence of a Specific Right to ‘Access Justice’ in the Convention on the Rights of Persons with Disabilities ................................................................................................. 21
4.3. Interconnections between Article 13 and other Convention Rights ...................................................... 24
4.3.1. Article 13 and Other Articles Affecting its Scope ............................................................................ 24
4.3.2. Article 13 and Other Articles Operating to Achieve Access to Justice ........................................... 26
4.4. Scope of Article 13 ................................................................................................................................ 29
5. The Right to Access Justice in European Union Law .................................................................................. 30
5.1. The EU and the CRPD ......................................................................................................................... 30
5.2. Access to Justice as a Fundamental Right in EU law .......................................................................... 32
5.2.1. Scope of the Right .......................................................................................................................... 32
5.2.2. Effect of the Right .......................................................................................................................... 33
5.2.3. Non-Discriminatory Enjoyment of the Right ................................................................................. 34
5.3. Access to Justice in Secondary EU law ............................................................................................... 36
5.3.1. Disability Discrimination ............................................................................................................... 36
5.3.2. Criminal Justice ............................................................................................................................ 37

Intersentia
Contents

6. Conclusion ................................................................. 42

TRACKING THE PROGRESS OF THE PROPOSED WIPO TREATY ON EXCEPTIONS AND LIMITATIONS TO COPYRIGHT TO BENEFIT PERSONS WITH PRINT DISABILITIES
ABIGAIL REKAS, JD ......................................................... 45

1. Introduction ................................................................. 45
2. The Right to Read ......................................................... 47
3. Accessible Formats ....................................................... 48
4. Copyright Law ............................................................. 50
5. The EU and InfoSoc Directive ......................................... 53
6. EU Stakeholders’ Platform ............................................. 56
7. Timeline of the Right to Read for Print Disabled Persons ......... 57
8. First Four Proposals ....................................................... 60
8.1. Proposal by Brazil, Ecuador and Paraguay, Relating to Limitations and Exceptions: Treaty Proposed by the World Blind Union .. . . 60
8.3. Draft Joint Recommendation Concerning the Improved Access to Works Protected by Copyright for Persons with a Print Disability (European Union) ..................................................... 64
8.4. Draft Consensus Instrument (United States) ....................... 66
9. Towards Consensus ........................................................ 67
10. WIPO Stakeholders’ Platform and TIGAR ......................... 68
11. Private Sector .............................................................. 70
12. Conclusions .............................................................. 71

STAYING THE COURSE: THE EUROPEAN DISABILITY STRATEGY 2010–2020
DAVID L. HOSKING ........................................................... 73

1. Introduction ................................................................. 73
2. EU Disability Policy ....................................................... 74
3. The 2010–2020 Disability Strategy ..................................... 77
3.1. Locating the Strategy ................................................... 77
3.2. The 2010–2020 Strategy ............................................... 80
3.3. The Implementation Plan .............................................. 81
4. Resistance and Retreat? .................................................. 87
4.1. Completing the Anti-discrimination Framework ................ 87
4.2. A European Accessibility Act ....................................... 90
6. Conclusion ................................................................. 97

US AND EU PERSPECTIVES ON GENETIC DISCRIMINATION IN EMPLOYMENT AND INSURANCE: STRIKING A BALANCE IN A BATTLEFIELD OF COMPETING RIGHTS
AISLING DE PAOR ............................................................. 99

1. Introduction ................................................................. 99

viii

Intersentia
Contents

1.1. The Background: Advances in Genetic Science .......................... 100
2. Ethical and Legal Dilemmas Arising from Third Party Use of Genetic Information .......................................................... 102
2.1. Genetic Discrimination ............................................................................ 103
3. Genetic Discrimination in Employment – Exploring the Balance of Rights ................................................................. 104
3.1. The Desire for Healthy, Productive Workers ..................................... 105
3.2. Genetic Testing to Advance Health and Safety .................................. 106
3.3. Consequences of Misuse of Genetic Information in Employment ...... 107
3.4. Towards a Balance of Rights ................................................................. 109
4.1. Arguments in Favour of Using Genetic Information: Perspectives from the Insurance Industry .............................................. 113
4.2. Arguments Against Using Genetic Information: Perspectives from the Insured ................................................................. 115
4.2.1. The Social Purpose of Insurance ...................................................... 117
4.3. Insurer versus Insured ........................................................................... 118
5. The Need for Regulation ...................................................................... 119
6. The US Position – A Robust Approach to Genetic Discrimination? 120
6.1. Legislative History – The Trials and Tribulations ............................... 122
6.2. Legislative Position Prior to GINA – Limited Protections ................. 124
6.3. The Arrival of GINA ........................................................................... 124
6.3.1. GINA’s Exceptions ........................................................................ 125
6.4. Does GINA Live up to Expectations? .................................................. 127
7. The Current European Position – A Patchwork of Laws .................. 130
7.1. Legal Basis for Action – A Combined Non-Discrimination and Privacy Approach ................................................................. 131
7.1.1. Building a Case for EU-Level Regulation of Genetic Information . 131
7.1.2. EU Charter of Fundamental Rights ............................................... 132
7.1.3. Non-Discrimination in the EU ....................................................... 133
7.1.4. Protection of Privacy in the EU .................................................... 134
7.2. Potential Obstacles to EU action .......................................................... 135
7.3.1. Current Data Protection Law in the EU ......................................... 137
7.3.2. Current Non-Discrimination Law in the EU ................................. 138
8. The UN Convention on the Rights of Persons with Disabilities – Can the Conclusion of the CRPD shape EU Regulation of Genetic Information? .............................................................. 139
8.1. EU Obligations under the CRPD .......................................................... 142
9. Conclusion – What Next for the EU? ..................................................... 143

FLEXICURITY AND EMPLOYMENT OF PERSONS WITH DISABILITY IN EUROPE IN A CONTEMPORARY DISABILITY HUMAN RIGHTS PERSPECTIVE
MARIA VENTEGODT LIISBERG ................................................................................................................................. 145

1. Introduction ............................................................................................. 145
2. The Contemporary Disability Human Rights Approach ...................... 146
2.1. Models of Disability and Equality ....................................................... 147

Intersentia

ix
Contents

2.2. An Open, Inclusive and Accessible Labour Market .......................... 149
2.3. Anti-Discrimination Protection .................................................. 152
2.4. Employment Promotion ............................................................. 153
2.5. The Involvement of Disability Organizations .................................. 156
2.6. Conclusion ................................................................................. 157
3. Danish Flexiunity ......................................................................... 158
3.1. An Open, Inclusive and Accessible Labour Market .......................... 159
3.2. Anti-Discrimination ................................................................. 162
3.3. Employment Promotion ............................................................. 165
3.4. Civil Society ............................................................................... 167
4. Conclusion ..................................................................................... 168

EQUAL TO THE TASK? RE-EXAMINING EU EQUALITY LAW IN LIGHT OF THE
UNITED NATIONS CONVENTION ON THE RIGHTS OF PERSONS WITH DISABILITIES
LISA WADDINGTON ................................................................. 169

1. Introduction .................................................................................... 169
2. The Status of the CRPD under EU law ......................................... 170
3. The CRPD, the Social Model of Disability and the Principles of
Non-Discrimination and Equality ..................................................... 175
4. EU Disability Non-Discrimination and Equality Law .................. 178
4.1. General Overview ........................................................................ 178
4.2. The Employment Equality Directive ......................................... 180
4.2.1. Definition of Discrimination .................................................. 181
4.2.2. Reasonable Accommodation ................................................ 183
4.2.3. Case Law of the European Court of Justice Interpreting the
Personal Scope of the Disability Provisions of the Employ
ment Equality Directive ............................................................. 185
5. Possible Tensions Between the CRPD and EU Non-Discrimination
and Equality Law ................................................................. 188
5.1. Prohibition of Discrimination – Direct and Indirect Discrimination . 188
5.2. Reasonable Accommodation ..................................................... 190
5.3. The Definition of Disability ......................................................... 192
5.4. Protection from Discrimination on the Grounds of Disability for
People who Associate with a Person with a Disability ................. 195
5.5. Material Scope of the Protection from Discrimination ............ 197
6. Conclusion ..................................................................................... 198

PART II: ANNUAL REVIEW OF EUROPEAN LAW AND POLICY ..................... 201

THE EUROPEAN UNION .................................................................. 203

1. Background to the European Union and Disability .................. 203
1.1. Strategic Direction ..................................................................... 205
1.1.1. Previous Strategies ............................................................... 205
1.1.2. Current Strategy: The European Disability Strategy 2010–2020:
A Renewed Commitment to a Barrier-Free Europe ................... 206
1.1.2.1. Implementation of the Strategy .......................................... 207

Intersentia
## Contents

1.1.3.  Europe 2020: A Strategy for Smart, Sustainable and Inclusive Growth .................................................. 207
1.2.  Legislative Measures ........................................... 209
1.2.3.  The European Accessibility Act ........................................... 213
1.2.4.  EU Structural Funds ........................................... 216
1.3.  The EU and International Legal Developments .............. 222
1.3.1.  European Union Conclusion of the UN CRPD .................. 222
1.3.2.  European Union Implementation of the UN CRPD .......... 224
1.3.3.  The Framework to Promote, Protect and Monitor the Implementation of the UN CRPD .................................................. 225
1.3.4.  Other Developments ........................................... 228
1.4.  EU Accession to the European Convention on Human Rights .............. 228
1.4.1.  Negotiation of the EU Accession ........................................... 229
2.  Activities of the European Commission ......................... 233
2.1.  Directorate General for Justice ................................. 233
2.1.1.  Unit for the Rights of Persons with Disabilities .......... 233
2.1.2.  Equal Treatment Legislation Unit ............................... 240
2.1.3.  Non-discrimination Policies and Roma Co-ordination Unit .............. 241
2.1.4.  Other Activities ........................................... 244
2.2.  Directorate General for Health and Consumers ............. 246
2.3.  Directorate General for Competition ............................ 248
2.4.  Directorate General for Internal Market and Services ......... 255
2.5.  Directorate General for Mobility and Transport ............... 262
2.6.  Directorate General for Enterprise and Industry ............. 269
2.7.  Eurostat .................................................. 274
2.8.  The Information Society and Media Directorate General .... 279
2.9.  Directorate General for Employment, Social Affairs and Inclusion ......... 283
2.10.  Research and Innovation Directorate General ............... 288
2.11.  Directorate General Education and Culture ................. 290
2.12.  Directorate General for Regional Policy ..................... 291
3.  Activities of the Council of the European Union ............. 295
3.1.  Activities under the Open Method of Coordination ........... 295
3.1.1.  Open Method of Coordination – Social Protection and Social Inclusion .................................................. 295
3.1.2.  Open Method of Coordination – European Employment Strategy ......... 296
3.2.  EU Presidency and Ministerial Conferences on Disability .............. 298
4.  Current Activities of the European Parliament ................. 301
4.1.  Activities of the Disability Intergroup of the European Parliament ......... 302
5.  Case Law of the Court of Justice of the European Union .............. 304
5.1.  The Powers of the Court of Justice of the European Union .............. 304
5.2.  Recently Decided Cases ........................................... 305
5.2.1.  Social Security ........................................... 305

Intersentia

xi
Contents

5.2.1.1. Juan Perez Garcia, Jose Arias Neira, Fernando Barrera Castro, Dolores Verdín Espinosa v. Familienkasse Nürnberg
5.2.1.2. Salemink v. Raad van bestuur het Uitvoeringsinstituut werknemersverzekeringen
5.2.2. Cross-Border Healthcare
5.2.2.1. European Commission v. Portuguese Republic
5.2.2.2. Annual Paid Leave.
5.2.3. KHS AG v. Winfried Schulte
5.2.3.1. Mariel Dominguez v. Central Institutions of the Social Protection Committee
5.2.4.1. Cross-Salemink v. Raad van bestuur het Uitvoeringsinstituut verzekeringen
5.2.4.2. Reinhard Prigge, Michael Fromm, Volker Lambach v. Deutsche Lufthansa AG.
5.2.4.3. Galina Meister v. Speech Design Carrier Systems GmbH
5.2.5. Cases Pending
5.2.5.1. Health Service Executive v. S.C. and A.C.
5.2.5.2. Johann Odar v. Baxter Deutschland GmbH
5.2.5.3. K. v. Bundesasylamt
5.2.5.4. European Commission v. Italian Republic
5.2.6. HK Danmark, acting on behalf of Lone Skouboe Werge v. Pro Display A/S and Jette Ring v. Dansk almennyttigt Boligselskab DAB
6. European Economic and Social Committee
6.1. 2011 Opinions with a Disability Dimension
6.2. Activities of the European Union Fundamental Rights Agency
6.3. Studies and Reports
6.4. Study on Long-Term Care
6.5. Report on Persons Placed in Institutions
6.6. Getting a Life: Living Independently and Being Included in the Community
6.7. The European Union and the Right to Community Living – Structural Funds and the European Union’s Obligations under the Convention on the Rights of Persons with Disabilities
6.9. Report of the Social Protection Committee
6.10. Report on the Coordination of Long-term Care Benefits
6.11. World Report on Disability
6.12. Reports Published by the Academic Network of European Disability Experts (ANED)
6.13. ICTs in Education for People with Disabilities Review
6.15. Making Mobile Phones and Services Accessible for Persons with Disabilities Report
6.16. Best Practice Guidelines for Accessible Publishing
6.17. Web Accessibility Policy Making: An International Perspective

xii

Intersentia
9. Disability Awareness Events ............................................. 336
9.2. Access City Award ...................................................... 336
9.3. Vodafone Foundation Smart Accessibility Awards ............... 337

THE COUNCIL OF EUROPE .................................................. 339

1. Background to the Council of Europe and Disability ................. 339
1.1. The Role and Institutions of the Council of Europe ............... 339
1.2. The Strategic Direction of the Council of Europe on Disability . 341
2. The European Court of Human Rights and Recent Case Law on Disability .................................................. 342
2.1. The Convention and the Court ....................................... 342
2.2. Background, Proceedings and Jurisdiction of the Court ........ 342
2.3. Court Reform ............................................................ 345
2.3.1. Reform of the Court .............................................. 345
2.3.2. EU Accession ....................................................... 347
2.4. Disability and the Court ............................................... 348
2.5. Recently Decided Disability-Related Case Law ................. 350
2.5.1. General Disability-Related Case Law .......................... 350
2.5.1.1. Stanov v. Bulgaria ........................................... 350
2.5.1.2. D.D. v. Lithuania ............................................. 355
2.5.1.3. M.S. v. the United Kingdom ................................ 359
2.5.2. Case Law Concerning Conditions of Detention for People with Disabilities ............................................. 362
2.5.2.1. Arutyunyan v. Russia ......................................... 362
2.5.3. Cases Involving Family Rights ................................... 367
2.5.3.1. Assunção Chaves v. Portugal .................................. 367
2.5.4. Interesting Pending Applications ................................ 370
2.5.4.1. Djordjevic and Djorjievic v. Croatia .......................... 370
2.5.4.2. Malacu and others v. Romania ................................ 372
2.5.4.3. Gauer v. France ............................................... 372
2.5.4.4. R.P. v. UK ..................................................... 373
2.5.4.5. Ryabay v. Russia .............................................. 374
3. European Social Charter ................................................. 375
3.1. Background of the European Social Charter and Committee ....... 375
3.2. Recent Conclusions of the European Committee of Social Rights on State Party Reports on Disability .................. 377
3.3. Recent decisions of the European Committee of Social Rights in Collective Complaints that Relate to Disability .............. 379
3.3.1. International Federation of Human Rights (FIDH) v. Belgium 380
4. European Committee for the Prevention of Torture and Inhuman or Degrading Treatment or Punishment (CPT) .................. 381
4.1. Background of the CPT .............................................. 381
4.2. The CPT Standards and Disability .................................. 382
4.3. The 2011 CPT General Report ...................................... 382
4.4. Country visits of the CPT and Disability .......................... 383
4.4.1. CPT visit to Ukraine (2009) ...................................... 384
4.4.2. CPT visit to Poland (2009) ...................................... 387
Contents

4.4.3. CPT visit to Latvia (2009) ......................................................... 390
4.4.4. CPT visit to Albania (2010) ...................................................... 391
4.4.5. Visit to Armenia (2010) .......................................................... 394
4.4.6. CPT visit to Kosovo (2010) ...................................................... 399
4.4.7. CPT visit to Romania (2010) .................................................... 401
4.4.8. CPT visit to Macedonia (2010) ............................................... 405
4.4.9. CPT visit to Bulgaria (2010) .................................................... 409
4.4.10. CPT visit to Germany (2010) ............................................... 414
4.4.11. CPT visit to Greece (2011) .................................................... 417
4.4.12. CPT visit to Norway (2011) .................................................... 419
4.4.13. CPT visit to Moldova (2011) ............................................... 422
5. The Council of Europe Human Rights Commissioner .................. 426
  5.1. Background .................................................................................. 426
  5.2. Recent Activities of the Human Rights Commissioner on Disability 427
  5.2.1. Annual Activity Report 2011 .................................................. 427
  5.2.2. Position Papers and Speeches ................................................. 428
  5.2.2.1. ‘Who Gets to Decide’ Right to Legal Capacity for Persons with 
   Intellectual and Psychosocial Disabilities’ .................................. 428
  5.2.2.2. ‘The Right of People with Disabilities to Live Independently and 
   Be Included in the Community’ ................................................. 431
  5.3. Country Visits .............................................................................. 435
  5.3.1. Report on Visit to Italy .......................................................... 435
  5.3.2. Report on Visit to Ireland ........................................................ 435
  5.3.3. Report on Visit to Serbia ........................................................ 436
  5.3.4. Report on Visit to Slovakia ...................................................... 436
  5.3.5. Letter to the Prime Minister of the Republic of Moldova .......... 437
  5.3.6. Letter to the Minister for Foreign Affairs of Bulgaria .............. 438
  5.3.7. Letter to the Head of the Federal Department of Foreign Affairs of 
   Switzerland ................................................................................. 439
  5.3.8. Interventions and Hearings ...................................................... 439
6. The Parliamentary Assembly and the Committee of Ministers ....... 440
  6.1. Recent Activities of the Parlamentary Assembly on Disability ... 440
   Protection of Privacy and Personal Data on the Internet and Online 
   Media ......................................................................................... 440
  6.1.3. Recommendation 1990 (2012): The Right of Everyone to Take 
   Part in Cultural Life .................................................................... 442
   Protecting Human Rights and Dignity by Taking into Account 
   Previously Expressed Wishes of Patients .................................... 443
  6.2. Recent Activities of the Committee of Ministers on Disability .... 444
  6.2.1. Recommendation CM/Rec(2011)14 of the Committee of Ministers 
   to Member States on the Participation of Persons with Disabilities 
   in Political and Public Life ......................................................... 444
  6.2.2. Building a Europe for and with Children Programme ............ 445
  6.2.3. Guidelines on Child-Friendly Health Care ......................... 446
6.2.4. Recommendation CM/Rec(2011)12 of the Committee of Ministers to Member States on Children’s Rights and Social Services Friendly to Children and Families ......................................... 446

6.2.5. Recommendation CM/Rec(2012)2 of the Committee of Ministers to Member States on the Participation of Children and Young People under the Age of 18 .............................................. 447

7. European Co-ordination Forum for the Council of Europe Disability Action Plan (CAHPA) ............................................... 447

8. The European Commission of Democracy Through Law (the Venice Commission) ............................................................ 448

8.1. Other Activities ................................................................. 450


8.1.2. Opinion on the Draft Law on Judges and Prosecutors of Turkey ... 450

OTHER EUROPEAN INTERGOVERNMENTAL ORGANIZATIONS AND CIVIL SOCIETY GROUPS ......................................................... 451

1. European Intergovernmental Organizations .................................. 451

1.1. Organization for Economic Co-operation and Development (OECD) 451

1.2. World Health Organization – Regional Office for Europe ........ 455

1.3. International Labour Organization ....................................... 459

1.3.1. ILO Regional Office for Europe and Central Asia ............. 462

1.3.2. The ILO Office for the European Union and the Benelux ..... 463

1.4. World Bank ........................................................................ 465

1.4.1. The World Bank and Disability ...................................... 466

1.4.2. Europe and Central Asia Region ..................................... 468

1.4.3. The World Bank and the European Union ...................... 469

2. European Civil Society Organizations .................................... 470

2.1. The European Disability Forum ......................................... 470

2.1.1. General Activities ....................................................... 471

2.1.2. Papers/Reports/Publications ....................................... 474

2.1.3. Commission Activities ................................................. 477

2.1.4. European Parliament .................................................... 480

2.2. Inclusion Europe ............................................................... 483

2.3. European Network on Independent Living (ENIL) ............... 485

2.4. Mental Disability Advocacy Center (MDAC) ..................... 487

2.4.1. Legislative Reform ..................................................... 488

2.5. Mental Health Europe (MHE) ............................................ 492

2.6. INTERIGHTS ................................................................. 497

2.6.1. Strategic Litigation ...................................................... 497

2.6.2. Publications ................................................................. 500

PART III: LITERATURE REVIEW .................................................. 503

LITERATURE REVIEW .............................................................. 505

1. Disability Law and Policy Books ............................................. 505

2. Disability Law and Policy Book Chapters ............................... 511

3. Disability Law and Policy journal Articles ............................... 513

Intersentia xv
PART IV: ANNEX OF KEY DOCUMENTATION ............................. 537

Commission Staff Working Document

Choice and Control: The Right to Independent Living
Report of the European Union Agency for Fundamental Rights on the experiences of persons with intellectual disabilities and persons with mental health problems in nine EU Member States .............................. 561

Extract from the Judgment of the European Court of Human Rights (First Section) of 24 July 2012 in the Case of Đorđević v. Croatia ............ 569